

Contents

Preface for Instructors	vii
Acknowledgments	xi
1 <i>Linguistic Run-up</i>	1
1.0 Perspective	1
1.1 Nominalization	1
1.2 The Transformationalist Hypothesis	4
1.3 The Lexicalist Hypothesis	7
1.4 Chomsky's Choice	10
1.5 Linguistics and Metascience	13
Selected Reading	16
2 <i>Blueprint of Study</i>	18
2.0 Perspective	18
2.1 Guiding Questions for Study	18
2.2 Outline of Study	19
2.3 Angles of Study	21
Selected Reading	23
3 <i>Choosing Aims for Linguistic Inquiry</i>	24
3.0 Perspective	24
3.1 Introduction	24
3.2 Inquiry in General	25
3.2.1 General Nature and Guiding Aim	25
3.2.2 Choosing Aims	26
3.2.2.1 Choosing an Object	27
3.2.2.2 Abstracting and Idealizing	27
3.2.2.3 Choosing Objectives	28
3.2.2.4 Choosing Criteria of Adequacy	29
3.3 Grammatical Inquiry	29
3.3.1 Components of Aim	29

3.3.1.1	Object of Inquiry	30
3.3.1.2	Abstractions and Idealizations: The Ideal Speaker	32
3.3.1.3	Objectives of Inquiry	34
3.3.1.4	Criteria for Grammatical Knowledge	37
3.3.2	Choosing a Grammatical Aim	39
3.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	40
3.4.1	Components of Aim	40
3.4.1.1	Object of Inquiry	40
3.4.1.2	Abstractions and Idealizations: Instantaneous Language Acquisition	42
3.4.1.3	Objectives of Inquiry	43
3.4.1.4	Criteria for General Linguistic Knowledge	46
3.4.2	Choosing a General Linguistic Aim	47
3.5	Retrospect	48
Selected Reading		
4	<i>Formulating Linguistic Problems</i>	52
4.0	Perspective	52
4.1	Introduction	52
4.2	Inquiry in General	54
4.2.1	Nature of Problematic States of Affairs and Problems	54
4.2.2	Formulating Problems	54
4.3	Grammatical Inquiry	54
4.3.1	Nature of Grammatical Problems	55
4.3.1.1	Substantive Problems	57
4.3.1.2	Metascientific Problems	58
4.3.2	Formulating Grammatical Problems	58
4.3.2.1	Analyzing the Problematic State of Affairs	59
4.3.2.1.1	Determining the Problematic Data	59
4.3.2.1.2	Determining the Grammatical Background Assumptions	61
4.3.2.1.3	Determining the General Linguistic Background Assumptions	62
4.3.2.1.4	Determining the Assumptions about Linguistic Inquiry	63
4.3.2.1.5	Structure of a Problematic State of Affairs	63
4.3.2.2	Describing the Problematic State of Affairs	64
4.3.2.2.1	Pretheoretical Grammatical Descriptions	67
4.3.2.2.2	Collecting Data	67
4.3.2.2.2.1	Recording the Data	68
4.3.2.2.2.2	Evaluating the Data	74
4.3.2.2.3	Systematizing the Data	75
4.3.2.2.3.1	Classifying	77
4.3.2.2.3.2	Correlating	79
4.3.2.2.3.3	Ordering	80
4.3.2.2.3.4	Measuring	81
4.3.2.2.4	Symbolizing	

4.3.2.2.5	Interrelatedness	82
4.3.2.2.6	Taxonomic Linguistic Inquiry	83
4.3.2.3	Constructing Problems	84
4.3.2.4	Evaluating Problems	86
4.3.2.4.1	Assessing for Well-formedness	86
4.3.2.4.2	Assessing for Significance	89
4.3.2.5	The Formulating of Grammatical Problems	91
4.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	92
4.4.1	General	92
4.4.2	Nature of General Linguistic Problems	92
4.4.2.1	Substantive Problems	93
4.4.2.2	Metascientific Problems	94
4.4.2.3	Problems vs. Mysteries	95
4.5	Status of the Formulation of Problems	96
	Selected Reading	97
 <i>5 Making Linguistic Discoveries</i>		99
5.0	Perspective	99
5.1	Introduction	99
5.2	Inquiry in General	101
5.2.1	The Nature of Insight	101
5.2.2	The Nature of Discovery	103
5.2.2.1	Nonrational Aspect of Discovery	103
5.2.2.2	Rational Aspect of Discovery	105
5.2.3	Formulation of Hypotheses as a Modus Operandi	107
5.2.4	Heuristic Strategies	108
5.3	Grammatical Inquiry	110
5.3.1	General	110
5.3.2	Nature of Grammatical Discovery	111
5.3.2.1	Language-specific Discoveries	111
5.3.2.2	Language-independent Discoveries	112
5.3.3	Making Language-specific Discoveries	115
5.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	118
5.4.1	Nature of General Linguistic Discovery	118
5.4.2	Making General Linguistic Discoveries	118
5.4.2.1	Nonguided Nature of General Linguistic Discovery	118
5.4.2.2	The Nonaccidental in General Linguistic Discovery	119
5.4.2.2.1	The Role of Higher-order Principles	119
5.4.2.2.2	The Role of Analogy	121
	Selected Reading	124
 <i>6 Giving Theoretical Linguistic Descriptions</i>		126
6.0	Perspective	126

6.1	Introduction	127
6.2	Inquiry in General	128
6.2.1	Biological Excursion	128
6.2.2	Nature of Theoretical Descriptions	129
6.2.2.1	“Description”	129
6.2.2.2	“Theoretical”	131
6.2.3	Giving a Theoretical Description	132
6.3	Grammatical Inquiry	133
6.3.1	General	133
6.3.2	Nature of Grammars	134
6.3.2.1	Technical Characterization	134
6.3.2.2	Grammatical Concepts	134
6.3.2.3	Ontological Status	138
6.3.2.3.1	Aspects of Linguistic Competence	139
6.3.2.3.2	“Represent”	141
6.3.2.3.3	Nonexistence of Ideal Speaker	144
6.3.2.3.4	Metascientific Perspective	144
6.3.3	Giving a Grammatical Description	146
6.3.3.1	Forming Theoretical Concepts	146
6.3.3.1.1	Explaining Primary Problematic Data	149
6.3.3.1.2	Expressing Linguistically Significant Generalizations	150
6.3.3.1.3	Having Systematic Grammatical Content	152
6.3.3.1.4	Having General Linguistic Content	153
6.3.3.2	Explicating of Concepts	155
6.3.3.3	Integrating of Concepts	159
6.3.3.3.1	Constructing Grammatical Hypotheses	160
6.3.3.3.2	Constructing Grammatical Theories	162
6.3.3.4	Symbolizing the Content	163
6.3.3.5	Elucidating the Content	166
6.3.3.6	Axiomatizing of Grammars	168
6.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	169
6.4.1	General	169
6.4.2	Nature of General Linguistic Theories	170
6.4.2.1	General Linguistic Hypotheses and Concepts	172
6.4.2.2	Ontological Status	174
6.4.3	Nature of General Linguistic Description	176
6.4.3.1	Forming Theoretical Concepts	177
6.4.3.1.1	Explaining Problematic Data	178
6.4.3.1.2	Expressing Linguistically Significant Generalizations	179
6.4.3.1.3	Restricting the Power of a General Linguistic Theory	180
	Selected Reading	182

7	<i>Giving Linguistic Explanations</i>	184
7.0	Perspective	184
7.1	Introduction	185
7.2	Inquiry in General	186
7.2.1	Nature of Scientific Explanations	186
7.2.1.1	Types of Explanation	186
7.2.1.2	Structure of Scientific Explanations	189
7.2.1.3	Logical Nature of Scientific Explanations	192
7.2.1.4	Minimal Criteria for Scientific Explanations	194
7.2.1.5	Additional Criteria for Scientific Explanations	195
7.2.1.6	Theoretical Descriptions and Scientific Explanations	195
7.2.2	Giving Scientific Explanations	197
7.3	Grammatical Inquiry	198
7.3.1	General	198
7.3.2	Nature of Grammatical Explanations	201
7.3.2.1	Function of Grammatical Explanations	201
7.3.2.2	Structure of Grammatical Explanations	202
7.3.2.2.1	The Explanandum	203
7.3.2.2.2	The Explanans	204
7.3.2.2.2.1	Lawlike Reasons	205
7.3.2.2.2.2	Factual Reasons	208
7.3.2.2.2.3	The Logical Relation	209
7.3.2.3	Minimal Criteria for Grammatical Explanations	210
7.3.2.4	Additional Criteria for Grammatical Explanations	211
7.3.2.5	Theoretical Descriptions and Grammatical Explanations	213
7.3.3	Giving Grammatical Explanations	216
7.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	217
7.4.1	General	217
7.4.2	Levels of Adequacy of Linguistic Theories	218
7.4.2.1	Observational Adequacy	218
7.4.2.2	Descriptive Adequacy	219
7.4.2.3	Explanatory Adequacy	219
7.4.3	Sample of an Internal Explanation	221
7.4.4	Structure of Internal Explanations	222
7.4.5	External Explanations	225
7.4.6	A Strategy for Assessing the Genuineness of Linguistic Intuitions	227
7.4.6.1	An Application of the Strategy	228
7.4.6.2	Complexity of the Strategy	232
7.4.6.3	Philosophical Basis of the Strategy	234
7.4.7	Giving General Linguistic Explanations	236
Selected Reading		237

8	<i>Making Linguistic Projections</i>	239
8.0	Perspective	239
8.1	Introduction	240
8.2	Inquiry in General	241
8.2.1	Nature of Scientific Projections	241
8.2.1.1	Forms of Nonscientific Projection	243
8.2.1.2	Scientific Projection	246
8.2.1.3	Structure of Scientific Projections	247
8.2.1.4	Types of Scientific Projection	248
8.2.1.5	Differences between Scientific Projection and Explanation	250
8.2.1.6	Minimal Criteria for Scientific Projections	251
8.2.1.7	Functions of Scientific Projection	252
8.2.2	Making Scientific Projections	252
8.3	Grammatical Inquiry	252
8.3.1	General	254
8.3.2	Nature of Grammatical Projections	254
8.3.2.1	Four General Points	254
8.3.2.1.1	Main Types of Grammatical Projection	255
8.3.2.1.2	Atemporal Nature of Grammatical Predictions	256
8.3.2.1.3	Direct vs. Indirect Grammatical Predictions	257
8.3.2.1.4	Grammatical Predictions vs. Calculations	258
8.3.2.2	Structure of Direct Grammatical Predictions	258
8.3.2.2.1	The Projectandum	261
8.3.2.2.2	The Projectans	261
8.3.2.2.2.1	The Lawlike Generalization	262
8.3.2.2.2.2	The Factual Reasons	263
8.3.2.2.3	The Logical Relation	263
8.3.2.3	Other Characteristics of Grammatical Projections	264
8.3.3	Making Grammatical Predictions	265
8.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	265
8.4.1	General	266
8.4.2	Nature of Internal General Linguistic Predictions	266
8.4.2.1	“Possible Human Language”	268
8.4.2.2	Structure of Internal General Linguistic Predictions	269
8.4.3	Nature of External General Linguistic Projections	269
8.4.3.1	“Possible Linguistic Change”	272
8.4.3.2	A Sample Projection about Possible Linguistic Changes	273
8.4.3.3	Structure of Projections about Possible Linguistic Changes	275
8.4.3.4	Retrospect: External Grammatical Projections	275
8.4.4	Making General Linguistic Projections	276
	Selected Reading	

9	<i>Justifying Linguistic Hypotheses</i>	278
9.0	Perspective	278
9.1	Introduction	279
9.2	Inquiry in General	280
9.2.1	Nature of Scientific Justifications	280
9.2.1.1	General	280
9.2.1.2	The Factual Component	282
9.2.1.2.1	Justification on the Basis of Explained Data	282
9.2.1.2.2	Justification on the Basis of Projected Data	285
9.2.1.2.3	Minimal Criteria for Evidence	287
9.2.1.2.4	Additional Criteria for Evidence	288
9.2.1.3	The Systematic Component	291
9.2.1.4	The Nonobjective Component	293
9.2.2	Giving Scientific Justifications	295
9.3	Grammatical Inquiry	296
9.3.1	General	296
9.3.2	Nature of Grammatical Justifications	297
9.3.2.1	Fragmentary Nature and Complexity	297
9.3.2.2	The Factual Component	298
9.3.2.2.1	Justification on the Basis of Explained Data	298
9.3.2.2.2	Justification on the Basis of Projected Data	300
9.3.2.2.3	Types of Linguistic Evidence	302
9.3.2.2.4	Minimal Criteria for Linguistic Evidence	304
9.3.2.2.5	Additional Criteria for Linguistic Evidence	307
9.3.2.2.5.1	Criterion of Evidential Comprehensiveness	307
9.3.2.2.5.2	Criterion of Evidential Independence	309
9.3.2.3	The Systematic Component	313
9.3.2.3.1	The Acceptability of Grammatical Hypotheses	313
9.3.2.3.2	Acceptability Standards for Grammatical Hypotheses	314
9.3.2.3.3	Logical Status of Grammatical Acceptability Standards	320
9.3.2.4	The External Component	321
9.3.2.4.1	Psychological Reality of Grammatical Hypotheses	321
9.3.2.4.2	A Neuropsychological Justification of the Lexicalist Hypothesis	324
9.3.2.4.3	Nature of External Linguistic Justifications	326
9.3.2.5	Retrospect	329
9.3.3	Giving Grammatical Justifications	330
9.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	331
9.4.1	General	331
9.4.2	Nature of General Linguistic Justifications	332
9.4.2.1	The Factual Component	332
9.4.2.1.1	Justification on the Basis of Explained Data	332
9.4.2.1.2	Justification on the Basis of Projected Data	334

9.4.2.1.3	Types and Criteria of Evidence	335
9.4.2.2	The Systematic Component	336
9.4.2.2.1	Importance of the Systematic Component	336
9.4.2.2.2	Acceptability Standards for General Linguistic Hypotheses	336
9.4.2.3	The External Component	340
9.4.2.3.1	Universality, Psychological Reality, Genuineness	340
9.4.2.3.2	External Justification of Universality	341
9.4.2.3.3	External Justification of Psychological Reality	343
9.4.2.3.4	External Justification of Genuineness	344
9.4.2.4	The Nonobjective Component	347
9.4.3	Giving General Linguistic Justifications	349
	Selected Reading	349
10	<i>Criticizing Linguistic Hypotheses</i>	352
10.0	Perspective	352
10.1	Introduction	353
10.2	Inquiry in General	354
10.2.1	Nature of Criticism of Scientific Hypotheses	354
10.2.1.1	General	354
10.2.1.2	The Factual Component	356
10.2.1.2.1	Criticism on the Basis of Inaccurate Projections	356
10.2.1.2.2	Inconclusive Nature of Refutation	358
10.2.1.3	The Systematic Component	361
10.2.1.4	The Nonobjective Component	362
10.2.2	Criticizing Scientific Hypotheses	363
10.3	Grammatical Inquiry	364
10.3.1	General	364
10.3.2	Nature of Criticism of Grammatical Hypotheses	365
10.3.2.1	The Factual Component	365
10.3.2.1.1	Structure of a Fragment of Factual Criticism	365
10.3.2.1.2	Logical Form of a Fragment of Factual Criticism	368
10.3.2.1.3	Complexity of Factual Criticism	369
10.3.2.1.4	Evidential Criteria in Factual Criticism	371
10.3.2.2	The Systematic Component	372
10.3.2.3	The External Component	374
10.3.2.3.1	Criticism of the Psychological Reality of Grammatical Hypotheses	374
10.3.2.3.2	Nature of External Criticism	374
10.3.2.3.3	A Fragment of External Criticism	375
10.3.3	Criticizing Grammatical Hypotheses	377
10.3.3.1	General Characterization	377
10.3.3.2	Testing Grammatical Hypotheses	378
10.3.3.2.1	Assessing Testability	378

10.3.3.2.1.1	Obscurity of Content	379
10.3.3.2.1.2	Nature of Empirical Data	381
10.3.3.2.1.3	Protective Devices	381
10.3.3.2.2	Deriving Test Implications	382
10.3.3.2.3	Collecting Raw Data	384
10.3.3.2.4	Processing Raw Data	385
10.3.3.2.5	Confronting the Test Implications with the Data	387
10.3.3.2.6	Interpreting Disconfirming Evidence	387
10.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	389
10.4.1	General	389
10.4.2	Nature of the Criticism of General Linguistic Hypotheses	390
10.4.2.1	The Factual Component	390
10.4.2.1.1	Logical Form of a Fragment of Factual Criticism	391
10.4.2.1.2	Nature of Disconfirming Evidence	391
10.4.2.1.3	Nature of Linguistic Universals	393
10.4.2.1.4	General Linguistic Background Assumptions	394
10.4.2.2	The Systematic Component	394
10.4.2.2.1	Logical Structure of a Fragment of Systematic Criticism	395
10.4.2.2.2	Points of Systematic Criticism	395
10.4.2.3	The External Component	397
10.4.2.3.1	Criticism on the Basis of False Projections	397
10.4.2.3.2	Criticism on the Basis of Unaccountable Data	397
10.4.3	Criticizing General Linguistic Hypotheses	399
10.4.3.1	General Characterization	399
10.4.3.2	Refutability of "Relative Universals"	399
10.4.3.3	Refutability of "Absolute Universals"	401
	Selected Reading	403
11	<i>Reacting to Criticism of Linguistic Hypotheses</i>	405
11.0	Perspective	405
11.1	Introduction	405
11.2	Inquiry in General	407
11.2.1	Hypotheses vs. Theories vs. Approaches	407
11.2.2	Types of Reaction	408
11.3	Grammatical Inquiry	409
11.3.1	Nature and Types of Reaction to Criticism	409
11.3.1.1	Indifference	409
11.3.1.2	Reasoned Apathy	411
11.3.1.3	Countercriticism	412
11.3.1.4	Protection	413
11.3.1.4.1	<i>Ad hoc</i> (Auxiliary) Hypotheses	414
11.3.1.4.2	Non- <i>ad hoc</i> Auxiliary Hypotheses	415
11.3.1.5	Modification	417

11.3.1.6	Replacement	419
11.3.2	Reacting to Criticism	420
11.4	General Linguistic Inquiry	421
11.4.1	General	421
11.4.2	Revolution	423
11.4.2.1	The Chomskyan Revolution	424
11.4.2.1.1	Contributory Circumstances	424
11.4.2.1.2	General Content	425
11.4.2.1.3	Types of Consequences	426
11.4.2.2	An Empiricist Counterrevolution?	429
	Selected Reading	431
12	<i>Integration and Diversity of Linguistic Inquiry</i>	432
12.0	Perspective	432
12.1	Integration	432
12.1.1	Integration of Aspects of Inquiry	432
12.1.2	Integration of Aims	436
12.2	Diversity	438
	Bibliography	440
	Index	454