

# Contents

|   |    |
|---|----|
| <i>List of Contributors</i> .....   | xv |
| 1. Introduction .....   | 1  |
| <i>Dennis Davis, Alan Richter and Cheryl Saunders</i>                       |    |
| I. Outline of Project.....  | 1  |
| II. Comparative Law and Constitutionalism.....                              | 3  |
| III. Constitutional Systems—Convergence and Particularism.....              | 5  |
| IV. Identifying Constitutional Systems for Comparison .....                 | 8  |
| V. Defining Values .....  | 10 |
| 2. Values in Australian Constitutionalism.....                              | 15 |
| <i>Cheryl Saunders and Megan Donaldson</i>                                  |    |
| I. The Australian Dilemma .....   | 15 |
| II. The Australian Context: Meaning and Sources of ‘Values’ .....           | 18 |
| III. Which Values?.....   | 27 |
| A. Review of Listed Values .....  | 27 |
| i. Justice/Fairness .....   | 27 |
| ii. Equality .....  | 34 |
| iii. Community .....  | 38 |
| iv. Freedom/Independence .....  | 42 |
| v. Responsibility/Accountability and Integrity/Honesty .....                | 45 |
| vi. Respect/Tolerance .....   | 50 |
| vii. Participation/Inclusion .....  | 53 |
| viii. Security .....  | 53 |
| ix. Life .....  | 55 |
| x. Dignity .....  | 56 |
| xi. Compassion/Caring .....   | 57 |
| xii. Family .....   | 58 |
| xiii. Environment .....   | 58 |
| B. Priority of Values .....   | 59 |
| IV. Congruence.....   | 60 |
| 3. Global Values and Local Realities:<br>Brazilian Constitutional Law ..... | 67 |
| <i>Fábio Carvalho Leite and Florian F Hoffmann</i>                          |    |
| I. Values in Brazilian Constitutional History .....                         | 67 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| II.  | Finding Values in Constitutional Law .....                           | 71  |
| A.   | Legal Infrastructure and Legal Culture.....                          | 71  |
| B.   | Values in the Constitutional Text and<br>Jurisprudence .....         | 74  |
| i.   | The Constitutional (Value) Architecture .....                        | 74  |
| ii.  | Jurisprudence .....  | 75  |
| III. | Conclusion: Values Between Constitutional<br>Ideal and Reality ..... | 88  |
| 4.   | Canada .....   | 93  |
|      | <i>Lorraine E Weinrib</i>  |     |
| I.   | Context: Historical Background and<br>Pre-Charter Values .....       | 93  |
| II.  | Values and their Prioritisation .....                                | 97  |
| A.   | The Normative Framework.....   | 98  |
| B.   | The Court and Nationhood:<br>Respecting Diversity.....               | 100 |
| C.   | Language .....   | 102 |
| D.   | Individual Protection.....   | 103 |
| E.   | Democracy and Rights .....   | 105 |
| F.   | Dignity: the Core Value.....   | 106 |
| G.   | Expression .....   | 108 |
| H.   | Political Rights.....  | 109 |
| I.   | Rights to Life .....   | 110 |
| J.   | Death Penalty.....   | 111 |
| K.   | Liberty .....  | 112 |
| L.   | Equality .....   | 113 |
| III. | Congruence and Incongruence .....                                    | 114 |
| A.   | A Particular Canadian Solution.....                                  | 115 |
| 5.   | Constitutions and Values in Three Chinese Societies.....             | 119 |
|      | <i>Albert HY Chen</i>  |     |
| I.   | Introduction.....  | 119 |
| II.  | Historical and Ideological Contexts .....                            | 120 |
| A.   | The ROC Constitution.....  | 120 |
| B.   | The PRC Constitution.....  | 122 |
| C.   | The Basic Law of the HKSAR .....                                     | 124 |
| III. | The Political Systems Concerned.....                                 | 125 |
| A.   | Taiwan.....  | 125 |
| B.   | The PRC .....  | 127 |
| C.   | The HKSAR.....   | 128 |
| IV.  | Values in the Three Constitutional Texts.....                        | 130 |
| A.   | Life .....   | 130 |
| B.   | Dignity.....   | 131 |
| C.   | Security .....   | 131 |

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| D.  | Freedom (or Liberty).....  | 132 |
| E.  | Privacy.....   | 133 |
| F.  | Equality.....  | 134 |
| G.  | Justice and Fairness.....  | 135 |
| H.  | Respect and Tolerance.....   | 137 |
| I.  | Family.....  | 138 |
| J.  | Work.....  | 138 |
| K.  | Property.....  | 139 |
| L.  | Community.....   | 140 |
| M.  | Compassion and Solidarity.....   | 141 |
| N.  | Education.....   | 142 |
| O.  | Environment.....   | 144 |
| P.  | Peace.....   | 145 |
| Q.  | Responsibility and Accountability.....   | 145 |
| R.  | Participation.....   | 146 |
| S.  | Honesty and Integrity.....   | 148 |
| V.  | Prioritisation and Congruence.....   | 148 |
| A.  | Prioritisation of Values in the<br>Constitutional Texts.....   | 148 |
| B.  | Congruence Between Constitutionally Proclaimed<br>Values and Social and Political Reality.....           | 150 |
| VI. | Conclusion.....  | 152 |
| 6.  | Human Dignity, Individual Rights and Equality:<br>The Core Values of the Finnish Constitutional Act..... | 155 |
|     | <i>Martta Ochober and Riikka Salonen</i>   |     |
| I.  | Introduction.....  | 155 |
| A.  | Constitutional Processes at the Gaining of<br>Independence 1809–1917.....                                | 156 |
| B.  | The Development of Finnish Constitutionalism<br>1917–90.....   | 157 |
| C.  | The Reformed Finnish Constitution<br>1995–2000.....  | 158 |
| II. | Explicit and Implicit Cultural Values of<br>the Finnish Constitutional Act.....                          | 160 |
| A.  | Human Dignity, Democracy and<br>Rule of Law.....   | 160 |
| B.  | Equality and Equity.....   | 161 |
| C.  | Justice and Freedom.....   | 164 |
| D.  | Inclusion and Community.....   | 166 |
| E.  | Peace, Life, Integrity and Security.....   | 167 |
| F.  | Compassion and Environment.....  | 168 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| III. | Law in Action—Do the Values Expressed in the Text Conform with Reality? .....                           | 169 |
| A.   | Supervision of the Compliance with the Constitution .....   | 169 |
| B.   | Challenges of the Present Practice of National Basic and Human Rights Policies .....                    | 170 |
| C.   | Equality Provisions in Action .....   | 171 |
| D.   | More to be Done on Inclusion .....  | 173 |
| IV.  | Conclusion.....   | 174 |
| 7.   | Constitutional and Legal Framework for Rights Protection in France.....                                 | 177 |
|      | <i>Michel Troper</i>  |     |
| I.   | Sources.....  | 177 |
| II.  | The Terms ‘Values’ and ‘Principles’ .....   | 182 |
| III. | Values .....  | 185 |
| A.   | Values Mentioned in Constitutional Documents in Terms Identical or Analogous to those of the List ..... | 185 |
| B.   | Values that Relate or are Comparable to some of the List, Although Formulated in Different Words .....  | 187 |
| C.   | Values that Never Appear either in Fundamental Documents or in Court Interpretations .....              | 187 |
| D.   | Values which are not on the List, but are Mentioned Very Frequently in Constitutional Documents.....    | 188 |
| IV.  | Prioritisation .....  | 191 |
| V.   | Congruence.....   | 194 |
| 8.   | Values in German Constitutional Law .....   | 199 |
|      | <i>Dieter Grimm</i>   |     |
| I.   | Constitutions and Values.....   | 199 |
| II.  | Values in the German Constitution .....   | 199 |
| A.   | General Survey.....   | 199 |
| III. | Values in the Basic Law.....  | 203 |
| IV.  | Understanding the Text.....   | 204 |
| V.   | Prioritisation .....  | 212 |
| VI.  | Congruence.....   | 213 |
| 9.   | Crafting Constitutional Values: An Examination of the Supreme Court of India .....                      | 215 |
|      | <i>Menaka Guruswamy</i>   |     |
| I.   | The Constitution of India, 1950.....  | 216 |
| A.   | The Power of the Supreme Court Under the Constitution.....  | 217 |
| B.   | The Emergence of the Supreme Court as a Value Crafter.....  | 218 |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| II.   | Constitutions, Values and the People.....  | 220 |
| A.    | The Preamble of the Indian Constitution—Values<br>of We the People: .....                        | 222 |
| III.  | Fundamental Rights .....   | 224 |
| A.    | The Directive Principles of State Policy .....   | 225 |
| B.    | The Right to Life: A Right that Encompasses All .....  | 226 |
| C.    | Right to Education.....  | 229 |
| D.    | Family/Community .....   | 232 |
| E.    | Freedom/Independence.....  | 233 |
| F.    | Sustainable Development/Environment .....  | 236 |
| G.    | Tolerance and Education/Spirituality.....  | 237 |
| H.    | Justice .....  | 237 |
| I.    | Democracy.....   | 238 |
| J.    | Secularism.....  | 239 |
| IV.   | Prioritisation .....   | 240 |
| A.    | Prioritisation: Creation of the Basic<br>Structure Doctrine by the Supreme Court .....           | 240 |
| B.    | The Content of this ‘Basic Structure’ was<br>Considered and Crafted on a Case-by-Case Basis..... | 240 |
| C.    | Prioritisation: Directive Principles and<br>Fundamental Rights .....                             | 241 |
| i.    | The Literal Approach .....   | 242 |
| ii.   | Harmonious Construction.....   | 243 |
| iii.  | Equally Important—the Balancing Act .....  | 243 |
| V.    | Conclusion .....   | 244 |
| 10.   | Values in Iranian Constitutional Law .....   | 247 |
|       | <i>Nazila Ghanea</i>   |     |
| I.    | Context of Iranian Constitutional Values .....   | 247 |
| A.    | Constitutions and Values.....  | 247 |
| B.    | Historical Context .....   | 247 |
| C.    | Religious Context .....  | 249 |
| D.    | Political Context .....  | 251 |
| II.   | Values and their Prioritisation .....  | 252 |
| A.    | Values Contained in the Constitution.....  | 252 |
| i.    | Fairness, Justice .....  | 252 |
| ii.   | Freedom, Independence .....  | 253 |
| iii.  | Community, Family .....  | 254 |
| iv.   | Responsibility, Accountability .....   | 254 |
| v.    | Integrity, Honesty .....   | 255 |
| vi.   | Compassion, Caring.....  | 255 |
| vii.  | Respect, Tolerance.....  | 255 |
| viii. | Reverence for Life .....   | 255 |
| ix.   | Spirituality.....  | 256 |
| x.    | Learning, Education .....  | 256 |

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
|     | B. Understanding these Values Conceptually .....   | 256 |
|     | C. Realising these Values—The Balance of Powers System .....   | 259 |
|     | D. ‘Human Rights’ in the Constitution?.....  | 263 |
|     | III. Congruence and Priorities?.....   | 264 |
| 11. | Global Values and Local Realities: The Case of Israeli Constitutional Law .....                                  | 267 |
|     | <i>Aeyal M Gross</i>   |     |
|     | I. Introduction: Values in Israeli Constitutional Law .....  | 267 |
|     | II. Sources of Values.....   | 269 |
|     | A. The First Channel for Values: 1948–92 .....   | 269 |
|     | B. The Second Channel for Values: Since 1992.....  | 272 |
|     | III. Examining Values.....   | 276 |
|     | A. Declaration of Independence.....  | 276 |
|     | B. Basic Laws .....  | 277 |
|     | C. Case Law .....  | 278 |
|     | i. Human Dignity .....   | 278 |
|     | ii. Fairness .....   | 281 |
|     | iii. Equality.....   | 281 |
|     | iv. Freedom .....  | 283 |
|     | v. Tolerance.....  | 284 |
|     | vi. Respect for Life .....   | 286 |
|     | vii. Accountability and Integrity .....  | 287 |
|     | viii. Education .....  | 288 |
|     | ix. Family .....   | 289 |
|     | D. The Elephant in the Room: A Jewish Democratic State—Questions of Community, Participation and Inclusion ..... | 292 |
|     | E. The Elephant Outside: The Occupation and the Role of the Security Discourse .....                             | 295 |
|     | IV. Conclusion: Global Values in a Local Context .....   | 299 |
| 12. | Japan.....   | 303 |
|     | <i>Yasuo Hasebe</i>  |     |
|     | I. Context .....   | 303 |
|     | II. Values in the Constitution of Japan .....  | 303 |
|     | A. Fairness/Justice.....   | 303 |
|     | B. Equality .....  | 304 |
|     | C. Honesty/Integrity .....   | 305 |
|     | D. Community .....   | 305 |
|     | E. Family.....   | 305 |
|     | F. Freedom/Liberty/Independence .....  | 307 |
|     | G. Responsibility/Accountability.....  | 307 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| H.   | Compassion/Caring.....   | 309 |
| I.   | Respect/Tolerance .....  | 309 |
| J.   | Life .....   | 310 |
| K.   | Security .....   | 311 |
| L.   | Learning/Education.....  | 311 |
| M.   | Dignity .....  | 312 |
| N.   | Environment .....  | 312 |
| O.   | Participation/Inclusion .....  | 313 |
| P.   | Peace.....   | 313 |
| III. | Congruence .....   | 314 |
| A.   | Judicial Review: Gap Between Text and Law .....                                  | 314 |
| B.   | Constitutional Pacifism: Gap Between<br>Value and Reality .....                  | 316 |
| IV.  | Conclusion .....   | 318 |
| 13.  | Values in the South African Constitution.....                                    | 321 |
|      | <i>Catherine Albertyn</i>  |     |
| I.   | Introduction .....   | 321 |
| II.  | Values.....  | 323 |
| A.   | Values in the South African Constitution .....                                   | 323 |
| B.   | Value Hierarchies? .....   | 324 |
| III. | The 'Universal List' of Values .....   | 326 |
| A.   | Dignity .....  | 326 |
| B.   | Equality .....   | 330 |
| C.   | Freedom/Independence/Liberty .....   | 334 |
| D.   | Responsibility/Accountability.....   | 339 |
| E.   | Participation/Inclusion .....  | 340 |
| F.   | Life .....   | 341 |
| G.   | Community .....  | 343 |
| H.   | Fairness/Justice.....  | 345 |
| I.   | Family.....  | 346 |
| J.   | Integrity/Honesty .....  | 347 |
| K.   | Compassion/Caring.....   | 347 |
| L.   | Respect/Tolerance .....  | 348 |
| M.   | Security .....   | 350 |
| N.   | Learning/Education.....  | 350 |
| O.   | Environment .....  | 351 |
| IV.  | Values, Transformation and Courts .....  | 351 |
| 14.  | Values in the UK Constitution .....  | 357 |
|      | <i>Jeffrey Jowell and Colm O'Cinneide</i>  |     |
| I.   | Introduction and Context.....  | 357 |
| II.  | The Presumption of Liberty .....   | 360 |
| III. | The Primacy of Representative Government<br>(or Sovereignty of Parliament) ..... | 363 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| IV.  | Commitment to the Rule of Law.....  | 368 |
| V.   | The Resolution of Conflict Between the<br>Presumption of Liberty, the Rule of Law and<br>the Sovereignty of Parliament..... | 374 |
| VI.  | The ‘Secondary’ Constitutional Values and<br>Their Impact on Public and Private Law .....                                   | 377 |
|      | A. Respect for Individual Autonomy .....  | 380 |
|      | B. Respect for Human Dignity .....  | 382 |
|      | C. Equality .....   | 383 |
|      | D. Tolerance .....  | 385 |
|      | E. Transparency, Openness and<br>Political Accountability .....   | 387 |
|      | F. Effective Governance .....   | 388 |
|      | G. Latent Values .....  | 389 |
| VII. | Conclusion—The Gap Between Values and Reality .....   | 390 |
| 15.  | Global Constitutional Values in the United States.....  | 393 |
|      | <i>Ruti Teitel</i>  |     |
|      | I. Introduction.....  | 393 |
|      | II. Founding Values.....  | 393 |
|      | A. Freedom/Independence.....  | 394 |
|      | i. Constitutional Incongruence.....   | 395 |
|      | B. Equality .....   | 396 |
|      | i. Constitutional Incongruence.....   | 396 |
|      | ii. Prioritisation.....   | 397 |
|      | III. Free Speech/Expression .....   | 397 |
|      | i. Prioritisation and Congruence .....  | 399 |
|      | IV. Freedom of Religious Exercise.....  | 401 |
|      | i. Prioritisation and Congruence .....  | 402 |
|      | V. Of Liberty and Due Process.....  | 405 |
|      | i. Prioritisation and Congruence .....  | 406 |
|      | VI. Privacy .....   | 406 |
|      | i. Prioritisation and Congruence .....  | 406 |
|      | ii. Congruence.....   | 409 |
|      | VII. The Evolution of Freedom in the Modern State.....  | 410 |
|      | i. Prioritisation and Congruence .....  | 412 |
|      | A. The Debate Over Freedom of Contract.....   | 413 |
|      | i. Prioritisation and Congruence .....  | 414 |
|      | VIII. Conclusion.....   | 415 |
| 16.  | Global Values in the Venezuelan Constitution:<br>Some Prioritisations and Several Incongruences.....                        | 417 |
|      | <i>Allan R Brewer-Carías</i>  |     |
|      | I. Introduction and Constitutional Background.....  | 417 |



|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| II.  | Constitutional Values and their Prioritisation.....  | 419 |
| A.   | Human Dignity.....   | 421 |
| B.   | Fairness/Justice/Rule of Law/State of Justice .....  | 424 |
| C.   | Equality/Respect/Tolerance/Diversity/<br>Multiculturalism .....  | 425 |
| D.   | Democracy/Participation/Decentralisation/<br>Inclusion .....   | 426 |
| E.   | Compassion/Caring/Solidarity/Social Justice/<br>Social State .....   | 428 |
| F.   | Community/Civil Society .....  | 429 |
| G.   | Family.....  | 430 |
| H.   | Life .....   | 431 |
| I.   | Learning/Education.....  | 431 |
| J.   | Honesty/Integrity .....  | 432 |
| K.   | Freedom/Liberty/Independence .....   | 433 |
| L.   | Security.....  | 434 |
| M.   | Responsibility/Accountability/Transparency .....   | 434 |
| N.   | Environment.....   | 435 |
| III. | The Incongruences between Declared Values and<br>Political and Judicial Practice .....   | 436 |
| A.   | Subjection of the Superior Values of the<br>Constitution to its 'Political Project' and the<br>Rejection of the Supra-Constitutional Rank of<br>International Instruments on Human Rights..... | 436 |
| B.   | The Erosion of Public Participation in<br>Political Decision Making.....   | 439 |
| C.   | The Erosion of the Democratic Principle.....   | 441 |
| D.   | The Contradictory State Intervention in the<br>Internal Life of Civil Society Entities.....  | 442 |
| E.   | The Dangerous Expansion of Security and<br>Defence Values.....   | 444 |
| IV.  | Conclusion .....   | 446 |
| 17.  | Conclusion .....   | 449 |
|      | <i>Dennis Davis, Alan Richter and Cheryl Saunders</i>  |     |
| I.   | The Ambiguities: A Critical Assessment .....   | 454 |
| A.   | Freedom/Independence .....   | 454 |
| B.   | Family/Community .....   | 455 |
| C.   | Respect/Tolerance .....  | 455 |
| D.   | Democracy.....   | 455 |
| II.  | Prioritisation of Ascribed Meanings .....  | 455 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| III. Congruence .....                                | 460 |
| A. The Relationship Between Theory and Practice..... | 460 |
| i. Australia .....                                   | 460 |
| ii. Brazil.....                                      | 461 |
| iii. Canada.....                                     | 461 |
| iv. China .....                                      | 461 |
| v. Finland.....                                      | 461 |
| vi. France .....                                     | 462 |
| vii. Germany .....                                   | 462 |
| viii. India.....                                     | 462 |
| ix. Iran .....                                       | 462 |
| x. Israel .....                                      | 463 |
| xi. Japan.....                                       | 463 |
| xii. South Africa .....                              | 463 |
| xiii. United Kingdom.....                            | 463 |
| xiv. United States .....                             | 463 |
| xv. Venezuela .....                                  | 464 |
| IV. Where Does this Leave this Project? .....        | 464 |
| V. The Impartial Spectator.....                      | 467 |
| VI. The Implications Which Flow From This Study..... | 469 |
| VII. Annexure: Law and Versteeg (2011).....          | 473 |
| <br>   |     |
| <i>Index</i> .....                                   | 477 |