

CONTENTS

Acknowledgments xiii

Introduction 1

1. The Formal Authority of the Court 5
 - I. Introduction 5
 - II. The Decision to Establish the Permanent Court 6
 - III. Background Assumptions 8
 - IV. The Intended Scope of the P.C.I.J.'s Authority 9
 - A. The Work of the Advisory Committee 9
 1. Jurisdiction 9
 2. Choice of Law 12
 3. Enforcement 14
 4. Summary 15
 - B. The Work of the League Organs 15
 1. The Council of the League of Nations 15
 2. The League Assembly 17
 - C. Summary 19
 - V. From the P.C.I.J. to the I.C.J. 20
 - VI. Conclusion 23
2. The Law the Court May Apply 25
 - I. Introduction 25
 - II. Positivism 25
 - III. The Importance of Article 38 27
 - IV. Introduction to Article 38 28
 - V. International Conventions and General Principles of Law 29
 - VI. Customary International Law 31
 - A. Creating and Destroying Customary International Law 31
 - B. Customary International Law—Weakening the Concept of State Practice 39
 1. Introduction 39
 2. Modern Custom 41
 3. Deriving Customary Law from Values 46

- C. Flaws in Arguments for Modern Custom and Values Theories 55
 - 1. Introduction 55
 - 2. Modern Custom 56
 - 3. Values-Based Approaches 59
 - a) *Jus Cogens*? 59
 - b) Constitutionalism 76
 - D. Summary of Discussion of Customary International Law 77
 - VII. Subsidiary Means for the Determination of Rules of Law 78
 - A. Introduction 78
 - B. Scholarly Efforts to Broaden the Court's Powers 82
 - 1. Courts' Authority as an Element of the International Legal "System" 82
 - 2. Courts' Authority Deriving from a "Need" 84
 - C. Judicial Arguments 85
 - VIII. "State-Centrism"? 89
 - IX. Conclusion 92
-
- 3. Errors of Procedure 93
 - I. Introduction 93
 - II. Errors of Jurisdiction 94
 - A. Disputes over Whether a State Is a Party to the Statute 95
 - 1. Issues from the Dissolution of Yugoslavia: the Facts and the Court's Judgments 95
 - 2. Issues from the Dissolution of Yugoslavia: Analysis of the Court's Judgments 106
 - B. Disputes over the Availability of Jurisdiction under the Optional Clause 112
 - 1. Aerial Incident of 27 July, 1955 112
 - 2. Nicaragua v. U.S., Jurisdiction 116
 - C. Disputes over Compromissory Clauses in Treaties 124
 - 1. South West Africa Cases, Second Phase 124
 - 2. Application for Revision 128
 - 3. Application of C.E.R.D. 130
 - 4. Croatia v. Serbia, Preliminary Objections 142
 - D. Disputes over the Existence and Content of a Special Agreement 144
 - III. Admissibility 156
 - A. Definition 156
 - B. Application 159
 - 1. Cases Necessarily Dealing with the Rights of Absent Parties 159
 - 2. Cases Determined to Be without Object 161

- 3. Cases Requiring Assessment of Non-legal Considerations 163
- 4. Cases Involving Issues Properly Addressed by the Security Council 169
- C. Admissibility—Conclusion 176
- IV. The Operation of the Doctrine of Res Judicata 177
 - A. South West Africa Cases, Second Phase 177
 - B. Genocide Case, Merits 180
 - C. The Cases Compared 181
 - D. Analysis of South West Africa Cases, Second Phase 181
 - E. Analysis of Genocide Case, Merits 185
 - F. Summary 188
- V. Fact-Finding Errors 188
 - A. Introduction 188
 - B. Nicaragua v. U.S. 192
 - 1. Preliminary Issues 192
 - 2. The Court's Fact Determinations 193
 - 3. Analysis of the Court's Fact-finding 198
 - 4. Conclusion 208
 - C. Oil Platforms, Merits 208
 - D. Legal Consequences of the Construction of a Wall in the Occupied Palestinian Territory 212
 - E. Armed Activities in the Territory of the Congo (D.R.C. v. Uganda) 215
 - F. Genocide Case, Merits 220
 - G. Pulp Mills on the River Uruguay 231
 - H. Kosovo Declaration of Independence Advisory Opinion 232
 - I. Application of C.E.R.D 236
 - J. Final Thoughts on Fact-Finding 241
- VI. Summary 244
- 4. Errors of Substance 245
 - I. Introduction 245
 - II. Reliance on Rules of Customary International Law Whose Existence Is Doubtful 245
 - A. Introduction 245
 - B. Cases in Which Rule of Decision Not Derived from State Practice, Despite Its Availability 246
 - C. Cases in Which the Court Relied on a Doubtful Rule to Reach a Doubtful Result 252
 - 1. Introduction 252
 - 2. Nuclear Tests Cases 252

- 3. Nicaragua v. U.S. 260
- 4. Nuclear Weapons Advisory Opinion 268
- 5. Arrest Warrant Case 271
- 6. Oil Platforms 272
- 7. Advisory Opinion on the Israeli Wall 277
- 8. Armed Activities in the Territory of the Congo 282
- 9. Genocide Case 284
- 10. Diallo Case 292
- III. Questionable Approaches to Treaty Interpretation 293
 - A. Introduction 293
 - B. Certain Expenses of the United Nations 295
 - C. LaGrand and Avena 298
 - D. Advisory Opinion on the Israeli Wall 311
 - E. Genocide Case, Merits 312
 - F. Questions Relating to the Obligation to Prosecute or Extradite 315
 - G. Peru v. Chile 318
- IV. Apparent Strategic Behavior 325
 - A. Aerial Incident of 27 July, 1955 (Israel v. Bulgaria) 325
 - B. Certain Expenses of the United Nations 326
 - C. South West Africa Cases, Second Phase 326
 - D. Nuclear Test Cases 327
 - E. Nicaragua v. U.S., Jurisdiction; Nicaragua v. U.S., Merits 328
 - F. LaGrand and Avena 330
 - G. Oil Platforms 330
 - H. Yugoslav Dissolution Cases 331
 - I. Kosovo, Advisory Opinion 333
 - J. Application of C.E.R.D. 334
 - K. Peru v. Chile 335
 - L. Conclusion 335
- V. Summary 336
- 5. The Court's Performance: Quantitative Summary and Suggested Explanations 339
 - I. Introduction 339
 - II. Quantitative Summary of the Court's Performance 340
 - III. Explanations for the Court's Performance 353
 - A. The Setting 353
 - 1. The Situation of the P.C.I.J. 353

2. The Situation of the I.C.J. 354
B. Inferences 362

Final Thoughts 365
Bibliography 367
Table of Authorities 379
Index 395