

# Contents

<b>1</b>	<b>The Problem of Judicial Independence</b> . . . . .	<b>1</b>
1.1	Introduction . . . . .	1
1.2	Legal Scholarship . . . . .	3
1.2.1	Introduction . . . . .	3
1.2.2	Universal Scholars . . . . .	3
1.2.3	Contextual Scholars . . . . .	6
1.2.4	Implications for the Study . . . . .	9
1.3	Judicial Reformers . . . . .	9
1.3.1	Introduction . . . . .	9
1.3.2	Development Banks and Donor Agencies . . . . .	10
1.3.3	Human Rights Advocates . . . . .	21
1.4	Theoretical Frameworks . . . . .	27
1.4.1	Introduction . . . . .	27
1.4.2	The Universal Theory . . . . .	27
1.4.3	The Pragmatic and Context-Sensitive Theory . . . . .	30
1.5	Case Study in Brief: Judicial Independence in England . . . . .	33
1.5.1	Introduction . . . . .	33
1.5.2	Focus . . . . .	33
1.5.3	Rationale . . . . .	35
1.5.4	Conventions . . . . .	35
1.5.5	Expansion . . . . .	36
1.5.6	Limitations . . . . .	38
1.5.7	Summary . . . . .	40
1.6	Methodology of the Study . . . . .	40
	References . . . . .	43
<b>2</b>	<b>Judicial Independence in Malaysia</b> . . . . .	<b>47</b>
2.1	Introduction . . . . .	47
2.1.1	Case Study . . . . .	47
2.1.2	Overview . . . . .	48

2.1.3	Structure . . . . .	48
2.2	Context . . . . .	49
2.2.1	Introduction . . . . .	49
2.2.2	Historical Development . . . . .	50
2.2.3	Legal Heritage . . . . .	52
2.3	Previous Scholarship and Internal Perspectives . . . . .	52
2.4	Institutional Framework . . . . .	57
2.4.1	Introduction . . . . .	57
2.4.2	Overview . . . . .	58
2.4.3	The Executive . . . . .	65
2.4.4	The Judiciary . . . . .	67
2.4.5	The Legislature . . . . .	84
2.5	Jurisprudence of the Superior Courts . . . . .	85
2.5.1	Introduction . . . . .	85
2.5.2	Overview . . . . .	86
2.5.3	Detentions and National Security . . . . .	86
2.5.4	1988 Judicial Crisis . . . . .	89
2.5.5	Trials of Anwar Ibrahim . . . . .	94
2.5.6	United Nations Special Rapporteur on Judicial Independence . . . . .	97
2.5.7	Lingam Tape Affair . . . . .	99
2.6	Review of Judicial Independence . . . . .	101
2.6.1	Introduction . . . . .	101
2.6.2	Contemporary Judicial Independence . . . . .	102
2.6.3	Evolution and Context . . . . .	109
2.6.4	Future Developments in Malaysia . . . . .	119
	References . . . . .	121
<b>3</b>	<b>Judicial Independence in Pakistan . . . . .</b>	<b>125</b>
3.1	Introduction . . . . .	125
3.1.1	Case Study . . . . .	125
3.1.2	Overview . . . . .	126
3.1.3	Structure . . . . .	126
3.2	Context . . . . .	127
3.2.1	Introduction . . . . .	127
3.2.2	Legal Heritage . . . . .	128
3.3	Previous Scholarship and Internal Perspectives . . . . .	129
3.4	Institutional Framework . . . . .	133
3.4.1	Introduction . . . . .	133
3.4.2	Overview . . . . .	133
3.4.3	The Executive . . . . .	135
3.4.4	The Judiciary . . . . .	136
3.4.5	The Legislature . . . . .	149
3.5	Jurisprudence of the Supreme Court I: 1947–1999 . . . . .	151
3.5.1	Introduction . . . . .	151

3.5.2	Overview . . . . .	152
3.5.3	Constitutional Wrangling: 1947–1956 . . . . .	152
3.5.4	The 1956 Constitution and Martial Law . . . . .	158
3.5.5	Muhammad Ayub Khan’s Military Government: 1958–1969 . . . . .	159
3.5.6	Agha Mohammed Yahya Khan and the Division of Pakistan: 1969–1971 . . . . .	160
3.5.7	Zulfikar Ali Bhutto’s Pakistan: 1971–1977 . . . . .	161
3.5.8	Zulfikar Ali Bhutto’s Detention, Trial, and Execution: 1977–1979 . . . . .	166
3.5.9	Muhammad Zia ul Haq’s Military Regime: 1977–1988 . . .	168
3.5.10	Benazir Bhutto and Nawaz Sharif: 1988–1999 . . . . .	169
3.6	Judicial Independence after the First 50 Years . . . . .	175
3.7	Jurisprudence of the Supreme Court II: 1999–2016 . . . . .	177
3.7.1	Pervez Musharraf’s Military Government: 1999–2005 . . .	177
3.7.2	Judiciary Under Attack: 2005–2008 . . . . .	183
3.7.3	Expanding Judicial Power: 2009–2016 . . . . .	188
3.8	Review of Judicial Independence . . . . .	203
3.8.1	Introduction . . . . .	203
3.8.2	Contemporary Judicial Independence . . . . .	204
3.8.3	Evolution and Context . . . . .	209
3.8.4	Future Developments in Pakistan . . . . .	215
	References . . . . .	216
<b>4</b>	<b>Conclusion . . . . .</b>	<b>221</b>
4.1	Introduction . . . . .	221
4.2	Comparing Judicial Independence . . . . .	222
4.2.1	Introduction . . . . .	222
4.2.2	Malaysia . . . . .	223
4.2.3	Pakistan . . . . .	225
4.2.4	England . . . . .	226
4.2.5	Contrasts among Malaysia, Pakistan, and England . . . . .	227
4.2.6	Conclusion . . . . .	238
4.3	The Universal Theory . . . . .	238
4.3.1	Introduction . . . . .	238
4.3.2	Results of the Case Studies . . . . .	239
4.4	The Pragmatic and Context-Sensitive Theory . . . . .	242
4.4.1	Introduction . . . . .	242
4.4.2	Results of the Case Studies . . . . .	242
4.4.3	Compared with the Universal Theory . . . . .	244
4.5	Conclusion . . . . .	245
4.6	Broader Implications . . . . .	247
	References . . . . .	250