Contents

Foreword xv
Preface xviii
Acknowledgements and a Note on Archival Research xxi
A Brief Note about Nomenclature – "The Gulf" xxv
List of Figures xxxii

Introduction 1
The Islands – "A Pile of Rock"? 5
Lesser Tunb 6
Greater Tunb 7
Abu Musa 11
Fundamental Legal Questions 15

1 **Origins and Nature of the Dispute** 19
Status and Extent of Independence of the Qawásim Rulers in Lengeh 38
Relevance of the Qawásim Reign in Lengeh to the Disputed Islands 51

2 **The Gulf Islands Dispute in Historical Perspective** 70
The Islands in Antiquity 72
The Islands during the Sixteenth through the Eighteenth Centuries 78
Evidence of Possession or Ownership of the Islands 85
Claims of Ownership of the Islands 86
Use of the Islands 87
Control of the Persian Littoral and the Gulf Waters 87
Reliance on Historical Assumptions and Conjecture – from Antiquity to the Eighteenth Century 88
The Emergence of "Critical Dates" in the Nineteenth and Twentieth Centuries 93
The Events of the Nineteenth Century Prior to 1887 96
The Tunbs 97
Abu Musa 99
The Events of 1887 101
The Persian Position 108
The Qawásim/British Position 110

The Events of 1904 115
The Events of (and Preceding) 1971 123
UAE Protests since 1971 144
Iran's Reply 147

3 Modes of Acquisition and Effective Control of Territory 150
General Rules under International Law 150
Accretion 153
Cession 153
Occupation 154
Subjugation or Conquest 159
Acquisitive Prescription 161
Historical Consolidation of Title 166
Geographical Considerations and the Doctrine of Contiguity 170
Establishing Effective Control over Territory 172
The Concept of Effectivités 173
The Relationship between Effectivités and Title to Territory 176
Subsequent Conduct 177
Other Relevant Concepts 178
Recognition, Acquiescence and Estoppel 178
The Critical Date 182
Intertemporal Law 186
Uti Possidetis Juris *and Its Relation to the Right of Self-determination* 188

4 The Pre-Sixteenth Century Period and the Existence of Historic Rights of Ownership 191
Iranian Claims of Historic Rights of Ownership 191
Challenges in Establishing the Iranian Claims 199
Ancient or Historic Title over Territory under International Law 203
Continuous Display of Authority 203
Insufficiency of Presumptive Evidence 212
Admissibility of Evidence and Unsubstantiated Assertions 221
Nature of Sovereign Functions 223
Loss of Ancient Title/Failure to Maintain Title 224
Consequence of Loss of Ancient Title 228
Analysis of Iran's Claim of Ancient or Historic Title 229
Initial Observations 232
Absence of Direct Evidence 234
Inference, Indirect Evidence, Conjecture and Speculation 238
Conclusions 260

5 The Kingdom of Hormuz, Its Conquest by Portugal in 1515 and Portugal's Defeat at the Hands of Persia and Britain in 1622 265
Were the Three Islands Territories of the Kingdom of Hormuz? 268
In Conquering Hormuz, did Portugal Acquire Sovereignty over the Islands? 283
The Kingdom of Hormuz as a Persian "Vassal" 284
Status of Hormuz's Territorial Possessions after Its Conquest by Portugal 293
Persian "Cession" of Hormuz to Portugal 297
Portuguese "Occupation" of the Islands 299
Did Portugal Subsequently Cede the Islands to Persia? 299
Did Persia Acquire Possession of the Islands through Conquest in 1622? 302
Were the Kingdom of Hormuz or Portugal Sovereign over the Islands by Virtue of Geographical Considerations? 305
Conclusions 315

6 The Early Seventeenth Century to the End of the Eighteenth Century: Were the Islands Still *Terra Nullius*? 317
Recorded Sightings and Visits to the Islands 319
Lack of Persian Sea Power 325
Theories Underlying Persian Claims of Sovereignty 332
Asserted Incorporation of the Islands into the Province of Fars and the Raising of Taxes from the Islands 336
"Contiguity" or Other Geographical Considerations 345
Persian Acquisition of Title through Acts of the Qawásim 351
Conclusions 365

7 The Seeds of Conflict: 1800 until 1887 – Effective Occupation 367
Raising of the Persian Flag at the Island of Sirri in 1887 367
Theoretical Framework for Asserting Acquisition of Title by Occupation 373
Grounds for a Persian Claim of Occupation from 1800–1887 374
Absence of Evidence of a Direct Persian Occupation 380
Persian Occupation through the Lengeh Qawásim 380
Persian "Ratification" of an Effective Occupation Carried out by the Lengeh-Qawásim 394
Grounds for a Qawásim Claim of Occupation from 1800–1887 395
Applicable Legal Doctrines 395
Effective Occupation 395
Special Conditions of the Region 396

Evidentiary Framework – Abu Musa 399
Claims of Ownership and Disputes over Use and Access 399
Building Infrastructure 403
Investigating Crime 404
Exiling of the Ex-Ruler 404
Recognition of Qawásim Title 405
The Hennell Line and Other Considerations 406
Legal Analysis – Abu Musa 408
Intention and Will to Act as Sovereign 410
Display of Sovereign Authority 414
Private Acts Carried out with the Authority of the Ruler 416
Activities or Functions of the State 418
Division of Ownership of Islands between Sharjah and Ras Al Khaimah 422
Conclusions – Abu Musa 425
Evidentiary Framework – The Tunbs 425
Claims of Ownership and Disputes over Use and Access 427
Key Documentary Evidence 432
Legal Analysis – The Tunbs 438
Intention and Will to Act as Sovereign 438
Display of Sovereign Authority 442
Independent Ownership of Greater Tunb by the Qawásim Rulers of Lengeh 445
No Basis for Finding Effective Occupation of Greater Tunb by Rulers of Lengeh 448
Did Qawásim Rulers of Lengeh Hold Partial Ownership of Greater Tunb? 449
Conclusions – Greater Tunb 451
The Lesser Tunb 455
Geographical Considerations 457
Conclusions – Lesser Tunb 459

8 The Period 1887–1971: The Possible "Critical Dates" in the Sovereignty Dispute 462
The Principle of the "Critical Date" 463
Protest and Acquiescence 465
Relevant Events Leading to the Possible Critical Dates 469
The Events of 1887/8: Factual Background 471
The Events of 1887/8: Is This the Critical Date of the Dispute? 479
Abu Musa 479
The Tunbs 482

The "Flag Incident" of 1903/4: Factual Background 490
The "Flag Incident" of 1903/4: Is This the Critical Date of the Dispute? 502
Events Following the Critical Dates 509
The Wönckhaus Affair (1906–1914) 510
Requested Mining Concession on the Lesser Tunb (1908) 518
Construction of a Lighthouse on Greater Tunb (1913) 521
Red Oxide Concession on Abu Musa Granted by the Ruler of Sharjah (1922) 525
Visit of Persian Customs Launch to Abu Musa (1925) and the Detention of an Arab Dhow Approaching Greater Tunb by Iranian Customs (1928) 527
The 1928 "Status Quo Agreement" and the Anglo-Iranian Treaty Negotiations (1929–1935) 529
Various Visits by Iranian Authorities to Greater Tunb (1933, 1934 and 1935) 533
Red-Oxide Concession over Abu Musa (1934/5) 536
Withdrawal of the Flag of Ras Al Khaimah at Greater Tunb by Order of the Ruler (1934/5) 539
Iranian Concession for Mineral Exploration in the Area Around the Islands (1939) 542
Visits of HMS Nearchus to Greater Tunb (1942) 544
Increasing Assertiveness by Iran (Post-Second World War) 545
Iranian Intention to Establish Administrative Offices on the Islands (1948) 546
Planting of Iranian Flag on Lesser Tunb (1949) 547
Visit of Iranian Naval Vessel to Abu Musa (1951) 547
Tripartite Discussions (1954–55) 548
Unconfirmed Reports of Iranian Encroachment on the Islands (1956) 551
Iranian Military Incursions (1961–71) 552
Conclusions 553

9 The MOU Related to Abu Musa, the Seizure of the Tunbs by Iran on 30 November 1971 and Subsequent Events up to the Present 555
Relevant Historical Developments 556
British Withdrawal from the Gulf 556
Negotiations Leading to the MOU and the Seizure of the Tunbs 572
UAE Protests 606

General Responses of the Islamic Republic of Iran 621
Attempts at Bilateral Negotiations 624
Legal Analysis – The Seizure of the Tunbs by Iran 625
No Recognition or Acquiescence by Third States Generally 628
No Acquiescence by Ras Al Khaimah or the UAE 630
Conclusions on the Tunbs 633
Legal Analysis – Abu Musa, Its Rightful Sovereign and the Legal Status and Effects of the MOU 634
Sovereign Ownership of Abu Musa Post-MOU 635
Legal Status of the MOU under International Law 636
(a) *Initial Considerations – The Vienna Convention on the Law of Treaties* 636
(b) *Was Sharjah a State or Did It Otherwise Possess Treaty-Making Capacity in November 1971?* 639
(c) *Sharjah's Status as a State Prior to the 1892 Exclusive Agreement* 641
(d) *Sharjah's Status Following the Conclusion of the Exclusive Agreement* 642
(e) *The Impact of the Exclusive Agreement on Sharjah's Treaty-Making Capacity* 652
(f) *Did the Parties Intend to Create Legal Relations?* 656
(g) *Conclusion* 665
Succession of the UAE to the International Treaties of Sharjah 665
The Case of "Protectorates" 667
Newly Independent States 669
Application of the Principles of State Succession to the MOU 672
Conclusions on the MOU's Binding Nature and UAE Succession 678
Is the MOU Null and Void *Ab Initio* for Having Been Procured by the Threat of Force? 678
Background and Overview 678
Article 51 or 52? 686
Illegality of the Threat to Use Force 689
Evidence of Iranian Coercion and Threats to Use Force 689
Causal Link between the Threats of Force and the Conclusion of the MOU 691
Existence of Quid Pro Quo *Benefits* 696
Loss of the Right to Invoke Invalidity 700

Interpretative Analysis of the MOU, Asserted Breach and Consequences 708
(a) *Scope and Meaning of the Rights and Obligations Arising out of the MOU* 708
(b) *The Iranian "Proviso" and Its Legal Effect* 725
(c) *Conduct of Iran on Abu Musa* 731
(d) *Acquisitive Prescription* 732
(e) *Nature of the Territorial Regime Established by the MOU* 734
Unilateral Termination of the MOU in the Absence of Breach 737
Breach of the MOU by Iran and Its Consequences 740
Loss of Right to Terminate or Suspend 744
Procedural Requirements 745
Potential Role of the United Nations 748
The Security Council 748
The General Assembly 751

10 Evidentiary Value of Maps in Sovereignty Disputes over Territory 759
Evidentiary Value of Maps under International Law 762
International Case Law 766
Seventeenth and Eighteenth Century Maps Produced by the Dutch East India Company – An Early Window on the Islands 788
Maps Relied on by Iran and Scholars Supporting Iran's Claims of Sovereignty 794
Maps of the Eighteenth Century 796
Maps of the Nineteenth Century 802
Maps of the Twentieth Century 840
Assessment of the Evidentiary Value of the Maps Presented by Iran and Its Supporters 847

Bibliography 861
Books and Chapters in Books 861
Articles 869
Other Sources 872
Cases 873
Treaties 875
National Archives 875
Index 878