Contents

List of Contributors ix
List of Abbreviations xi

Prologue: The Changing Nature of Selection Procedures to the European Courts 1
Michal Bobek

1. The Topic 1
2. The Structure 6
3. The Themes 17
4. Acknowledgements 23

1. Not Quite the Bed that Procrustes Built: Dissecting the System for Selecting Judges at the Court of Justice of the European Union 24
Henri de Waele

1. Introduction 24
2. Staffing the System: The Selection of Selectors 28
3. Preparing Nominations to the EU Courts: National Pre-selection Procedures 32
4. Practical Dynamics: The *Modus Operandi* of the 255 Panel and the CST Committee 35
5. Position Within the Union's Institutional Architecture 43
6. The System in Action—Experiences So Far 44
7. Conclusion 49

2. Judicial Performance, Membership, and Design at the Court of Justice 51
Damian Chalmers

1. Introduction 51
2. Judicial Performance and the False Dilemma of Judicial Independence and Judicial Accountability 52
3. The Transitional Period and the Establishment of a Template for the EU Legal Order 56
4. Constitutional in Form and Functional in Substance: The Institution of an Autonomous Legal Order from 1970 Until Maastricht 59
5. Managing and Generalizing the Legal Order: From Maastricht to Lisbon 65

6. Integration and Rights: Legally Onwards from Lisbon? 71
7. Conclusion 75

3. Selecting the European Union's Judges: The Practice of the Article 255 Panel 78
Jean-Marc Sauvé

1. Objectives Pursued by Establishing the Panel 79
2. The Operation of the Panel 80
3. Evaluation of the Role of the Panel 82

4. The Real Test—How to Contribute to a Better Justice: The Experience of the Civil Service Tribunal 86
Georges Vandersanden

1. A Specific Committee for a Specific Tribunal 86
2. Questions and Reflections from the Practice 89
3. Some Final Considerations 92

5. (S)electing Judges for Strasbourg: A (Dis)appointing Process? 95
Koen Lemmens

1. Introduction 95
2. Selecting a Judge for Strasbourg: The Convention's Legal Framework and the Problematic Practice 97
3. The Council of Europe's Side of the Selection Process 100
4. The National Side of the Process 109
5. Conclusion 117

6. Selecting Strasbourg Judges: A Critique 120
David Kosař

1. Introduction 120
2. Breadth and Depth of the Problem 122
3. The Good 127
4. The Bad 129
5. The Ugly 149
6. How to Attract Top Candidates? 156
7. Conclusion 160

7. On the Democratic Legitimacy of Europe's Judges: A Principled and Comparative Reconstruction of the Selection Procedures 162
Armin von Bogdandy and Christoph Krenn

1. Introduction 162
2. Concurring Democratic Principles in the EU and the Council of Europe 166
3. Judicial Selection for the ECtHR and the CJEU: A Democratic Reconstruction 170
4. Conclusion 180

8. **Can Judicial Selection Secure Judicial Independence?: Constraining State Governments in Selecting International Judges** 181
Aida Torres Pérez

1. Introduction 181
2. The Independence of the International Judiciary 183
3. The Dominance of State Governments in Selecting International Judges 188
4. Mechanisms for Constraining State Governments 190
5. Concluding Remarks 200

9. **How Transparent is Transparent Enough?: Balancing Access to Information Against Privacy in European Judicial Selections** 202
Alberto Alemanno

1. Introduction 202
2. Comparing the Panels' Roles in Selecting Europe's Judges 205
3. How the Advisory Panels are Transforming the Selection of European Judges 208
4. The Challenge of Transparency in Judicial Selection 211
5. Towards More Transparency in Judicial Selection 217
6. Conclusion: Transparency as a Recipe for Effectiveness, Legitimacy, and Accountability of Judicial Selection 219

10. **Spillovers in Selecting Europe's Judges: Will the Criterion of Gender Equality Make it to Luxembourg?** 222
Bilyana Petkova

1. Introduction 222
2. The Concept of Legitimacy: As Elusive as an Eel 224
3. Horizontal Spillovers Between the CJEU and the ECtHR 229
4. Vertical Spillovers 239
5. Conclusion 242

11. **Selection, Appointment, and Legitimacy: A Political Perspective** 244
R. Daniel Kelemen

1. Introduction 244
2. Do European Courts Face a Legitimacy Crisis? 246
3. Maintaining the Democratic Pedigree 251
4. Conclusion 257

12. **The Legitimization Strategies of International Judges: The Case of the European Court of Human Rights** 259
Mikael Rask Madsen

1. Introduction 259
2. Overcoming the Problem of Legitimacy 263

3. The Legitimization of International Courts: The Case of the ECtHR 268
4. Conclusion: Implications for Judicial Selection to the ECtHR 276

Epilogue: Searching for the European Hercules 279
Michal Bobek

1. Hercules. Or Hermes? Or Was It Pallas Athena? 279
2. The 255 Panel and the Advisory Panel: A Comparison 281
3. The 'More Precisely Explained' Criteria 288
4. The Remaining Thorn: Transparency and Control 294
5. Thou Shalt be Made in (Whose?) Image 298
6. The Paradox of Success? Open Competitions, Fewer Candidates? 303
7. Coda (Française) 306

Select Bibliography 310
Index 321