

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments xi

1. Introduction 1
 - A. Summary of the argument 3
 - B. Delineation of the topic: What is personal self-defense? 4
 - I. Self-defense distinguished from other concepts of self-help 4
 - II. Personal self-defense versus interstate self-defense 6
 - C. Methodology and sources 9
 - I. Reliance on universal and regional jurisprudence 9
 - II. Transposition of jurisprudence from other disciplines of international law 11
 - III. Consideration of arguments from domestic jurisprudence 14
2. The Right to Personal Self-Defense as a General Principle of Law 17
 - A. No treaty provisions establish a right to personal self-defense 17
 - B. No recognition under customary international law 18
 - C. General principles according to Article 38(1)(c) of the ICJ Statute 21
 - I. Formation of general principles 22
 - II. Functions of general principles 25
 - D. The right to self-defense as a principle of natural law 27
 - I. Personal self-defense: a shared principle across cultural and religious traditions 30
 - II. Inherent moral justification of self-defense 47
 - E. The right to self-defense as a general principle derived from domestic law 58
 - I. Common classification as a right and justification 59
 - II. Comparable requirements of application 63
 - F. Transposition of the personal self-defense principle into international law 67
 - I. International humanitarian law 68
 - II. International criminal law 70
 - III. The law of the sea 71
 - IV. The law of diplomatic relations 72
 - G. Conclusion: A universally recognized right, but no unlimited license for violence 73

3. A Human Right to Self-Defense? 75
 - A. Positions in the academic literature 76
 - B. Lack of state recognition of a human right to self-defense 78
 - I. No recognition of a human right in international treaties or resolutions 78
 - II. Insufficient national practice supporting a human right 81
 - C. Conceptual differences between the right to self-defense and human rights 84
 - I. Inalienable nature as a commonality 85
 - II. Auxiliary and relational nature of the right to self-defense 85
 - III. No specific aim of curbing state power and abuses 86
 - IV. Neutrality of the right to self-defense on the nature of the state 88
 - D. Conclusion: Right *sui generis*, not human right 89

4. Defensive Force by Law Enforcement Agents 91
 - A. Self-defense as a justified limitation of the rights to life and physical security 92
 - I. Recognition in universal and regional human rights law 93
 - II. Defensive force as a state obligation 100
 - III. Self-defense as the sole peacetime justification of deliberately lethal force 103
 - B. Formal requirement: Sufficient basis for the use of force in domestic law 117
 - I. Minimum specifications 118
 - II. Publicity 121
 - III. Parliamentary prerogative to regulate lethal force 122
 - C. Substantive requirements for self-defense as a ground of justification 124
 - I. Unlawful attack against protected individual interests 124
 - II. Immediacy of defensive action 139
 - III. Necessity of defensive action 143
 - IV. Organizational or precautionary duties 164
 - V. Proportionality of defensive action 170
 - VI. Absolutely prohibited means of self-defense: torture and inhuman treatment 189
 - VII. Defensive intent 197
 - D. Burden of proof and evaluation of evidence 199
 - E. Post-action duties of care, accountability, and remedy 202
 - I. Medical care and psychosocial support 203
 - II. Duty to investigate incidents involving firearms and other force 204
 - III. Duty to prosecute perpetrators of excessive force 210
 - IV. Duties to provide compensation and make amends 213
 - F. Conclusion: A deep, but narrow, justification for the use of force in law enforcement 215

5. Personal Self-Defense in Military-Led Operations 217
 - A. Exceptional relevance of the personal self-defense principle in armed conflict 218
 - I. Riots, violent demonstrations, and opportunistic banditry 221
 - II. Violent prisoners of war and interned fighters 223
 - III. Enforcement of naval blockades and ceasefire lines 224
 - B. Military involvement in peacetime law enforcement 225
 - C. “Naked self-defense”—a conflation of personal and interstate self-defense 230
 - D. Conclusion: Exceptional relevance of personal self-defense in military-led operations 233

6. Human Rights Standards for Self-Defense between Private Persons 235
 - A. Applicability of human rights standards to private self-defense 236
 - B. Duty to recognize a right to self-defense between private persons 239
 - C. Duty to regulate and reasonably circumscribe self-defense between private persons 242
 - I. Unlawful attack on a defensible interest 244
 - II. Immediate defense: An exception for victims of intra-family violence? 247
 - III. Necessity and proportionality 255
 - IV. Absolute prohibition of inhuman treatment 268
 - V. Special requirements regarding private security companies 270
 - D. Duty to investigate and prosecute excessive or unwarranted self-defense 274
 - I. Immunities from prosecution 275
 - II. Burden of proof 276
 - E. No general right to possess firearms and other means of self-defense 278
 - I. Negative impact of gun proliferation on the protection of life and physical security 280
 - II. No enhancement of women’s right to self-defense 284
 - III. No effective means to pre-empt tyranny or atrocities 285
 - IV. The right to self-defense of unarmed citizens 288
 - F. Conclusion: Human rights circumscribe the ambit of private self-defense 289

7. Self-Defense Against the State—Resistance Against Human Rights Violations 293
 - A. Resistance against the state: a history of opposing views 294
 - I. Resistance as a legitimate defense against abusive governments 294
 - II. Unassailable authority based on divine mandate or constitutional supremacy 297
 - III. Rebellion as a threat to order and stability 298
 - IV. Balancing stability and vindication of the right to self-defense 299

- B. Personal self-defense against unlawful individual acts of law enforcement officials 301
 - I. Resistance against extrajudicial killings, torture, and other police brutality 304
 - II. No resistance against arbitrary arrest and detention if judicial remedies available 305
 - III. Force to escape inhuman conditions of detention 307
 - IV. General limits of the right to resist individual human rights violations 308
 - C. Collective self-defense below the threshold of direct participation in armed conflict 312
 - I. Limits based on the right to self-defense 313
 - II. Distinction between civilian defense groups and organized armed groups 314
 - D. Organized armed resistance against denials of the right to self-determination 316
 - I. Legal basis for a right to organized armed resistance 318
 - II. Limits of the right to organized armed resistance 320
 - III. Legal implications of the right to resistance 322
 - IV. No right to rebel against undemocratic governments 323
 - E. Organized armed resistance against mass atrocities 325
 - I. No state recognition of a right of armed resistance against mass atrocities 326
 - II. The case for a right of armed struggle against mass atrocities 332
 - III. Limits of a right to resist mass atrocities 333
 - IV. Legal implications of a right to resist mass atrocities 338
 - V. No justification of unilateral humanitarian interventions 341
 - F. Conclusion: A right to resistance only in exceptional circumstances 343
8. The Right to Personal Self-Defense in a *Rechtsstaat*—Final Reflections 345
- Bibliography 349
- Index 379