

Contents

Part I Introduction to the Research

1	Preliminary Issues	3
	A. The Problem	3
	B. Subject and Aims of the Investigation	5
	C. Methodology and Structure of the Investigation	6
	References	8

Part II *Audi Alteram Partem* in National Criminal Justice. The Perspective of Domestic Law

2	Participatory Rights in Italian Criminal Justice and the Developments Towards a <i>contradictoire</i> -Based Model of Criminal Proceedings	11
	A. Introductory Remarks. The Long Road of Italian Law Towards a New Model of Criminal Proceedings, Based on the Contribution of Private Parties to the Administration of Justice	13
	B. The Development of a Constitutional Participatory Model of Fair Criminal Justice	17
	I. Participatory Rights in the 1947 Constitution	17
	II. The Enactment of a <i>contradictoire</i> -Based Model of Criminal Justice Under the Increasing Influence of International Human Rights Law	19
	1. The Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> as the Core Guarantee of the Constitutional Model of a Fair Trial	19
	2. A Systematic Understanding of the Constitutional Model of a Fair Trial and the Need for an Overall Balance Between the Right to Confrontation and Other Constitutional Interests	21

C. The Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and Equality of Arms	24
I. Premise. The Link Between the Requirements of <i>contradictoire</i> and Equality of Arms in the Constitutional Model of a Fair Trial	24
II. Defence and Prosecutorial Inquiries	25
D. The Role of Private Parties in the Exercise of Criminal Prosecutions	28
I. The Role of the Victim in the Institution of Criminal Proceedings. The Relationship Between Private and Public Prosecution	28
II. Parties' Involvement in the Decision Not to Institute a Criminal Prosecution or to Drop Criminal Proceedings	32
1. The Defence's Involvement in the Decision Not to Institute a Criminal Prosecution	32
2. The Need to Balance Conflicting Interests in the Decision Whether to Prosecute or to Terminate Criminal Proceedings	34
E. The Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and the Right to Be Informed in Criminal Proceedings	39
I. The Constitutional Model of Informed Participation in Criminal Proceedings	39
II. Information on the Accusation	41
1. Information on the Charge in the Pre-Trial Inquiry	41
2. Preventive Information About the Decision to Charge	44
3. Information on the Indictment	48
III. Information on Developments of the Criminal Inquiry and the Evidence Supporting the Charging Decision	49
IV. Notice of the Institution of Court Proceedings and the Right to Know the Initiation of a Criminal Prosecution	52
F. Prosecutorial Needs and the Right of Participation in Criminal Proceedings	54
I. Premise	54
II. Prosecutorial Needs and the Right to Personally Participate in Court Proceedings. The Problem of <i>in absentia</i> Proceedings	55
1. The 1988 Rules on Default Proceedings and Developments Due to the Strasbourg Case-Law	55
2. The 2014 Reform: The Disappearance of Default Proceedings and the New Procedure for Absent Defendants	57
III. Participatory Rights in Alternative Proceedings	59
1. Premise	60
2. <i>Inaudito reo</i> Proceedings and the Problem of Criminal Conviction Without Previous Hearing. The Case of Penal Order Proceedings	61

3. Criminal Hearings <i>in camera</i> and the Right to Be Heard Fairly. The Complex Trade-Offs Required by Plea Bargaining and Abbreviated Proceedings	64
G. The Right to Have Oneself Fairly Heard	68
I. Premise	68
II. The Right to Be Fairly Heard in the Pre-Trial Phase	68
1. The 1988 Model and the Subsequent Developments in the Dynamics of the Prosecutorial Inquiry. The Progressive Re-Enhancement of the Power of the Investigative Bodies to Obtain Oral Evidence	68
2. The Weak Protection of Suspects and Victims	71
3. The Risks of the Witness Testimony of Co-Defendants Assisted by a Lawyer	74
III. The Right to Be Heard Fairly in Open Court	76
H. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Collection of Evidence	80
I. Introductory Remarks. Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> in the Taking of Evidence	80
II. Participatory Rights in Evidence-Gathering in the Pre-Trial Inquiry	82
1. The Involvement of Private Parties in Prosecutorial and Police Inquiries	82
2. The Right to Confrontation in <i>incidente probatorio</i>	83
III. Participatory Rights in Evidence-Gathering at Trial	85
1. Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> , Oral Evidence and the Need for Constant Balance Among Conflicting Interests	85
2. Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and the Collection of Expert Evidence	87
3. Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and Documentary Evidence. Participatory Rights and the Admission of Evidence Gathered in Other Proceedings	89
4. Defendant's Consent and Evidentiary Agreements Among the Parties	91
I. Participatory Rights, the Use of Untested Evidence and the Defence's Contribution to Fact-Finding	93
I. Systematic Remarks. The High Relativism of Italian Evidence Law	93
II. Participatory Rights and Fact-Finding in the Trial Phase	96
1. Premise	96
2. Evidence Unavailable at Trial	97
3. Hearsay Evidence	100
4. Inconsistent Out-of-Court Evidence	102
III. Participatory Rights and Fact-Finding in Alternative Proceedings	109
1. Premise	109

2. Alternative Proceedings and the Waiver of the Right to Participation in Evidence-Gathering	109
3. The Impact of the Accused's Waiver on the Interests of Other Parties and on Fact-Finding	112
J. The Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and Pre-Trial Restrictions on Freedom	113
I. Premise	113
II. Participatory Rights and Fact-Finding in the Decision on Coercive Measures. Another Endurance Test for the Distinction Between Strict and Free Assessment of Evidence	115
III. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> in the Procedure on Remand Detention and Further Restrictions on Liberty	117
1. Participatory Safeguards in the Procedure on the Application of Coercive Measures. The Inconveniences of Another Example of <i>inaudito reo</i> Proceedings	117
2. Participatory Rights in the Judicial Review Proceedings Against Coercive Measures	120
K. Provisional Conclusions	123
References	124
3 Participatory Rights in Brazilian Law and the Requirements of <i>contradictoire</i> and Full Defence in Criminal Proceedings	129
A. Premise	130
B. Participatory Safeguards in the Constitutional Model of a Fair Trial. The Right to <i>contradictoire</i> and Full Defence	130
C. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and Equality of Arms	132
D. The Role of Private Parties in the Decision to Charge	135
I. Participatory Rights of the Victim in the Initiation of Criminal Proceedings. The Forms of Private Criminal Prosecution	135
II. The Involvement of Private Parties in the Decision Not to Institute or to Drop a Criminal Prosecution	136
E. The Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and Right to Information in Criminal Proceedings	138
I. The Right to Information in the Pre-Trial Stage	138
II. Charging Decision and the Need for Proper Information on the Initiation of Criminal Proceedings	140
F. Prosecutorial Needs and the Right to Take Part Personally in Criminal Proceedings. The Problem of <i>in absentia</i> Procedures in Brazilian Law	141
G. Investigative Needs and the Right to Be Fairly Heard	145
I. The Right to Be Fairly Heard in the Pre-Trial Phase	145
II. The Right to Be Fairly Heard in Court Proceedings	146
H. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Collection of Evidence	149
I. The Right to <i>contradictoire</i> in Obtaining Oral Evidence	149
II. The Right to <i>contradictoire</i> in the Taking of Expert Evidence	151
III. The Right to <i>contradictoire</i> and Documentary Evidence	152

I. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Proof of Guilt	153
J. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Use of Measures of Coercion	155
I. Premise	155
II. The Right to <i>contradictoire</i> and Restrictions on Freedom	155
1. Participatory Safeguards in Remand Proceedings	155
2. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and Provisional Arrest	159
3. The Right to Be fairly Heard in Cases of Temporary Detention	160
III. The Right to Be fairly Heard and Investigative Interferences with Fundamental Rights	161
IV. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> in <i>habeas corpus</i> Proceedings	162
1. <i>Habeas corpus</i> in Brazilian Law	162
2. Participatory Rights in <i>habeas corpus</i> Proceedings	163
K. Interim Conclusions	164
References	165

**Part III *Audi Alteram Partem* in Transnational Criminal Justice.
The Perspective of Domestic Law**

4 Participatory Rights in Transnational Criminal Justice Under Italian Law	169
A. General Remarks on the Rules Governing Transnational Criminal Inquiries	170
I. The Domestic Rules on Legal Assistance and the Influence of International Law Instruments	170
II. The Domestication of EU Law on Legal Assistance	171
B. Human Rights Developments in the Italian Law on Transnational Criminal Justice. Introductory Remarks	172
C. Participatory Rights in National Cases with Transnational Features	174
D. Participatory Rights, Right to Freedom and International Surrender Procedures. The Italian Law on Extradition	176
I. <i>In absentia</i> Trials and International Surrender	176
II. The Right to Be Fairly Heard and to Challenge the Lawfulness of the Surrender Procedure	179
III. Coercive Means and the Right to a Judicial Hearing	181
1. Coercive Means in Surrender Procedures	181
2. The Hearing of the Person Subject to Measures of Coercion	183
IV. The Role of the Judiciary in Extradition Procedures	185
E. Participatory Rights and Transnational Evidence	188
I. Models of Gathering Evidence Abroad	188
II. Participatory Rights in the Taking of Evidence Abroad	190

III. Defence Rights and the Use of Overseas Evidence	192
1. Premise	192
2. Movement of Evidence and Defence Rights in the Admission of Information already Gathered Abroad	192
3. Defence Rights and the Use of Evidence Taken Abroad in Response of an Italian Request for Legal Assistance	194
4. The Lax Approach of Italian Courts to the Use of Overseas Evidence	196
IV. Defence Rights in Gathering Evidence Requested by Other Countries	197
F. Provisional Conclusions	199
References	199
5 Participatory Safeguards in Transnational Criminal Justice Under Brazilian Law	201
A. General Remarks on the Brazilian Rules Governing Transnational Criminal Justice	201
B. Human Rights in Brazilian Transnational Inquiries	203
C. Participatory Rights in Domestic Criminal Proceedings with Transnational Features	205
D. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Protection of Personal Freedom in Extradition Procedures	206
I. The Problem of <i>in absentia</i> Trials	206
II. The Right to a Fair Hearing and the Role of the Judiciary in Extradition Procedures	207
E. Participatory Rights and the Taking of Evidence in Transnational Cases	210
I. Modes of Gathering Overseas Evidence	210
II. The Right to a Defence and Equality of Arms in the Taking of Overseas Evidence	211
III. Participatory Rights in the Collection of Evidence Requested by Foreign Countries	213
F. Provisional Conclusions	215
References	215
Part IV Convergences and Divergences in the National Understanding of Participatory Rights in Domestic and Transnational Criminal Justice	
6 Common Developments and Deficiencies of the Domestic Approach to Participatory Safeguards in Criminal Proceedings	219
A. Premise	220
B. The Constitutionalisation of the Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and Its Contribution of to a Human Rights-Oriented Understanding of Criminal Justice	222

C. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Principle of Equality of Arms. The Weak Role of the Judiciary and Persistent Imbalances in the Pre-trial Inquiry	225
D. Criminal Prosecution and the Role of Private Parties	227
I. The Proactive Role of the Injured Party in the Institution of Criminal Proceedings. The Problem of Private Prosecutions	227
II. The Involvement of Private Parties in the Decision Not to Institute or to Drop a Criminal Prosecution	230
E. Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> and Information in Criminal Proceedings	234
I. The Right to Information on the Charge, Right to Know Relevant Evidence and the Difficult Trade-Offs Required in the Investigative Phase	234
II. Information on the Initiation of a Criminal Law Action and Recent Legal Arrangements to Involve the Accused Personally in the Proceedings	237
F. The Right to Personal Participation in Criminal Proceedings and the Problem of <i>in absentia</i> Proceedings	239
G. Investigative Needs and the Right to Be Fairly Heard in Criminal Proceedings	241
I. The Right to a Fair Hearing, Legal Assistance and the Role of the Judiciary in the Pre-trial Examination of the Accused	241
II. The Right to a Fair Hearing of Individuals Other Than the Accused and the Lack of Comprehensive Rules on Different Informants	245
III. The Right to Silence, Defensive Choices and the Right to Be Fairly Heard in Judicial Proceedings	246
IV. Methods of Examination and the Guarantees of a Fair Hearing	248
H. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Collection of Criminal Evidence	250
I. Participatory Rights in the Taking of Oral Evidence and the Role of the Judiciary	250
II. The Right to Confrontation, Documentary Evidence and the Use of Information Gathered in Other Proceedings	253
III. The Right to <i>contradictoire</i> , Technical Investigations and Expert Evidence	255
I. The Parties' Contribution to the Decision-Making and the Requirements of <i>contradictoire</i> -Based Fact-Finding	257
I. Relativism of Criminal Evidence and the Different Probative Value Depending on the Decision at Stake	257
II. Principle of <i>contradictoire</i> , the Proof of Guilt and the Principle of Free Assessment of Evidence	259

J. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and Pre-trial Restrictions on Freedom	261
I. Premise	261
II. The Right to <i>contradictoire</i> and Short-Term Restrictions on Liberty	262
III. Pre-trial Measures and the Guarantee of a Fair Hearing of the Accused and the Victim in Remand Proceedings	265
IV. Participatory Rights in the Proceedings Activated by the Defence on Judicial Oversight of Restrictions on Freedom	267
K. Provisional Conclusions	268
References	269
7 Similarities and Shortcomings of the National Understanding of Participatory Rights in the Field of Transnational Criminal Justice	271
A. Constitutional Law Safeguards and the Slow Enhancement of Participatory Rights in Transnational Criminal Cases	272
B. Information Rights and the Conduct of a Criminal Law Action with Transnational Elements	274
C. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and International Surrender Procedures	276
I. Premise	276
II. Participatory Rights in the Trial Country and Surrender Procedures. The Rising Influence of International and Constitutional Law, and the Enhancement of the Procedural Safeguards in the Field of <i>in absentia</i> Proceedings	276
III. Participatory Rights in the Surrender Procedure	278
1. Giving a Voice to the Sought Person	278
a) Procedural Safeguards in the Prosecutorial Hearing and the Right to be Fairly Heard by a Judge	278
b) Surrender Procedures, Coercive Means and the Right to a Fair Hearing	281
2. The Role of the Judiciary in the Surrender Procedures and the Right to Challenge the Lawfulness of the Proceeding	282
D. Participatory Rights and Transnational Evidence	284
I. Models of Gathering Transnational Evidence. The Traditional Approach of the Brazilian and Italian Law and the Rising Development of Informal Modes of International Cooperation	284
II. Participatory Safeguards in the Collection of Evidence Abroad	285
1. Defence Rights in the Evidence-Gathering and the Right to Obtain Exculpatory Evidence	285
2. Participatory Safeguards and the Admissibility of Overseas Evidence	287

III. Participatory Rights in the Collection of Evidence Requested by Foreign Countries	289
E. Interim Findings	290
References	290
Part V Evolution of a Wideranging Participatory Approach to Criminal Justice in International Human Rights Law and EU Law	
8 Audi alteram partem in Criminal Proceedings Under the European Convention on Human Rights	293
A. Introductory Issues. The Right to a Fair Hearing and the Need for Overall Balance of Conflicting Interests	294
B. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Principle of Equality of Arms	296
C. Prosecutorial Needs and the Right to Be personally Involved in Criminal Proceedings. The Flexible Approach of the Strasbourg Case-Law	297
I. The Right to Be Present in Criminal Proceedings and Individual Duties of Diligence	297
1. The Right to Be Present at Trial	297
2. The Right to Be Present Before a Higher Instance	299
II. The Problem of <i>in absentia</i> Procedures	300
III. <i>Inaudito reo</i> Proceedings and the Right of the Injured Party to Participate in Criminal Hearings	302
D. Information Rights and Requirements of Effective Participation in Criminal Proceedings	304
I. Premise	304
II. The Right to Know and Understand the Accusation	305
1. Information on the Charge	305
2. Decision to Charge and Information Rights in the Pre-Trial Inquiry	308
III. Information on the Evidence Gathered and the Right to Access to the Prosecutorial File	310
E. The Guarantee of a Fair Hearing and the Privilege Against Self-Incrimination	313
I. The Accused's Right to Be fairly Heard by an Independent Body and Qualitative Requirements of Pre-Trial Questionings	313
II. Prosecutorial Needs and the Right of Individuals Other than the Accused to Make Their Voice Heard in Criminal Proceedings	314
III. The Right Not to Be Heard in Criminal Justice. Developments in the Principle of <i>nemo tenetur se detegere</i>	315
F. Defence's Contribution to the Evidence-Gathering and the Requirements of a Fair Decision-Making	319
I. Premise	319

II. Participation Rights in the Collection of Criminal Evidence	321
1. The Right to Confrontation and the Need for an Overall Balance of Conflicting Interests in Criminal Proceedings	321
2. Methods of Confrontation	321
a) Direct and Indirect Examination	321
b) Anonymous Witnesses and the Use of Alternative Means of Confrontation	323
3. The Right to Confrontation and Inconsistent Testimony	326
III. The Right to Confrontation and the Proof of Guilt	327
1. Premise	327
2. Out-of-Court Confrontations and the Use of Evidence Obtained Without the Defence's Participation in the Case of Subsequent Confrontation	327
3. Absent Witnesses and the Use of Untested Evidence	329
a) The Traditional Approach of the Strasbourg Case-Law: The Sole and Decisive Evidence Doctrine	329
b) The Developments in the European Case-Law After the <i>Al-Khawaja and Tahery</i> Judgment: The Progressive Softening of the Sole and Decisive Evidence Test	330
IV. The Contribution of Private Parties to the Decision-Making. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> Rule and Argumentation in Criminal Proceedings	331
G. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and Measures of Coercion in Criminal Proceedings	335
I. Deprivation of Freedom and the Right to Information. The Soft Approach of the European Case-Law	335
II. The Right to a Fair Hearing and the Guarantee of Prompt Judicial Review of Arrest or Detention	337
III. Participatory Rights in <i>habeas corpus</i> Proceedings	340
H. Provisional Conclusions	343
References	343
9 Participatory Rights in Criminal Justice Under the American Convention on Human Rights	345
A. Premise. The Criminal Trial as a Listening Space with Due Guarantees and the Strong Human Rights Approach of the American Convention	345
B. The Right to Be Fairly Heard and the Overall Assessment of Human Rights Violations	347
C. The Right to Have Personal Access to Court and the Need for Comprehensive Judicial Oversight of Infringements on Human Rights	349
D. Investigative Needs and the Right to Informed Participation in Criminal Proceedings	350

E. Participatory Rights and the Taking of Criminal Evidence	353
I. The Right to Contribute to Evidence-Gathering in the Light of an Overall Human Rights Assessment	353
1. The Defence's Involvement in the Taking of Incriminating Evidence	353
2. Qualitative Conditions of Effective Confrontation, Miscarriage of Justice and Deficiencies of National Law	354
3. Anonymous Witnesses and the Use of Untested Evidence	355
II. The Right to Access to Exculpatory Evidence in Death Penalties	357
F. The Defence's Argumentative Contribution to the Decision- Making	357
G. Restrictions on Freedom, Right to Be Fairly Heard and the Enhanced Need for Overall Human Rights Oversight	359
I. The Broad Protection of Information Rights	359
II. The Right to a Prompt Judicial Hearing and the Protection Against Inhuman Treatment	362
III. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> in <i>habeas corpus</i> Proceedings	363
H. Provisional Conclusions	364
References	365
10 Harmonisation of Criminal Justice and Participatory Rights in Criminal Proceedings. New Developments in EU Law After the Lisbon Treaty	367
A. Harmonisation of Criminal Procedure Law and the Enhancement of Participatory Rights in Criminal Justice After the Lisbon Treaty	368
B. The Right to Be personally Involved in Criminal Proceedings in the EU Area	370
I. The Right to Personal Participation in Criminal Hearings. A Limited Guarantee	370
II. Exceptions to the Right to Personal Participation	372
1. <i>In absentia</i> Procedures	372
2. <i>Inaudito reo</i> Proceedings	375
a) The <i>Covaci</i> Case and the Indications of the European Court of Justice	375
b) The New Safeguards Laid Down by EU Statutory Law	379
III. Towards a Victim's Right to Personally Participate in Criminal Proceedings?	380
C. Conditions of Effective Defence and the Right to Active Participation in Criminal Proceedings	381
I. Language and the Right to Effective Participation in Criminal Proceedings	381
1. Linguistic Guarantees of the Accused	381
2. Linguistic Guarantees of the Victim	383

II. Information Rights and the Guarantee of Effective Defence	386
1. Information Rights of the Accused	386
a) Premise	386
b) Information on the Charge	386
c) Information on the Investigation and the Right to Access the File	388
2. Information Rights of the Victim	389
III. The Right to Be fairly Heard in Criminal Proceedings	390
1. The Voice of the Accused	390
2. The Voice of the Victim	392
IV. The Defence's Contribution to the Gathering of Evidence	393
D. Participatory Rights and Coercive Measures in the Field of Personal Freedom	396
E. Interim Conclusions	398
References	399

**Part VI Developments in International and Supranational Law
Towards a Participatory Understanding of Transnational
Criminal Justice**

11 Participatory Rights and Transnational Criminal Justice in the European Convention	403
A. Introductory Remarks	403
B. The European Convention and the Protection of Fair Trial Rights in Transnational Cases	405
C. Information and Participatory Safeguards in National Criminal Proceedings Having Transnational Dimension	409
D. Participatory Rights in International Cooperation in Criminal Matters	412
I. Premise	412
II. The Right to Freedom and Participatory Guarantees in Surrender Procedures	412
1. Information Rights in Extradition Proceedings	412
2. Extradition Proceedings and the Right to Be Heard in Person	413
3. The Problem of <i>in absentia</i> Trials in the Field of International Surrender	414
III. Participatory Rights in Cross-Border Investigations and the Taking of Overseas Evidence	416
1. Premise	416
2. The Responsibility for Ensuring Confrontation	417
3. The Method of Confrontation	419
4. The Use of Witness Evidence Taken Abroad Without Confrontation	420
E. Provisional Conclusions	422
References	422

12	<i>Audi alteram partem</i> in Transnational Cases Under the American Convention	423
	A. Introductory Remarks. The Need for a Systematic Approach to Transnational Cases Under the American Convention	423
	B. A Victim-Centred Approach to International Cooperation and the Responsibility of the International Community for Avoiding the Impunity of the Perpetrators of Serious Human Rights Violations	424
	C. Participatory Guarantees in International Cooperation Under the American Convention	425
	I. Premise	425
	II. Extradition Procedures and the Right of the Victims of Serious Human Rights Violations to Examine the Alleged Perpetrators. The Colombian Case of the Justice and Peace Process	426
	III. The Right to Obtain Exculpatory Evidence, the Guarantee of Confrontation and the Use of Untested Evidence in Transborder Cases	428
	D. Interim Conclusions	430
	References	430
13	Defence Rights and Participatory Guarantees Acknowledged by EU Law in the International Cooperation Within the Area of Freedom, Security and Justice	431
	A. Introductory Remarks	432
	B. Participatory Guarantees and the Protection of Personal Freedom in International Cooperation Among Member States	432
	I. Premise	432
	II. The Right to Personal Participation in Criminal Proceedings and Surrender Procedures. The Protection of Absent Defendants in EAW Proceedings	433
	1. The Soft Solutions of the 2002 Legislation on the European Arrest Warrant	433
	2. Subsequent Developments in EU Law	434
	a) The Enhancement of Information and Participatory Rights by the 2009 Legislation	434
	b) The Responses of the EU Court of Justice. The ‘ <i>Melloni</i> Doctrine’	437
	III. Participatory Rights and International Procedures Involving Restrictions on Liberty	438
	1. Information Rights and Guarantees of a Fair Hearing in EAW Proceedings	438
	2. Defence Rights in the Proceedings on Supervision Measures	443
	C. Participatory Rights and Transnational Evidence in the EU Area	445
	I. Premise	445

II. Participatory Rights, Transnational Evidence-Gathering and the Developments of Legal Assistance Models	446
1. The Solutions of the Brussels Convention on Transnational Evidence-Gathering	446
2. The Shift from Mutual Legal Assistance to Mutual Recognition and the Defence Rights in the Order Model	447
a) The Combined Methods of Evidence-Gathering in the Order Model and the Weak Protection of Participatory Rights in the EU Legislation on the European Evidence Warrant and the European Investigation Order	447
b) Hearings by Videoconference, Right to Be fairly Heard and the Guarantee of Confrontation in Transnational Cases	452
III. Defence Rights in Joint Criminal Inquiries	454
D. Interim Conclusions	455
References	456

Part VII Solution Models and Principles of a Participatory Approach to Criminal Justice in International Human Rights Law and EU Law

14 Principles and Common Requirements of a Participatory Model of Criminal Justice in International Human Rights Law and EU Law	461
A. Premise	462
B. The Complex Character of Criminal Proceedings and the Broad Scope of the Right to Be Fairly Heard in International Human Rights Law and EU Law	462
C. The Proactive Role of the Parties in the Exercise of Criminal Prosecution. An Irrelevant Issue Under International Human Rights Law and EU Law?	464
D. The Right to Personal Participation in Criminal Proceedings. The Flexible Approach of International Human Rights Case-Law and the New Findings of EU Law	467
I. The Right to Be personally Involved in Criminal Proceedings and the Assessment of Human Rights Violations Under the European Convention and the Pact of San José	467
II. The Problem of <i>in absentia</i> Proceedings. A Comparison Between Strasbourg's Approach and the New Arrangements of EU Law	469
III. Out-of-Court Decisions on the Merits of the Case. The Issue of <i>inaudito reo</i> Proceedings Under the European Convention and EU Law	473

IV. The Right of the Aggrieved Parties to Personally Participate in Criminal Proceedings Under the European Convention and EU Law	476
E. Conditions and Qualitative Requirements for Effective Participation in Criminal Proceedings under International and EU Law	477
I. Premise	477
II. Linguistic Guarantees	478
III. Information Safeguards	480
1. Information on the Charge	480
2. Information on the Evidence Available and the Right to Access to the Investigative File	483
F. The Right to a Fair Examination as a General Guarantee of All the Individuals Involved in Criminal Proceedings	484
I. Premise	484
II. The Conditions of a Fair Examination	485
III. <i>Nemo tenetur</i> Principle and the Right Not to Be Heard in Criminal Proceedings. The Admissibility of Incriminating Evidence Obtained Coercively	486
IV. The Right to Give Statements in One's Favour	488
G. The Defence's Contribution to Evidence-Gathering	489
I. The Right to Produce Exculpatory Evidence	489
II. The Right to Be Involved in the Taking of Incriminating Evidence. The Complex Challenges of the Right to Confrontation	490
1. Direct and Indirect Forms of Confrontation	490
2. Context of Confrontation	491
3. Conditions of Effective Confrontation	493
III. A Systematic Understanding of the Right to Confrontation. The Need to Balance the Right to Challenge Incriminating Evidence and the Protection of Other Human Rights	494
H. Participatory Rights and the Requirements of a Fair Decision-Making. The Complex Trade-Offs Among Conflicting Interests Required by International Human Rights Law	496
I. Premise	496
II. The Right to Confrontation and the Proof of Guilt	496
1. The Admissibility of Out-of-Court Evidence in Cases of Subsequent Confrontation and the Problem of Anonymous Testimony	496
2. The Conditions on Use of Untested Evidence	498
III. Argumentative Contribution to the Decision-Making	500
I. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and Restrictions on Freedom. The Requirements of International Human Rights Case-Law and the Developments in the EU Legislation	501

I. Information Rights of Arrested and Detained Individuals	501
II. The Right to a Prompt Independent Review of the Lawfulness of Coercion and the Need for an Overall Human Rights Assessment	504
III. The Defence's Right to Challenge Unlawful Detention. Participatory Rights in <i>habeas corpus</i> Proceedings	507
J. Provisional Conclusions	508
References	509
15 Solution Models for a Participatory Approach to Transnational Criminal Justice in International and Supranational Law	511
A. International Human Rights Law and the Protection of Fair Trial Guarantees. Introductory Remarks	511
B. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> and the Specific Human Rights Challenges of Criminal Proceedings with Transnational Features	513
C. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> in the Field of Surrender Procedures	515
I. The Right to Personal Participation in the Trial Country and Procedural Guarantees in the Surrender Procedure. The Soft Approach of the Strasbourg Court and the Safeguards Set by EU Law	515
II. Participatory Safeguards and the Right to Evidence in Surrender Procedures. The Qualitative Requirements Set by International Human Rights Case-Law and the Solution Models of EU Law	518
D. Participatory Rights and Transnational Evidence-Gathering	521
I. The Right to Obtain Exculpatory Evidence. A Proactive Right of the Defence in the Field of International Cooperation?	521
II. The Multiple Expressions of the Guarantee of Confrontation in the Field of Transnational Evidence-Gathering	521
1. Responsibility for Ensuring Confrontation	521
2. The Role of the Defence in the Taking of Incriminating Evidence	524
3. The Use of Untested Evidence	525
E. Interim Conclusions	526
References	527
 Part VIII De-formalisation of Legal Systems and Reconstruction of a Participatory Model of Criminal Justice	
16 Mutual Interaction of Systems of Human Rights Protection and the Development of a Participatory Understanding of Criminal Justice Based on Transcultural Dialogue	531
A. Introductory Remarks	533
B. The Relevance of International Human Rights Law in the Selected Countries and Its Relationship with National Law	535
I. The Long Road Towards the Enhancement of International Human Rights Law in Italy	535

1. The Traditional Approach to International Human Rights Law and the Weak Formal Status of the European Convention	535
2. The Contribution of the Constitutional Case-Law to the Enhancement of International Human Rights Law and the Legislative Reforms of the Constitution	536
3. The Shift from the Formal Perspective to the Para-Constitutional Relevance of International Human Rights Law. The Complex Relationship Between Constitutional and Strasbourg Case-Law	539
II. The Relevance of the American Convention in the Contracting States and the Relationship with National Law	540
1. The Multisided Relevance of International Human Rights Law in Brazil	540
2. The Strong Approach of the Inter-American Court to Constitutional Law, Viewed from the Perspective of Brazilian Law	542
III. Comparative Remarks	544
C. The Relevance of EU Human Rights Law and the Relationship with Constitutional Law	546
I. The Approach of the EU Court of Justice and the Reaction of Constitutional Courts in the EU Area	546
II. The Approach of the Italian Constitutional Court to EU Law and the 'Counter-Limits Doctrine'	550
D. Cross-Fertilisation of Systems of Human Rights Protection and the Enhancement of a Participatory Understanding of National Criminal Justice on the Basis of Transcultural Dialogue	553
I. Premise	553
II. Personal Participation in Criminal Proceedings and the Lawfulness of Procedures in the Absence of the Individuals Concerned. A Multilevel Approach	554
1. Right to Personal Participation, Fairness of Criminal Proceedings and <i>in absentia</i> Proceedings	554
a) The Impact of International Human Rights Law on the Developments in Criminal Proceedings <i>in absentia</i> and the Persistent Lacunas of National Law	554
b) New Perspectives of EU Law and the Room for Manoeuvre for Italian Law	560
2. The Problem of <i>inaudito reo</i> Proceedings. General Requirements of International Human Rights Law, Developments at the EU Level and the Legal Arrangements of Italian Law	562
III. Conditions of Effective Participation in Criminal Proceedings. The Incidence of International Human Rights Law on the Developments in Brazilian and Italian Criminal Justice and the Evolution of Italian Law Under the Influence of EU Legislation	564

1. Information Rights in Criminal Proceedings	564
a) Information on the Charge. A Human Rights Approach . . .	564
aa) Information Rights and the Need for a Balance Between Conflicting Interests	564
bb) Developments in Italian Criminal Justice Towards EU Law and the Persistent Deficiencies in the Light of the European Convention	567
b) Information on the Evidence Gathered and Interferences with Fundamental Rights. The Safeguards of EU and International Human Rights Law and the Weak National Arrangements	568
2. Linguistic Guarantees in Criminal Proceedings. Developments Towards International Human Rights Law and EU Law and the Shortcomings of National Criminal Justice	570
IV. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> , the Right to Be Fairly Examined and the Privilege Against Self-Incrimination	571
1. Procedural Safeguards and Conditions of a Fair Hearing in the Pre-trial Inquiry	571
2. The Right to a Fair Hearing and the Procedural Safeguards Against Coercion. The Increased Enhancement of the <i>nemo</i> <i>tenetur</i> Principle	575
3. Private Initiative and the Right to Make Oneself Heard by the Competent Authority	578
V. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> , Evidence-Gathering and Qualitative Requirements of a Fair Fact-Finding. The Need for Broad Balance Among Conflicting Interests	580
1. Obtaining Incriminating Evidence. The Need for Systematic Approach to the Right to Confrontation in the Light of the Overall Set of the Human Rights Challenges Posed by Each Concrete Case	580
a) The Requirements Set by International Human Rights Case-Law and the Developments in National Law	580
b) The Risks of an Enlarged View of the Guarantee of Confrontation. The Problems of Indirect Examination and of Subsequent Confrontation	582
c) Right to Confrontation and Inconsistent Evidence. The Need to Avoid an Accused-Centred Understanding of the Principle of <i>contradictoire</i>	584
2. Proof of Guilt and the Defence's Contribution to a Fair Decision-Making	586
a) Impossibility of Confrontation and the Use of Untested Evidence. The Need to Avoid Absolutist Interpretations . . .	586
b) Special Forms of Confrontation and the Use of the Information Gathered. The Problem of Anonymous Testimony	590

VI. Participatory Rights and Restrictions on Freedom	591
1. The Right to Be Fairly Heard and the Qualitative Requirements of Effective Participation in Remand Proceedings	591
a) Premise	591
b) The Guarantee of Information in International Human Rights Instruments and EU Law, and the Procedural Safeguards Provided at the Domestic Level	592
c) The Need for Comprehensive Assistance in the Remand Proceedings	594
2. The Guarantee of a Prompt Independent Review of the Deprivation of Liberty and the Voice of the Defence	595
3. Challenging Pre-trial Restrictions on Liberty. The Persistent Distance from the Standards Set Forth by International Human Rights Law and EU Law	598
E. Interaction of Legal Systems and the Strengthening of a Participatory Approach to Transnational Criminal Justice	599
I. Introductory Remarks	599
II. <i>Audi alteram partem</i> , Right to Freedom and Procedural Safeguards in the Field of International Surrender. The EU Legislation on the European Arrest Warrant and Its Influence on Italian Law	600
1. <i>In absentia</i> Trials and Surrender Procedures with EU Countries	600
2. Participatory Rights in the Executing Country and the Right to Be Fairly Heard in EAW Proceedings	602
3. Coercive Measures and the Right to a Fair Hearing in the Executing Country	604
4. The Enhanced Role of the Judiciary in EAW Proceedings	607
III. Participatory Rights and Transnational Evidence-Gathering	612
1. Responsibility of the Cooperating Countries for the Granting of Participatory Safeguards in Transnational Inquiries. The Feasibility of the Strasbourg Case-Law at the Domestic Level	612
2. The Right to Confrontation, the Participatory Safeguards in the Taking of Incriminating Evidence, and the Use of Untested Evidence	613
F. Conclusions	615
References	615