

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Preface	v
Note on the citation of Strasbourg cases	xix
List of European Court of Human Rights and European Commission of Human Rights cases	xxi
Numerical list of Unnamed European Commission of Human Rights cases	lxvi
List of National Court cases	lxvii
List of International Court of Justice cases	lxviii
List of UN Human Rights Committee cases	lxviii
List of European Court of Justice cases	lxix
List of European Committee of Social Rights cases	lxix
List of I-ACtHR cases	lxix

---

## PART I THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS IN CONTEXT

1 THE EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS IN CONTEXT	3
1 Background	3
2 The Substantive Guarantee	5
3 The Strasbourg Enforcement Machinery	6
4 The Interpretation of the Convention	7
5 Negative and Positive Obligations and <i>Drittwirkung</i>	21
6 Reservations	24
7 The Convention in National Law	26
8 The Convention and the European Union	31
9 Achievements and Prospects	34

---

## PART II ENFORCEMENT MACHINERY

2 ADMISSIBILITY OF APPLICATIONS	43
1 The General Approach to Admissibility	43
2 Application of Admissibility Requirements to Inter-state Cases	45
3 Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies	47
4 The Six-month Rule	61
5 No Significant Disadvantage (Article 35(3))	67
6 Other Grounds of Inadmissibility	72
7 Incompatibility and the Competence of the Court	81

<b>3 THE EUROPEAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS: ORGANIZATION, PRACTICE, AND PROCEDURE</b>	<b>103</b>
1 The Organization of the Court	103
2 Procedure before the Court (I): From the Initial Application to Judgment	113
3 Procedure before the Court (II): Additional Procedural Matters	136
4 Article 41: Just Satisfaction	155
5 Article 46	162
6 Protocol 14	165
7 Reform of the Court	166
8 The Future	176
<b>4 THE EXECUTION OF THE COURT'S JUDGMENTS</b>	<b>180</b>
1 The Role of the Committee of Ministers	181
2 Procedure	181
3 The Court and Execution of its Judgments	191
4 The Parliamentary Assembly and Execution of Judgments	194
5 Protocol 14	196
6 Conclusion	198

---

### PART III THE RIGHTS GUARANTEED

<b>5 ARTICLE 2: THE RIGHT TO LIFE</b>	<b>203</b>
1 The Obligation to Protect the Right to Life by Law	203
2 Preventive Action	207
3 Health Care and Other Social Services	212
4 The Procedural Obligation to Investigate	214
5 Application of the Obligation to Protect Life to Non-fatal Cases	218
6 Protection of the Unborn Child	219
7 The Prohibition of the Taking of Life by the Use of Force	221
8 Conclusion	233
<b>6 ARTICLE 3: FREEDOM FROM TORTURE OR INHUMAN OR DEGRADING TREATMENT OR PUNISHMENT</b>	<b>235</b>
1 Introduction	235
2 Torture	238
3 Inhuman Treatment	241
4 Inhuman Punishment	259
5 Degrading Treatment	261
6 Degrading Punishment	271
7 The Obligation to Protect Individuals from Proscribed Ill-Treatment	274
8 Conclusion	277

7	ARTICLE 4: FREEDOM FROM SLAVERY, SERVITUDE, OR FORCED OR COMPULSORY LABOUR	279
1	Freedom from Slavery and Servitude	279
2	Freedom from Forced or Compulsory Labour	280
3	Human Trafficking	284
4	Positive Obligations	284
5	Deportation or Extradition to Another State	286
6	Conclusion	286
8	ARTICLE 5: THE RIGHT TO LIBERTY AND SECURITY OF THE PERSON	287
1	Article 5: Generally	288
2	The Meaning of Arrest or Detention (ie Loss of 'Liberty')	289
3	Loss of Liberty: Further Issues	297
4	Overarching Principles: 'Lawfulness' of Detention and Protection from Arbitrary Detention	301
5	Article 5(1)(a)-(f): Grounds for Detention	306
6	Article 5(2): Reasons for Arrest to be Given Promptly	334
7	Article 5(3): Accountability during Pre-trial Detention and Trial within a Reasonable Time	338
8	Article 5(4): Remedy to Challenge the Legality of Detention	352
9	Article 5(5): Right to Compensation for Illegal Detention	366
10	Conclusion	368
9	ARTICLE 6: THE RIGHT TO A FAIR TRIAL	370
1	Article 6: Generally	370
2	Field of Application	373
3	Article 6(1): Guarantees in Criminal and Non-criminal Cases	398
4	Article 6(2): The Right to be Presumed Innocent in Criminal Cases	460
5	Article 6(3): Further Guarantees in Criminal Cases	467
6	Conclusion	491
10	ARTICLE 7: FREEDOM FROM RETROACTIVE CRIMINAL OFFENCES AND PUNISHMENT	493
1	<i>Ex Post Facto</i> Criminal Offences	494
2	<i>Ex Post Facto</i> Criminal Penalties	499
3	General Principles of Law Exception	501
11	ARTICLES 8-11: GENERAL CONSIDERATIONS	503
1	Introduction	503
2	Negative and Positive Obligations	504
3	Limitations	505
4	Conclusion	521

12	ARTICLE 8: THE RIGHT TO RESPECT FOR PRIVATE AND FAMILY LIFE, HOME, AND CORRESPONDENCE	522
1	Introduction	522
2	The Four Interests Protected by Article 8(1)	524
3	Negative, Positive, and Procedural Obligations	531
4	Subject Areas	536
5	Conclusion	590
13	ARTICLE 9: FREEDOM OF THOUGHT, CONSCIENCE, AND RELIGION	592
1	The Scope of Article 9	592
2	Freedom of Thought, Conscience, and Religion: The Right to Believe	594
3	Freedom of Thought, Conscience, and Religion: The Individual, the Group, and the State	597
4	Manifesting Religion or Belief in Worship, Teaching, Practice, and Observance	602
5	Justifiable Interferences	605
6	Conclusion	611
14	ARTICLE 10: FREEDOM OF EXPRESSION	613
1	Introduction	613
2	The Scope of Protection	614
3	Different Categories of Expression	629
4	Different Means of Expression	639
5	Prescribed by Law	649
6	Legitimate Aims	652
7	Duties and Responsibilities under Article 10(2)	683
8	Distinct Methodologies and Principles Developed to Examine Issues of Defamation	691
9	Conclusion	707
15	ARTICLE 11: FREEDOM OF ASSEMBLY AND ASSOCIATION	710
1	Introduction	710
2	Freedom of Peaceful Assembly	711
3	Freedom of Association	724
4	Freedom to Form and Join Trade Unions	740
5	Restrictions on Public Service Employees	750
6	Conclusion	752
16	ARTICLE 12: THE RIGHT TO MARRY AND TO FOUND A FAMILY	754
1	Introduction	754
2	The Right to Marry	755

3	The Right to Found a Family	760
4	Non-married Persons	762
5	Conclusion	762
17	<b>ARTICLE 13: THE RIGHT TO AN EFFECTIVE NATIONAL REMEDY</b>	764
1	Introduction	764
2	Article 13 within the General Scheme of the Convention	765
3	Article 13: General Principles/Requirements of an 'Effective Remedy'	768
4	Article 13: General Principles/Requirements in Specific Contexts	774
5	Conclusion	782
18	<b>ARTICLE 14 (FREEDOM FROM DISCRIMINATION IN RESPECT OF PROTECTED CONVENTION RIGHTS) AND PROTOCOL 12 (NON-DISCRIMINATION IN RESPECT OF 'ANY RIGHT SET FORTH BY LAW')</b>	783
1	Introduction	783
2	Overview of the Application of Article 14	785
3	Protection for Guaranteed Rights Only and the Ambit Test	786
4	Differential Treatment on a Prohibited Ground	788
5	Differential Treatment May Be Justified on Objective and Reasonable Grounds	792
6	Intensive Scrutiny of Differential Treatment for 'Suspect Categories'	796
7	Article 14, the Burden of Proof and the Protection of Minorities	809
8	Article 14 and Violence Motivated by Discrimination	811
9	Indirect Discrimination	815
10	Positive Obligations to Protect against Discrimination and Reverse Discrimination	817
11	Protocol 12	819
12	Conclusion	821
19	<b>ARTICLE 15: DEROGATION IN TIME OF WAR OR OTHER PUBLIC EMERGENCY THREATENING THE LIFE OF THE NATION</b>	823
1	Introduction	823
2	The Need to Resort to Article 15 (Some Comments on the Court's General Approach to 'Terrorism Cases')	825
3	The General Pattern of Article 15	829
4	'In Time of War or Other Public Emergency Threatening the Life of the Nation'	829
5	'Measures ... to the Extent Strictly Required by the Exigencies of the Situation ...'	837
6	Other International Law Obligations	843
7	Article 15(2): The Non-derogable Provisions	844
8	Article 15(3): The Procedural Requirements	846

9	Proposals for Reform	847
10	Conclusion	848
20	<b>ARTICLES 16-18: OTHER RESTRICTIONS UPON THE RIGHTS PROTECTED</b>	851
1	Article 16: Restrictions on the Political Rights of Aliens	851
2	Article 17: Restrictions on Activities Subversive of Convention Rights	852
3	Article 18: Prohibition of the Use of Restrictions for an Improper Purpose	857
4	Conclusion	861
21	<b>ARTICLE 1, FIRST PROTOCOL: THE RIGHT TO PROPERTY</b>	862
1	Introduction	862
2	The Structure of Article 1, First Protocol, and the Inter-relationship of its Provisions	872
3	Article 1/1/1: Interference with the Peaceful Enjoyment of Possessions	880
4	Article 1/1/2: Deprivation of Property	885
5	Article 1/2: Control of Use	895
6	Conclusion	903
22	<b>ARTICLE 2, FIRST PROTOCOL: THE RIGHT TO EDUCATION</b>	906
1	Introduction	906
2	No Denial of the Right to Education	909
3	Respect for Parents' Religious and Philosophical Convictions	912
4	Discrimination and Minority Rights	916
5	Conclusion	918
23	<b>ARTICLE 3, FIRST PROTOCOL: THE RIGHT TO FREE ELECTIONS</b>	920
1	Introduction	920
2	General Principles Governing Article 3, First Protocol Jurisprudence	921
3	The Scope of Electoral Rights: Legislative and Other Elections	924
4	The Right to Vote	926
5	The Right to Stand for Election	933
6	Election Administration and Post-Electoral Rights	943
7	Electoral Systems	946
8	Media Reporting of Election Campaigns	949
9	Conclusion	950
24	<b>THE FOURTH, SIXTH, SEVENTH, AND THIRTEENTH PROTOCOLS</b>	952
1	Article 1, Fourth Protocol: Freedom from Imprisonment for Non-fulfilment of a Contractual Obligation	952

2	Article 2, Fourth Protocol: Freedom of Movement within a State and Freedom to Leave its Territory	953
3	Article 3, Fourth Protocol: The Right of a National not to be Expelled from and to Enter a State's Territory	959
4	Article 4, Fourth Protocol: Freedom of Aliens from Collective Expulsion	960
5	The Sixth and Thirteenth Protocols: The Death Penalty	963
6	Article 1, Seventh Protocol: Freedom from Expulsion of Individual Aliens	965
7	Article 2, Seventh Protocol: The Right to Review in Criminal Cases	966
8	Article 3, Seventh Protocol: Right to Compensation for Miscarriages of Justice	968
9	Article 4, Seventh Protocol: <i>Ne Bis In Idem</i>	969
10	Article 5, Seventh Protocol: Equality of Rights of Spouses	974
	<i>Index</i>	977

In 1996, the Series A volumes, which were for individual cases, were replaced by annual volumes of the *Reports of Judgments and Decisions*, containing Court judgments, or extracts from them, plus some decisions as to admissibility or extracts from them. Most of the Court's judgments and most decisions as to admissibility are not published in the official reports, but are accessible in HUDOC (see below).

From 1996 to 1998 these official reports covered both the Commission and the Court; from 1999 they cover only the Court, following the demise of the Commission. The annual volumes are published in separate parts. The judgments and decisions are published in English and French. Citations indicate the volume and part, but not the page number within the volume, for example, *Khan v UK 2000-V*. There is no equivalent to the Series B reports.

Of great importance is the Court's HUDOC database, to be found on the Council of Europe website: <http://www.echr.coe.int/echr/>. HUDOC has all the recent Court judgments and admissibility decisions, whether they are printed later in the official reports or not. Judgments in HUDOC are cited as follows: *Ploski v Poland hudoc (2002)*. Decisions as to admissibility are cited as follows: *Gonzalez v Spain No 43544/98 hudoc (1999) DA*. DA is added to assist in finding the case in HUDOC. HUDOC judgments are in English and French or, in the case of less important cases, English or French.

Some report series are specific to the former European Commission of Human Rights:

#### *Collection of Decisions of the European Commission of Human Rights*

This series (volumes 1–46, 1959–1974) was published by the Council of Europe in English and French. These are cited as follows: *X v Norway No 867/60 6 CD 24 1961*.

#### *Decisions and Reports of the European Commission of Human Rights*

This series (volumes 1–94, 1975–1998) was published by the Council of Europe. It contains in English and French selected Commission decisions as to admissibility; Commission friendly settlement reports; and Commission reports on the merits under the former Article 31 of the Convention when the case was not referred to the Court. In the case of an Article 31 report, the Committee of Ministers resolution is also printed. As of volume 76, the volumes are published as volumes 76-A and 76-B, etc, with volume A containing the original language of the decision, etc, and volume B containing the translation.