## Contents

| Table of Cases  | xi    |
|---|-------|
| List of Abbreviations   | xxvii |
| List of Contributors  | XXXV  |
|   |       |
| 1. Introduction Georg Nolte   | 1     |
| dong  |       |
| PART I FOUNDATIONS AND DOCTRINAL ASPE   | CTS   |
| 2. Principles of Treaty Interpretation: Developed for and Applied by National Courts?  Michael Waibel | 9     |
| I. Introduction   | 9     |
| II. Treaty Interpretation by National Courts in Perspective   | 10    |
| III. Minimum Harmonization for Diverse National Judges  | 13    |
| IV. The Application of the VCLT by National Courts  | 19    |
| V. Contract and Statutory Analogies in Treaty Interpretation  |       |
| by National Courts  | 26    |
| VI. Conclusion  | 32    |
| 2. Communation of International Rules   |       |
| 3. Grounds for the Application of International Rules   | 34    |
| of Interpretation in National Courts  André Nollkaemper   | 0.1   |
|   | 34    |
| I. Introduction   | 37    |
| II. Effective Performance of International Obligations  | 42    |
| III. The International Quality of Domesticated Norms  | 45    |
| IV. External Effects V. Conclusion  | 47    |
| v. Conclusion   | 1/    |
| 4. 'Contractual' and 'Statutory' Treaty Interpretation  |       |
| in Domestic Courts? Convergence around the Vienna Rules   | 49    |
| Eirik Bjorge  |       |
| I. Introduction: Classification of Treaties in International Law and                                  | 1     |
| the Vienna Rules  | 49    |
| II. 'Contractual' and 'Statutory' Treaty Interpretation   |       |
| in International Law  | 51    |
| III. A Minimalist Approach Taken by the French Courts?  | 55    |
| IV. A Maximalist Approach of the UK Courts?   | 62    |
| V. Conclusion   | 70    |

viii Contents

| 5. | Judicial Dialogue as a Means of Interpretation  Antonios Tzanakopoulos   | 72  |
|----|--|-----|
|    | I. Introduction  | 72  |
|    | II. Judicial Dialogue Defined and Categorized  | 73  |
|    | III. Judicial Dialogue and Interpretation of International Law IV. Problems of Judicial Dialogue on the Interpretation                         | 78  |
|    | of International Law   | 83  |
|    | V. Judicial Dialogue as a (New) Means of Interpretation?   | 90  |
|    | VI. Conclusion   | 94  |
| 6. | The Role of the International Rules of Interpretation for<br>the Determination of Direct Effect of International Agreements<br>Mathias Forteau | 96  |
|    | I. Is the Identification of 'Direct Effect' a Matter of 'Interpretation'?  | 96  |
|    | II. Assessment of the Practice: Harmony or Cacophony?  | 104 |
|    | III. Conclusion  | 112 |
| 7. | The Interpretation of Unwritten International Law by Domestic Judges<br>Peter Staubach   | 113 |
|    | I. Peculiarities of Interpreting Unwritten International Law   | 113 |
|    | II. Methodological Problems and Theoretical Approaches   | 116 |
|    | III. Concluding Observations and Outlook   | 129 |
|    | PART II THE PRACTICE OF DOMESTIC COURTS  |     |
|    | IN CONTEXT   |     |
| 8. | Interpretation of Treaties in an International Law-Friendly  |     |
|    | Framework: The Case of South Africa  Dire Tladi  | 135 |
|    | I. Introduction  | 135 |
|    | II. Preliminary Issues   | 137 |
|    | III. Construing International Law in South African Courts  | 141 |
|    | IV. Conclusion   | 151 |
| 9. | The Law and Politics of the <i>Pro Persona</i> Principle in Latin America <i>Alejandro Rodiles</i>   | 153 |
|    | I. Contextualizing and De-contextualizing the Pro Persona Principle  | 153 |
|    | II. An Emerging Ius Constitutionale Commune Americanum?  | 156 |
|    | III. The Push Forward: The Pro Persona Principle in  |     |
|    | the Case Law of the IACHR  | 161 |
|    | IV. Of Resolute and Reluctant Courts?—The <i>Pro Persona</i> Principle in the Case Law of Colombia's Constitutional Court                      |     |
|    | and Mexico's Supreme Court   | 163 |
|    | V. Re-contextualizing the <i>Pro Persona</i> Principle: Concluding Remarks   | 172 |

Contents ix

| 10. | Dynamic and Evolutive Interpretation of the ECHR<br>by Domestic Courts? An Inquiry into the Judicial Architecture<br>of Europe  | 175                             |
|-----|---|---------------------------------|
|     | I. Introduction II. The Micro Perspective: Member States III. The Macro Perspective: Europe IV. Concluding Themes   | 175<br>178<br>188<br>195        |
| 11. | Deference to the Executive: The US Debate in Global Perspective Julian Arato  | 198                             |
|     | <ul><li>I. Introduction</li><li>II. The Doctrinal Question</li><li>III. Deference to the Executive in the United States and Beyond</li><li>IV. Normative Considerations</li><li>V. Conclusion</li></ul> | 198<br>202<br>204<br>208<br>214 |
| 12. | Gingerly Walking on the VCLT Frontier? Reflections from a Survey on the Interpretive Approach of the Japanese Courts to Treaties  Yukiko Takashiba  | 218                             |
|     | <ul> <li>I. Introduction</li> <li>II. Factors Limiting the Scope of Treaty Interpretation</li> <li>III. Interpretive Practice of the Japanese Judiciary with Respect to Treaties</li> </ul>             | 218<br>221<br>227               |
| 13. | IV. Conclusion  Treaty Interpretation in Indian Courts: Adherence, Coherence,   | 236                             |
|     | and Convergence Vik Kanwar  | 239                             |
|     | <ul><li>I. Introduction</li><li>II. The Interpretation of International Law</li></ul>   | 239                             |
|     | in Indian Courts  | 240                             |
|     | III. Treaty Interpretation in India   | 244                             |
|     | IV. Adherence and Coherence   | 245                             |
|     | V. Two Kinds of Adherence   | 245                             |
|     | VI. Corresponding Methods: Doing without Saying   | 246                             |
|     | VII. Nominal Adherence: Saying without Doing  | 252                             |
|     | VIII. Tax Treaties: A Self-Contained Regime?  IX. From Adherence to Coherence, with a View  | 254                             |
|     | to Convergence  | 261                             |
|     | X. Concluding Observations  | 263                             |

## PART III UNIFORMITY, DIVERSITY, CONVERGENCE: THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVES

| 14. | Diffusion Theories and the Interpretive Approaches of Domestic Courts   | 267        |
|-----|---|------------|
|     | Theresa Reinold   | 207        |
|     | I. Introduction   | 267        |
|     | II. International Relations Theory and the Role of Domestic Courts: The State of the Art  | 269        |
|     | <ul><li>III. The Interpretive Approaches of Domestic Courts:</li><li>Between Emulation and Translation</li><li>IV. Conclusion</li></ul> | 272<br>287 |
| 15. | Treaty Interpretation and Global Governance: The Role of Domestic Courts Achilles Skordas   | 290        |
|     | I. Scope and Argument   | 290        |
|     | II. Legal Cultures and the Reality of Divergence  | 292        |
|     | III. Seeking Compatibility via Translation  | 296        |
|     | IV. Good Governance and the Rule of Law   | 302        |
|     | V. International Peace and Security   | 309        |
|     | VI. Patterns of Interpretation as Enablers of Compatability   | 315        |
| 16  | National Courts and Interpretive Approaches   |            |
| 10. | to International Law  | 317        |
|     | Olga Frishman and Eyal Benvenisti   | 0-7        |
|     | I. Introduction   | 317        |
|     | II. The Underlying Assumptions of the Convergence Thesis  | 319        |
|     | III. The Case Against the Convergence Thesis  | 322        |
|     | IV. The Trusteeship Approach as a Middle Ground   | 328        |
|     | V. Conclusion   | 332        |
|     |   |            |
| 17. | Between Universal Aspiration and Local Application:   |            |
|     | Concluding Observations  Helmut Philipp Aust  | 333        |
|     | I. International Law Between Universal Aspiration   |            |
|     | and Local Application   | 333        |
|     | II. Interpretation Between Uniformity and Diversity   | 336        |
|     | III. The Context for Domestic Court Practice  | 338        |
|     | IV. The Practical Importance of the Matter  | 339        |
|     | V. Binding Obligation or Normative Expectation?   | 340        |
|     | VI. Interpretation and the Rule of Law  | 342        |
| Ind | er.   | 347        |
| Ind | ex  | 347        |