

Contents

Acknowledgments *page xv*

I INTRODUCTION

1	The Advent of Experimental Political Science	3
1.1	The Increase in Experimentation in Political Science	3
1.2	Is the Increase in Experimentation Real?	5
1.2.1	How "New" Is Experimental Political Science?	5
1.2.2	Political Science Experiments in the 1950s and 1960s	6
1.2.3	The Rise in Experimentation in the 1970s and 1980s	7
1.2.4	Not New Research, But New in Prominence	9
1.2.5	Is It the Artificiality?	10
1.3	Why Experiments Have Received More Interest	11
1.3.1	Is It Technology?	11
1.3.2	Inability of Existing Data to Answer Important Causal Questions	12
1.3.3	New Research Questions	14
1.4	Is Political Science Now an Experimental Discipline?	16
1.5	Why Study Causality?	17
1.5.1	What Is Experimental Reasoning?	17
1.5.2	Using Experiments as a Guide for Research Broadly	18
1.6	The Welcoming Discipline	19
1.6.1	Heritage Matters	19
1.6.2	The Advantages of the Welcoming Nature	21
1.6.3	The Disadvantages of the Welcoming Nature	22
1.7	Purpose of This Book	24
1.8	Our Audience	25
1.9	Plan of This Book	26

II EXPERIMENTAL REASONING ABOUT CAUSALITY

2	Experiments and Causal Relations	31
2.1	Placing Experimental Research in Context	31
2.2	Technical Background	32
2.3	Causes of Effects Versus Effects of Causes	33
2.3.1	Causes of Effects and Theoretical Models	33
2.3.2	Effects of Causes and Inductive Research	35
2.3.3	An Example: Information and Voting	36
2.4	Setting Up an Experiment to Test the Effects of a Cause	41
2.4.1	The Data We Use	41
2.4.2	What Is an Experiment?	42
2.4.3	Examples of Information and Voting Experiments	50
2.4.4	What Is Not an Experiment?	52
2.4.5	Experimental Versus Observational Data	56
2.5	Chapter Summary	57
2.6	Appendix: Examples	58
3	The Causal Inference Problem and the Rubin Causal Model	75
3.1	Variables in Modeling the Effects of a Cause	76
3.1.1	The Treatment Variable	76
3.1.2	Variables That Affect Treatments	76
3.1.3	The Dependent Variable	77
3.1.4	Other Variables and Variable Summary	78
3.2	Manipulations Versus Treatments	79
3.2.1	Why Are Manipulations Sometimes Called Treatments?	79
3.2.2	When Treatment Variables Cannot Be Manipulated	80
3.2.3	When Manipulations Affect Treatments Only Indirectly	80
3.3	The Rubin Causal Model	84
3.3.1	Defining Causal Effects	84
3.3.2	The Causal Inference Problem and Observational Data	85
3.3.3	Causal Inference Problem and Experimental Data	86
3.4	Design Versus Analysis	93
3.5	Measures of Causality	94
3.5.1	Average Unconditional Treatment Effects	94
3.5.2	Average Conditional Treatment Effects	95
3.5.3	Other Treatment Effects	95

3.6	The Stable Unit Treatment Value Assumption	96
3.6.1	What Does It Mean for δ_i to Represent the Causal Effect?	96
3.6.2	Implications of SUTVA for Inductive Experimental Work	98
3.7	Advantages of RCM	99
3.8	Chapter Summary	99
4	Controlling Observables and Unobservables	101
4.1	Control in Experiments	101
4.1.1	Controlling Observables in Experiments	101
4.1.2	Controlling Unobservables in Laboratory Experiments	102
4.2	Control Functions in Regressions	108
4.2.1	When an Observable Variable Cannot Be Controlled or Manipulated	108
4.2.2	A Digression on Dealing with Voting as a Dependent Variable	109
4.2.3	The Switching Regression Model	110
4.2.4	Selection on the Observables or Ignorability of Treatment	111
4.2.5	How Reasonable Is the Ignorability of Treatment Assumption?	113
4.2.6	When Ignorability of Treatment Holds but Observables Affect Potential Choices	115
4.2.7	Political Science Examples	116
4.2.8	Using Regression Control Methods with Experimental Data	126
4.3	Using Time to Control for Confounding Unobservables	127
4.3.1	Time and Data Structures	127
4.3.2	Panel Data and Control of Unobservables	128
4.3.3	Political Science Example: A Panel Study of Turnout	130
4.4	Propensity Scores in Regressions	131
4.5	Use of Controls and Propensity Scores Without Regression	133
4.6	Control by Matching	134
4.6.1	Propensity Scores and Matching	134
4.6.2	Nonparametric Preprocessing and Matching	135
4.6.3	Political Science Example	136
4.7	Causal Effects Through Mediating Variables	137
4.8	Chapter Summary	138

5	Randomization and Pseudo-Randomization	141
5.1	RCM-Based Methods and Avoiding Confounding	141
5.2	The Ideal Instrumental Variable	142
5.2.1	Definition of an Ideal IV	142
5.2.2	Is Random Assignment of Manipulations in Experiments an Ideal IV?	144
5.3	When Assignment of Treatment Is Not Independent of Potential Choices	145
5.3.1	Potential Violations of Independence in Random Assignment	145
5.3.2	Using Experimental Design to Solve Independence Problems	150
5.3.3	Solving Independence Problems After an Experiment or with Observational Data	153
5.4	When an IV or Assignment Is Not a Perfect Substitute for Treatment	155
5.4.1	Potential Problems of Substitutability in Random Assignment	155
5.4.2	Using Experimental Design to Solve Substitutability Problems	162
5.4.3	Solving Substitutability Problems After the Experiment	172
5.5	Missing Data	182
5.5.1	When Might Data Be Missing?	182
5.5.2	Using Experimental Design to Reduce Missing Data	183
5.5.3	Dealing with Missing Data After an Experiment	183
5.6	Manipulation and Time	192
5.7	Chapter Summary	193
5.8	Adding in Formal Theory	195
6	Formal Theory and Causality	196
6.1	What Is a Formal Model?	196
6.2	Using an RCM Approach with Predictions from Nonformal Models	197
6.2.1	The Theoretical Consistency Assumption	197
6.2.2	Addressing the Theoretical Consistency Assumption	199
6.3	Using an RCM Approach with Predictions from Formal Models	201
6.4	The FTA Process	202
6.4.1	Essence of FTA	202
6.4.2	Theory and Stress Tests	204

6.5	FTA and the Design Stage of Experimental Research	204
6.5.1	The Formal Model: An Example	204
6.5.2	Summary of the Features of the Model	206
6.5.3	Predictions of the Model	207
6.5.4	Designing a Theory Test	211
6.5.5	Designing a Stress Test	241
6.6	FTA and the Analysis Stage	243
6.6.1	The Growing Importance of the Analysis Stage	243
6.6.2	The Analysis Stage and FTA Experiments	244
6.6.3	FTA, Field Experiments, and Observational Data	248
6.7	Chapter Summary	250
III WHAT MAKES A GOOD EXPERIMENT?		
7	Validity and Experimental Manipulations	253
7.1	Validity of Experimental Research	253
7.2	Deconstructing Internal Validity	255
7.2.1	Statistical Validity	256
7.2.2	Causal Validity and the Identification Problem	259
7.2.3	Construct Validity	260
7.2.4	Summary of Internal Validity	264
7.3	Deconstructing External Validity	264
7.3.1	External, Statistical, and Ecological Validity	264
7.3.2	Establishing External Validity	265
7.3.3	Is External Validity Possible Without Satisfying Internal Validity?	275
7.4	Chapter Summary	276
8	Location, Artificiality, and Related Design Issues	277
8.1	Levels of Analysis	277
8.2	Location of Experiments	278
8.2.1	Survey Experiments	278
8.2.2	Internet Experiments	280
8.2.3	Lab-in-the-Field Experiments	296
8.2.4	Is Field More Than a Location?	301
8.2.5	Why Laboratories?	305
8.2.6	Why the Field or the Internet?	307
8.2.7	Which Is Better?	308
8.3	Baselines and Comparisons in Experiments	309
8.3.1	Making Comparisons	309
8.3.2	Determining the "Right" Baseline	310

8.3.3 Experiments with Theoretical Baselines	311
8.3.4 Multiple Comparisons	311
8.4 Artificiality in Experiments	312
8.4.1 Experimental Effect	312
8.4.2 Dealing with Experimental Effects	313
8.4.3 Desirability of Artificiality	313
8.5 Experimental Cross-Effects	314
8.6 Experiments as a Behavioral Testbed for Methodologies	316
8.7 Chapter Summary	321
9 Choosing Subjects	322
9.1 On the Use of Students as Subjects	322
9.1.1 How Often Are Students Used as Subjects?	322
9.1.2 Why Use Students as Subjects?	323
9.1.3 Worries About Students as Subjects	324
9.2 Internal Validity and Subject Pools	325
9.2.1 Representativeness and Statistical Validity	325
9.2.2 Construct Validity	330
9.3 External Validity and Subject Pools	347
9.3.1 Experiments Conducted with Multiple Subject Pools	347
9.3.2 Meta-Analysis and Subject Pool Comparisons	348
9.4 Chapter Summary	351
9.5 Money and Subjects	352
10 Subjects' Motivations	353
10.1 Financial Incentives, Theory Testing, and Validity	353
10.1.1 How Financial Incentives Work in Theory Testing	353
10.1.2 Financial Incentives Versus Intrinsic Motivations	355
10.1.3 Is Crowding Out by Financial Incentives a Problem?	358
10.1.4 Induced Value Theory	361
10.1.5 Risk Aversion	374
10.1.6 Risk Aversion and Repetition	381
10.2 Other Incentive Mechanisms	382
10.2.1 Home-Grown Values	382
10.2.2 Grades	385
10.2.3 Recruiting Mechanisms	386
10.3 Motivating Subjects Without Explicit Incentives	387
10.3.1 Experimental Relevance and Validity	387
10.3.2 Task Information and Validity	390
10.4 Chapter Summary	398

IV ETHICS

11	History of Codes of Ethics and Human Subjects Research	403
11.1	Codes of Ethics and Social Science Experiments	403
11.2	Early Professional Codes of Ethics	406
11.3	The Nuremberg Code	407
11.4	Regulation in the United States	408
11.4.1	The Impetus for Regulation	408
11.4.2	The Belmont Report and the Common Rule	409
11.4.3	The Common Rule and Social Science Research	412
11.4.4	The Current System	417
11.5	Regulations in Other Countries	419
11.6	Cross-Country Research and Regulations	420
11.7	Chapter Summary	421
11.8	Appendix A: Code of Federal Regulations: Title 45, Public Welfare, Department of Health and Human Services, Part 46, Protection of Human Subjects	422
11.8.1	Subpart A: Basic HHS Policy for Protection of Human Research Subjects	423
11.8.2	Subpart B: Additional Protections for Pregnant Women, Human Fetuses, and Neonates Involved in Research	439
11.8.3	Subpart C: Additional Protections Pertaining to Biomedical and Behavioral Research Involving Prisoners as Subjects	444
11.8.4	Subpart D: Additional Protections for Children Involved as Subjects in Research	447
11.9	Appendix B: Categories of Research That May Be Reviewed by the Institutional Review Board (IRB) Through an Expedited Review Procedure	451
11.9.1	Applicability	451
11.9.2	Research Categories	452
12	Ethical Decision Making and Political Science Experiments	455
12.1	Expected Benefits and Costs in Experiments	455
12.1.1	Expectations, Probabilities, and Magnitudes	455
12.1.2	Expected Benefits from Experimental Research	456
12.1.3	Expected Costs from Experimental Research	462
12.1.4	IRB Assessment of Benefits and Risks	473

12.2	Other Criteria in the Common Rule	485
12.2.1	Subject Selection	485
12.2.2	Informed Consent	493
12.3	Chapter Summary	497
12.4	Appendix: Sample Consent Letter for Laboratory Experiments	498
13	Deception in Experiments	500
13.1	Deception in Political Science Experiments	500
13.2	What Is Deception?	501
13.3	Types of Deception	502
13.3.1	Deceptive Purpose	502
13.3.2	Deceptive Materials and Information	502
13.3.3	Deceptive Identities	503
13.4	Arguments for Deception	504
13.4.1	Control over Perceived Artificiality and Subjects' Motivations	504
13.4.2	Experiments on Rare Situations	505
13.4.3	Deception as a Method of Lowering Costs of Experiments	506
13.4.4	Deception as an Educational Benefit	506
13.4.5	The Societal Costs of Prohibiting Deception	507
13.4.6	Deception Is Part of Everyday Life	507
13.5	Objections to Deception	508
13.5.1	Ethical Concerns	508
13.5.2	Methodological Concerns	508
13.6	Effects of Deception	510
13.6.1	Are Harms from Deception Minimal?	510
13.6.2	Does Deception Affect Subjects' Behavior in Future Experiments?	511
13.6.3	Debriefing and Removing Effects of Deception	515
13.7	The Conditional Information Lottery Procedure and Avoiding Deception	517
13.8	How Much Deception Should Be Allowed in Political Science Experiments?	519
13.9	Chapter Summary	520
V CONCLUSION		
14	The Future of Experimental Political Science	525
14.1	The Promise of Collaboration	525
14.2	The Difficulties Ahead	528

15	Appendix: The Experimentalist's To Do List	530
15.1	The Target Population and Subject Pools	530
15.1.1	Nonspecific Target Populations	530
15.1.2	Specific Target Populations	531
15.2	Location of the Experiment	532
15.2.1	Traditional Laboratory Experiments	532
15.2.2	Lab-in-the-Field Experiments	532
15.2.3	Internet Experiments	532
15.2.4	Survey Experiments	533
15.2.5	Field Experiments	533
15.3	Motivation and Recruitment of Subjects	533
15.3.1	Financial Incentives Related to Subjects' Choices	533
15.3.2	Other Types of Incentives Related to Subjects' Choices	534
15.3.3	Motivating Subjects in Other Ways and the Role of Frames and Scripts	534
15.3.4	Subject Recruitment	535
15.4	Relationship to Theory, Manipulations, and Baselines	535
15.4.1	When Working from a Formal Theory	535
15.4.2	When Working from a Nonformal Theory or a Prediction That Is Inspired by a Formal Theory	536
15.5	Operationalizing Random Assignment	536
15.5.1	Random Assignment in Laboratories, Both Traditional and in the Field	536
15.5.2	Random Assignment Outside the Laboratory	537
15.6	Considering Ethical Issues Involved in the Experiment and Securing IRB Approval	537
15.6.1	Benefit and Cost Evaluation	537
15.6.2	IRB Approval	538
15.6.3	Deception	538
15.7	Post-Experimental Analysis	538
	<i>References</i>	539
	<i>Author Index</i>	571
	<i>Subject Index</i>	581