

# *Table of Contents*

<i>Foreword by Bruno de Witte .....</i>	v
<i>Acknowledgements .....</i>	vii
<i>Table of Cases .....</i>	xv
<i>Table of Legislation.....</i>	xxiii
<i>Table of Institutional Documents.....</i>	xli

1. Introduction .....	1
I. Setting the Scene: A Fundamental Rights Policy in the Internal Market? .....	1
II. Methodology .....	6
III. Analysis.....	8
A. The Internal Market Competence and Fundamental Rights .....	8
B. <i>Ex Ante</i> Fundamental Rights Tools .....	8
C. Data Protection .....	9
D. Freedom of Expression .....	10
E. Fundamental Labour Rights.....	12
F. The Right to Health .....	13
IV. Conclusion .....	14
2. Competence .....	15
I. Introduction.....	15
II. Harmonising Fundamental Rights Under Article 114 TFEU.....	15
A. A Horizontal Fundamental Rights Competence .....	16
B. Article 114 TFEU and the Court's Case Law .....	19
i. Harmonisation Under Article 114 TFEU:	
Basic Principles .....	19
ii. Within the Scope of Article 114 TFEU (ex Art 95 EC):	
Improving the Conditions for the Establishment and	
Functioning of the Internal Market.....	21
III. Conclusion .....	30
3. New Mechanisms for Fundamental Rights Protection in EU Legislation:	
Building a Fundamental Rights Culture Outside the Courts .....	32
I. Introduction.....	32
II. Evolution .....	35
III. The Fundamental Rights Scrutiny Tools in Detail.....	38
A. The Commission.....	38
i. Pre-Legislative Scrutiny/Fundamental Rights Mainstreaming:	
Impact Assessments .....	38
ii. Legislative Scrutiny/Compatibility Assessments:	
Recitals and Explanatory Memoranda .....	51
iii. Monitoring Compliance: Charter Compliance	
Throughout the Legislative Process .....	65

B.	The European Parliament.....	66
C.	The Council.....	72
D.	The FRA.....	75
IV.	Conclusion .....	86
4.	Data Protection .....	90
I.	Introduction.....	90
II.	Data Protection as a Fundamental Right.....	91
A.	The ECHR Approach vis-a-vis the EU Approach .....	91
B.	An Autonomous Definition of the Right to Data Privacy in the EU? .....	94
III.	Regulating Data Protection: The Data Protection Directive and the e-Privacy Directive .....	97
A.	The Data Protection Directive 95/46/EC.....	97
i.	Legislative History .....	97
ii.	The Provisions .....	100
iii.	Enforcement, Harmonisation and Policy Development Through (New) Bodies of Governance .....	101
B.	The e-Privacy Directive 2002/58/EC.....	105
i.	Legislative History .....	105
ii.	The Provisions .....	106
C.	Limits to the Autonomous Definition of the Right to Data Protection: The Directives and Conflicting Fundamental Rights.....	107
i.	<i>Promusicae</i> : Clashing Fundamental Rights in Clashing Directives .....	108
ii.	<i>Satamedia</i> : Clashing Fundamental Rights within the DPD.....	111
iii.	Making Sense of the Court's Abstaining Approach (or Not).....	114
iv.	A New Direction in the Case Law Away from Abstention? .....	119
IV.	Regulating Restrictions to Data Protection: The (Invalidated) Data Retention Directive 2006/24/EC .....	129
A.	The Provisions.....	130
B.	Challenges to the DRD .....	131
V.	Proposal for a Coherent Data Protection Framework for the Twenty-First Century: Moving Away from the Internal Market, Moving Closer to Autonomy? .....	136
VI.	Conclusions.....	141
5.	Freedom of Expression .....	143
I.	Introduction.....	143
II.	Media Pluralism—How the Regulatory Process Can Fail .....	143
III.	The Audiovisual Media Services Directive—Promoting Freedom of Expression/to Provide Services .....	156

IV.	Regulating Commercial Expression in the Internal Market.....	165
A.	Commercial Expression—What is the Status in EU Law? .....	165
B.	Advertising Regulation: An Assessment Through the Fundamental Rights Lens .....	167
	i. Content-Based Rules .....	168
	ii. Content-Neutral Rules .....	183
C.	Conclusion .....	188
6.	Fundamental Labour Rights.....	191
I.	Introduction.....	191
II.	The Right to Fair and Just Working Conditions in the Posted Workers Directive 96/71/EC.....	191
A.	Legislative History of the PWD.....	192
	i. Background .....	192
	ii. The PWD—Has the Instrument been Conceived in Fundamental Rights Terms? Can it be so Conceived? .....	194
B.	The Legislator’s Balancing Exercise in the PWD .....	196
	i. How is ‘Fair Competition’ Achieved or ‘Unfair Competition’ Avoided? .....	197
	ii. How is Respect for the Rights of Workers Achieved?.....	198
	iii. How (if at all) is the Free Movement of Services Promoted/Ensured? Is the PWD Legitimately Based on (ex) Article 47(2) and 55 EC? .....	199
C.	The Judicial Intervention: <i>Laval</i> , <i>Rüffert</i> and <i>Commission v Luxembourg</i> .....	200
	i. The Court’s Assessment in <i>Laval</i> .....	201
	ii. The Court’s Assessment in <i>Rüffert</i> : Posted Workers and Public Procurement.....	202
	iii. The Court’s Assessment in <i>Commission v Luxembourg</i> .....	207
D.	The Political Response .....	209
	i. Deviating from the Judicial Interpretation: The Position of the European Parliament .....	209
	ii. Endorsing the Judicial Interpretation: The Commission and the Council .....	211
	iii. The Commission’s IA Report.....	213
	iv. The Resulting PWED: Leaving the Substance of the PWD Intact .....	216
E.	Conclusion .....	218
III.	The Right to Take Collective Action and its Reconciliation with Economic Freedoms.....	218
A.	The Right to Take Collective Action in EU and International Case Law .....	219
	i. The Right to Take Collective Action in EU Law: <i>Viking</i> and <i>Laval</i> .....	219
	ii. The Fundamental Right to Take Collective Action, Including the Right to Strike and its Reconciliation with the Economic Freedoms Post-Lisbon.....	224

iii. The Legislative Approach: ‘Saving’ the Right to Take Collective Action from the Economic Freedoms?—Monti I, Monti II, Services and Posted Workers.....	229
B. Conclusion .....	240
IV. Final Conclusion.....	241
7. Health .....	242
I. Introduction.....	242
A. Health in the Internal Market.....	242
B. Questions of Inquiry and Areas of Examination .....	244
II. Public Health versus Health as a Fundamental Human Right .....	246
A. The Definitional Exercise.....	246
i. Public Health Policy .....	246
ii. The Fundamental Human Right to Health .....	247
B. Differences, Similarities and the Preferred Approach .....	250
III. Market–Health Harmonisation Practice and the Role of Fundamental Rights .....	255
A. Orphan Medicinal Products: Regulation (EC) No 141/2000 .....	255
i. The Motives for Market Intervention.....	255
ii. The Fundamental Rights Dimension .....	257
B. Tobacco Control Regulation.....	261
i. The Motives for Market Intervention.....	262
ii. The Fundamental Rights Dimension .....	270
C. Patient Mobility: Directive 2011/24/EU on the Application of Patients’ Rights in Cross-Border Healthcare .....	283
i. The Motives for Market Intervention.....	283
ii. The Fundamental Rights Dimension .....	286
IV. Conclusion .....	290
8. Conclusions.....	292
I. Harmonising Fundamental Rights Protection Through the Internal Market.....	292
II. Existing Harmonisation Practice .....	292
A. Fundamental Rights Regulation: Existent but to a Great Extent not Explicit/Visible.....	293
B. Determinants of the Role of Fundamental Rights in Internal Market Legislation .....	294
i. Political Context .....	295
ii. The Sensitivity of Constitutional Context.....	298
iii. The Institutional Apparatus (Mainstreaming Fundamental Rights through IAs and <i>ex ante</i> Fundamental Rights Compatibility Assessments of Legislation) .....	299
iv. The Incentives Provided by the Court .....	300
v. The Type of Right Affected .....	300

C. Consequences of Adopting a Fundamental Rights Approach .....	301
i. The Absence of a Fundamental Rights Conceptualisation does not Necessarily Lead to a Violation of Fundamental Rights Standards in the Legislation .....	302
ii. A Fundamental Rights Conceptualisation may not Always Provide Added Value .....	302
iii. The Correlation Between a Fundamental Rights Conceptualisation and a Higher Standard of Fundamental Rights Protection .....	303
iv. Is there any Impact on the Balancing of the Conflicting Interests? .....	303
III. Final Conclusion: Don't Judge a Book by its Cover .....	305
IV. Epilogue .....	307
 <i>Bibliography</i> .....	310
<i>Index</i> .....	321

Abbildung 1  
Arbeitsgruppe  
Sicherheit  
Arbeitsrecht  
Assessing  
and  
Associations  
CG  
BSM CG  
- Stichwort  
Belgische  
(SAB)  
Blätter für  
- Equality  
Bonnier AG  
(C-461/10)  
Bundesdruckerei  
(C-519/13-14)  
Carpenter (Menzel)  
(C-60/00) [2001]  
Christa Neukom  
Rundfunk (C-14/01)  
Cinéthique SA  
(C-60/84 & C-61/85)  
Coditel v Ciné-Voxy  
Coditel v Ciné-Voxy  
Commission v Austria  
Commission v Cognac