

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	v
List of Abbreviations	xv

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Rights and wrongs under the ECHR	1
1.2 Problem definition and research questions	3
1.3 Research structure and methodology	4
1.3.1 The current interpretation of Article 17 ECHR	5
1.3.2 Exploring potential solutions to the current controversies	6
1.3.2.1 Other abuse clauses in human rights law	7
1.3.2.2 The concept of abuse of rights	7
1.3.2.3 The concept of militant democracy	8
1.3.3 Towards a more consistent approach to the interpretation of Article 17 ECHR	9
1.4 Legal research on Article 17 ECHR	10
1.5 Focus on the ECHR	10
1.6 Terminology	11
1.7 Structure of this book	13

CHAPTER 2 THE CREATION OF THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS

2.1 Introduction	15
2.2 First steps by the European Movement	15
2.3 The work of the Consultative Assembly	17
2.4 Final decisions by the Committee of Ministers	20
2.5 The signing of the Convention	20
2.6 Conclusions	21

CHAPTER 3 THE STRASBOURG CASE LAW ON ARTICLE 17 ECHR

3.1	Introduction	23
3.2	The scope of application of Article 17 ECHR	24
3.3	Article 17 ECHR invoked vis-à-vis a State Party	26
3.4	Article 17 ECHR applied vis-à-vis groups and individuals	27
3.4.1	Revisionist speech	28
3.4.1.1	Early Commission cases regarding Holocaust denial	29
3.4.1.2	Garaudy v. France	31
3.4.1.3	Witzsch v. Germany	33
3.4.1.4	Broad interpretation of Article 17 ECHR with regard to Holocaust denial	34
3.4.1.5	The Court's approach to other historical debates	36
3.4.1.6	Perinçek v. Switzerland	40
3.4.1.7	Restrictive application of Article 17 ECHR to other historical debates	42
3.4.2	Promotion of totalitarian ideologies	42
3.4.2.1	Kühnen v. Germany	43
3.4.2.2	Fáber v. Hungary	44
3.4.2.3	Communist ideology	46
3.4.3	Hate speech	48
3.4.3.1	Hate speech excluded from the protection of the Convention	50
3.4.3.2	Hate speech dealt with under the scope of the right to freedom of expression	52
3.4.4	Incitement to violence	56
3.4.5	Challenges to the notion of secularism	59
3.4.6	Paksas v. Lithuania	62
3.5	Conclusions	63

CHAPTER 4 THE INTERPRETATION OF ARTICLE 17 ECHR IN LEGAL DOCTRINE

4.1	Introduction	67
4.2	Different addressees of Article 17 ECHR	67
4.3	The relation between the two norms in Article 17 ECHR	70
4.4	Does Article 17 ECHR impose a positive obligation on states?	71
4.5	The relation between Article 17 ECHR and other provisions in the Convention	73

4.5.1	Which rights are eligible for the application of Article 17 ECHR?	75
4.5.1.1	Rights and freedoms that can be abused	75
4.5.1.2	Rights and freedoms that cannot be abused	79
4.5.2	Derogations in time of emergency	80
4.5.3	The prohibition of an abuse of the right to individual petition	82
4.6	Methods of application of Article 17 ECHR	83
4.6.1	(i) Direct application of Article 17 ECHR	84
4.6.2	(ii) Indirect application of Article 17 ECHR	84
4.6.3	(iii) Article 17 ECHR could have been, but was not applied	86
4.6.4	(iv) The facts in the case were not sufficiently serious for Article 17 ECHR	87
4.7	Criticism of Article 17 ECHR	88
4.7.1	Restrictions in the name of protecting fundamental rights and democracy	88
4.7.2	The inconsistent interpretation of Article 17 ECHR	89
4.7.3	Marginal balancing exercise under the direct application of Article 17 ECHR	91
4.7.4	The broadening of the scope of Article 17 ECHR	94
4.8	Conclusions	95

CHAPTER 5 OTHER ABUSE CLAUSES IN HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

5.1	Introduction	99
5.2	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights	99
5.3	The International Covenants on Human Rights	103
5.3.1	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	105
5.3.1.1	Case law on the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights	106
5.3.2	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	110
5.4	The American Convention on Human Rights	112
5.4.1	Individual petitions under the American Convention on Human Rights	113
5.4.2	Case Law on Article 29(a) American Convention on Human Rights	114
5.5	The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the EU	117
5.5.1	The abuse clause in Article 54 EU Charter	117
5.5.2	Case Law on Article 54 EU Charter	118
5.6	Conclusions	119

CHAPTER 6 THE CONCEPT OF ABUSE OF RIGHTS

6.1	Introduction	121
6.2	The historical background of the prohibition of abuse of rights	122
6.2.1	Josserand: relativity and the social function of rights	123
6.2.2	Criticism of the concept of abuse of rights	126
6.3	The development of the concept of abuse of rights in different legal traditions	129
6.3.1	France as the cradle of the concept	129
6.3.2	Abuse of rights in Germany: reasonableness and fairness in contract law	131
6.3.3	The absence of the concept of abuse of rights in common law	132
6.4	The concept of abuse of rights in public law	134
6.4.1	The prohibition of abuse of rights in public international law	134
6.4.2	The prohibition of abuse of rights in EU Law	135
6.5	Provisional observations on the doctrine of abuse of rights	139
6.6	The prohibition of abuse in human rights law	141
6.7	Conclusions	144

CHAPTER 7 THE CONCEPT OF MILITANT DEMOCRACY

7.1	Introduction	147
7.2	The concept of militant democracy	148
7.3	The introduction of the concept of militant democracy	149
7.4	Militant democracy put into practice	153
7.5	Reflections on the implementation of militant democracy	157
7.5.1	Procedural, substantive, tolerant and militant democracies	157
7.5.1.1	The procedural model of democracy	157
7.5.1.2	The substantive model of democracy	159
7.5.1.3	Tolerant and militant democracies	159
7.5.2	Militant democracy as a linear concept	161
7.5.3	Militant democracy as calculated risk aversion	163
7.5.4	Different paradigms for militant measures	164
7.5.4.1	Militant democracy as anti-extremism	165
7.5.4.2	Militant democracy as banning the former ruling party	166
7.6	Criticism of the concept of a militant democracy	170
7.6.1	Complexities of intolerance and democracy	170
7.6.2	The risk of abusing militant measures	175
7.6.3	Stretching the focus of militant democracy?	177
7.6.3.1	Militant democracy as civic society	180
7.6.3.2	Decline of democracy and human rights protection?	182

7.7	Conclusions	182
CHAPTER 8 THE GERMAN 'WEHRHAFTE DEMOKRATIE'		
8.1	Introduction	185
8.2	The role of Article 17 ECHR in the German legal order	187
8.3	Militant democracy in Germany: <i>die wehrhafte Demokratie</i>	187
8.3.1	The drafting of a militant constitution	188
8.3.2	<i>Wehrhafte Demokratie</i> as adopted by the Federal Constitutional Court	191
8.4	Article 18 Basic Law as an instrument of the <i>wehrhafte Demokratie</i>	194
8.4.1	Whoever abuses	195
8.4.2	Abuse (<i>Missbrauch</i>)	195
8.4.3	The basic rights liable for abuse	197
8.4.4	To combat	199
8.4.5	The free democratic basic order	200
8.4.5.1	The free democratic basic order equals the elements in Article 79(3) Basic Law	201
8.4.5.2	The free democratic basic order as a liberal democracy	202
8.4.6	Forfeiture (<i>Verwirkung</i>)	203
8.4.6.1	Which rights will be forfeited?	203
8.4.6.2	Loss of the right itself or merely a loss of the right to exercise it?	204
8.4.6.3	Is forfeiture a criminal sanction?	207
8.4.7	The procedure of Article 18 Basic Law	208
8.4.8	Additional sanctions based on section 39(2) LFCC	210
8.5	Article 18 Basic Law proceedings before the Federal Constitutional Court	211
8.5.1	The case law on Article 18 Basic Law	212
8.5.2	Common elements	214
8.6	Other ' <i>wehrhafte</i> ' elements in the German legal order	215
8.6.1	The party ban in Article 21(2) BL	216
8.6.2	The prohibition of associations in Article 9(2) BL	217
8.6.3	Non-constitutional militant measures	219
8.6.3.1	The German prohibition of Holocaust denial	219
8.6.3.2	The Irving case	220
8.6.3.3	Holocaust denial under the German Basic Law and the ECHR compared	222
8.7	Conclusions	222

CHAPTER 9 MILITANT DEMOCRACY IN THE CONTEXT OF THE ECHR

9.1	Introduction	225
9.2	The militant interpretation of the European Convention on Human Rights	227
9.2.1	Militant democracy during the early years of the Convention	228
9.2.1.1	National Socialism	229
9.2.1.2	Communism	230
9.2.2	The Convention's militant democracy in the context of democratisation	232
9.2.2.1	Militant democracy as a temporary instrument during transition	233
9.2.2.2	The continued justification of militant measures against neo-Nazis	236
9.2.3	Towards a new militant paradigm?	238
9.3	Balancing the protection of fundamental rights and democracy	241
9.4	The margin of appreciation with regard to militant measures	243
9.5	Conclusions	244

CHAPTER 10 CONCLUSIONS

10.1	Introduction	247
10.2	Background and interpretation of the abuse clause	249
10.3	In search of a clarification of Article 17 ECHR	251
10.3.1	The scholarly interpretation of Article 17 ECHR	251
10.3.2	Abuse clauses in other human rights documents	252
10.3.3	The concept of abuse of rights	254
10.3.4	Article 17 ECHR and the concept of militant democracy	256
10.3.4.1	The concept militant democracy	256
10.3.4.2	The 'wehrhafte Demokratie' in Germany	257
10.3.4.3	Militant democracy and the ECHR	259
10.4	When and how can Article 17 ECHR be applied?	261
	Bibliography	265
	Table of Cases	281
	Samenvatting (Dutch Summary)	287
	Curriculum Vitae	301