

# CONTENTS

|   |           |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i>   | xiii      |
| <i>Abbreviations</i>  | xv        |
| <i>Table of Cases</i>   | xvii      |
| <i>Table of Legislation</i>   | xxix      |
| <i>National Legislation</i>   | xxxiii    |
| <br>  |           |
| 1 Introduction  | 1         |
| 1.1 Scope   | 1         |
| 1.2 Structure   | 10        |
| 1.3 The Human Trafficking Legal Framework versus the Human Rights Law: Structural Differences | 11        |
| <br>  |           |
| <b>PART I The Human Trafficking Legal Framework</b>   | <b>17</b> |
| <br>  |           |
| 2 Origins, Context and the Currently Valid Law  | 19        |
| 2.1 The Roots of the Concept of Human Trafficking   | 19        |
| 2.2 Re-emergence of Concerns about Trafficking and the Nexus with Organized Crime             | 23        |
| 2.3 The Palermo Protocols as Transnational Criminal Law Treaties                              | 25        |
| 2.4 The CoE Trafficking Convention  | 27        |
| 2.5 The EU Law on Human Trafficking   | 29        |
| 2.6 Conclusion  | 30        |
| <br>  |           |
| 3 The Definition of Human Trafficking in International Law                                    | 32        |
| 3.1 Not a Form of Exploitation  | 33        |
| 3.1.1 The <i>Mens Rea</i> Attached to the 'Action' Element                                    | 43        |
| 3.1.2 Accomplice Liability and the 'Action' Element   | 48        |
| 3.2 Deceptive and Coercive Process  | 50        |
| 3.2.1 The Timing  | 50        |
| 3.2.2 The Threshold   | 54        |

|       |   |     |
|-------|---|-----|
| 3.3   | For the Purpose of Sexual Exploitation                            | 57  |
| 3.3.1 | Drafting the 'Purpose' Element                                    | 57  |
| 3.3.2 | Actors in Opposition to the Term 'Exploitation'                   | 61  |
| 3.3.3 | Feminist Clashes at Palermo                                       | 62  |
| 3.4   | For the Purpose of Labour Exploitation                            | 66  |
| 3.5   | Conclusion  | 72  |
| 4     | Positive Obligations under the Human Trafficking Legal Framework  | 74  |
| 4.1   | Obligation to Criminalize   | 75  |
| 4.1.1 | Establishment of Criminal Jurisdiction                            | 75  |
| 4.1.2 | Approximation of National Substantive Criminal Law                | 77  |
| 4.1.3 | Investigation and Punishment                                      | 80  |
| 4.1.4 | Criminalization of the Use of Services of Victims                 | 82  |
| 4.2   | The Status of a Victim of Human Trafficking                       | 86  |
| 4.3   | The Procedure for Identifying Victims                             | 91  |
| 4.4   | Stages in the Identification Procedure                            | 101 |
| 4.4.1 | The Preliminary Stage under CoE Law                               | 102 |
| 4.4.2 | The Preliminary Stage under EU Law                                | 111 |
| 4.4.3 | The Conclusive Stage  | 114 |
| 4.5   | Assistance for Victims  | 117 |
| 4.5.1 | The Minimum Level   | 117 |
| 4.5.2 | Access to the Labour Market                                       | 120 |
| 4.5.3 | Assistance Not Conditional on Cooperation                         | 122 |
| 4.5.4 | Timeframe of the Assistance                                       | 123 |
| 4.5.5 | Assistance in the Framework of the Criminal Proceedings           | 129 |
| 4.6   | Immigration Status in the Host Country                            | 131 |
| 4.6.1 | Repatriation  | 131 |
| 4.6.2 | Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under CoE Law          | 134 |
| 4.6.3 | Residence Permit for Victims Who Cooperate under EU Law           | 136 |
| 4.6.4 | Residence Permit on Humanitarian Grounds under CoE Law            | 138 |
| 4.7   | Protection from Punishment  | 142 |
| 4.7.1 | '... victims ...'   | 144 |
| 4.7.2 | '... to the extent that they have been compelled to do so ...'    | 146 |
| 4.7.3 | '... provide for the possibility ...'                             | 150 |
| 4.7.4 | '... in accordance with the basic principles of its legal system' | 152 |
| 4.7.5 | '... not imposing ...'  | 155 |
| 4.7.6 | '... penalties ...'   | 157 |
| 4.7.7 | Comparison with Article 31(1) of the Refugee Convention           | 158 |

|   |   |            |
|---|---|------------|
| 4.8   | Immigration Detention of Victims of Trafficking                                       | 160        |
| 4.8.1   | Detention in the Context of Deportation Proceedings                                   | 161        |
| 4.8.2   | Detention in the Context of an Unauthorized Entry                                     | 167        |
| 4.8.3   | Detention during Determination of International Protection Needs and Dublin Transfers | 169        |
| 4.9   | Compensation  | 172        |
| 4.9.1   | Access to Information   | 172        |
| 4.9.2   | Legal Assistance  | 172        |
| 4.9.3   | Compensation from the Perpetrators  | 177        |
| 4.9.4   | State Compensation Funds  | 178        |
| 4.10  | Conclusion  | 181        |
| <b>PART II The Human Rights Law Framework</b> |   | <b>187</b> |
| 5   | The Historical Background   | 189        |
| 5.1   | Colonialism and the Differentiation between Slavery and Forced Labour                 | 190        |
| 5.2   | The Term 'Institutions and Practices Similar to Slavery'                              | 201        |
| 5.3   | The Conceptual Division under Human Rights Law  | 206        |
| 5.4   | Conclusion  | 215        |
| 6   | Definitions with Contemporary Relevance   | 218        |
| 6.1   | Slavery: Exercise of Powers Attaching to the Right of Ownership                       | 220        |
| 6.1.1   | The 1953 Secretary General Report   | 221        |
| 6.1.2   | The ICC Statute and the Elements of Crimes  | 222        |
| 6.1.3   | <i>Kunarac et al.</i>   | 230        |
| 6.1.4   | Destruction of Juridical Personality  | 234        |
| 6.1.5   | <i>The Queen v. Tang</i> and Its Follow Up  | 240        |
| 6.1.6   | The ECtHR and the Definition of Slavery   | 245        |
| 6.1.7   | Slavery and Abuses against Migrants   | 248        |
| 6.2   | Servitude   | 251        |
| 6.2.1   | Particularly Serious Form of Denial of Freedom  | 257        |
| 6.2.2   | Usage of Labour Capacity  | 258        |
| 6.3   | Forced Labour   | 260        |
| 6.3.1   | No Exceptions under Article 4(3) of the ECHR  | 260        |
| 6.3.2   | The Disproportionate Burden Test  | 266        |
| 6.4   | An Absolute Right   | 279        |
| 6.5   | The Distinctions between Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour                         | 285        |
| 6.5.1   | The Gradation Model   | 285        |
| 6.5.2   | The Distinctiveness of Slavery  | 287        |
| 6.5.3   | The Special Stigma of Slavery   | 288        |
| 6.5.4   | Why do the Distinctions Matter?   | 290        |
| 6.6   | Conclusion  | 291        |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| 7     | The Relationship between the Concept of Human Trafficking and the Concepts of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour | 292 |
| 7.1   | 'Dancing' on the Borders of Article 4 of the ECHR and <i>Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia</i>                          | 294 |
| 7.2   | Slavery and <i>Rantsev v. Cyprus and Russia</i>  | 301 |
| 7.3   | The Ineffectiveness of the Concept of Human Trafficking in the Context of Abuses against Migrant Prostitutes       | 307 |
| 7.4   | The Displacement of the Focus from the Actual Abusive Conditions to the Migration Process                          | 310 |
| 7.5   | Addressing Indeterminacy   | 315 |
| 7.6   | Conclusion   | 318 |
| 8     | Positive Obligations under Human Rights Law  | 319 |
| 8.1   | Sources and Means of Interpretation  | 319 |
| 8.2   | Reasonableness, Proximity and Knowledge  | 324 |
| 8.3   | Systematization  | 329 |
| 8.4   | Obligation to Criminalize  | 330 |
| 8.4.1 | The Interaction between Human Rights Law and National Criminal Law   | 331 |
| 8.4.2 | Criminalization under the Specific Labels of Slavery, Servitude and Forced Labour                                  | 338 |
| 8.4.3 | Defining the Crimes at National Level  | 344 |
| 8.5   | Obligation to Investigate  | 351 |
| 8.5.1 | The Conditions Triggering the Obligation to Investigate  | 352 |
| 8.5.2 | Criteria for Assessing the Effectiveness of the Investigation  | 360 |
| 8.5.3 | The Test of Reasonableness and the 'Significant Flaws' Test  | 365 |
| 8.6   | Prosecution  | 367 |
| 8.7   | Obligation to Develop Effective Regulatory Frameworks  | 369 |
| 8.7.1 | Protection by Law  | 369 |
| 8.7.2 | The Importance of Labour Law   | 372 |
| 8.7.3 | Regulating Agencies  | 378 |
| 8.7.4 | The Clash between Protection and Immigration Control   | 380 |
| 8.7.5 | The Opportunities and the Limitations of Human Rights Law  | 387 |
| 8.8   | Obligation to Develop Guarantees in the Identification Procedure   | 394 |
| 8.9   | Obligation to Take Protective Operational Measures   | 400 |
| 8.9.1 | The Knowledge Element  | 402 |
| 8.9.2 | Reasonable Measures  | 404 |

|        |  |     |     |
|--------|--|-----|-----|
| 8.10   | Obligation to Provide for Effective Remedy   | 407 |     |
| 8.10.1 | The Requirements Raised by Article 13 of the ECHR  |     | 407 |
| 8.10.2 | Suspension of Deportation Proceedings and the<br>Procedural Aspect of the Right to Remedy          | 415 |     |
| 8.10.3 | Non-removal as a Form of Remedy  | 421 |     |
| 8.11   | Conclusion   | 424 |     |
| 9      | Conclusion   | 427 |     |
| 9.1    | Historical Corrective and Conceptual Clarity   | 427 |     |
| 9.2    | The Criminal Law Approach Subverts the Human<br>Rights Law Approach                                | 430 |     |
| 9.3    | New Possibilities for Challenging States' Immigration<br>Control Interests                         | 431 |     |
| 9.4    | The Historical Account of Slavery as a Cautionary  | 434 |     |
| 9.5    | The Protection Gap   | 435 |     |
| 9.6    | Better Definitional Articulation of Criminal Offences  | 438 |     |
| 9.7    | Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the<br>Obligation of Investigating Abuses | 439 |     |
| 9.8    | Interactions between the Legal Frameworks in Relation to the<br>Obligation of Identifying Victims  | 440 |     |
| 9.9    | Limited Entitlements Attached to the Status of Victim of<br>Human Trafficking                      | 442 |     |
| 9.10   | The Difficulty of Ensuring Non-removal under the Existing<br>Legal Parameters                      | 445 |     |
| 9.11   | The EU Law on Human Trafficking Undermines<br>the CoE Standards                                    | 448 |     |
|        | <i>Select Bibliography</i>   | 453 |     |
|        | <i>Index</i>   | 465 |     |