



© Portokalis/Shutterstock, Inc.

# Table of Contents

Preface		xix
Prologue		ix
<b>Part I</b>	<b>Foundations</b>	<b>1</b>
Chapter 1	Introduction: A Framework for Public Health Ethics <i>by James F. Childress and Ruth Gaare Bernheim</i>	3
	Introduction: Public Health Ethics: A Preliminary Analysis	3
	What Is Public Health Ethics?	4
	Public Philosophy	5
	Moral Norms	5
	Moral Considerations in Public Health	5
	Relations Between Moral Norms and Public Health	5
	Addressing Ethical Conflicts and Dilemmas in Public Health	6
	Absolutist and Contextualist Approaches	6
	A Presumptivist Approach	7
	Interlude: Summary	7
	Justificatory Conditions for Overriding Norms in Conflict Situations	7
	Public Justification in Context	9
	Ethical Conflicts: Pervasive or Occasional?	10
	Ethical Dimensions of Public Health Decisions	10
	Competing Claims about Ethical Trade-offs in Public Health	11
	Scope of Societal Values: Inclusion of Personal Values	11
	Historical Perspective on Conflicts in Public Health	11

	Analyzing Ethical Issues in Particular Situations	12
	The Role of the Public Health Code of Ethics	13
	Metaphors in Public Health Ethics	14
	Public Health as Warfare	14
	Public Health as Stewardship	16
	Conclusions	17
	Discussion Questions	18
	References	19
Chapter 2	Moral Considerations: Bases and Limits for Public Health Interventions	21
	<i>by James F. Childress</i>	
	Introduction	21
	Utility: Balancing Probable Benefits, Costs, and Risks	22
	Utility	22
	Cost-Effectiveness and Cost-Benefit Analyses	23
	Risk Assessment	25
	Variations in Risk Perception	25
	Distributive Justice	25
	Formal Justice and Material Justice	26
	Theories of Distributive Justice	26
	Excursus: Just Care in a Public Health Crisis: Utility and Egalitarian Justice	28
	Triage in a Public Health Crisis	28
	Types of Utility-based Triage	28
	Applications of Medical and Social Utility	29
	Public Participation, Public Trust, and Social Stability	30
	Fair Procedures and Processes	31
	Respect for Autonomous Choices and Liberties	32
	The Intervention Ladder	32
	Paternalistic Interventions	37
	Privacy and Confidentiality	38
	Privacy	38
	Confidentiality	39
	Conclusions	41
	Discussion Questions	42
	References	43
Chapter 3	The Political and Legal Context of Public Health Ethics	45
	<i>by Ruth Gaare Bernheim and Richard J. Bonnie</i>	
	Introduction	45
	The Relationship Between Law and Ethics in Public Health	46

	Source and Distribution of Government Authority in Public Health	49
	Case Study: Bathhouse Scenario	51
	Constraints on Government Authority: Balancing Individual and Public Interests	53
	Does Government Have a Duty to Protect Health?	59
	Law as a Tool for Improving Public Health	60
	Public Deliberation and Leadership	63
	Case Study: Smoke-Free Policies in Outdoor Public Spaces	68
	Conclusions	69
	Discussion Questions	70
	References	71
Chapter 4	Public Health Perspectives	73
	<i>by Ruth Gaare Bernheim</i>	
	Introduction	73
	Improving Population Health	74
	Evidence-Based and Value-Based Approaches	75
	Setting Goals in State and Local Public Health	77
	Case Study: Addressing Heart Disease	77
	Proposals for Advisory Committee Review	80
	Population Prevention	81
	Implications of Population-Wide Approaches	82
	Determinants and Pathways	83
	Ecological Approaches and Health Inequalities	84
	Evidence in Public Health Practice	86
	Healthy Communities: Collaborations, Stakeholders, and Systems	88
	Conclusions	90
	Discussion Questions	92
	References	93
Part II	Tools and Interventions in Public Health	95
Chapter 5	Surveillance and Public Health Data: The Foundation and Eyes of Public Health	97
	<i>by James F. Childress</i>	
	Introduction	97
	Public Health Surveillance: Its Nature and Goals	98
	What Is Public Health Surveillance?	98
	Types of Public Health Surveillance	98
	Who Is Involved in Public Health Surveillance?	99

	Surveillance: Necessary but Insufficient for Effective Public Health	99
	Health Security, Securitization, and Surveillance	101
	Ethical Considerations in Public Health Surveillance	101
	Practice vs. Research: Is the Distinction Ethically Significant for Surveillance?	103
	The Practice/Research Distinction in Public Health Surveillance	103
	Ethical Review of the Public Health Practice of Surveillance	106
	CHEERS: A Case of Ethically Unjustified Research?	107
	Case Study: Nonconsensual Name-Based Surveillance of	
	Diabetes Control	109
	New York City's Surveillance Program for Inadequately	
	Controlled Diabetes	109
	Ethical Issues Raised by the NYC Diabetes Surveillance Program	109
	Ethical Analysis and Assessment of the NYC Diabetes Surveillance Program	113
	Public Disclosure of Surveillance Data	115
	Conclusions	115
	Discussion Questions	116
	References	117
Chapter 6	Case Finding: Screening, Testing, and Contact Tracing	119
	<i>by Alan L. Melnick</i>	
	Introduction	119
	Newborn Screening	120
	Case Contact Tracing and Contact (Partner) Notification	122
	Summary: Newborn Screening and Contact Tracing/Notification	123
	Screening and Coerced Treatment of a Pregnant Woman for HIV Infection	123
	Overview of Prenatal HIV Screening and Treatment	123
	Case Description	128
	Ethics Framework	128
	HIV/Syphilis Contact Investigation and Partner Notification	134
	Overview of Contact Investigation and Partner Notification	134
	Case Description	135
	Ethics Framework	135
	Conclusions	139
	Discussion Questions	141
	References	142
Chapter 7	Immunization: Protection Through Vaccination	145
	<i>by James F. Childress</i>	
	Introduction	145
	Mass Immunization Programs: Justifications	146
	<i>Jacobson v. Massachusetts</i>	146

	Societal Self-Defense for the Common Good	146
	Balancing Principles	147
	More Specific Guidance for Mass Immunization Programs	148
	Voluntary and Mandatory Immunization Programs	148
	Persuasion and/or Coercion?	148
	Incentive Rewards or Monetary Sanctions?	149
	Targeted Vaccinations	151
	Case Study: Annual Influenza Vaccination for Nursing Home Staff:	
	Mandatory or Voluntary?	151
	Exemptions from Mandatory Vaccination Programs	152
	Variations in State Exemptions	152
	Exemption of Conscientious Objectors	154
	Case Study: Should Religiously Based and Philosophical/Personal	
	Objections to Vaccinations Be Recognized as Bases for Exemption?	154
	Religious Convictions	154
	Philosophical and Personal Beliefs	155
	Free Choices or Hurdles and Nudges?	155
	Case Study: Debating Whether the HPV Vaccination Should Be Mandatory	156
	Background	156
	Pro and Con Arguments About the HPV Vaccine	156
	For Females Only?	158
	Cost	158
	Symbolic Significance of Legal Mandates	159
	Exemption from HPV Mandates	159
	Justice, Fairness, and Compensation for Vaccine-Related Injuries	159
	Allocating Scarce Vaccines: Utility and Fairness	160
	Case Study: Allocating Influenza Vaccine in a Serious Shortage:	
	The 2004–2005 “Crisis”	160
	Background	160
	Public Health Decisions About Vaccine Allocation	161
	Other Criteria and Methods of Rationing Vaccine	163
	Lessons Learned, Questions Raised for a Possible Influenza Pandemic	164
	Conclusions	166
	Discussion Questions	167
	References	168
Chapter 8	Containing Communicable Diseases: Personal Control Measures	171
	<i>by Alan L. Melnick</i>	
	Introduction	171
	Directly Observed Therapy for Multiple Drug-Resistant Tuberculosis	172
	Background	172

	Case 1: Ordering Directly Observed Therapy for MDR TB	173
	Background	173
	Ethical Analysis and Assessment of this Case	174
	Personal and Community Control Measures in Response to Outbreak of Severe Respiratory Illness	179
	Background	179
	Monitoring: Active and Passive	180
	Types of Quarantine	180
	Focused and Community-Wide Measures to Create Social Distance: Benefit-Risk Analysis	181
	Case 2: Controlling Severe Respiratory Illness of Unknown Etiology at a Major University	182
	Background	183
	Ethical Framework	183
	Conclusions	188
	Discussion Questions	189
	References	190
Chapter 9	Health Communication	193
	<i>by Ruth Gaare Bernheim and Richard J. Bonnie</i>	
	Introduction	193
	Government's Role in Using and Regulating Mass Communication	194
	Early Government Health Education Efforts	194
	Possible Aims and Justifications	195
	Overview of First Amendment Constraints	196
	Principles and Concepts	196
	Commercial Advertising	197
	Mandated Factual Disclosures	198
	Government Speech	198
	Aggressive Tobacco Control: New Frontiers of the First Amendment	199
	Restrictions on Tobacco Advertising	200
	Aggressive Package Regulation	202
	Government-Supported Media Campaigns	206
	Ethical Dimensions of Government Communication	207
	Providing Information	207
	Persuading With and Without Explicit Reasons	208
	Marketing Health	210
	Empowering Health	210
	Conclusions	214
	Discussion Questions	215
	References	216

Chapter 10	Public Health and the Environment	219
	<i>by Alan L. Melnick</i>	
	Introduction	219
	Part 1: Ethical Perspectives on Environmental Policies:	
	Water Fluoridation and Lead	221
	Water Fluoridation: Too Much or Too Little?	221
	Fluoridation History and Trends	221
	Benefits of Fluoridation	223
	Opposition to Fluoridation	223
	Continuing Deliberation	224
	Lead: Too Much for Some	224
	Part 2: Environmental Public Health Practice	227
	Introduction	227
	Case Study: Lead Poisoning at a Private Indoor Shooting Range	228
	Ethical Framework	232
	Case Study: Banning Raw Milk Sales at Local Farmers' Markets	239
	Ethical Framework	240
	Conclusions	244
	Discussion Questions	246
	References	247
Index		249

This book grows out of our many collaborations enabled us to develop the frameworks for this book. This is an integrated book, which draws on our shared experiences, but we decided it would be useful to list the primary author or authors for each chapter.

We have dedicated this book to our many students and colleagues from whom we have learned so much. Our interactions with students in the classroom as well as those with colleagues in co-teaching, collaborative projects, and other settings have stimulated our reflections and helped us refine our ideas. They have also given us confidence that the frameworks we use in this book can be helpful.

We thank several doctoral students in ethics in the Department of Religious Studies at the University of Virginia for their valuable assistance in the preparation of this book. Laura Alexander, Matthew Puffer, and Mark Storslee provided research assistance on bibliography and arguments for several chapters, and Betty Mesard, Travis Pickell, and Matthew Puffer prepared the teaching ancillaries. We are also grateful to Aaron Pennow for his help in developing several figures for the book. James Childress wishes to thank his colleagues at the Centre for the Advanced Study of Bioethics at the University of Münster for helpful conversations on John Stuart Mill, public health ethics, and paternalism, in May and June of 2011. Ruth Gatzke Bernheim wishes to express her appreciation to Deas Barrett and Leonard Ortmann in the Public Health Ethics Unit at the Centers for Disease Control and Prevention.

Ruth Gatzke Bernheim, James P. Childress, Richard J. Bonnie, and Alan L. Melnick