

Contents

Introduction	1
<i>Petr Agha</i>	
1. Universalism and Relativism in the Protection of Human Rights in Europe: Politics, Law and Culture	17
<i>Steven Greer</i>	
I. Introduction	17
II. The Relative Universality of Human Rights	18
III. Human Rights, Multiculturalism and Minority Rights	21
IV. The Margin of Appreciation Doctrine under the ECHR.....	27
V. Culture and the Margin of Appreciation	31
VI. Conclusion.....	34
2. On the Varieties of Universalism in Human Rights Discourse	37
<i>Ben Golder</i>	
I. Introduction: Europe, Human Rights and the Universal.....	37
II. Modernist Universalism and its Critics.....	41
III. The Limits of Particularism and the Returns of the Universal	44
IV. Human Rights and Hegemonic Universalism	49
V. Concluding Thoughts	53
3. When Human Rights Clash in ‘the Age of Subsidiarity’: What Role for the Margin of Appreciation?	55
<i>Stijn Smet</i>	
I. Introduction	55
II. Setting the Scene: Preliminary Remarks on the Margin of Appreciation and Subsidiarity	57
III. The Court, the Margin of Appreciation and Human Rights Clashes.....	59
IV. The Court and the ‘Clashing Rights’ Principle	61
A. The ‘Clashing Rights’ Principle is Inconsistent with its Own Historical Origins	62
B. The ‘Clashing Rights’ Principle Does Not Cohere with the Court’s Wider Case Law	63
V. A Reinterpreted Role for the Margin of Appreciation in Human Rights Clashes	65
VI. Conclusion.....	69

4. The Margin of Appreciation as an Underenforcement Doctrine	71
<i>Dimitrios Tsarapatsanis</i>	
I. Introduction.....	71
II. Underenforcement, Institutional Considerations and the MoA	74
III. Explaining the Underenforcement of Convention Rights: Resource-Bounded Enforcement of the ECHR.....	78
IV. Justifying the Underenforcement of Convention Rights: Normative Institutional Considerations	84
A. Shared Responsibility	84
B. Subsidiarity.....	86
C. Legitimacy	87
5. Anything to Appreciate?: A Sociological View of the Margin of Rights and the Persuasive Force of Their Doctrines	89
<i>Jiří Přibáň</i>	
I. Introductory Remarks	89
II. Jurisprudential Triviality of the Margin of Appreciation Doctrine: General Remarks.....	90
III. The Council of Europe between the Universality of Rights and the Particularity of Cultures.....	92
IV. The Semantics of Rights in Politics, Law and Public Morality: From Normative Philosophies to the Social Systems Theory of Rights	93
V. Human Rights, Their Evolution and Paradoxes: A Sociological Perspective	97
VI. Human Rights as Power Constellations.....	99
VII. The Force and Limits of Legal Doctrine.....	101
VIII. Anything But Discretionary Power?	104
IX. From Different Reasons to the Reasonable Differences in the Margin of Appreciation of Doctrine	106
X. Concluding Remarks: Human Rights, Functional Differentiation and the Impossibility of Justice	109
6. The Prisoner's Dilemma: The Margin of Appreciation as Proportionality or Recognition?	111
<i>Marco Goldoni and Pablo Marshall</i>	
I. Introduction.....	111
II. Two Versions of the Margin of Appreciation	112
III. The European Saga of Prisoners' Voting Rights	114
A. Preliminaries	114
B. The <i>Hirst</i> Case	115
IV. Framing the Issue: Legal or Political Constitutionalism?	119

V.	The MoA and Proportionality Review: Trivialising the Right to Vote.....	122
VI.	Reasoning on the Right to Vote.....	126
7.	Social Sensitivity, Consensus and the Margin of Appreciation	129
	<i>Nicholas Bamforth</i>	
I.	Approaches to the Margin of Appreciation	130
II.	Sexuality and Same-Sex Partnerships	133
III.	Morally Contentious Expression.....	140
IV.	Conclusion	144
8.	Religious Rights and the Margin of Appreciation.....	145
	<i>Dominic McGoldrick</i>	
I.	Introduction	145
II.	The Place of Religion in the ECHR.....	146
III.	Religion and Human Rights	146
IV.	The Jurisprudence of the ECtHR on Religious Rights.....	149
V.	The MoA in Religious Cases.....	152
A.	The Role of Consensus in Determining the MoA	152
B.	Critiques of the Application of the MoA in Religious Rights Cases.....	154
C.	The Wide MoA and the 'Fair Balance' in Religion Cases	154
VI.	Case Study: <i>Fernandez Martinez v Spain</i>	158
VII.	Concluding Comments.....	166
9.	The Paradox of Human Rights and the Role of the European Court of Human Rights in Keeping it Alive	169
	<i>Petr Agha</i>	
I.	Preliminary Remarks	169
II.	Human Rights as a Means, Not as an End.....	172
III.	Human Rights as a Self-authored Normative Framework.....	176
IV.	Conclusions	182
	<i>Index</i>	<i>185</i>