

# Contents

- 1 Introduction 1
  - 1 Introduction and Overview 1
  - 2 Competence, Conferral and the Principle of Subsidiarity 16
  - 3 Anchoring Subsidiarity and the CJEU 29
  - 4 Case Selection 40
  - 5 Conclusion 43
  
- 2 Subsidiarity and Proportionality and the Balance of Power between the EU and the Member States 45
  - 1 Introduction 45
  - 2 Subsidiarity as a Legal Principle and Rule 46
    - 2.1 *The Adoption of Subsidiarity as a Legal and Constitutional Principle by the EU to Limit Unnecessary EU Intervention* 51
  - 3 Proportionality as a Widely Recognised Concept Used as a Test in Judicial Review 58
    - 3.1 *Introduction* 58
    - 3.2 *Proportionality as a Widely Recognised Concept Used as a Test in Judicial Review* 59
    - 3.3 *Differing Interpretations of the Operationalization of Proportionality* 65
    - 3.4 *Differing Levels of Intensity of Judicial Review by the CJEU of National Restrictions* 72
  - 4 Subsidiarity and Proportionality in EU Law-making in Shared Areas of Competence 82
    - 4.1 *A Conceptual Link between Conferral, Subsidiarity and Proportionality* 82
    - 4.2 *Subsidiarity Alongside Proportionality in EU Law-making in Shared Areas of Competence* 83
  - 5 EU Subsidiarity and Essentially Contested Concepts 89
  - 6 Subsidiarity and the Introduction of the Yellow Card Procedure Following the Treaty of Lisbon 99
  - 7 Conclusion 108
  
- 3 Subsidiarity and Proportionality and the Role of the CJEU in Relation to Interpretation of Shared Competence 112
  - 1 Introduction 112
  - 2 Introducing the CJEU: A Unique Supranational Court 117

- 3 The Pro-union Interpretative Tendency of the CJEU 126
  - 4 Subsidiarity and Judicial Review by the CJEU of Political Institutions 143
  - 5 Operationalising Subsidiarity and Proportionality Applied to Competences as Tool of Judicial Review 155
  - 6 Operationalising Subsidiarity in the Context of the Common Market 166
  - 7 Engaging the CJEU More Meaningfully with Subsidiarity in Its Legal Reasoning Outside of Judicial Review 173
  - 8 Conclusion 182
- 4 The CJEU, Subsidiarity and Determining the Residency Rights of EU Citizens 186**
- 1 Introduction 186
  - 2 Theoretical Perspectives – The Concept of Citizenship and Its Link to Political Identity 194
    - 2.1 *Introduction* 194
    - 2.2 *The Concept of Citizenship and Its Link to Political Identity Which in an EU Context* 194
    - 2.3 *The Limits of EU Citizenship* 197
    - 2.4 *The Problems of Differing Levels of Protection from Expulsion for Different Categories of EU Citizens* 202
    - 2.5 *Conclusion* 207
  - 3 Directive 2004/38 and the Distinction between Economically Active and Non-economically Active EU Citizens 208
    - 3.1 *Introduction* 208
    - 3.2 *The Introduction of EU Citizenship Provisions following the Treaty of Maastricht* 209
    - 3.3 *The Strengthening of Residence Rights in Directive 2004/38* 211
    - 3.4 *The CJEU, the Fundamental Status of EU Citizenship and Residency Rights of EU Citizens* 221
    - 3.5 *The Reaffirming and Strengthening of the Residence Rights Attaching to EU Citizens by the Treaty of Lisbon in Light of the Charter of Fundamental Rights* 235
  - 4 The Failure of the CJEU to Undertake a Subsidiarity and a Proportionality Review by the CJEU When Determining the Residency Rights of EU Citizens 242
  - 5 Conclusion 244

- 5 **Subsidiarity and Proportionality Review by the CJEU** 246
  - 1 Introduction 246
  - 2 The Shift in the Case Law of the CJEU from Discrimination to the Fundamental Status of Citizenship 258
  - 3 Operationalising a Subsidiarity and Proportionality Review 283
  - 4 The CJEU and More Meaningful Engagement with Subsidiarity in Its Judicial Reasoning 286
  - 5 Conclusion 293
  
- 6 **Conclusion** 297

### *Appendices*

- 1 **Table of Treaties, Instruments and Legislation** 309
- 2 **Table of Cases** 312
- Bibliography** 318
- Index** 338