## Contents

|   | Acknowledgements   | xii  |
|---|--|------|
|   | Table of cases   | xiv  |
|   | List of abbreviations                                      | xvii |
| 1 | General introduction                                       | 1    |
|   | 1.1 Scope of the book 4                                    |      |
|   | 1.2 Methodological approach 8                              |      |
|   | 1.3 Definitional challenges 11                             |      |
|   | 1.3.1 Right to access the internet and digital divide 11   |      |
|   | 1.3.2 'Access to the internet' vs 'right to access the     |      |
|   | internet' 13   |      |
|   | 1.4 Key themes of the book 16                              |      |
|   | 1.4.1 Access to content and access to infrastructure 16    |      |
|   | 1.4.2 Categorizing speech online 19                        |      |
|   | 1.5 Structure of the book 19                               |      |
|   |  |      |
| 2 | The historical context of international debates on a right |      |
|   | to access to information technology and digital divide     |      |
|   | guarantees   | 23   |
|   | 2.1 Phase I: the early years of the UN 25                  |      |
|   | 2.1.1 Communication scholars and NWICO 31                  |      |
|   | 2.2 Phase II: New World Information and Communication      |      |
|   | Order and the MacBride Report 33                           |      |
|   | 2.2.1 UNESCO's Mass Media Declaration 34                   |      |
|   | 2.2.2 The path to broadening the scope of freedom of       |      |
|   | expression guarantees: key elements and findings of the    |      |
|   | MacBride Commission Report 36                              |      |
|   | 2.2.2.1 Medium and content matter, but social context      |      |
|   | of communication is key 37                                 |      |
|   |  |      |

2.2.2.2 Inequalities of access to infrastructure necessitate broader human rights protections 39 2.3 Phase III: the 2003 and 2005 World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) 43 2.3.1 2003 Summit: differing visions and diverging approaches between NWICO and WSIS 45 2.3.1.1 The WSIS mission and participants 45 2.3.1.2 Geneva 2003 Declaration of Principles 47 2.3.1.3 Genera Plan of Action 48 2.3.1.4 2003 Civil Society Declaration at the WSIS 49 2.3.2 2005 Summit: setting the agenda for implementation 50 2.4 Phase IV: the Internet Governance Forum and the WSIS implementation process 52 2.4.1 The IGF's incorporation of a rights-based perspective to address the digital divide 52 2.4.2 The WSIS process emphasizes access to the internet as a development challenge over a human rights challenge 55 2.5 Conclusion: the need to assess the digital divide phenomenon through a human rights legal framework 60 62 3 Negative obligations 3.1 Brief introduction to freedom of expression: Article 10 of the European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR) 64 3.1.1 Restrictions clause 67 3.1.2 Relationship between the margin of appreciation and proportionality 72 3.2 Yildirim v. Turkey 74 3.2.1 Facts of the case and the decision 75 3.2.2 Collateral censorship: evolving criteria for evaluation of interferences with access to the Internet 76 3.2.2.1 Key elements of freedom of expression used to

establish interference 77

- 3.2.2.1.1 Prior restraint and role of the press 77
- 3.2.2.1.2 Importance of the Internet 78
- 3.2.2.1.3 Universal application, protection of means of dissemination, and right to impart and receive 79

|   |        | 3.2.2.2 Prescribed by law: application of principles of      |     |
|---|--------|--|-----|
|   |        | precision and foreseeability 81                              |     |
|   | 3.     | .2.3 Relevant Principles Absent in the Court's Yildirim      |     |
|   |        | Assessment but Present in Kalda v. Estonia and               |     |
|   |        | Jankovski v. Lithuania 84                                    |     |
|   |        | 3.2.3.1 Alternative means assessment and unique              |     |
|   |        | capabilities of the Internet 84                              |     |
|   | 3.     | 2.4 Relevant principles absent in the Court's first          |     |
|   |        | assessments 88   |     |
|   | 3.3 In | nter-American system: similarities and differences 92        |     |
|   | 3.     | 3.1 Scope and content of Article 13 of the American          |     |
|   |        | Convention on Human Rights 93                                |     |
|   |        | 3.3.1.1 Dual dimensions of freedom of expression under       |     |
|   |        | Article 13 94  |     |
|   |        | 3.3.1.2 Restrictions clause - Article 13(2) 98               |     |
|   |        | 3.3.1.3 Limitations of the principles of margin of           |     |
|   |        | appreciation outside the European Court of                   |     |
|   |        | Human Rights 101   |     |
|   |        | 3.3.1.4 Role of the Internet 104                             |     |
|   | 3.4 C  | Conclusions: denial of access to the Internet and prevention |     |
|   | 0)     | f collateral censorship on the Internet 106                  |     |
| 4 | Positi | ive obligations to facilitate access to the Internet         | 108 |
|   | 4.1 L  | Definition, scope, and how to determine whether there is a   |     |
|   | p      | ositive obligation 112                                       |     |
|   | 4.2 P  | ositive obligations to protect against third-party           |     |
|   | ir     | nterference 116  |     |
|   | 4.3 P  | ositive obligations to safeguard pluralism 131               |     |
|   | 4.     | 3.1 Relevant principles of freedom of expression to          |     |
|   |        | safeguard pluralism 134                                      |     |
|   |        | 4.3.1.1 Ensuring effective public access to impartial        |     |
|   |        | and accurate information and to a range of                   |     |
|   |        | opinions 137   |     |
|   |        | 4.3.1.2 Positive obligations to put in place effective       |     |
|   |        | legislative, regulatory, and administrative                  |     |
|   |        | structures 145   |     |
|   | 4.4 P  | ositive obligations to provide access to information 151     |     |
|   | 4.5 In | mplications on potential positive obligations to facilitate  |     |
|   | u      | niversal access to the Internet 157                          |     |
|   | 4.     | 5.1 Regulatory mechanisms and direct support to ICT          |     |
|   |        | access points 157  |     |

|   | possible uses and special procedures to ensure access to               |     |
|---|--|-----|
|   | the Internet for marginalized populations 159                          |     |
|   | 4.5.3 Emphasis on rural or disadvantaged populations 159               |     |
|   | 4.6 Opportunities and challenges for a freedom of expression           |     |
|   | framework to address the digital divide 160                            |     |
| 5 | Looking outside freedom of expression to strengthen                    |     |
|   | digital inclusion guarantees   | 162 |
|   | 5.1 Rights essential in a democratic society 163                       |     |
|   | 5.1.1 Importance of online exercise of freedom of assembly,            |     |
|   | association and participation in free elections 164                    |     |
|   | 5.1.2 Legal recognition of intersection between these rights 168       | •   |
|   | 5.2 Role of the Internet in society and the principle of               |     |
|   | self-fulfilment 172  |     |
|   | 5.3 Non-discrimination: framing of a 'right to access the              |     |
|   | internet' in terms of equality 178                                     |     |
|   | 5.4 Conclusion: creating a more robust human rights legal              |     |
|   | framework to bridge the digital divide 183                             |     |
| 6 | Case study in digital inclusion  | 18  |
|   | Purpose and scope 186  |     |
|   | 6.1 Jalisco's legal framework for La Agenda Digital                    |     |
|   | Jalisco 2013 187   |     |
|   | 6.2 JDA's digital inclusion implementation framework 190               |     |
|   | 6.2.1 Participating institutions 190                                   |     |
|   | 6.2.2 Centre budgets 192   |     |
|   | 6.2.3 Types of facilities 192  |     |
|   | 6.2.4 Available equipment and software 194                             |     |
|   | 6.3 The Digital Community Centres' improving digital literacy,         |     |
|   | increasing access to activities and services 194                       |     |
|   | 6.3.1 JDA policy on programme vision to offer a diversity of           |     |
|   | activities and services available at DCCs 195                          |     |
|   | 6.3.1.1 Centre objectives 196  |     |
|   | 6.3.1.2 Envisioned services and activities for a DCC 197               |     |
|   | 6.3.2 Principle user activities and informational needs                |     |
|   | served 197 6.3.3 Importance of the administrator in building awareness | r   |
|   | of the Internet and its herefits 200                                   | ,   |

4.5.2 Awareness-raising on the Internet's benefits and

|   | implementation of the digital inclusion programme 203              |     |
|---|--|-----|
|   | 6.4.1 Denied or inadequate services 203                            |     |
|   | 6.4.2 Lack of systematic training for administrators 207           |     |
|   | 6.4.3 Lack of central funding for digital inclusion                |     |
|   | programmes 208   |     |
|   | 6.5 Conclusion: toward mutually reinforcing lines of research to   |     |
|   | support bridging the digital divide 209                            |     |
| 7 | Conclusions  | 211 |
|   | 7.1 Access to the infrastructure and access to content 212         |     |
|   | 7.2 Difficulties in categorizing speech online 216                 |     |
|   | 7.3 Mapping international legal standards 218                      |     |
|   | 7.4 Linking human rights protection to the digital divide: setting |     |
|   | an inter-disciplinary agenda to bridge the digital divide 221      |     |
|   | Bibliography   | 224 |
|   | Index  | 241 |
|   |  |     |

6.4 Challenges or barriers preventing the effective