

# Contents

---

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	ix
<i>Method and Methodology of Comparative Law: Introductory Remarks</i> Maurice Adams, Jaakko Husa and Marieke Oderkerk	xi

## **PART I PRELIMINARY CONSIDERATIONS**

### **A Comparative Law and the ‘Legal’ Approach**

1. John Bell (2011), ‘Legal Research and the Distinctiveness of Comparative Law’, in Mark Van Hoecke (ed.), *Methodologies of Legal Research: What Kind of Method for What Kind of Discipline?*, Chapter 9, Oxford, UK and Portland, OR, USA: Hart Publishing, 155–76 5
2. Mathias Reimann (2012), ‘Comparative Law and Neighbouring Disciplines’, in Mauro Bussani and Ugo Mattei (eds), *The Cambridge Companion to Comparative Law*, Part I, Chapter 1, New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 13–34 27

### **B Research Aims, Questions and Methods**

3. Jaakko Husa (2006), ‘Methodology of Comparative Law Today: From Paradoxes to Flexibility?’, *Revue Internationale de Droit Comparé*, **58** (4), 1095–117 51
4. Geoffrey Samuel (2014), ‘Asking the Right Question’, in *An Introduction to Comparative Law Theory and Method*, Chapter 2, Oxford, UK and Portland, OR, USA: Hart Publishing, 25–44, references 74
5. Vernon Valentine Palmer (2004), ‘From Lerotholi to Lando: Some Examples of Comparative Law Methodology’, *Global Jurist Frontiers*, **4** (2), May, i–ii, 1–29 96
6. Mark Van Hoecke (2015), ‘Methodology of Comparative Legal Research’, *Law and Method*, **5**, accessed on 30 January 2017, 1–35, [www.lawandmethod.nl/tijdschrift/lawandmethod/2015/12/RENM-D-14-00001.pdf](http://www.lawandmethod.nl/tijdschrift/lawandmethod/2015/12/RENM-D-14-00001.pdf) 127

## PART II GETTING STARTED

### A Selecting Objects, Countries and Cases: Comparability

7. Marieke Oderkerk (2001), 'The Importance of Context: Selecting Legal Systems in Comparative Legal Research', *Netherlands International Law Review*, XLVIII (3), December, 293–318 167
8. Ran Hirschl (2005), 'The Question of Case Selection in Comparative Constitutional Law', *American Journal of Comparative Law*, 53 (1), Winter, 125–55 193

### B Where to Find the Objects to Compare: Sources of Law

9. Rodolfo Sacco (1991), 'Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment I of II)', *American Journal of Comparative Law*, 39 (1), Winter, 1–34 227
10. Rodolfo Sacco (1991), 'Legal Formants: A Dynamic Approach to Comparative Law (Installment II of II)', *American Journal of Comparative Law*, 39 (2), Spring, 343–401 261
11. Stefan Vogenauer (2006), 'Sources of Law and Legal Method in Comparative Law', in Mathias Reimann and Reinhard Zimmermann (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Law*, Part III, Chapter 27, New York, NY, USA: Oxford University Press, 869–98 320
12. David J. Gerber (1998), 'System Dynamics: Toward a Language of Comparative Law?', *American Journal of Comparative Law*, 46 (4), Autumn, 719–37 350

### C Research Plan and Examples

13. Gerhard Dannemann (2006), 'Comparative Law: Study of Similarities or Differences?', in Mathias Reimann and Reinhard Zimmermann (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Law*, Part II, Chapter 11, New York, NY, USA: Oxford University Press, 383–419 371
14. John C. Reitz (1998), 'How to Do Comparative Law', *American Journal of Comparative Law*, 46 (4), Autumn, 617–36 408
15. Esin Örüçü (2007), 'A Project: Comparative Law in Action', in Esin Örüçü and David Nelken (eds), *Comparative Law: A Handbook*, Part III, Chapter 19, Portland, OR, USA: Hart Publishing, 435–49 428
16. Mark Van Hoecke (2004), 'Deep Level Comparative Law', in *Epistemology and Methodology of Comparative Law*, Chapter 9, Oxford, UK and Portland, OR, USA: Hart Publishing, 165–95 443

17. Maurice Adams and John Griffiths (2012), 'Against "Comparative Method": Explaining Similarities and Differences', in Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff (eds), *Practice and Theory in Comparative Law*, Chapter 13, New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 279–301 474

### PART III ACTION

#### A Regulating

18. Jan M. Smits (2006), 'Comparative Law and its Influence on National Legal Systems', in Mathias Reimann and Reinhard Zimmermann (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Comparative Law*, Part II, Chapter 15, New York, NY, USA: Oxford University Press, 513–38 501
19. Jane Stapleton (2007), 'Benefits of Comparative Tort Reasoning: Lost in Translation', *Journal of Tort Law*, **1** (3), October, i–ii, 1–45 527
20. Aleksandar Momirov and Andria Naudé Fourie (2009), 'Vertical Comparative Law Methods: Tools for Conceptualising the International Rule of Law', *Erasmus Law Review*, **2** (3), 291–309 574

#### B Describing Legal Systems

21. Rudolf B. Schlesinger (1961), 'The Common Core of Legal Systems: An Emerging Subject of Comparative Study', in Kurt H. Nadelmann, Arthur T. von Mehren and John N. Hazard (eds), *XXth Century Comparative and Conflicts Law: Legal Essays in Honor of Hessel E. Yntema*, Part I, Leyden, the Netherlands: A.W. Sythoff, 65–79 595
22. John Cartwright and Martijn Hesselink (2008), 'Introduction' and 'Conclusions', in *Precontractual Liability in European Private Law*, Chapter 1 and Chapter 5, New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 1–17, 449–88 610
23. Vernon Valentine Palmer (2012), 'A Descriptive and Comparative Overview', in *Mixed Jurisdictions Worldwide: The Third Legal Family*, 2nd edn, Part I, Chapter I, New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 19–92 667

#### C Explaining Similarities and Differences

24. James Q. Whitman (2004), 'The Two Western Cultures of Privacy: Dignity Versus Liberty', *Yale Law Journal*, **113** (6), April, 1151–221 743

25. Máximo Langer (2004), 'From Legal Transplants to Legal Translations: The Globalization of Plea Bargaining and the Americanization Thesis in Criminal Procedure', *Harvard International Law Journal*, 45 (1), Winter, 1–64

EDITED BY

Maurice Adams, Jaakko Husa  
and Marieke Oderkerk

EE

Elgar

# Comparative Law Methodology

Volume II



3

THE INTERNATIONAL LIBRARY OF COMPARATIVE LAW

# Contents

---

## Acknowledgements

ix

*Introduction* An introduction to both volumes by the editors appears in Volume I

## PART I SOME CURRENT DEBATES

### A Interdisciplinarity

1. Geoffrey Samuel (2013), 'Comparative Law and its Methodology', in Dawn Watkins and Mandy Burton (eds), *Research Methods in Law*, Chapter 6, Abingdon, UK and New York, NY, USA: Routledge, 100–118, references 5
2. Jaakko Husa (2014), 'Interdisciplinary Comparative Law – Between Scylla and Charybdis?', *Journal of Comparative Law*, **9** (2), 12–26 25
3. Karen McAuliffe (2014), 'Translating Ambiguity', *Journal of Comparative Law*, **9** (2), 65–87 40

### B Functionalism

4. Konrad Zweigert and Hein Kötz (1998), 'The Method of Comparative Law', in *An Introduction to Comparative Law*, 3rd edn, Part I, Chapter 3, Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press, 32–47 65
5. Günter Frankenberg (1985), 'Critical Comparisons: Re-thinking Comparative Law', *Harvard International Law Journal*, **26** (2), Spring, 411–55 81
6. Jaakko Husa (2013), 'Functional Method in Comparative Law – Much Ado About Nothing?', *European Property Law Journal*, **2** (1), April, 4–21 126

### C Language

7. Gerard-René de Groot (2012), 'Legal Translation', in Jan M. Smits (ed.), *Elgar Encyclopedia of Comparative Law*, 2nd edn, Chapter 43, Cheltenham, UK and Northampton, MA, USA: Edward Elgar Publishing, 538–49 147
8. Max Gluckman (1997)[1969], 'Concepts in the Comparative Study of Tribal Law', in Laura Nader (ed.), *Law in Culture and Society*, Part IV, London, UK and Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA, USA: University of California Press, 349–73, references 159

9. Paul Bohannan (1997) [1969], 'Ethnography and Comparison in Legal Anthropology', in Laura Nader (ed.), *Law in Culture and Society*, Part IV, London, UK and Berkeley and Los Angeles, CA, USA: University of California Press, 401–18, references 189
- D Quantitative Approaches**
10. Mathias M. Siems (2005), 'Numerical Comparative Law: Do We Need Statistical Evidence in Law in Order to Reduce Complexity?', *Cardozo Journal of International and Comparative Law*, **13**, 521–40 211
11. Anne Meuwese and Mila Versteeg (2012), 'Quantitative Methods for Comparative Constitutional Law', in Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff (eds), *Practice and Theory in Comparative Law*, Chapter 11, New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 230–57 231
12. Francesco Parisi and Barbara Luppi (2012), 'Quantitative Methods in Comparative Law', in Pier Giuseppe Monateri (ed.), *Methods of Comparative Law*, Part VI, Chapter 16, Cheltenham, UK and Northampton, MA, USA: Edward Elgar Publishing, 306–16 259
- E Legal Families, Traditions and Cultures**
13. Mathias Siems (2014), 'Mapping the World's Legal Systems', in *Comparative Law*, Part I, Chapter 4, Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 72–94 273
14. H. Patrick Glenn (2008), 'A Concept of Legal Tradition', *Queen's Law Journal*, **34**, 427–45 296
15. Esin Örüçü (2004), 'Family Trees for Legal Systems: Towards a Contemporary Approach', in Mark Van Hoecke (ed.), *Epistemology and Methodology of Comparative Law*, Chapter 18, Oxford, UK and Portland, OR, USA: Hart Publishing, 359–75 315
16. David Nelken (2007), 'Defining and Using the Concept of Legal Culture', in Esin Örüçü and David Nelken (eds), *Comparative Law: A Handbook*, Part II, Chapter 5, Portland, OR, USA: Hart Publishing, 109–32 332
17. Hamid Harasani (2014), 'Islamic Law as a Comparable Model in Comparative Legal Research: Devising a Method', *Global Journal of Comparative Law*, **3** (2), 186–202 356
18. Teemu Ruskola (2002), 'Legal Orientalism', *Michigan Law Review*, **101** (1), October, 179–234 373

**F Legal Transplants**

19. Alan Watson (1974), 'Introduction to Legal Transplants', in *Legal Transplants: An Approach to Comparative Law*, Chapter 4, Charlottesville, VA, USA: University Press of Virginia, 21–30 431
20. Pierre Legrand (1997), 'The Impossibility of "Legal Transplants"', *Maastricht Journal of European and Comparative Law*, **4**, 111–24 441
21. Gunther Teubner (1998), 'Legal Irritants: Good Faith in British Law or How Unifying Law Ends Up in New Divergences', *Modern Law Review*, **61** (1), January, 11–32 455
22. David Nelken (2003), 'Comparatists and Transferability', in Pierre Legrand and Roderick Munday (eds), *Comparative Legal Studies: Traditions and Transitions*, Chapter 12, Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 437–66 477

**G Legal Origins**

23. Christopher A. Whytock (2009), 'Legal Origins, Functionalism, and the Future of Comparative Law', *Brigham Young University Law Review*, **2009** (6), 1879–905 509
24. John Reitz (2009), 'Legal Origins, Comparative Law, and Political Economy', *American Journal of Comparative Law*, **57** (4), Fall, 847–62 536

**H Challenges of Globalisation and Transnationalisation:  
Interacting Legal Orders and Dynamic Comparisons**

25. Peer Zumbansen (2012), 'Transnational Comparisons: Theory and Practice of Comparative Law as a Critique of Global Governance', in Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff (eds), *Practice and Theory in Comparative Law*, Chapter 9, New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 186–211 555
26. Larry Catá Backer (2008), 'Multinational Corporations as Objects and Sources of Transnational Regulation', *ILSA Journal of International and Comparative Law*, **14** (2), 499–523 581
27. Jonathan B. Wiener (2001), 'Something Borrowed for Something Blue: Legal Transplants and the Evolution of Global Environmental Law', *Ecology Law Quarterly*, **27** (4), 1295–371 606
28. Gerhard Dannemann (2012), 'In Search of System Neutrality: Methodological Issues in the Drafting of European Contract Law Rules', in Maurice Adams and Jacco Bomhoff (eds), *Practice and Theory in Comparative Law*, Chapter 5, New York, NY, USA: Cambridge University Press, 96–119 683