

Contents

<i>List of Contributors</i>	xiii
-----------------------------------	------

Part I: Introduction

1. The European Union and the Rule of Law—State of Affairs and Ways of Strengthening	3
<i>Werner Schroeder</i>	
I. Point of Departure: Dangers for the Rule of Law	3
II. Function of the Rule of Law in the Law of the Union	4
A. ‘Community Based on Law’ Means Respect for the Law.....	5
B. Rule of Law and Legal Protection as Maxims in the ECJ’s Jurisprudence.....	5
C. Rule of Law as Part of the Constitutionalisation Strategy.....	6
III. Rule of Law as Part of the Legal Order of the Union.....	9
A. Legal Homogeneity?	9
B. Rule of Law as Value and Principle	12
C. Normative Character of the Rule of Law.....	14
i. Binding Legal Norm.....	14
ii. Emanation into the Union Legal Order	15
iii. Basis for the Mutual Recognition of Legal Decisions of the Member States	16
iv. Respect for the Rule of Law in the Context of the Exercise of the Public Authority of the Union.....	18
IV. Content of the Rule of Law	19
A. Necessity of a Determination of the Content of the Rule of Law.....	19
B. Doubts Regarding the Usefulness of the Concept in Legal Terms.....	21
C. Formal and Material Aspects of the Union Rule of Law.....	22
D. Essence of the Union Rule of Law.....	25
V. Systemic Crises of the Rule of Law in the Member States	27
A. Risks for the Union Rule of Law Arising from Systemic Crises	28
B. Consequences of a ‘Systemic Deficit’ for the Respect of the Rule of Law	29

VI. Procedure for the Implementation of the Rule of Law vis-à-vis the Member States	30
VII. Conclusion—Strengthening of the Rule of Law Through Cooperation	32

Part II: Core Elements of the Rule of Law

2. Principle of Legality and the Hierarchy of Norms	37
<i>Franz Merli</i>	
I. Legality as the Core of the Rule of Law	37
II. Legality as a Complex Concept	38
III. Three Meanings of Legality	39
A. Legality as Compliance with the Law	39
B. Legality as Duty of the State	40
C. Legality as Dominance of Parliamentary Law	41
IV. Legality and the Quality of Law	42
V. Legality and the Hierarchy of Norms	43
VI. The Value of Legality	44
3. Access to Justice and Judicial Independence: Is There a Role for the EU?	46
<i>Attila Badó and János Bóka</i>	
I. Current Issues Concerning Judicial Independence	47
II. Selection and Promotion of Judges	50
III. Assignment and Transfer of Cases, Secondment of Judges	53
IV. Feasibility and Possibility of EU Activities Concerning Judicial Independence	58
V. Conclusions	60
4. Transparency as Part of a European Rule of Law	61
<i>Inger Österdahl</i>	
I. Introduction	61
II. Access to Documents According to the European Court of Human Rights	66
A. <i>Leander v Sweden</i>	66
B. <i>Gaskin v United Kingdom</i>	67
C. <i>Sdruzení Jihoceske Matky v Czech Republic</i>	68
D. <i>Társaság a Szabadságjogokért v Hungary</i>	69
E. <i>Kenedi v Hungary</i>	71
F. <i>Youth Initiative for Human Rights v Serbia</i>	72
G. <i>Janowiec and Others v Russia</i>	74
H. <i>Österreichische Vereinigung zur Erhaltung, Stärkung und Schaffung eines Wirtschaftlich Gesunden Land- und Forstwirtschaftlichen Grundbesitzes v Austria</i>	74
III. Tentative Conclusion	76
IV. Looking Forward: Digitalisation, Internationalisation, Privatisation	77

5. Legal Certainty	80
<i>Anna Gamper</i>	
I. Introduction.....	80
II. Elements of Legal Certainty	81
A. Formal Certainty	81
i. Recognisability.....	81
ii. Predictability.....	81
B. Substantive Certainty	83
III. Problem Areas of Legal Certainty	85
A. Legal Certainty versus Legal Delegation.....	85
B. Legal Certainty versus Legality	86
C. Legal Certainty versus Evolutive Interpretation.....	88
D. Legal Certainty versus Separation of Powers	91
IV. Conclusions.....	95
6. The Principle of Proportionality	98
<i>Peter M Huber</i>	
I. Historic Roots of the Principle of Proportionality	98
A. From Hamurabbi to Common Law.....	98
B. Prussian Police Law of 1794	99
II. Adoption and Generalisation in German	
Constitutional Law	100
A. Contributions of Scholars	100
B. Jurisprudence of the Federal Constitutional Court.....	101
i. The Beginning in the 1950s	101
ii. Generalisation in the 1960s and 1970s.....	102
iii. Extension to the Equal Protection Clause.....	103
III. Acknowledgement in the Jurisprudence of International	
Courts and other Countries	104
A. European Court of Human Rights	104
B. European Court of Justice	105
C. Other National Legal Orders.....	106
IV. Five Elements of the Proportionality Test	106
V. Three Different Dimensions of Proportionality	107
A. Bipolar Legal Relationships between	
Individuals and the State	107
B. Multipolar Legal Relationships	107
C. Competence Related Dimension	108
i. European Union (Article 5(4) TEU)	108
ii. <i>Grundgesetz</i> (Article 28(2) GG).....	109
VI. Problems.....	110
A. Standard of Scrutiny and Counter-majoritarian	
Difficulty	110
B. Open Questions	111

**Part III: Council of Europe and European Union—Different
Concepts of the Rule of Law?**

7. The Council of Europe and the Rule of Law	115
<i>Jörg Polakiewicz and Jenny Sandvig</i>	
I. Introduction.....	115
II. Defining the Rule of Law within Europe.....	117
III. Monitoring Mechanisms and Other Rule of Law Activities.....	121
A. European Commission for Democracy through Law (Venice Commission).....	122
B. PACE Monitoring Committee.....	124
C. Group of States against Corruption (GRECO).....	126
D. European Commission for the Efficiency of Justice (CEPEJ).....	128
E. Council of Europe Commissioner for Human Rights.....	128
IV. Cooperation on the Rule of Law with the European Union.....	130
V. Concluding Observations.....	133
8. The Rule of Law in the Jurisprudence of the European Court of Human Rights	135
<i>Elisabeth Steiner</i>	
I. Introduction.....	135
II. Attempting to Define the Rule of Law.....	136
III. The Rule of Law in the Case Law of the European Court of Human Rights.....	139
A. The Rule of Law as a Fundamental Principle of a Democratic Society.....	140
B. Guarantees that are Inherent to the Rule of Law.....	142
i. The Rule of Law and Judicial Oversight.....	142
ii. Due Process Guarantees.....	147
C. The Principle of Legality Under the Convention.....	150
i. The Quality of Law.....	151
IV. Concluding Remarks.....	154
9. The Rule of Law in the Recent Jurisprudence of the ECJ	155
<i>Thomas von Danwitz</i>	
I. Recent Jurisprudence of the ECJ on the Rule of Law.....	156
A. Effective Judicial Protection Against Restrictive Measures.....	157
B. Legislative Discretion and Judicial Scrutiny.....	159
C. Balancing Fundamental Rights.....	160
II. Ensuring the Respect of the Rule of Law by Member States of the European Union.....	162
A. Actual Context.....	163

- B. The Role of the ECJ in Ensuring the Respect of the Rule of Law by EU Member States167
 - i. Impressions of an Ongoing Integration Process167
 - ii. The Recent Constitutional Evolution in Hungary under Review by the ECJ168
- III. Ensuring the Rule of Law—A Never Ending Story169

Part IV: Mechanisms of Implementing the Rule of Law in Europe

- 10. **Reinforcement of the Rule of Law Oversight in the European Union: Key Options**.....173
Carlos Closa and Dimitry Kochenov
 - I. Introduction173
 - II. Arguments in Favour of the Rule of Law Oversight.....175
 - A. The ‘What?’ Question: On the Nature of the Rule of Law Problems at Issue175
 - B. The ‘Why?’ Question: What does the EU have to do with all this?177
 - i. The All-affected Principle.....177
 - ii. The Supranational Federation Approach178
 - iii. The Principle of Congruence179
 - III. The Legal Basis for Reinforced EU Oversight.....179
 - A. Article 7 TEU.....180
 - B. Key Options Framing the Way Forward: What About the Treaty Change?.....180
 - C. Legal Bases Currently Available182
 - i. Articles 2 TEU and 4(2), 3(1) and 13(1) TEU Read Together.....183
 - ii. Articles 2 TEU and 19 TEU Read Together184
 - iii. Articles 2 TEU and 258 TFEU Deployed Together184
 - iv. Adding Article 260 TFEU185
 - IV. Oversight Procedures186
 - A. Key Components and Classifications of Procedures187
 - i. Brand-new Procedures versus (Updated) Existing Ones187
 - ii. Judicial versus Political Procedures.....188
 - iii. Ex ante versus Ex post Procedures188
 - iv. Avoiding Semblance of Change189
 - B. Legal Procedures.....189
 - i. Systemic Infringement Procedure.....189
 - ii. ECJ Involvement via EU Citizenship Rights.....190
 - C. Political Procedures.....191
 - i. Learning from the Council of Europe191
 - ii. Using Existing EU Bodies192
 - iii. Creating a Special New EU Organ: The Copenhagen Commission.....192

D.	Penalties and Sanctions.....	193
i.	Financial Sanctions.....	193
ii.	Ejecting a Non-compliant Member State from the Union	194
V.	Conclusions	194
11.	The EU Rule of Law Framework.....	197
	<i>Emmanuel Crabit and Nicolaas Bel</i>	
I.	Introduction	197
A.	The Concept of Rule of Law—A Common Understanding.....	198
II.	Why has the Commission Established the EU Rule of Law Framework?.....	198
A.	Infringement Proceedings	199
B.	The Mechanisms of Article 7 TEU	200
C.	The Need to Address Intermediate Situations.....	201
III.	What are the Conceptual Components of the EU Rule of Law Framework?.....	202
A.	The Objective of the EU Rule of Law Framework.....	202
B.	‘National Rule of Law Safeguards’.....	203
C.	‘Systemic Threat to the Rule of Law’.....	203
D.	‘Rule of Law Crisis’.....	204
E.	The Power of the Commission to Establish the Framework	204
IV.	How Will the EU Rule of Law Framework Function?.....	205
V.	Conclusions	206
12.	Global Activities and Current Initiatives in the Union to Strengthen the Rule of Law—A State of Play.....	207
	<i>Andreas J Kumin</i>	
I.	Introductory Remarks.....	207
II.	Global and Regional Activities.....	208
A.	Global Activities	208
B.	Regional Activities.....	211
III.	Current Initiatives in the European Union.....	212
A.	Problems and Shortcomings.....	212
B.	The Initiative of the Irish Presidency of the Council in 2013	215
C.	The Initiative of ‘Four Member States’.....	216
D.	Approaches by the Other EU Institutions	217
13.	Managing the Rule of Law in a Heterogeneous Context: A Fundamental Rights Perspective on Ways Forward.....	221
	<i>Gabriel N Toggenburg and Jonas Grimheden</i>	
I.	How Much Heterogeneity can European Unity Afford? The Argument for Minimum Constitutional Cohesion	221

II.	How to Look at the Rule of Law Debate? The Argument for a Fundamental Rights Perspective.....	225
III.	How to Ensure a Rights-based Performance? The Argument for Fundamental Rights Indicators	227
IV.	How to Move Beyond Sanctions: The Argument for Leading by Example and Learning from Peers	230
V.	How to Make Fundamental Rights a 'Joined-up' Mission? The Argument for a Bottom-up Approach.....	233
VI.	How to Move the Value Debate from Extreme Scenarios to Day to Day Business? The Argument for a Strategic Framework	234
VII.	Who Does What? Addressing the 'Elephant in the Room' Through a Hybrid Approach with Supranational and Intergovernmental Elements	237

Part V: Institutional Implications of Implementing the Rule of Law in Europe

14.	The EU and Rule of Law—The Unavoidable Question of: Who Controls it?	243
	<i>Gregor Schusterschitz</i>	
I.	Introduction	243
II.	Institutional Power Play in Organisations and in the EU	244
III.	The Prelude to the Rule of Law Mechanism—The Negotiations for the Fundamental Rights Agency	245
A.	The Role of the Agency in the Legislative Procedure	246
B.	Remit of the Agency—Question of National Country Situations.....	246
C.	Role of Council of Europe.....	247
D.	Relevance for Rule of Law Discussion	247
IV.	Institutional Considerations behind the Rule of Law in the EU	247
A.	European Commission	248
B.	European Parliament	249
C.	Council	250
D.	Comparison of the Concepts of the Three Principal EU Organs	252
V.	Conclusion	253
15.	The Rule of Law in European Policy: A Parliamentarian's View	255
	<i>Eva Lichtenberger</i>	
I.	Introduction	255
II.	The Rule of Law in Neighbourhood Policy and External Action	255
A.	Neighbourhood-policy: Western Balkans.....	256
B.	Mexico	256

III.	The Rule of Law Within the Borders of the EU	257
A.	The Need for an Administrative Law for the European Institutions	258
B.	The Case of Hungary: The Article 7 Dilemma	259
C.	The Future of Article 7 TEU	262
16.	The Rule of Law and the Constitutionalisation of the European Union	265
	<i>Monica Claes and Matteo Bonelli</i>	
I.	Introduction	265
II.	Rule of Law, the Concept and the European Union	266
III.	Rule of Law and the Process of the Constitutionalisation of the European Union	269
A.	The Rule of EU Law	270
B.	The Rule of Law at the EU Level	271
C.	The Rule of Law in the Member States	274
IV.	Enforcing the Rule of Law in the EU Member States: the Dilemma	279
V.	The Responsibility to Guarantee the Rule of Law in the Member States: from Institutional Struggle to Institutional Cooperation?	282
VI.	The Way Forward?	288
	<i>Index</i>	<i>291</i>