

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	xlvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	liii
<b>1. The Creation of the Court of First Instance and of the Appeal</b>	
Section 1. The Objective of the Book	1.01
Section 2. The Creation of the Court of First Instance	1.04
Section 3. The Creation of the Appeal System	1.13
Section 4. The Civil Service Tribunal	1.17
Section 5. The Recast of the Rules of Procedure of the Court of Justice	1.21
Section 6. The Reform of the General Court and its Impact on Appeals	1.23
Section 7. Conclusion	1.27
<b>2. The Concept of an 'Appeal'</b>	
Section 1. Introduction	2.01
Section 2. The Appeal Must Be Directed against a Decision	2.03
Section 3. The Object of the Appeal Must Be the Setting Aside of the Decision	2.15
1. Inadmissibility of an application for a fresh assessment of the substantive issues	2.15
2. Inadmissibility of a new claim	2.20
3. Inadmissibility of an application for revision of a decision of the court sitting at first instance	2.22
4. Inadmissibility of a request for rectification of a decision of the court sitting at first instance	2.25
5. Inadmissibility of a request not provided for in the legislation	2.26
Section 4. The Appellant Must Submit a Criticism of the Decision under Appeal	2.27

Section 5. Inadmissibility of a New Plea in Law Relating to the Substance of the Dispute	2.31
1. The general rule	2.31
2. The possibility of criticising the judgment under appeal in its entirety	2.41
3. Pleas in law relating to the procedure or to the approach adopted by the court sitting at first instance	2.43
4. Amplifying arguments	2.45
5. Public policy pleas	2.48
6. Pleas in law based on the interpretation adopted by case-law	2.60
Section 6. Appeals are Confined to Points of Law	2.61
Section 7. Conclusion	2.62
<b>3. Decisions Open to Appeal</b>	
Section 1. Introduction	3.01
Section 2. Decisions Open to Ordinary Appeal	3.03
Section 3. Decisions on Costs	3.13
<b>4. Contesting the Admissibility of the Action at First Instance</b>	
Section 1. The Case-law	4.02
1. Rejection of a preliminary plea of inadmissibility	4.02
2. Joining a preliminary plea of inadmissibility to the substance	4.07
3. Where the admissibility of the action was not challenged before the General Court	4.10
Section 2. The 2012 Rules of Procedure	4.12
Section 3. Conclusions	4.14
<b>5. The Effects of Appeals</b>	
Section 1. The Principle of No Suspensory Effect	5.01
Section 2. The Exception in Respect of Regulations	5.06
Section 3. Procedural Options Open to the Parties	5.08
1. Applications for interim relief	5.08
2. Requests for the expedited procedure	5.16
3. Requests for priority treatment	5.19
<b>6. The Parties to Appeal Proceedings</b>	
Section 1. The General Principles and the Provisions of the Statute	6.01
Section 2. The Persons or Entities Allowed to Bring a Main Appeal	6.08
1. Ordinary appeals	6.08

## Table of Contents

A. Any party which has been unsuccessful, in whole or in part, in its submissions	6.09
B. Interveners other than Member States and institutions of the Union	6.17
C. Member States and institutions of the Union	6.20
(a) The right to bring an appeal	6.20
(b) Exception: staff cases	6.24
(c) Appeal by Member States who were interveners before the General Court	6.26
2. Appeals against decisions refusing applications for leave to intervene	6.27
3. Appeals against interlocutory decisions	6.31
Section 3. The Other Parties to the Relevant Case	6.37
Section 4. Interveners	6.47
<b>7. Review Confined to Points of Law</b>	
Section 1. The General Rule	7.01
Section 2. No Jurisdiction to Review the Findings of Fact or the Assessment of the Facts	7.10
Section 3. Review of the Legal Characterisation	7.17
Section 4. Checking for Manifest Inaccuracy or Distortion	7.24
1. The concept of distortion	7.25
2. Proof of distortion	7.33
3. Effects of a finding of distortion	7.36
Section 5. Review of the Evidence Considered Conclusive	7.38
Section 6. Review of the Reasons Stated for a Decision or the Grounds of the Judgment under Appeal	7.41
Section 7. Review of Fines Imposed for Infringement of Competition Law	7.44
Section 8. Review Relating to National Law	7.46
Section 9. Review of a Contract	7.48
Section 10. Conclusion Relating to the Fact that Appeals are Confined to Points of Law	7.49
<b>8. Grounds of Appeal</b>	
Section 1. Introduction	8.01
Section 2. Competence of the Court Sitting at First Instance	8.04
1. Review as to the competence of the court	8.04
A. Whether jurisdiction lies with the EU Courts or the courts of the Member States	8.07



*Table of Contents*

---

B. Respective jurisdiction of the General Court and the Civil Service Tribunal	8.08
2. Review as to whether the scope of jurisdiction has been respected	8.09
A. Review of legality	8.11
B. Unlimited jurisdiction	8.17
C. Other areas of jurisdiction	8.18
Section 3. Review of the Conduct of the Procedure at First Instance	8.20
1. Evidence relating to the conduct of the procedure at first instance	8.21
2. The rules governing the organisation and functioning of the General Court	8.22
3. Essential procedural requirements	8.26
4. The conditions for admissibility	8.28
5. Measures of inquiry and of organisation of procedure	8.30
6. The rights of the defence and the principle of <i>audi alteram partem</i>	8.37
7. Failure to rule 'within a reasonable time'	8.42
Section 4. Review of the Modus Operandi of the Court Sitting at First Instance	8.44
1. Re-characterisation of the subject-matter of the action	8.44
2. Duty to state reasons	8.46
3. The obligation to respond to the heads of claim and pleas	8.53
4. Form and content of the judgment under appeal	8.56
5. Breach at first instance of the duty to raise a plea of the court's own motion	8.58
Section 5. Review of the Decision on the Substantive Issues	8.59
<b>9. Consequences of a Finding that the Plea/Appeal is Well Founded</b>	
Section 1. Ineffective Pleas	9.01
Section 2. Substitution of Grounds	9.09
Section 3. Judgment Quashed and Final Judgment in the Case Given by the Court	9.14
1. 'Where the state of the proceedings so permits'	9.14
2. Final disposal of the case by the Court	9.19
3. The provisions of the Rules of Procedure	9.22
Section 4. Judgment Quashed and the Case Referred Back to the General Court	9.23
Section 5. The Scope and Implications of the Quashing of a Judgment	9.25
Section 6. Conclusion	9.31

<b>10. Cross-appeals</b>	
Section 1. Introduction	10.01
1. The origins of the cross-appeal mechanism	10.03
2. The 2012 Rules of Procedure	10.04
Section 2. Classification of Cross-appeals	10.05
1. Where the cross-appeal concerns the admissibility of the action at first instance	10.06
2. Where the subject-matter of the cross-appeal is different from that of the main appeal	10.07
3. Where the cross-appeal has the same subject-matter as the main appeal but is supported by a different plea in law	10.11
4. The special nature of disputes relating to intellectual property	10.17
5. Other types of cross-appeal	10.19
6. Conclusions drawn from the analysis of cross-appeals	10.31
Section 3. Difficulties Giving Rise to Cross-appeals	10.34
1. Referral of the case back to the judges who adopted the judgment under appeal	10.36
2. <i>Res judicata</i> as it applies to those parts of the General Court's judgment which are not contested in the appeal	10.39
3. The authority of the judgments of the Court	10.42
4. The influence of rules of national law	10.43
5. The recent emergence of problems	10.44
6. The form and content of the judgments of the General Court	10.45
Section 4. The Recast of the Rules of Procedure	10.47
Section 5. Advice to Parties Pleading before the Court	10.52
<b>11. The Procedure before the Court of Justice</b>	
Section 1. Introduction	11.01
Section 2. The Written Part of the Procedure	11.05
1. The appeal application	11.05
A. Lodging of the appeal application	11.05
B. Time-limits	11.07
C. The file in the case at first instance	11.12
D. Formal requirements regarding the content of the appeal application	11.19
E. The obligation to be represented	11.32
F. Information relating to service	11.36
G. Opportunity to put the appeal application in order	11.39
H. Form of order sought in the appeal application in relation to the appeal	11.40

## *Table of Contents*

---

I. The requirement regarding precision in the wording of the appeal application	11.48
J. Form of order sought in the event that the appeal is declared well founded	11.57
2. The response	11.66
A. Service of the appeal on the other parties to the relevant case before the General Court	11.66
B. Parties who may submit a response	11.70
C. Content of the response and the form of order sought	11.79
3. The reply and the rejoinder	11.86
4. Cross-appeals	11.99
A. Submission of a cross-appeal	11.99
B. The content of the cross-appeal	11.106
C. Responses, replies and rejoinders in cross-appeals	11.114
D. The ancillary nature of cross-appeals	11.116
5. Intervention	11.119
6. The Court's handling of the case during the written part of the procedure	11.125
Section 3. The Oral Part of the Procedure	11.139
1. The hearing	11.139
2. Delivery of the Opinion	11.152
3. Response to the Opinion of the Advocate General	11.157
4. Opening or reopening of the oral part of the procedure	11.163
Section 4. The Deliberations and the Judgment	11.171
1. The deliberations	11.171
2. The judgment	11.175
Section 5. Disposal of the Case by Reasoned Order	11.178
1. Appeal manifestly inadmissible or manifestly unfounded	11.179
2. Appeal manifestly well founded	11.185
Section 6. Rectification, Interpretation or Revision of a Judgment—Applications Seeking to Remedy a Failure to Adjudicate	11.189
1. Rectification of a judgment or order	11.189
2. Interpretation of a judgment or order	11.192
3. Failure to adjudicate	11.195
4. Revision	11.196
Section 7. Legal Aid	11.197
Section 8. Other Provisions	11.203
1. Interim measures, the expedited procedure and priority treatment	11.203
2. Protection of anonymity and confidential information	11.205
3. Amicable settlements, discontinuance, cases which do not proceed to judgment and absolute bars to proceeding	11.209



## *Table of Contents*

---

4. Joinder	11.212
5. Requests for information—A measure of inquiry	11.214
6. The language arrangements	11.215
7. Costs	11.221
Section 9. The 'Filtering' and Rapid Handling of Appeals	11.224
<b>12. Appraisal of the Current Situation and Future Prospects</b>	
Section 1. The Characteristics of the Appeal System of the Court of Justice	12.02
Section 2. Achievement of Objectives	12.11
1. The caseload of the Court	12.12
2. Judicial protection of individuals	12.18
Section 3. Prospects	12.27
Annex 1: Documents Relating to the Court of Justice and to the Appeals Procedure	285
Annex 2: Steps in the Handling of an Appeal	287
Annex 3: Number of Appeals Brought before the Court of Justice and the General Court	289
Annex 4: Outcome of Appeal Cases before the Court of Justice	291
Annex 5: Well-founded Appeals—Number and Percentage of Cases without Referral and with Referral	293
Annex 6: Dismissed Appeal Cases—Number and Percentage of Judgments and Orders	295
<i>Bibliography</i>	297
<i>Index</i>	303