

CONTENTS

Foreword

Navanethem PILLAY	v
-------------------------	---

From the Editors

William A. SCHABAS	vii
--------------------------	-----

A Critical Introduction Assessment of the UN Human Rights Mechanisms

M. Cherif BASSIOUNI	1
---------------------------	---

PART I.

UN TREATY BODIES – WHAT FUTURE?

Section I. The Place and Role of Human Rights Treaty Bodies in the UN

<i>Institutional System of Protection of Human Rights</i>	15
---	----

Chapter 1. It's Time for a World Court of Human Rights

Manfred NOWAK	17
---------------------	----

I. Introduction	17
II. Human Rights Achievements by the United Nations during the Cold War	18
III. Developments after the End of the Cold War	20
IV. The “Arab Spring” as a New Window of Opportunities	25
V. The Need for a World Court of Human Rights	26
VI. The Swiss Initiative for a UN Agenda for Human Rights	28
VII. The Main Features of the Consolidated Draft Statute for a World Court of Human Rights	29
VIII. Conclusions	32

<i>Section II. Strengthening the UN Treaty Bodies Reporting Process</i>	35
---	----

Chapter 2. Periodic Reporting: The Backbone of the UN Treaty Body Review Procedures

Michael O’FLAHERTY and Pei-Lun TSAI	37
---	----

I. Introduction	37
II. The UN Treaty Bodies Reporting Procedure: An Overview	38

III.	The Impact of the Reporting Procedure	44
IV.	Challenges for the Reporting Procedure.....	45
V.	UPR and the Treaty Body Reporting Procedure.....	47
VI.	Strengthening the Reporting Procedure.....	49
	A. Preparation of States Parties' Reports	50
	B. Interaction of Treaty Bodies with State Parties and Other Stakeholders.....	50
	C. Implementation of Recommendations on the Ground and Follow-Up.....	52
VII.	Perspectives for the Future	53
VIII.	Conclusion.....	56

Section III. Harmonizing the Working Procedures of the UN Treaty Bodies 57

Chapter 3. Streamlining the Constructive Dialogue: Efficiency from States' Perspectives

	Rachael Lorna JOHNSTONE.....	59
I.	Introduction	59
II.	A Proposal for the Operation of a Single Periodic Report and Meeting .	63
	A. Overlap and Repetition	63
	B. Some Remarks on the International Convention for the Protection of All Persons from Enforced Disappearances (ICPPED)	65
	C. Reporting to a Single Periodic Meeting.....	70
	D. Managing a Single Periodic Meeting.....	79
	E. Consolidated Concluding Observations.....	84
	F. Staffing	86
III.	An Itinerant Treaty Body	86
	A. Organization of Regular Regional Meetings	87
	B. Advantages of Regional Meetings	88
	C. Difficulties of Regional Meetings	89
IV.	Distance Meetings	90
V.	Concluding Comments	92

Section IV. Enhancing the Implementation of UN Treaty Bodies'

Recommendations and Views..... 95

Chapter 4. On the Binding Nature of the Findings of the Treaty Bodies

	William A. SCHABAS.....	97
--	-------------------------	----

Chapter 5. Implementing Treaty Body Recommendations: Establishing Better Follow-Up Procedures

Felice D. GAER	107
I. Treaty Body Powers: From Receiving Reports to Active Implementation?	107
II. Treaty Reform: Procedure or Substance?	108
A. UN Criticisms	108
B. Criticisms of Effectiveness of Treaty Bodies	109
C. Authoritativeness of Treaty Body Oversight	111
III. Follow-Up Procedures	114
A. What the Follow-Up Achieves	117
B. Follow-Up Should Identify and Follow Essential Issues	118

Chapter 6. Accessing Justice by All Means: Individual Communications before UN Treaty Bodies – A Case Study of CERD

Chris Maina PETER	123
I. Introduction	123
II. Combating Racism Seriously	124
III. Committee on Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (CERD)	125
A. Establishment and Mandate	125
B. State Reports before CERD	126
C. Individual Complaints Procedure	128
D. Other Activities of CERD	129
IV. Lack of Awareness on the Existence of ICERD and CERD	130
V. Possible Contribution to the Work of CERD by Other Institutions ...	130
A. The Civil Society Actors at International and National Levels ...	131
B. Academic and Higher Education Institutions	132
VI. Conclusion	133
VII. Selected References	134

Chapter 7. The Complementary Role of General Comments in Enhancing the Implementation of Treaty Bodies' Recommendations and Views (the Example of CESCR)

Aslan ABASHIDZE	137
I. The <i>sui generis</i> Nature of CESCR	137
II. Increasing the Use of General Comments as a Tool for Enhancing the Implementation of Treaty Bodies' Recommendations and Views ..	139
A. Objectives of the Reporting Process	140
B. Nature of the Legal Obligations Undertaken by States Parties ...	142

C.	Ways of Domestic Implementation of Treaty Obligations	144
D.	Issues not Directly Reflected in Existing Treaties (the Cases of the Rights of Persons with Disabilities and the Rights of the Elderly Persons).	145
III.	Conclusions	147

<i>Section V. Strengthening the Representativeness of Treaty Body Membership.</i>	149
---	-----

Chapter 8. Universal Suffrage and the International Human Rights Treaty Bodies: Where are the Women? Alice EDWARDS	151
I. Introduction	151
II. Where are the Women? The Treaty Body Record on Women’s Representation and Participation	152
III. Why the Absence of Women? Feminist Explanations for the Absence of Women in Decision-Making Roles and Why Their Representation and Participation is Crucial	154
A. Equal Representation as a Human Right.	156
B. Equal Representation, Democracy and Universality.	158
C. Feminist ‘Dissent’ and Women’s Impact on Decision-Making.	158
D. Female Decision-Makers as Role Models	163
IV. How Can More Women Be Elected to the Treaty Bodies? How Can We Achieve Parity in Committee Membership?	164
A. The International Criminal Court	164
B. The European Court of Human Rights	165
C. Lessons for the Treaty Bodies and Ways Forward.	167
V. Conclusion.	170

<i>Section VI. Strengthening the Role of Stakeholders (Civil Society)</i>	171
---	-----

Chapter 9. Taking Human Rights from the Grassroots to Geneva... and Back: Strengthening the Relationship between UN Treaty Bodies and NGOs Philip LYNCH and Ben SCHOKMAN.	173
I. Introduction	173
II. Some Principles to Guide Treaty Body Strengthening from an NGO Perspective.	177
III. Cross-Cutting Recommendations and Reforms	180
A. Awareness and Visibility	180
B. Accessibility	182

C.	Protection of Human Rights Defenders and Prevention of Reprisals	184
D.	Impact and Utility of Recommendations and Remedies	185
E.	Implementation and Follow-Up	186
1.	Domestic Implementation and Follow-Up	186
2.	International Follow-Up	187
IV.	Recommendations on General Comments and Individual Communications	189
A.	General Comments	189
B.	Individual Communications	190
V.	Conclusion	192
Chapter 10. Strengthening of the UN Treaty Bodies' Complaint Procedures: Elements for a Reform Agenda from an NGO Perspective		
Gabriela KLETZEL, Camila BARRETTO MAIA and Mónica ZWAIG		193
I.	Foreword	193
II.	Towards a Victim-Centered Approach	197
A.	Ensuring Full Accessibility	199
B.	The Need to Clarify the Admissibility Criteria	202
C.	Enhancing Interaction	205
III.	Ensuring Effective Redress	209
A.	Improve the Quality of the Decisions: Identify Specific and Comprehensive Remedies	210
B.	The Utmost Relevance of Devising Remedies Meant as Guarantees of Non-Recurrence	213
C.	Friendly Settlements	220
IV.	The Need for a Comprehensive and Effective Follow-Up System	223
A.	Current Features	225
B.	Enhancing the Effectiveness of Follow-Up Procedures	228
1.	Institutionalize a Comprehensive Involvement of the Victim and the Participation of Civil Society at the Follow-Up Stage.	228
2.	Develop a Comprehensive Database on Follow-Up to Views – Carry out Periodic Assessments	230
3.	Develop Reporting Guidelines for Follow-Up	231
4.	Assess State Parties' Institutional Mechanisms for Implementation	232
C.	The Development of Adequate Enforcement Mechanisms at the National Level	232
1.	Intergovernmental Coordination	234
2.	National Focal Point	234
3.	A Roadmap for Implementation	234
V.	Final Remarks	235

PART II.

THE UN HUMAN RIGHTS COUNCIL AT A TURNING POINT

Section I. Strengthening Working Procedures of the UN Human Rights Council..... 239

Chapter 1. Building a Universal System for the Protection of Human Rights: The Way Forward
 Olivier DE FROUVILLE..... 241

I. Change or Continuity: Has the Establishment of the Council Really Changed Anything in the Universal System of Human Rights Protection?..... 243
 A. Negative Elements..... 245
 B. Positive Elements..... 245
 C. Developing Trends 248
 II. Is the UPR of Real Added Value to the System? 250
 III. Why the Council does not Represent a Real Progress for the Universal Human Rights Protection System 255
 IV. Towards Progress: How Could the System for the Protection of Human Rights Evolve in the Future? 261

Chapter 2. Making the Connection: Security and Human Rights
 Elvira DOMÍNGUEZ-REDONDO 267

I. Introduction 267
 II. Using International Humanitarian Law to Monitor States 268
 III. Subsidiary Bodies' and Armed Conflict Scenarios 271
 IV. Bridging the Gap Between the UN Commission on Human Rights and the Security Council 274
 A. Carlsson, the Fall of Srebrenica and Brahimi Reports 274
 B. Mainstreaming Human Rights – 1997 UN Reform 276
 C. Engaging the Security Council with the Commission on Human Rights 277
 V. The Human Rights Council's New Tools to Address Armed Conflict and Insecurity 282
 A. Proliferation of Special Sessions 283
 B. Universal Periodic Review..... 284
 C. Responsibility to Protect and Reforming the Security Council ... 285
 D. Peacebuilding Commission..... 287
 VI. Conclusions and Some Reflections on the Way Forward..... 288

<i>Section II. The Work of the UN Human Rights Council Through International Commissions of Investigation of Violations of International Human Rights Law.</i>	291
 Chapter 3. The Work of the International Commission of Inquiry for Libya Philippe KIRSCH	293
I. Events in Libya	295
A. Demonstrations and Repression.	296
B. Armed Conflict	297
II. The Commission's Approach	297
III. First Phase (April–June 2011)	299
A. The First Field Mission	299
B. Challenges	300
C. Legal Framework.	302
D. Findings	305
1. Violations of Human Rights Law	305
2. Violations of International Humanitarian Law	306
3. Outstanding Issues	307
E. End of the First Phase.	310
IV. Second Phase (from June 2011 on).	312
A. Changing Circumstances.	312
B. Challenges and Prospects	315
 Chapter 4. What Should Be the UN Human Rights Council's Role in Investigating Genocide, War Crimes and Crimes Against Humanity? Lyal S. SUNGA.	319
I. Aim of the Present Inquiry	319
II. How the International Community's Responses to the Crises in the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda have Reoriented UN Human Rights Investigations	322
A. UN Human Rights Investigations Prior to the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda Situations.	322
B. Investigations in the Former Yugoslavia and Rwanda	326
III. Post-Yugoslavia and Rwanda UN Human Rights Investigations into Situations Possibly Involving Genocide, War Crimes or Crimes Against Humanity	330
A. Darfur	330
B. Israeli Occupied Palestinian Territories	333
C. Côte d'Ivoire	335
D. Libya	338
E. Syria.	341

IV.	The Complementary Roles of UN Human Rights Investigation and International Criminal Investigation	342
V.	Practical Recommendations	346
	A. Prevention and Early Warning	347
	B. Appropriate Channels for Investigative Response	347
	C. Tightening Up of Inquiry Procedures	348
	D. Training in Fact-Finding and Investigations	348
	E. Training of Criminal Prosecutors and Investigators	349
	F. Training of Peacekeepers	349
	G. Lessons Learned and Best Practices	349

	<i>Section III. The Added Value of the Mechanism of the Universal Periodic Review of the Human Rights Council</i>	351
--	---	-----

Chapter 5. Peer Review in the Mix: How the UPR Transforms Human Rights Discourse

	Constance DE LA VEGA and Tamara N. LEWIS	353
I.	A New Instrument for the New Millennium	353
	A. Introduction	353
	B. Chapter Outline	357
II.	The Mission of the UPR	357
	A. Founding Resolutions	357
	B. Standards for the Review	359
	C. Periodicity and Phases of the Review	359
	1. Pre-Review	360
	2. Review and Interactive Dialogue	360
	3. Adoption of the Final Outcome	361
	D. Implementation	362
III.	Peer Review: Accountability in Governance Through Multilateral Surveillance and Peer Pressure	363
	A. Peer Review's Role in National Policy-Making	364
	1. OECD and EU: Examples of Peer Review Used for Policy Diffusion/Convergence	364
	2. UPR Success Measured Through its Influence on National Human Rights Policy	366
IV.	The First Cycle of the UPR: Accountability for Human Rights Obligations	367
	A. Data Gathering	368
	B. National Consultations	369
	C. Constructive Final Recommendations	371

1.	Wording of Recommendations has Become More Specific . . .	371
2.	The Recommendations Reinforce Treaty Body and Special Procedures	372
3.	Wide Breadth of the Subject Matter Covered by Recommendations	374
D.	Transparency	376
V.	Improving the Universal Periodic Review	377
A.	Three Recommendations for Improving the UPR	377
1.	Reconsider the Roles of the Secretariat and the Troika	378
a.	OHCHR Secretariat as Theme and Agenda Setter	378
b.	The Troika as the Review Facilitators	379
2.	Theme-Related, Time-Specific Recommendations	380
a.	Limiting the Number of Recommendations	380
b.	Time-Specificity	383
3.	Establish the Modalities for a Formal Follow-Up Procedure . .	383
VI.	Conclusion	384

<i>Section IV. Enhancing the Work of the Special Procedures of the Human Rights Council</i>	<i>387</i>
---	------------

Chapter 6. The System of the UN Special Procedures: Some Proposals for Change

Ingrid NIFOSI-SUTTON	389	
I.	Introduction	389
II.	The UN SPs: Main Characteristics	390
III.	The Subject Matter of Thematic Mandates	390
A.	Thematic Mandates and Implementation	391
IV.	The Subject Matter of Country Mandates	397
A.	Implementation of Country Mandates	397
V.	The SPs and the Universal Periodic Review	399
VI.	The Review of the Human Rights Council	400
VII.	Coordination Among the SPs	402
VIII.	The SPs and Treaty Bodies	405
IX.	The Strengths and Flaws of the SPs	406
X.	Conclusions and Recommendations	413
A.	The Conceptual Framework of the SPs	413
B.	The Structure of the System of the SPs	414
C.	The Effectiveness of the SPs	415
D.	Management	417
E.	Contribution to the Work of Treaty Bodies	417

Chapter 7. The Unfinished Business of a Special Procedures System	
Tania BALDWIN-PASK and Patrizia SCANNELLA	419
I. Summary	419
II. Introduction: Special Procedures – A Cornerstone of Human Rights Protection.	420
III. Rationalization, Duplication and “Filling The Gaps”	424
A. Rationalizing, Reviewing and Improving the Mandates	425
B. Minding the Gaps	427
C. Conclusion	428
IV. Dealing with the Challenge of Uncoordinated Proliferation and Gaps in Coverage	430
A. Criteria to Guide the Creation of New Thematic Mandates.	430
B. Gaps in Country Scrutiny	432
C. The Creation of Country Mandates	432
D. Duration of Country Mandates	435
E. Conclusion	437
V. Early Warning, Emergency Response and the Special Procedures	437
A. Conclusion	439
VI. The Principle of Cooperation	440
A. Standing Invitations – Mask or Measure of Cooperation?	442
B. Urgent Appeals and Communications	444
C. Conclusion	445
VII. The Paramount Importance of Follow-Up	446
A. Follow-Up to Communications	446
B. Follow-Up to Country Visits	447
C. Follow-Up at the Political Level	449
D. Conclusion	452
VIII. Appointment of Mandate-Holders	452
A. Broadening the Pool of Candidates	459
B. Dealing with Unexpected Vacancies and Appointment of Country Mandates	461
IX. Of Codes and Conduct	463
A. Conclusion	470
X. The Resources Gap	470
A. Transparency of Funding.	474
B. Determining Requirements and Allocations	476
XI. Conclusion	478
<i>List of Contributors</i>	479