
CONTENTS

Preface: Personal Reflection and Acknowledgements vii

Part I

1. Introduction 3

 I. Introducing ‘Strategic’ Human Rights Litigation 3

 II. Overview of Chapters 6

**2. The Growing Field of ‘Human Rights’ Litigation in the World Today:
Context, Trends, Opportunities and Challenges** 9

 I. An Expanding Panorama of Human Rights Litigation 9

 A. ‘Human Rights’ Litigation on the National Level 9

 B. Available International Mechanisms: Expanding Scope
 and Outstanding Gaps 13

 C. Diversification of Actors Engaged in SHRL 18

 D. Developing Law and Broadening ‘Trans-judicial’ Dialogue 19

 E. Increasing Role for *Amicus Curiae*/Third Party Interventions 21

 II. Challenges and Limitations to Pursuing Human Rights Litigation 22

 A. Impediments to Access to Justice at the National Level 23

 i. Legal/Jurisdictional Obstacles 23

 ii. Access to Evidence and Proof 24

 iii. Pressure on Victims and Human Rights Defenders
 and Closing Civil Society Space 24

 iv. Judicial Independence, Impartiality and Capacity 25

 v. Lack of Legal Aid, Resources and Costs 27

 B. Obstacles to Access to Justice at the Supranational Level 27

 i. Outstanding Gaps 27

 ii. Overload and Delays 28

 iii. Growing Politicisation of International Human Rights
 Litigation 29

 iv. ‘Reform’ of Human Rights Courts and Bodies: Positive
 and Negative Consequences 31

 v. Limited Remedies, Reparation and Implementation 33

 vi. The Resources Challenge 34

 vii. The Burden on Victims: Standing and Status,
 Vulnerability and Dropping out 35

3. Understanding Impact: Bursting the Bubble on the Champagne Moment	37
I. Adjusting the Lenses to Capture the Impact of SHRL	37
II. Approaches to Impact and the Meaning of Success	39
A. Impact as Multi-dimensional.....	39
B. Appreciating the Contribution of Litigation in Context: The Wide-angled View	40
C. Impact over Time: The Threat of Litigation, the Power of the Process and the Longer-term View	42
D. Redefining ‘Success’	44
III. Monitoring and (the Challenge of) Measuring Impact	45
IV. Classifications and Distinctions	47
A. Impact versus Goals.....	47
B. Avoiding Sharp Distinctions Between ‘Strategic’, ‘Public Interest’ and ‘other’ Litigation	48
4. Identifying Levels of Impact	50
I. Victim Impact.....	50
A. Judicial Recognition and Vindication.....	50
B. The Restorative and Empowering Role of the Process	51
C. Reparation.....	52
i. Compensation.....	52
ii. Other Concrete Reparation: Restitution, Rectification, Cessation, Protection and Access to Services.....	56
iii. Accountability, Investigation and Prosecution	57
iv. Symbolic Reparation of Victims.....	58
D. From Victim to Survivor to Complainant to Activist	59
II. Legal Impact	59
A. Changing National Legislation	60
B. Triggering Enforcement of National Law.....	60
C. Developing Legal Standards through National or International Jurisprudence	61
D. Shaping Remedies and Procedures	62
III. Impact on Policy and Practice	63
A. Challenging and Changing Policy.....	63
B. Frustrating Policies	65
C. Eroding Impunity.....	65
IV. Institutional Impact, Including Judicial Strengthening	67
V. Information, Truth and the Historical Record	69
VI. Social or Cultural Impact.....	72
A. Reframing Issues, Catalysing Debate and Influencing Attitudes?	72
B. The Humanising Power of the Litigation Narrative	73
C. Recognition, Reconciliation and Restoration of Culture	74

VII. Mobilisation and Empowerment.....	75
VIII. Democracy and the Rule of Law Impact.....	76
IX. Negative Impact.....	77

Part II

5. Case Study—<i>Hadijatou Mani v Niger: Slavery</i> before the ECOWAS Court	83
I. Introduction	83
II. Background.....	84
A. Slavery in Niger and beyond	84
B. Hadijatou Mani's Slave Status and 'Liberation'	85
C. Futile Attempts at Justice in Niger	87
III. The <i>Hadijatou Mani</i> Case before the ECOWAS Court.....	88
IV. The Impact of the <i>Mani</i> Case	91
A. Victim Impact in the Context of Slavery	91
i. Judgment as Recognition	91
ii. Critical Compensation	92
iii. The Power of the Process	92
B. Out of the Shadows: Social and Political Impact	94
i. Exposing and Naming Slavery	94
ii. From State Acknowledgement to Shaping Policy	95
iii. Impact on the Practice of Slavery?.....	96
C. Empowerment and Mobilisation	96
i. Claims by Victims and Survivors of Slavery.....	96
ii. Activists and Civil Society	98
D. Limited Impact on Accountability	98
E. Strengthening Institutions.....	100
i. Domestic Institution Building, Including Judicial Impact	100
ii. Supranational Impact: Launching the Rights Jurisdiction of the ECOWAS Court.....	101
F. ECOWAS and the Law of Modern Day Slavery.....	102
i. Admissibility: Clarifying Non-applicability of the 'Exhaustion of Local Remedies' Rule	103
ii. Nature and Definitions of Slavery	104
iii. Weak Approach to Discrimination and other Violations	106
iv. Trans-judicial Dialogue and Modern Day Slavery.....	107
V. Conclusions	107
6. Case Study—<i>Plan de Sánchez v Guatemala: Genocide</i> in the Inter-American System	109
I. Introduction	109
II. Background.....	110
III. The <i>Plan de Sánchez</i> Case.....	117
A. Developing Community Relations	117

B.	Researching and Preparing the Case.....	118
C.	Filing the Case.....	119
D.	Judgment and Implementation	120
IV.	The Impact of the <i>Plan de Sánchez</i> Litigation.....	120
A.	The Power of the Process	120
i.	Research, Preparation, Confronting the Truth	120
ii.	Setting the Record Straight	121
iii.	Organisation and Mobilisation	121
iv.	Recognition and Apology	122
v.	Acknowledging the Nature of the Wrongs: Naming Genocide in Guatemala.....	123
B.	Reparation and Implementation	125
i.	Developing Collective as well as Individual Reparations	125
ii.	Socio-economic Measures, Health and Education.....	125
iii.	Satisfaction and Guarantees of Non-repetition.....	126
iv.	Cultural and Linguistic Reparation.....	127
v.	Compensation	128
vi.	Duty to Investigate and Accountability.....	129
C.	Impact on Impunity and the On-going Quest for Justice in Guatemala.....	129
i.	Clarifying Accountability Obligations, and Reducing the Scope of Amnesty.....	130
ii.	Prosecuting at Low Levels.....	132
iii.	Faltering Advances towards Accountability at the Highest Levels.....	132
V.	Conclusions	134
7.	Case Study—Arbitrary Detention, Torture and Extraordinary Rendition: Litigating the ‘War on Terror’	136
I.	Introduction	136
II.	Litigating Arbitrary Detention	138
A.	Guantánamo Hábeas Corpus Litigation in US Courts.....	138
i.	The Multi-staged Guantánamo Litigation.....	139
ii.	Reflection on the Impact of the Habeas Litigation.....	142
B.	[Not] the UK’s Guantánamo: Litigating Unlawful Deprivation of Liberty in UK Courts	146
III.	Litigating Rendition and Torture	150
A.	Damages Litigation in Domestic Courts in the US and UK	151
B.	Litigation Relating to Cooperation with the US in Foreign Courts.....	153
C.	Supranational Rendition Litigation: The Impact and Limitations of <i>Abu Zubaydah v Poland</i>	157
i.	Jurisprudential Impact of the Judgment.....	159
ii.	Responsibility and Accountability of the State	159

iii.	Victim Reparation	160
iv.	Representations Regarding On-going Violations	162
v.	Legislative and Institutional Reform	162
vi.	Investigation and Impunity	163
vii.	Broader Visibility, Debate and Social Impact?	163
IV.	Conclusions	165
8.	Case Study—Justice for Enforced Disappearance in Argentina	171
I.	Introduction	171
II.	Background.....	172
A.	Disappearances and Responses during Dictatorship.....	172
B.	Responses Following the Restoration of Democracy.....	175
C.	Evolving Strategies in the Face of Impunity Laws	177
III.	The Nature and Cumulative Impact of Litigation on Enforced Disappearance in Argentina.....	180
A.	Laying the Groundwork: Litigation during Dictatorship.....	180
B.	Transition and Trying the Truth	180
i.	<i>Mignone</i> Case.....	182
ii.	<i>Lapacó</i> Case.....	183
iii.	<i>Urteaga</i> Habeas Data Case	183
iv.	<i>Lapacó</i> Case before the IACommHR.....	184
v.	The ‘Truth Trials’	184
C.	Universal Jurisdiction Cases.....	185
D.	Pursuing Reparation: Nationally and Internationally	188
E.	The <i>Simón</i> Case: Unconstitutionality of Amnesty Laws.....	190
F.	Reopened Trials and the Expanding Scope of Prosecution	192
IV.	Conclusions	194
9.	Case Study—Litigating Palestinian Land Rights	198
I.	Introduction	198
II.	Background to Land Rights Litigation in Israeli Courts.....	200
III.	Impact of Litigation on Land Rights before Israeli Courts?	204
A.	Delay as Success? Slowing the Displacement of Palestinians	205
B.	Occasional Direct Recognition of Rights and Implementation of Orders	206
C.	Challenging, Modifying and/or Frustrating Policies?.....	207
D.	The Preservation of Culture and Heritage	208
E.	‘Holding a Mirror’ to the Problem: Exposure of Unjust Policies, Practices	209
i.	Exposing Fallacies in Official Positions.....	210
ii.	Exposing Discrimination and Deficiencies in the Justice System	210
iii.	Demonstrating Victim Impact and Resilience.....	211
F.	Psycho-social Impact on Victims and Communities.....	211

G.	Reframing the Problem.....	213
H.	Documentation and Historical Records	213
I.	Impact on Legal Culture and the Rule of Law?	215
J.	Paving the Way for International Litigation?.....	215
K.	The Cost of Litigation: Negative Impact and Managing Risk	216
	i. Reprisals and Accelerated Violations	216
	ii. Policy Impact?	216
	iii. Regressive Legal Standards	216
	iv. The Risk of 'Legitimation' and 'Beautifying the Occupation'	217
	v. Complicity or Boycott	218
	vi. Distraction and Disempowerment	218
	vii. Financial Strain and Vulnerability	220
IV.	International Litigation on Palestinian Land Rights.....	220
A.	Foreign Courts and Universal Jurisdiction	221
B.	The Wall Advisory Opinion.....	223
	i. Background to the Opinion	223
	ii. The Wall Advisory Opinion's Impact?	225
V.	Conclusions	228

Part III

10.	Litigating Strategically and Meeting the Challenges.....	233
I.	Strategic Planning (and its Limits)	235
II.	Identifying Goals and Realistically Assessing Risks.....	236
III.	Litigating in Context: Understanding, Naming and Framing the Problem	239
IV.	Litigating for the Long Term: Incremental Change and the Question of Timing.....	240
V.	Strategic Nibbling at the Edges of Injustice v Judicial Confrontation?	241
VI.	Exploiting Litigation Synergies: Movement Building, Legal Advocacy and Reaching beyond the Court.....	242
A.	Litigation and Advocacy	243
B.	The Role of the Media.....	246
C.	Complementary (Non-litigation) International Processes?.....	247
D.	Developing the Right Partners, Networks and Coalitions	248
E.	Educating Judges and Improving Human Rights Literacy	249
VII.	Case Selection, Sourcing and Tactics: Is there a Right Case at the Right Time?	250
A.	Single Case, Sequential Cases or a Series?	251
B.	Paradigmatic or Unique Cases?	252
C.	The Sympathetic Victim?	253

VIII.	Strategic Use of Fora	254
IX.	The Victim in the Human Rights Process: Whose Case is this Anyway?.....	256
A.	The Representative/Client Relationship	256
B.	Victim Protection.....	257
C.	Managing Expectations and Effective Communication	258
D.	The Victim's Role in the Process	258
E.	Multiple Victims and Survivors	259
F.	Collectivising Complaints and Working around Victim Standing?.....	260
X.	Additional Litigation Roles: <i>Amicus</i> , Expert or Observer?.....	261
XI.	Effecting Change in Real Time: Litigating to Stop or Prevent Violations.....	263
A.	Precautionary or Urgent Measures	263
B.	Systemic Change and Non-repetition.....	264
C.	Litigation as a Measure of (almost) Last Resort?	265
XII.	Creative Remedies and Implementation.....	266
XIII.	The Economy of Human Rights Litigation.....	268
11.	Conclusion: Appreciating and Demythologising Strategic Human Rights Litigation	270
<i>Index</i>	275