

Contents

Preface XIII

List of Figures XV

Abbreviations and Acronyms XVI

1 Introduction 1

- 1 Restructuring the Relationships of Criminal Process from a Human Rights Perspective 1
- 2 A Paradoxical Relationship of Criminal Law and Human Rights as a Research Question 6
- 3 Methodological Issues 15
 - 3.1 *The Scope of the Study* 15
 - 3.2 *Methodological Choices* 18
 - 3.2.1 Human Rights Offences 18
 - 3.2.2 The Sources of International Human Rights Law 22
 - 3.3 *Structure of the Book* 27

2 Procedural Obligation in the Multi-layered Structure of Human Rights 29

- 1 *Proceduralisation* of Human Rights 29
- 2 Procedural Obligation within the Structure of Positive Obligations 36
 - 2.1 *Introduction* 36
 - 2.2 *Procedural Obligation as a Democratic Limit in the Application of Criminal-law Mechanisms* 40
 - 2.3 *Reducing the Procedural Obligation from the General Scope of Positive Obligations* 42
- 3 Procedural Obligation and the Right to an Effective Remedy in Human Rights Law 48
 - 3.1 *The Right to a Remedy in Human Rights Law* 48
 - 3.2 *Application of Criminal-law Mechanisms as a Remedy for Breaches of Human Rights* 53
 - 3.2.1 Punishment as Retribution 56
 - 3.2.2 Deterrence through Punishment 59
 - 3.2.3 Punishment and Restorative Justice 61
 - 3.2.4 Criminal-law Remedies and the Right to Truth 65
 - 3.3 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute in the Structure of the Right to a Remedy* 71

- 4 Procedural Obligation as an Inherent Component of Human Rights Norms 73
- 5 Instead of Conclusion: Conceiving the Procedural Obligation within a General Conceptual Framework 78
 - 5.1 *Substantive or Procedural Primacy* 79
 - 5.2 *Procedural Obligation and the Right to a Remedy* 85
 - 5.3 *Procedural Obligation and the Concept of Positive Obligations* 88
- 3 **Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute Human Rights Offences in International Human Rights Law** 92
 - 1 Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute Human Rights Offences in the *Soft Law* Instruments 92
 - 1.1 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute in the UN Instruments* 92
 - 1.1.1 UN Declaration on Torture 92
 - 1.1.2 Basic Principles of Justice for Victims 93
 - 1.1.3 Declaration on Enforced Disappearance 96
 - 1.1.4 Principles on the Investigation of Summary Executions 98
 - 1.1.5 Vienna Declaration 101
 - 1.1.6 Principles on Impunity 102
 - 1.1.7 Victims Rights Guidelines 104
 - 1.2 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute in the COE Instruments* 107
 - 1.2.1 Rec(85)11 on Crime Victims Rights 107
 - 1.2.2 Guidelines on Impunity 108
 - 1.2.3 COE Mechanisms on the Protection from Sexual Exploitation and Abuse 110
 - 1.2.4 COE Mechanisms Related to Domestic Violence 118
 - 1.2.5 COE Mechanisms on the Protection of Victims of Terrorist Acts 120
 - 2 Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute Human Rights Offences in the Mechanisms of *Soft Enforcement* 122
 - 2.1 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute under the ICCPR* 122
 - 2.1.1 Conceptualising the Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute under the ICCPR 122
 - 2.1.2 General Duty to *Effectively* Apply Criminal-Law Mechanisms 124
 - 2.1.3 Particular Instances of the Duty to Investigate and Prosecute 131
 - 2.2 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute under the CAT* 137

- 2.2.1 Duty to Prosecute 143
 - 2.2.2 Duty to Investigate 151
 - 2.2.3 Duty to Redress 157
 - 2.3 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute under the CED* 159
 - 2.3.1 The *ex post* Aspects of Protection: The Right to Truth and the Obligation to Investigate 163
 - 2.3.2 Reparative Aspects: The Right to Access to Justice 165
 - 2.3.3 Repression of Enforced Disappearance 166
 - 3 Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute Human Rights Offences in the Mechanisms of *Direct Impact* 170
 - 3.1 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute under the ACHR* 170
 - 3.1.1 Conceptualising the Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute under the ACHR 170
 - 3.1.2 The State Responsibility in Ensuring Human Rights 173
 - 3.1.3 Duty to Investigate (and Prosecute) and Punish 175
 - 3.1.4 Criminal Investigation and Prosecution as Mechanisms of Reparation 185
 - 3.2 *Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute in the ACHPR System* 189
 - 3.2.1 Conceptualising the Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute under the ACHPR 189
 - 3.2.2 Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute in the African Human Rights Case-Law 192
 - 4 Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute Human Rights Offences in EU Law 197
 - 4.1 *A (Still) Developing Concept of Human Rights Protection within the EU* 197
 - 4.2 *The Victims Directive* 202
 - 4.2.1 Victims' Functional Rights 203
 - 4.2.2 Victims' Participatory Rights 205
 - 4.3 *Specific Areas of Human Rights Protection through the Effective Application of Criminal-Law Mechanisms* 207
 - 5 Conclusion 212
-
- 4 **Obligation to Investigate and Prosecute Human Rights Offences under the ECHR** 217
 - 1 Procedural Obligation under the ECHR 217
 - 2 Article 2 ECHR (Right to Life) and Article 3 ECHR (Prohibition of Torture) 218
 - 2.1 *Applicability of the Procedural Obligation under Article 2 ECHR* 219

	2.1.1	Killings by State Agents	219
	2.1.2	Deaths Related to Wide-Scale Operations of Military and Security Forces	222
	2.1.3	Enforced Disappearances	224
	2.1.4	Deaths in Custody and State Institutions	225
	2.1.5	Suicides	229
	2.1.6	Deaths Caused by Hazards	230
	2.1.7	Road Accidents	232
	2.1.8	Medical Negligence	232
	2.1.9	Killings by Private Parties and Other Suspicious Deaths	234
2.2		<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation under Article 3 ECHR</i>	236
	2.2.1	Ill-Treatment by State Authorities	239
	2.2.2	Private Violence	240
	2.2.3	Negligence	242
2.3		<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation under Articles 2 and 3 ECHR</i>	243
	2.3.1	Appropriate Procedural Avenue	246
	2.3.2	Institution of Proceedings	288
	2.3.3	Requirements of Independence and Impartiality	291
	2.3.4	Public Scrutiny of the Proceedings and Victim Participation	296
	2.3.5	Promptness and Reasonable Expedition of the Proceedings	304
	2.3.6	Procedural Thoroughness: Adequacy or Effectiveness in the Narrow Sense	310
3		Article 4 ECHR (Prohibition of Slavery and Forced Labour)	326
	3.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	326
	3.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	327
4		Article 5 ECHR (Right to Liberty and Security)	330
	4.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	330
	4.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	331
5		Article 8 ECHR (Right to Respect for Private and Family Life)	332
	5.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	332
	5.2	<i>Particular Instances of the Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	333
	5.3	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	336
	5.3.1	The General Approach	336
	5.3.2	Private Prosecution	340
	5.3.3	Procedural Obligation in Cases of Negligence	342
6		Article 9 ECHR (Freedom of Thought, Conscience and Religion)	343

6.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	343
6.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	344
7	Article 10 ECHR (Freedom of Expression)	345
7.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	345
7.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	346
8	Article 11 ECHR (Freedom of Assembly and Association)	347
8.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	347
8.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	348
9	Article 14 ECHR (Prohibition of Discrimination)	348
9.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	348
9.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	352
10	Article 1 of Protocol No. 1 to the ECHR (Protection of Property)	354
10.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	354
10.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	355
11	Conclusion	357
11.1	<i>Applicability of the Procedural Obligation</i>	357
11.1.1	Applicability of Criminal-Law Mechanisms as the Requirement of an Official Investigation	357
11.1.2	The Requirement of an Effective Judicial System	359
11.2	<i>Effectiveness of the Procedural Obligation</i>	360
5	The Concept of Procedural Obligation in Practical Legal Reasoning	364
1	Introduction	364
2	Logical and Conceptual Juridical Construction of the Concept of Procedural Obligation	367
3	Substantive and Criterial Aspect of the <i>Right-Claim</i> to Effective Application of Criminal-Law Mechanisms	380
4	Instead of Conclusion	387
6	Conceptualising Variances: The <i>Right-claim</i> to Effective Application of Criminal-law Mechanisms and the Public Prerogative of Criminal Prosecution	389
1	Prosecutorial Discretion	389
1.1	<i>Introduction</i>	389
1.2	<i>Discretion</i>	392
1.3	<i>Discretion in the Charging Process</i>	398
1.4	<i>Public Interest and the Human Rights Element in the Charging Process</i>	406
1.4.1	Weighing of Human Rights and Public Interest	409
1.4.2	Weighing the Human Rights Element in Prosecutorial Decision-making	414
1.5	<i>Conclusion</i>	418

2	Protection of the Rights of the Accused	421
2.1	<i>Introduction</i>	421
2.2	<i>A Spurious Conflict</i>	426
2.3	<i>Optimisation of the Central Ranges of Protection</i>	434
2.4	<i>Procedural Optimisation in the Context: The Example of</i> <i>ne bis in idem</i>	441
2.4.1	<i>The ne bis in idem Principle in International Human</i> <i>Rights Law</i>	441
2.4.2	<i>Optimising the ne bis in idem Protection and the</i> <i>Right-claim to Effective Application of Criminal-law</i> <i>Mechanisms</i>	453
2.5	<i>Scope of the Intended Procedural Optimisation</i>	458
7	Optimising Variances: Differentiation of the Human Rights Element in the Charging Process	460
1	Introduction	460
2	Two Mechanisms of Procedural Optimisation	463
2.1	<i>The Mechanisms of Procedural Optimisation in National Criminal</i> <i>Justice Systems</i>	464
2.1.1	<i>The Private Prosecution Model</i>	464
2.1.2	<i>The Review Model</i>	472
2.2.	<i>The Two Mechanisms of Procedural Optimisation in International</i> <i>Materials</i>	479
2.3	<i>The Mechanisms of Procedural Optimisation in the ECtHR</i> <i>Case-law</i>	482
2.3.1	<i>The Private Prosecution Model in the ECtHR</i> <i>Case-law</i>	484
2.3.2	<i>The Review Model in the ECtHR Case-law</i>	491
3	Conclusion	499
8	Conclusion	504
	Bibliography	511
	Table of Cases	511
	Table of Statutes	535
	Table of Secondary Sources	538
	Table of International and Comparative Materials	540
	Literature	543
	Index	573