

# Contents

|  |       |
|--|-------|
| <i>Foreword</i> .....  | v     |
| <i>Preface</i> .....   | vii   |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> .....                           | xxi   |
| <i>Table of Cases</i> .....                                  | xxv   |
| <i>Table of National Legislation</i> .....                   | xliv  |
| <i>Table of International and Regional Instruments</i> ..... | lxiii |

## Part I: Reflections on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 1. The International Legal Protection of Economic,<br>Social and Cultural Rights .....                              | 3  |
| I. Introduction .....   | 3  |
| II. Human Rights Obligations Under International Law .....  | 7  |
| A. Background .....   | 7  |
| B. What are Human Rights? .....   | 13 |
| C. Human Rights Obligations and Responsibilities.....   | 24 |
| D. Globalisation and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....  | 25 |
| E. Obligations of Conduct and Result in International Law .....   | 30 |
| III. Tripartite Typology of Obligations .....   | 31 |
| A. Obligation to Respect .....  | 32 |
| B. Obligation to Protect .....  | 33 |
| C. Obligation to Fulfil.....  | 35 |
| D. Obligation to Recognise? .....   | 36 |
| IV. The International Covenant on Economic,<br>Social and Cultural Rights .....                                     | 36 |
| A. Adoption and Ratification .....  | 36 |
| B. Overview of the Covenant .....   | 39 |
| C. Treaty-monitoring Body: The Committee<br>and the Examination of State Reports.....                               | 39 |
| D. A Complaints Procedure Under the Covenant<br>and the Optional Protocol to the Covenant .....                     | 43 |
| E. Substantive Rights.....  | 51 |
| F. Non-derogability and Protection of Economic, Social<br>and Cultural Rights During and After Armed Conflicts..... | 52 |
| G. Extraterritorial Application and Scope of the Covenant .....   | 62 |
| H. Denunciation of or Withdrawal from the Covenant .....  | 74 |
| V. Conclusion .....   | 76 |
| 2. State Obligations Under the International Covenant on<br>Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....              | 78 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| I.   | Introduction .....  | 78  |
| II.  | Article 2(1) .....  | 79  |
|      | A. Obligation to 'Take Steps ... by All Appropriate Means' .....  | 81  |
|      | i. Adoption of Legislative Measures .....   | 84  |
|      | ii. Non-Legislative Measures.....   | 87  |
|      | B. Progressive Realisation and Prohibition of Retrogression.....  | 90  |
|      | i. The Standard of Progressive Realisation.....   | 90  |
|      | ii. Presumption Against Deliberate<br>Retrogressive Measures .....  | 93  |
|      | C. Obligation to Utilise 'Maximum Available Resources' .....  | 95  |
|      | i. Obligation to Eliminate Corruption.....  | 99  |
|      | ii. Budget Allocations to Economic,<br>Social and Cultural Rights.....                                      | 102 |
|      | D. Minimum Core Obligations .....   | 105 |
|      | E. Obligations Regarding International<br>Assistance and Cooperation .....                                  | 109 |
|      | i. Obligation to Respect.....   | 113 |
|      | ii. Obligation to Protect .....   | 114 |
|      | iii. Obligation to Fulfil .....   | 116 |
|      | F. The Application of International<br>Cooperation and Assistance .....                                     | 118 |
|      | i. Developed States: Any Obligation to Assist?.....   | 118 |
|      | ii. Developing States: Obligation to Seek<br>and Use Effectively International Assistance?.....             | 124 |
|      | iii. Non-state Actors: Any Obligation to Assist? .....  | 126 |
| III. | Articles 2(2) and 3: Obligation to 'Guarantee'<br>Non-discrimination and Promote Equality .....             | 128 |
|      | A. Prohibition of Discrimination .....  | 130 |
|      | B. Equality Between Men and Women.....  | 136 |
|      | C. Eradication of <i>De Jure</i> and <i>De Facto</i> Discrimination .....                                   | 139 |
|      | D. Temporary Special Measures .....   | 142 |
|      | E. Discrimination by Non-State Actors .....   | 146 |
| IV.  | Article 2(3): Non-nationals in Developing Countries .....   | 147 |
| V.   | Articles 4 and 5: Limitations on Economic,<br>Social and Cultural Rights and Safeguards Against Abuse ..... | 150 |
| VI.  | Conclusion .....  | 154 |
| 3.   | Beyond the State: Non-State Actors and Economic,<br>Social and Cultural Rights .....                        | 157 |
|      | I. Introduction .....   | 157 |
|      | II. Definition of Non-State Actor .....   | 161 |
| III. | State Obligation to Protect Against Human<br>Rights Violations by Non-State Actors .....                    | 162 |
|      | A. State Obligation to Protect .....  | 162 |
|      | B. Protection Against Discrimination .....  | 169 |
|      | C. Global Actors/Institutions.....  | 172 |
|      | D. Remedies Against Violations by Non-state Actors .....  | 174 |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| IV.   | Direct Human Rights Responsibilities of Non-State Actors with Respect to Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....           | 177 |
| A.    | Responsibilities of Non-state Actors in International Human Rights Instruments.....  | 177 |
| B.    | Responsibility of Non-state Actors Under International Humanitarian Law and International Criminal Law.....                  | 185 |
| V.    | Human Rights Obligations of International Organisations .....  | 187 |
| A.    | The IMF, the World Bank and Human Rights.....  | 187 |
| B.    | The WTO and Human Rights.....  | 195 |
| i.    | TRIPS and the Right to Health.....   | 199 |
| ii.   | Agreement on Agriculture and the Right to Food.....  | 201 |
| iii.  | Aligning WTO Policies with States' Human Rights Obligations.....   | 202 |
| iv.   | Human Rights as 'Public Morals' Under the WTO.....   | 204 |
| VI.   | Corporations, Other Business Entities and Human Rights .....   | 206 |
| A.    | Corporations and Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....  | 206 |
| B.    | Corporate Criminal Responsibility .....  | 214 |
| VII.  | Non-State Armed Opposition Groups.....   | 216 |
| VIII. | Conclusion .....   | 220 |
| 4.    | Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights .....                               | 225 |
| I.    | Introduction .....   | 225 |
| II.   | The Legal Protection of Economic Social and Cultural Rights in the African Charter .....                                     | 226 |
| III.  | The Interpretation of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights by the African Commission on Human and Peoples' Rights .....      | 229 |
| A.    | Right to Property.....   | 231 |
| B.    | Rights to Health and Education .....   | 235 |
| C.    | Right to Work.....   | 242 |
| D.    | The Right to Cultural Life .....   | 243 |
| E.    | Non-discrimination in the Enjoyment of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....   | 244 |
| F.    | Rights Implied in the African Charter: Rights to Housing, Food, Social Security, Water and Sanitation .....                  | 246 |
| IV.   | Conclusion .....   | 248 |
| 5.    | The Domestic Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Protected in International Law.....                          | 251 |
| I.    | Introduction .....   | 251 |
| II.   | The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights on the National Plane .....                               | 253 |
| III.  | Examples of the Application of the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights on the National Plane..... | 258 |
| A.    | United Kingdom.....  | 259 |
| i.    | The Covenant in the United Kingdom .....   | 259 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| ii.  | Why has the United Kingdom not Incorporated Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Protected in the Covenant? .....          | 265 |
| B.   | South Africa .....   | 268 |
| i.   | The Covenant in South Africa .....   | 268 |
| ii.  | Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Protected Under the South African Constitution.....                                   | 272 |
| C.   | Uganda.....  | 279 |
| i.   | The Covenant in Uganda .....   | 279 |
| ii.  | Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Protected Under Uganda's Constitution .....   | 285 |
| D.   | Italy .....  | 294 |
| i.   | The Covenant in Italy .....  | 294 |
| ii.  | Discrimination in the Enjoyment of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Italy.....                                      | 297 |
| E.   | Ecuador, Norway, Serbia and Montenegro, Macedonia .....  | 299 |
| F.   | India .....  | 301 |
| i.   | Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in India.....   | 301 |
| ii.  | Judicial Protection of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in India.....  | 304 |
| G.   | Canada .....   | 307 |
| IV.  | Towards an Effective Domestic Application of the Covenant: The Role of Independent National Human Rights Institutions..... | 309 |
| V.   | Conclusion .....   | 321 |
| 6.   | State Reservations to the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....                             | 323 |
| I.   | Introduction .....   | 323 |
| II.  | Permissible Reservations and the Consequence of an Invalid Reservation.....  | 328 |
| A.   | Permissible Reservations: The 'Object and Purpose' Test .....  | 328 |
| B.   | Consequence of an Invalid Reservation .....  | 332 |
| i.   | Who should Determine the Validity of a Reservation? .....  | 332 |
| ii.  | The General Consequences of an Invalid Reservation .....   | 337 |
| III. | Questionable Reservations.....   | 340 |
| A.   | Kuwait's Reservations.....   | 340 |
| B.   | Pakistan's Reservations.....   | 348 |
| C.   | Turkey's Reservations .....  | 354 |
| IV.  | Reservation by Other States: Examples from Africa and Europe.....  | 358 |
| A.   | Reservations by African States .....   | 359 |
| B.   | Reservations by European States .....  | 360 |
| V.   | Conclusion .....   | 364 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| 7.   | Women's Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....   | 367 |
| I.   | Introduction .....   | 367 |
| II.  | Background and Context .....   | 369 |
| III. | Human Rights of Women to Equality and<br>Non-discrimination: African Experiences.....  | 372 |
| A.   | The African Charter on Human and Peoples'<br>Rights and the Rights of Women in Africa.....   | 374 |
| B.   | Protocol to the African Charter on Human and<br>Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa .....   | 376 |
| C.   | The State of Women's Rights in Africa in Practice .....  | 381 |
| IV.  | Prejudicial Cultural Practices and Customs as an<br>Obstacle to the Realisation of Women's Economic,<br>Social and Cultural Rights in Africa ..... | 383 |
| A.   | African Culture in General .....   | 383 |
| B.   | Right to Inheritance .....   | 388 |
| i.   | The <i>Magaya</i> Case .....   | 389 |
| ii.  | The <i>Bhe</i> Case .....  | 391 |
| iii. | The <i>Mmusi</i> Case .....  | 393 |
| C.   | Right to Marry and Found a Family:<br>Same-sex Marriages and Polygamous Marriages .....  | 395 |
| i.   | Right to Marry and Found a Family.....   | 395 |
| ii.  | Polygamous Marriages.....  | 397 |
| D.   | Right to Equality and Divorce.....   | 406 |
| V.   | Conclusion: The Duty to Uproot Cultural Obstacles<br>to Enhance Women's Enjoyment of Economic,<br>Social and Cultural Rights .....                 | 408 |

## Part II: Substantive Economic, Social and Cultural Rights

|                                   |   |     |
|-----------------------------------|---|-----|
| 8.                                | Right to Work and Right to Just and Favourable<br>Conditions of Work: Articles 6, 7 and 8 ..... | 415 |
| I.                                | Introduction .....  | 416 |
| II.                               | Non-discrimination and Equal Protection in Employment.....                                      | 418 |
| A.                                | Non-nationals: Migrant Workers.....   | 422 |
| B.                                | Equal Remuneration of Men and Women .....   | 434 |
| C.                                | Health (HIV) Status and the Right to Work .....   | 439 |
| III.                              | Freedom from Slavery and Forced or Compulsory Labour .....                                      | 442 |
| A.                                | General Overview .....  | 442 |
| B.                                | Slavery, Servitude and Human Trafficking.....   | 444 |
| C.                                | Forced or Compulsory Labour .....   | 446 |
| D.                                | Protection against Exploitative Child Labour .....  | 449 |
| i.                                | <i>Siliadin v France</i> : The Facts.....   | 455 |
| ii.                               | <i>Siliadin v France</i> : The Decision .....   | 457 |
| State Obligation to Protect ..... | 457   |     |
| Slavery.....                      | 458   |     |
| Forced Labour .....               | 458   |     |
| Servitude .....                   | 459   |     |

|     |   |     |
|-----|---|-----|
| IV. | Right not to be Unfairly Deprived of Employment.....                          | 460 |
| V.  | Conclusion .....  | 463 |
| 9.  | Rights to an Adequate Standard of Living and Social Security:                 |     |
|     | Articles 11 and 9.....  | 465 |
|     | I. Introduction .....   | 465 |
|     | II. Obligations of the Right to an Adequate<br>Standard of Living .....       | 468 |
|     | A. Non-state Actors .....   | 468 |
|     | B. State Obligations .....  | 468 |
|     | III. Normative Content of the Right to an<br>Adequate Standard of Living..... | 473 |
|     | A. The Right to Adequate Food.....  | 473 |
|     | i. International Legal Protection of the<br>Right to Adequate Food .....      | 473 |
|     | ii. National Legal Protection of the Right to<br>Adequate Food .....          | 476 |
|     | iii. Essential Elements of the Right to<br>Adequate Food .....                | 480 |
|     | B. The Right to Water and Sanitation.....                                     | 481 |
|     | i. International Legal Protection of the<br>Right to Water .....              | 481 |
|     | ii. National Legal Protection of the<br>Right to Water .....                  | 483 |
|     | iii. Essential Elements of the Right to Water .....                           | 485 |
|     | iv. The Right to Sanitation .....   | 486 |
|     | v. International Legal Protection of the<br>Right to Sanitation .....         | 487 |
|     | vi. National Legal Protection of the<br>Right to Sanitation .....             | 488 |
|     | vii. Essential Elements of the Right<br>to Sanitation .....                   | 489 |
|     | C. The Right to Adequate Housing.....   | 489 |
|     | i. International Legal Protection of the<br>Right to Adequate Housing .....   | 489 |
|     | ii. National Legal Protection of the Right to<br>Adequate Housing .....       | 493 |
|     | iii. Essential Elements of the Right to<br>Adequate Housing .....             | 496 |
| IV. | The Right to Social Security.....   | 498 |
|     | A. International Legal Protection of the Right to<br>Social Security .....    | 498 |
|     | B. Defining Social Security and State Obligations.....                        | 500 |
| V.  | Remedies and Accountability .....   | 504 |
| VI. | Conclusion .....  | 506 |

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| 10. | The Right to Health: Article 12.....   | 507 |
|     | I. Introduction.....   | 507 |
|     | II. International Protection of the Right to Health.....   | 510 |
|     | III. Scope and Content of the Right to Health.....   | 518 |
|     | A. The Right to Healthcare.....  | 519 |
|     | B. Underlying Determinants of Health .....   | 522 |
|     | IV. State Obligations Regarding the Right to Health .....  | 525 |
|     | A. Availability .....  | 525 |
|     | B. Accessibility .....   | 526 |
|     | i. Equality and Non-discrimination .....   | 526 |
|     | ii. Physical Accessibility.....  | 527 |
|     | iii. Economic Accessibility.....   | 527 |
|     | iv. Informational Accessibility.....   | 528 |
|     | C. Acceptability and Quality.....  | 529 |
|     | D. Implementation of the Right to Health<br>Through Policies and Other Operational Interventions .....             | 530 |
|     | V. Levels of Obligations .....   | 532 |
|     | A. Obligation to Respect the Right to Health .....   | 532 |
|     | B. Obligation to Protect the Right to Health .....   | 535 |
|     | C. Obligation to Fulfil the Right to Health .....  | 537 |
|     | VI. Minimum Core Obligations of the Right to Health .....  | 538 |
|     | VII. Justiciability of the Right to Health .....   | 540 |
|     | A. General Overview.....   | 540 |
|     | B. Progressive Realisation and Resource Availability .....   | 545 |
|     | C. Immediate Obligations .....   | 546 |
|     | D. Available, Accessible, Acceptable and of Good Quality .....   | 547 |
|     | E. Reproductive Rights and Freedom from<br>Non-consensual Sterilisation.....                                       | 549 |
|     | VIII. Conclusion.....  | 555 |
| 11. | The Right to Education: Articles 13 and 14.....  | 558 |
|     | I. Introduction.....   | 559 |
|     | II. International Protection of the Right to Education .....   | 562 |
|     | A. Protection Under the UN Charter.....  | 562 |
|     | B. Protection Under the Universal Declaration<br>of Human Rights .....   | 563 |
|     | C. Protection Under the Convention against<br>Discrimination in Education .....                                    | 564 |
|     | D. Protection Under the International Convention on<br>the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination ..... | 566 |
|     | E. Protection Under the Convention on the Elimination<br>of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women .....        | 567 |
|     | F. Protection Under the International Covenant on<br>Civil and Political Rights.....                               | 569 |
|     | G. Protection Under the International Covenant on<br>Economic, Social and Cultural Rights .....                    | 570 |
|     | H. Protection Under the European Convention on<br>Human Rights.....  | 572 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| I.   | Protection Under the Convention on the Rights of the Child.....   | 575 |
| J.   | Protection Under the African Charter on Human and Peoples' Rights .....   | 578 |
| K.   | Protection Under the Protocol of San Salvador .....   | 579 |
| L.   | Protection Under the (Revised) European Social Charter and the First Protocol to the European Convention on Human Rights .....                | 580 |
| III. | Scope and Content of the Right to Education .....   | 581 |
| A.   | Scope and Content.....  | 581 |
| B.   | Levels of Education .....   | 582 |
| i.   | Primary Education .....   | 582 |
| ii.  | Fundamental Education.....  | 585 |
| iii. | Secondary Education.....  | 586 |
| iv.  | Higher Education .....  | 589 |
| IV.  | Human Rights Obligations in the Context of Education .....  | 594 |
| A.   | Making Education Available, Accessible, Acceptable and Adaptable.....   | 594 |
| B.   | Levels of State Obligations: Respect, Protect and Fulfil .....  | 599 |
| C.   | Justiciability of the Right to Education.....   | 603 |
| i.   | Making Education Available, Accessible and of Good Quality .....  | 603 |
| ii.  | Prisoners' Access to Education .....  | 604 |
| iii. | Non-discrimination .....  | 605 |
| iv.  | Making Education Acceptable .....   | 613 |
| V.   | Academic Freedom and Institutional Autonomy .....   | 617 |
| VI.  | The Right to Inclusive Education of Persons with Disabilities .....   | 619 |
| VII. | Conclusion.....   | 621 |
| 12.  | Cultural Rights: Article 15 .....   | 623 |
| I.   | Introduction.....   | 623 |
| II.  | The Right to Take Part in Cultural Life .....   | 626 |
| A.   | What is Cultural Life? .....  | 626 |
| B.   | The Scope of the Right to take Part in Cultural Life.....   | 630 |
| C.   | State Obligations in Relation to the Right to Take Part in Cultural Life .....  | 631 |
| i.   | Obligations to Respect, Protect and Fulfil .....  | 631 |
| ii.  | Availability, Accessibility, Acceptability, Adaptability and Appropriateness .....  | 635 |
| iii. | Minimum Core Obligation .....   | 635 |
| III. | The Right to Enjoy the Benefits of Scientific Progress and its Applications .....   | 636 |
| IV.  | The Right to Benefit from Protection of the Moral and Material Interests Resulting from Any Scientific, Literary or Artistic Production ..... | 640 |
| V.   | Limitations to Cultural Rights.....   | 643 |
| VI.  | Conclusion.....   | 646 |



---

**Part III: Conclusion**

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 13. The Right of Victims of Economic, Social and Cultural Rights Violations to an Effective Remedy:<br>Towards a World Court of Human Rights ..... | 651 |
| I. Introduction .....  | 651 |
| II. Reasons for the Establishment of a World Court<br>of Human Rights .....  | 653 |
| III. Reasons Against the Establishment of a World Court<br>of Human Rights .....   | 656 |
| IV. Responding to Reasons Against the Establishment of<br>a World Court of Human Rights.....   | 657 |
| V. Establishing the World Court of Human Rights.....   | 660 |
| <i>Selected Bibliography</i> .....   | 665 |
| <i>Index</i> .....   | 683 |