

Contents

Conscientious Objection and Human Rights: A Systematic Analysis	1
<i>Grégor Puppinck</i>	
Abstract	1
Keywords	1
Introduction	2
I Conscientious Objection: A Clarification of Concepts	3
1 <i>Conscience</i>	3
a Psychological and Moral Functions of Conscience	3
i <i>Psychological Conscience</i>	3
ii <i>Moral Conscience</i>	4
b The Mechanism of Moral Conscience	5
c Social and Religious Norms are Transcended through the Moral Sense Perceived by Personal Conscience	7
2 <i>Convictions (or Beliefs)</i>	9
3 <i>Forum Internum</i> and <i>Forum Externum</i>	10
a <i>Forum Internum</i>	11
b <i>Forum Externum</i>	12
4 <i>Objection</i>	12
II Conscientious Objection in Positive Law	13
1 <i>Conscientious Objection as a Duty</i>	14
a In international and European Law	14
b In Domestic Law	16
2 <i>Conscientious Objection as a Right</i>	17
a Refusal of Military Service	17
b Refusal of Abortion and of Certain Biotechnologies	24
c Refusal to Swear on the Gospels	27
d Refusal to Attend Religious Education Classes or to Take Part in Religious Activities	27
e Refusal to Reveal and Express One's Beliefs	28
f Refusal to Celebrate the Union of Two Persons of the Same Sex	29
g Refusal to Allow Hunting	29
h Refusal of Vaccination	30
III Evaluation Criteria of Conscientious Objection	31
1 <i>Distinguishing whether the Refusal Comes from a Reasonable Person</i>	32

- 2 *Distinguishing between Positive Manifestation and Negative Expression of Freedom of Conscience* 34
 - a Positive and Negative Manifestations of Freedom of Conscience 34
 - i *Positive Manifestation of Freedom of Conscience (or Positive Freedom)* 34
 - ii *Negative Dimension of Freedom of Conscience (or Negative Freedom)* 35
 - iii *Differences in the Scope of Interference Depending on whether it Aims at a Positive or Negative Manifestation* 36
 - b Consequences of such Distinction 38
- 3 *Distinguishing between "Convictions" and "Personal Conveniences"* 39
 - a Evaluation Criteria for the Quality of Beliefs (of the Motive of the Objection) 40
 - b Evaluation Criteria for the Quality of the Objection 41
 - c Dealing with Personal Convenience and Other Opinions 43
- 4 *Distinguishing between "Moral Objection" and "Religious Objection"* 45
 - a The Distinction between Moral Objection and Religious Objection 46
 - i *Moral Objection* 46
 - ii *Religious Objection* 47
 - iii *Mixed Objections* 48
 - b How to Recognize a Moral Objection (Based on Justice) 49
 - i *The Moral Objection should Aim to Respect what is Just and Good* 49
 - ii *The Commandment Objected to Derogates from a Right or a Basic Principle* 50
 - iii *The Objection is Universalizable* 52
 - iv *The Objection is about an Ethically Sensitive Question* 53
- 5 *Distance between the Object and Motive of the Objection* 53
 - a The Need for a Direct Nexus, and the Doctrine of the Double Effect 54
 - b The Need for a Close Nexus 55
- 6 *The Question of the Relationship with Nature* 56

IV	Rights and Obligations of the State	59
1	<i>Faced with a "Personal Convenience"</i>	59
2	<i>Faced with a Moral Conviction or a Religious Belief</i>	60
a	Faced with a Moral Conviction	60
i	<i>The Objector cannot be Coerced nor Sanctioned</i>	60
ii	<i>It is Incumbent upon the State to Positively Guarantee Respect for this Right by Taking Reasonable and Appropriate Measures</i>	61
b	Faced with a Religious or Philosophical Belief	63
i	<i>Foundation of Respect for a Person whose Objection is Based on a Religious Belief</i>	63
ii	<i>Obligations of Public Authorities in Case of an Objection Based on a Religious Belief</i>	66
	Table of Authorities	71
	Bibliography	74