

# CONTENTS

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xxv
<i>Table of Legislation, Treaties, and Conventions</i>	cxxxv

## 1. General Introduction

A. Overview	1.01
B. The complete and the coherent system of judicial protection in the European Union	1.02
C. Union based on the rule of law	1.03
D. Role of the national courts	1.04
E. Challenges underlying the system of judicial protection of the European Union	1.05
F. Former Treaty framework and the pillar structure	1.06
G. Changes brought by the Treaty of Lisbon	1.07
H. The two-fold task of the Union judicature	1.08
I. Structure of the book	1.09
J. Procedural texts applicable to the procedure before the Union courts	1.10

## I THE JUDICIAL ORGANIZATION OF THE EUROPEAN UNION

### 2. The European Courts

I. The National Courts	2.01
II. The Court of Justice of the European Union	2.03
III. The Court of Justice	2.04
A. Composition	2.04
B. Internal organization	2.10
C. Basic functions	2.21
IV. The General Court	2.23
A. Composition	2.23
B. Internal organization	2.29
C. Basic function	2.35
V. The European Union Civil Service Tribunal	2.37
VI. Allocation of Jurisdiction Among the Union Courts	2.45
A. The position before the Treaty of Nice	2.45
B. The Treaty of Nice: a fundamental reallocation of jurisdiction in embryo	2.47
C. The present allocation of jurisdiction	2.49

### 3. Cooperation Between National Courts and the Court of Justice: The Reference for a Preliminary Ruling

I. Introduction	3.01
A. General	3.01

B. Changes brought by the Treaty of Lisbon	3.02
C. The EAEC Treaty	3.03
D. The former ECSC Treaty	3.04
E. Objectives of the preliminary ruling procedure	3.05
F. Sole power of the Court of Justice to declare a Union act invalid	3.06
G. Topics to be discussed	3.07
II. The Initiative for Requesting a Preliminary Ruling	3.08
A. What is a 'court or tribunal of a Member State'?	3.08
B. Types of proceedings in which a preliminary ruling may be requested	3.16
C. Timing and content of a request for a preliminary ruling	3.19
D. Annulment of a request for a preliminary ruling	3.29
III. Determination of the Relevance of the Request for a Preliminary Ruling	3.31
A. Task of the national court	3.31
B. The limits set by Union law	3.34
IV. The Duty to Request a Preliminary Ruling	3.43
A. General	3.43
B. What national courts and tribunals are involved?	3.44
C. Decisions against which there is no judicial remedy under national law	3.48
D. Limits placed on the duty to request a preliminary ruling	3.50
E. Enforcement of the obligation to request a preliminary ruling	3.56
F. Obligation to request a preliminary ruling <i>praeter legem</i>	3.59
<b>4. National Procedural Autonomy, Equivalence, and Effectiveness</b>	
I. Introduction	4.01
A. Overview	4.01
B. National procedural autonomy	4.02
C. Judicial supervision	4.03
D. Constraints	4.04
E. Expressions of the principle of effectiveness	4.05
II. The Principle of Effective Judicial Protection	4.06
A. General	4.06
B. Access to a court	4.07
C. Equal treatment	4.08
D. Statement of reasons	4.09
E. Deficiencies in the system of judicial protection in the European Union pre-Lisbon	4.10
F. Possible solutions identified in the case-law	4.11
G. The Treaty of Lisbon	4.12
III. Constraints: The Principles of Equivalence and Effectiveness	4.13
A. General	4.13
B. <i>Locus standi</i> and interest in bringing proceedings	4.17
C. Limitation periods and rules of evidence	4.19
D. Assessment of the legality of national provisions in the light of Union law	4.36

E. Raising pleas derived from Union law of the court's own motion	4.39
F. Effects of infringements of Union law	4.42
IV. Legal Protection in Proceedings for Interim Relief	4.60
A. Two situations	4.60
B. Allegedly illegal national measure	4.61
C. Allegedly illegal Union measure	4.62
D. Appeal against a national decision	4.63
E. Counterpart of interim relief granted by the Union judicature	4.64
<b>II ENFORCEMENT OF UNION LAW</b>	
<b>5. The Action for Infringement of Union Law by a Member State</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	5.01
A. General	5.01
B. Failure of a Member State to fulfil an obligation under the Treaties	5.05
C. Relationship with special legal procedures to obtain a declaration that a Member State has failed to fulfil its obligations under Union law	5.21
II. Identity of the Parties	5.31
A. The applicant	5.31
B. The defendant	5.36
III. Special Characteristics	5.40
A. The pre-litigation stage of the procedure	5.40
B. The stage of the procedure held before the Court of Justice	5.51
IV. Consequences	5.69
A. Result of the action	5.69
B. Legal force of the judgment declaring that a Member State has failed to fulfill its obligations	5.70
C. Sanctions for failure to comply with the judgment	5.75
<b>6. Preliminary Rulings on the Interpretation of Union Law</b>	
I. Introduction	6.01
A. General	6.01
B. Topics to be discussed	6.02
II. Subject-Matter of a Preliminary Ruling on Interpretation	6.03
A. Overview	6.03
B. The Treaties	6.04
C. Acts of Union institutions, bodies, offices, or agencies	6.08
D. International agreements concluded by the Union and acts of bodies established by such agreements	6.13
E. Provisions of Union law to which national law refers	6.16
III. Content of a Preliminary Ruling on Interpretation and Limits Placed on the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice	6.18
A. Interpretation versus application	6.18
B. Judicial cooperation	6.19

C. Limits placed on the jurisdiction of the Court of Justice	6.20
D. The Court of Justice does not rule on facts and points of national law	6.21
E. Reformulation of questions	6.22
F. No jurisdiction to rule on the compatibility of national rules with Union law	6.23
G. The issues raised must fall within the scope of Union law	6.24
H. Reference back to the national court	6.25
I. Jurisdiction of the national court	6.26
IV. Consequences of a Preliminary Ruling on Interpretation	6.27
A. As regards the national court deciding the case at issue in the main proceedings	6.27
B. As regards national courts generally	6.30
C. Temporal effects	6.33
III PROTECTION AGAINST ACTS OF THE INSTITUTIONS	
7. The Action for Annulment	
I. Introduction	7.01
A. General	7.01
B. Role in the complete and coherent system of judicial protection in the European Union	7.02
C. Overview of the changes brought by the Treaty of Lisbon	7.03
D. The former second and third pillars of the Union	7.04
E. Temporal effect of the Treaty of Lisbon	7.05
F. EAEC and former ECSC Treaties	7.06
G. Overview of the chapter	7.07
II. Subject-Matter	7.08
A. The concept of a reviewable act	7.08
B. The concept of a reviewable act: some fields of application	7.30
III. Identity of the Parties	7.69
A. Defendants	7.69
B. Applicants	7.76
IV. Special characteristics	7.145
A. Grounds for annulment	7.145
B. Conduct during the administrative procedure and admissibility of pleas in judicial proceedings	7.185
C. Standard of review in competition cases	7.190
D. Time limits	7.207
E. Examination <i>ex officio</i> of the conditions governing the admissibility of an action for annulment	7.217
V. Consequences	7.219
A. Result of an application for annulment	7.219
B. Authority of the judgment	7.222

<b>8. The Action for Failure to Act</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	8.01
A. General	8.01
B. Subject-matter of an action for failure to act	8.04
C. Relationship between the action for annulment and the action for failure to act	8.09
II. Identity of the Parties	8.11
A. Defendants	8.11
B. Applicants	8.12
III. Special Characteristics	8.15
A. Pre-litigation procedure	8.15
B. Procedure before the Court	8.21
IV. Consequences	8.23
<b>9. The Objection of Illegality</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	9.01
A. General	9.01
B. Acts against which an objection of illegality may be raised	9.05
II. Identity of the Parties	9.09
A. Natural or legal persons	9.10
B. Member States and Union institutions	9.11
C. Union bodies, offices, and agencies	9.12
D. Objection raised by the parties and exceptionally by the Union courts	9.13
III. Special Characteristics	9.14
A. Requirements for admissibility	9.14
B. Actions in which an objection of illegality may be raised	9.16
C. Pleas in law	9.18
IV. Consequences	9.19
<b>10. Preliminary Rulings on the Validity of Union Law</b>	
I. Introduction	10.01
A. General	10.01
B. Topics to be discussed	10.02
II. Subject-Matter of Preliminary Ruling Proceedings Relating to the Validity of a Union Act	10.03
A. Acts excluded from review	10.03
B. Union acts in the former second and third pillars of the Union	10.04
C. Review of the validity of international agreements concluded by the Union	10.05
D. Acts of Union institutions, bodies, offices, or agencies	10.06
E. Acts of bodies established by international agreements concluded by the Union	10.07
F. Review of the validity of Union acts in the light of international agreements	10.08
G. Binding and non-binding Union acts	10.09
H. Acts of general application	10.10
I. Individual acts and the <i>Deggendorf</i> line of case-law	10.11
J. Failure to act	10.12

III. Substance of the Review of the Validity of a Union Act in Preliminary Ruling Proceedings	10.13
A. Review of legality of Union acts reserved to the Court of Justice under <i>Foto-Frost</i>	10.13
B. Differences compared with an action for annulment	10.14
C. Grounds on which validity may be contested	10.15
D. Assessment of validity normally based on the situation existing when Union measure adopted	10.16
E. Finding of facts necessary to assess the legality of a given Union act	10.17
IV. Consequences of the Review of the Validity of a Union Act in Preliminary Ruling Proceedings	10.18
A. Ruling of the Court of Justice	10.18
B. Definitive effect of a declaration of invalidity	10.19
C. Consequences of the declaration of invalidity in the national legal order	10.20
D. Declaration of invalidity comparable to declaration of nullity	10.21
E. Temporal effects	10.22
F. Exceptional limitation of temporal effects	10.23
<b>11. The Action for Damages</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	11.01
A. General	11.01
B. Union 'non-contractual' liability	11.06
C. The relationship between the action for damages and other actions in the Treaties	11.09
II. Identity of the Parties	11.13
A. Applicants	11.13
B. Defendants	11.18
III. Special Characteristics	11.33
A. General	11.33
B. Substantive requirements for liability	11.36
C. Limitation period	11.86
IV. Consequences	11.95
A. Judgment holding the Union liable	11.95
B. Judgment dismissing the action for damages	11.97
<b>12. Application for an Opinion on the Compatibility with the Treaties of an International Agreement to be Concluded by the Union</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	12.01
A. General	12.01
B. The expression 'agreement envisaged'	12.07
II. Identity of the Parties	12.09
A. Applicants	12.09
B. No obligation	12.10
III. Special Characteristics	12.11
A. Extent of the jurisdiction to give opinions	12.11
B. Time limit	12.14
C. Procedure before the Court	12.18

IV. Consequences	12.20
A. Adverse opinion	12.20
B. Favourable opinion	12.21
<b>IV SPECIAL FORMS OF PROCEDURE</b>	
<b>13. Proceedings for Interim Measures Before the Union Courts</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	13.01
A. Introduction	13.01
B. Types of measure	13.04
C. The ancillary nature of proceedings for interim measures	13.07
D. The provisional nature of interim measures	13.15
II. Identity of the Parties	13.17
A. The applicant	13.17
B. The defendant	13.20
III. Special Characteristics	13.23
A. Competent Judge	13.23
B. Procedure before the Union courts	13.24
C. Other requirements for admissibility	13.25
D. Substantive requirements	13.31
IV. Consequences	13.44
A. Provisional nature	13.44
B. Costs	13.45
C. Appeal	13.46
<b>14. Proceedings for Authorization to Serve a Garnishee Order on the Union</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	14.01
A. Principle and purpose	14.01
B. Competent court	14.02
II. Identity of the Parties	14.03
A. Applicants	14.03
B. Defendants	14.04
III. Special Characteristics	14.05
A. Automatic immunity	14.05
B. Limited jurisdiction	14.06
C. Applications	14.07
<b>15. Unlimited Jurisdiction of the Union Courts in Respect of Actions Relating to Sanctions</b>	
I. General	15.01
A. Legal basis	15.01
B. Changes brought by the Treaty of Lisbon	15.02
C. EAEC Treaty and former ECSC Treaty	15.03
D. Objective	15.04
E. Notion of unlimited jurisdiction	15.05
II. Scope of Review	15.06
A. Review of the sanction	15.06
B. Reasonableness of the sanction	15.07
C. Criteria	15.08
III. Force of Unlimited Jurisdiction	15.09

<b>16. Appeals</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	16.01
A. General	16.01
B. Appeals are confined to points of law	16.02
C. Against what decisions of the General Court will an appeal lie?	16.12
II. Identity of the Parties	16.14
A. Appellant	16.14
B. Interveners	16.15
C. Union institutions and Member States	16.16
D. Other parties to the proceedings	16.17
III. Special Characteristics	16.18
A. Pleas	16.18
B. Appeal must clearly indicate errors of law	16.19
C. No change in the subject-matter of the proceedings	16.20
D. Inoperative or ineffective pleas	16.21
E. Pleas of public interest ( <i>moyens d'ordre public</i> )	16.22
F. Injury suffered as a result of the bringing of the appeal	16.23
G. Measures of inquiry	16.24
H. Time limits	16.25
IV. Consequences	16.26
A. No suspensory effect	16.26
B. Dismissal of the appeal	16.27
C. Successful appeal	16.28
D. Consequences of a successful appeal	16.29
E. Court of Justice gives final judgment	16.30
F. Referral back to the General Court	16.31
G. Effects of a successful appeal brought by a Member State or a Union institution	16.32
<b>17. The Review Procedure</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	17.01
II. Special Characteristics	17.02
A. Determination whether there is a serious risk of the unity or consistency of Union law being affected	17.02
B. Procedure	17.04
III. Consequences	17.09
<b>18. Proceedings Brought By Officials and Other Servants of the Union (Staff Cases)</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	18.01
A. General	18.01
B. Against what measures will an action lie?	18.03
II. Identity of the Parties	18.08
A. Applicants	18.08
B. Defendants	18.11

III. Special Characteristics	18.13
A. The requirement for a pre-litigation procedure	18.13
B. Priority of an action brought under Art. 270 TFEU	18.27
IV. Consequences	18.28
A. Decision of the Civil Service Tribunal	18.28
B. Costs	18.29
C. Appeal	18.30
D. Review	18.31
<b>19. Jurisdiction of the Union Courts to Give Judgment Pursuant to an Arbitration Clause or a Special Agreement</b>	
I. Art. 272 TFEU	19.01
A. Subject-matter	19.01
B. Identity of the parties	19.13
C. Special characteristics	19.15
D. Consequences	19.21
II. Art. 273 TFEU	19.22
A. Disputes between Member States	19.22
B. EAEC and now-expired ECSC Treaties	19.23
C. Special agreement	19.24
D. Dispute related to the subject-matter of the Treaties	19.25
E. Only between Member States	19.26
F. Art. 273 TEU <i>juncto</i> Art. 344 TFEU	19.27
<b>20. Jurisdiction of the Union Courts over Disputes Relating to Intellectual Property Rights</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	20.01
II. System of Legal Protection	20.02
A. Boards of Appeal	20.02
B. The General Court	20.03
III. Identity of the Parties	20.09
A. The defendant	20.09
B. The applicant	20.11
IV. Special Characteristics	20.12
A. Pleas in law	20.12
B. Time limits	20.18
C. Content of the application	20.19
V. Consequences	20.20
<b>21. Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice under Conventions Concluded by the Member States</b>	
I. Subject-Matter	21.01
A. General	21.01
B. What conventions are involved?	21.02
II. Survey of the Court's Powers	21.06
A. Jurisdiction to give preliminary rulings	21.06
B. Direct actions	21.09

III. Procedure Before the Court of Justice	21.12
A. Preliminary references	21.12
B. Direct actions	21.13
IV. Consequences	21.14
A. Preliminary references	21.14
B. Direct actions	21.15
<b>22. Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice of the European Union with Regard to the Area of Freedom, Security, and Justice</b>	
I. Removal of Restrictions Placed on Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice of the European Union in the AFSJ	22.02
A. Former Treaty framework	22.02
B. Changes brought by the Treaty of Lisbon	22.05
II. Urgent Preliminary Ruling Procedure in the AFSJ	22.06
A. General	22.06
B. Scope	22.07
C. Procedure	22.13
D. Relationship to expedited procedure	22.19

## V PROCEDURE BEFORE THE UNION COURTS

<b>23. Common Procedural Rules Applicable to Cases Before the Union Courts</b>	
I. Language Arrangements	23.02
A. Language of a case	23.02
B. Internal language arrangements at the Court of Justice of the European Union	23.11
II. Parties' Representation	23.14
A. General	23.14
B. Rights and obligations	23.20
III. Service	23.24
A. Methods of service	23.24
B. Service by e-Curia	23.25
IV. The Calculation of Time Limits	23.26
A. Distinction between procedural time limits and limitation periods	23.26
B. Preliminary objection	23.27
C. Main steps in the calculation of procedural time limits	23.28
D. <i>Dies a quo</i>	23.29
E. Starting point in case of publication	23.30
F. Duration of the period	23.31
G. Extension of ten days on account of distance	23.32
H. <i>Dies ad quem</i>	23.33
I. Applications	23.34
J. The Court is never closed	23.35
K. Lodgment at the Registry	23.36
L. Lodgment by telefax, e-Curia, or any other means of communication	23.37
M. Excusable error, unforeseeable circumstances, or <i>force majeure</i>	23.38

V. Procedures for Dealing with Cases	23.39
A. General	23.39
B. Joinder of cases	23.43
C. Stay of proceedings	23.46
D. Deferment of the determination of a case	23.48
VI. Written Part of the Procedure	23.49
A. Lodging of procedural documents	23.49
B. e-Curia	23.50
C. Original procedural documents must be signed	23.51
D. Copies and translations	23.52
E. Annexes and schedule	23.53
F. All procedural documents must be dated	23.54
G. Length of procedural documents	23.55
VII. The Preliminary Report and Assignment of Cases	23.56
VIII. Measures of Organization of Procedure and Measures of Inquiry	23.57
A. Burden of proof on the parties and role played by the Union courts in fact-finding	23.57
B. Measures of organization of procedure	23.62
C. Measures of inquiry	23.64
IX. Oral Part of the Procedure	23.73
A. Opening of the oral part of the procedure	23.73
B. Course of the oral procedure	23.76
C. Reopening of the oral procedure	23.82
X. Judgments and Orders	23.85
A. The judgment or order	23.85
B. Content and formal requirements	23.88
C. Legal force	23.93
<b>24. Procedure in the Case of References for a Preliminary Ruling</b>	
I. The Order for Reference	24.02
A. Formal and substantive requirements	24.02
B. Notification	24.06
II. The Written Part of the Procedure	24.09
A. Written observations	24.09
B. Calculation of the two-month period for submission of written observations	24.10
C. No second exchange of written observations	24.11
D. No intervention	24.12
III. The Oral Part of the Procedure	24.13
A. Oral observations	24.13
B. Reopening of the oral part of the procedure	24.14
C. Cases in which no hearing is held	24.15
IV. Expedited and Urgent Preliminary Ruling Procedures	24.16
A. General	24.16
B. Expedited preliminary ruling procedure	24.17
C. Urgent preliminary ruling procedure	24.20
V. Special Characteristics	24.22
A. General	24.22

B. Measures of organization of procedure and measures of inquiry	24.23
C. Representation	24.24
D. Withdrawal of the reference for a preliminary ruling	24.25
E. Costs	24.26
F. Legal aid	24.27
G. Language of the case	24.28
H. No appeal	24.29
I. No interpretation	24.30
J. Revision	24.31
K. Rectification	24.32
L. EEA Agreement	24.33
<b>25. Procedure in the Case of Direct Actions</b>	
I. The Written Procedure	25.02
A. The application	25.02
B. The defence	25.28
C. The reply and the rejoinder	25.46
D. Directions for preparing procedural documents	25.52
II. Intervention	25.58
A. Aim and manner in intervention	25.58
B. Substantive requirements	25.61
C. Formal requirements	25.70
III. The Expedited Procedure	25.79
A. General	25.79
B. Separate document	25.80
C. Importance of the oral part of the procedure	25.81
IV. Discontinuance, Cases that do not Proceed to Judgment, and Preliminary Issues	25.82
A. Discontinuance	25.82
B. No need to proceed to judgment	25.84
C. Preliminary issues	25.86
V. The Closure of Proceedings	25.88
A. The judgment or order	25.88
B. Costs	25.89
C. Legal aid	25.101
D. Requests and applications relating to judgments and orders	25.106
<b>26. Procedure in the Case of Appeals Against Decisions of the General Court</b>	
I. The Written Part of the Procedure	26.02
A. Appeal	26.02
B. Response	26.03
C. Cross-appeal	26.04
D. Reply and rejoinder	26.05
II. The Oral Part of the Procedure	26.06
A. Submission of reasoned request	26.06
B. Cases in which no hearing is held	26.07
III. Application of General Rules and Special Characteristics	26.08
A. Provisions applicable to appeals	26.08

---

B. No measures of inquiry	26.09
C. Legal aid	26.10
D. Effect on cross-appeal of dismissal of the appeal	26.11
E. Procedure when a case is referred back to the General Court	26.12

*Index*

871