

Suggestions for Additional Reading

Study of the Investiture Controversy is a common enterprise that stretches over national boundaries, and to keep abreast of scholarly literature on the subject one has to consult the bibliographical aids in journals published in a number of languages. For the person who wants a general idea of how the wind is blowing, the book review sections in two English-language periodicals will suffice: *Speculum*, the journal of the Mediaeval Academy of America, and the *English Historical Review*. The substantive judgments of the reviews themselves should of course not be accepted without seeing the evidence for oneself. The student who can deal with languages other than English can gain a precise knowledge of the current trends in scholarship by consulting the bibliographical sections in *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique*, *Deutsches Archiv*, and *Historische Zeitschrift*. One periodical *Studi Gregoriani* is devoted entirely to Gregory VII and his age; but fascicles appear irregularly and at long intervals, and there is no attempt to inventory work in the field.

General treatments of the dispute fall into two categories. The first includes works that describe the Controversy as part of a process or set of processes. Of these the most ample is the *Cambridge Medieval History*, volume 5. Other works that describe the historical context of the struggle are: G. Barraclough, *The Origins of Modern Germany* (New York, 1963) and Christopher Brooke, *Europe in the Central Middle Ages, 962-1154* (New York, 1964). In the narrower field of Church history, one may mention the following as works that give sound, general orientations: H. M. Chew, *English Ecclesiastical Tenants-in-Chief* (London, 1932); A. Fliche, *La réforme Grégorienne et la reconquête chrétienne* (Paris, 1940); A.

Hauck, *Kirchengeschichte Deutschlands*, vol. 3 (Leipzig, 1906); K. S. Latourette, *A History of the Expansion of Christianity*, vol. 2: *The Thousand Years of Uncertainty; A.D. 500-1500*. New York, 1938; J. B. Russell, *Dissent and Reform in the Early Middle Ages* (Berkeley-Los Angeles, 1965). Two fundamental works dealing with the broad course of Church history may also be mentioned: the classic study of canon law by P. Fournier and G. Le Bras, *Histoire des collections canoniques en occident depuis les Fausses Décretales jusqu'au Décret de Gratien* (2 vols.; Paris, 1931-1932) and the equally indispensable analysis of Church councils, C. J. Hefele and H. Leclercq, *Histoire des Conciles*, vol. 5 (Paris, 1912-1913).

The second category of general treatments comprises studies of the Controversy in the broad matrix of intellectual history. Perhaps the most ambitious work in this class is R. W. and A. J. Carlyle, *A History of Medieval Political Theory in the West*, vols. 2-4 (third impression, London, 1950). A healthy divergence of opinion concerning the issues and positions in the Controversy will become clear by comparing W. Ullmann, *The Growth of Papal Government in the Middle Ages. A Study in the Ideological Relation of Clerical to Lay Power* (2d ed.; London, 1962) and Karl F. Morrison, *Tradition and Authority in the Western Church, ca. 300-1140* (Princeton, N.J. 1969). Three fascinating studies that emphasize hierarchic and legal considerations are: F. Kern, *Kingship and Law in the Middle Ages*, translated by S. B. Chrimes (Oxford, Eng., 1939); G. Tellenbach, *Church, State and Christian Society at the Time of the Investiture Contest*, translated by R. F. Bennett (Oxford, Eng. 1948); and R. W. Southern, *The Making of the*

Middle Ages (New Haven, Conn., 1953). For the later history of the ideas that Gregory VII enacted, the following articles are essential: Gerhart B. Ladner, "The Concepts of 'Ecclesia' and 'Christianitas' and their Relation to the Idea of Papal 'Plenitudo Potestatis' from Gregory VII to Boniface VIII," *Miscellanea Historiae Pontificiae*, 18 (1954), 49-77; and M. J. Wilks, "The *Apostolicus* and the Bishop of Rome," *Journal of Theological Studies*, 13 (1962), 290-317; 14 (1963), 311-354.

Among the specialist studies on the Investiture Controversy, some deal with the intricacies of the entire dispute; some cast light particularly on crises in special regions; others treat the roles of individual figures, and still others try to describe how it all ended. Though his theories were severely challenged by Erich Caspar, the editor of Gregory VII's letters, A. Fliche's three-volume treatise, *La Réforme grégorienne* (Louvain, 1924, 1925, 1937) takes pride of place in any historiographical review. The essential fact of polemical literature has so far been considered only by writers in the German language, but their essays deserve to be mentioned here because of the importance of their subject and their skill in dealing with it: C. Erdmann, "Die Anfänge der staatlichen Propaganda im Investiturstreit," *Historische Zeitschrift*, 154 (1936), 491-512, and C. Mirbt, *Die Publizistik im Zeitalter Gregors VII* (Leipzig, 1894). Among area studies, the following are exceptional for their breadth of view: A. Becker, *Studien zum Investiturproblem in Frankreich* (Saarbrücken, 1955) and N. F. Cantor, *Church, Kingship, and Lay Investiture*

in England, 1089-1135 (Princeton, N.J., 1958).

The following studies treat individual figures in the Gregorian movement, with special reference to the effects of their legal knowledge on Church order: O. J. Blum, *St. Peter Damian: His Teaching on the Spiritual Life* (Washington, 1947); J. J. Ryan, *St. Peter Damian and His Canonical Sources* (Toronto, 1956); J. Gilchrist, "Humbert of Silva-Candida and the Political Concept of *Ecclesia* in the Eleventh-Century Reform Movement," *Journal of Religious History*, 2 (1962-1963), 13-28; A. B. Cavanaugh, *Pope Gregory VII and the Theocratic State* (Washington, 1934); A. Murray, "Pope Gregory VII and His Letters," *Traditio*, 22 (1966), 147-202. The special contribution of Cluniacs to the reform program is discussed in L. M. Smith, *Cluny in the Eleventh and Twelfth Centuries* (London, 1930), now brought up to date by T. Schieffer, "Cluny et la querelle des Investitures," *Revue historique*, 225 (1961), 47-72. On the final stages of the dispute one can hardly recommend a more fruitful and intriguing constellation of articles than the classic essay by Z. N. Brooke, "Lay Investiture and Its Relation to the Conflict of Empire and Papacy," *Proceedings of the British Academy*, 25 (1939), 217-249, together with the recent studies, from a completely different perspective, by H. V. White: "Pontius of Cluny, the *Curia Romana*, and the End of Gregorianism in Rome," *Church History*, 27 (1958), 195-219, and "The Gregorian Ideal and Saint Bernard of Clairvaux," *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 21 (1960), 321-348.