

8	Assessing risk of bias in a randomised trial	4
8.1	Introduction	4.1
8.2	Overview of RoB 2	4.2
8.3	Bias arising from the randomization process	4.3
8.4	Bias due to deviations from intended strategies	4.4
8.5	Bias due to missing data	4.5
8.6	Bias in measurement of the outcome	4.6
8.7	Bias in selection of the reported result	4.7
8.8	Differences from the previous version of the tool	4.8
8.9	References	4.9
8.10	References	4.10
Contents		
9	Contributors	xiii
10	Preface	xxiii
Part One Core methods		
1	Starting a review	3
1.1	Why do a systematic review?	3
1.2	What is the review question?	4
1.3	Who should do a systematic review?	5
1.4	The importance of reliability	7
1.5	Protocol development	8
1.6	Data management and quality assurance	11
1.7	Chapter information	12
1.8	References	12
2	Determining the scope of the review and the questions it will address	13
2.1	Rationale for well-formulated questions	13
2.2	Aims of reviews of interventions	15
2.3	Defining the scope of a review question	16
2.4	Ensuring the review addresses the right questions	21
2.5	Methods and tools for structuring the review	24
2.6	Chapter information	29
2.7	References	29
3	Defining the criteria for including studies and how they will be grouped for the synthesis	33
3.1	Introduction	33
3.2	Articulating the review and comparison PICO	35
3.3	Determining which study designs to include	51
3.4	Eligibility based on publication status and language	60
3.5	Chapter information	61
3.6	References	61

4	Searching for and selecting studies	67
4.1	Introduction	68
4.2	General issues	68
4.3	Sources to search	70
4.4	Designing search strategies	79
4.5	Documenting and reporting the search process	90
4.6	Selecting studies	92
4.7	Chapter information	99
4.8	References	99
5	Collecting data	109
5.1	Introduction	109
5.2	Sources of data	110
5.3	What data to collect	114
5.4	Data collection tools	125
5.5	Extracting data from reports	130
5.6	Extracting study results and converting to the desired format	136
5.7	Managing and sharing data	136
5.8	Chapter information	137
5.9	References	137
6	Choosing effect measures and computing estimates of effect	143
6.1	Types of data and effect measures	143
6.2	Study designs and identifying the unit of analysis	145
6.3	Extracting estimates of effect directly	148
6.4	Dichotomous outcome data	150
6.5	Continuous outcome data	156
6.6	Ordinal outcome data and measurement scales	168
6.7	Count and rate data	170
6.8	Time-to-event data	172
6.9	Conditional outcomes only available for subsets of participants	173
6.10	Chapter information	174
6.11	References	174
7	Considering bias and conflicts of interest among the included studies	177
7.1	Introduction	177
7.2	Empirical evidence of bias	180
7.3	General procedures for risk-of-bias assessment	185
7.4	Presentation of assessment of risk of bias	188
7.5	Summary assessments of risk of bias	188
7.6	Incorporating assessment of risk of bias into analyses	190
7.7	Considering risk of bias due to missing results	192
7.8	Considering source of funding and conflict of interest of authors of included studies	193
7.9	Chapter information	199
7.10	References	199

8	Assessing risk of bias in a randomized trial	205
8.1	Introduction	205
8.2	Overview of RoB 2	206
8.3	Bias arising from the randomization process	212
8.4	Bias due to deviations from intended interventions	214
8.5	Bias due to missing outcome data	217
8.6	Bias in measurement of the outcome	220
8.7	Bias in selection of the reported result	221
8.8	Differences from the previous version of the tool	225
8.9	Chapter information	226
8.10	References	227
9	Summarizing study characteristics and preparing for synthesis	229
9.1	Introduction	229
9.2	A general framework for synthesis	230
9.3	Preliminary steps of a synthesis	231
9.4	Checking data before synthesis	238
9.5	Types of synthesis	238
9.6	Chapter information	240
9.7	References	240
10	Analysing data and undertaking meta-analyses	241
10.1	Do not start here!	242
10.2	Introduction to meta-analysis	242
10.3	A generic inverse-variance approach to meta-analysis	245
10.4	Meta-analysis of dichotomous outcomes	246
10.5	Meta-analysis of continuous outcomes	251
10.6	Combining dichotomous and continuous outcomes	254
10.7	Meta-analysis of ordinal outcomes and measurement scales	255
10.8	Meta-analysis of counts and rates	255
10.9	Meta-analysis of time-to-event outcomes	256
10.10	Heterogeneity	257
10.11	Investigating heterogeneity	265
10.12	Missing data	272
10.13	Bayesian approaches to meta-analysis	276
10.14	Sensitivity analyses	277
10.15	Chapter information	279
10.16	References	280
11	Undertaking network meta-analyses	285
11.1	What is network meta-analysis?	285
11.2	Important concepts	287
11.3	Planning a Cochrane Review to compare multiple interventions	293
11.4	Synthesis of results	297
11.5	Evaluating confidence in the results of a network meta-analysis	304
11.6	Presenting network meta-analyses	309

11.7	Concluding remarks	315
11.8	Chapter information	316
11.9	References	316
12	Synthesizing and presenting findings using other methods	321
12.1	Why a meta-analysis of effect estimates may not be possible	321
12.2	Statistical synthesis when meta-analysis of effect estimates is not possible	324
12.3	Visual display and presentation of the data	330
12.4	Worked example	333
12.5	Chapter information	345
12.6	References	346
13	Assessing risk of bias due to missing results in a synthesis	349
13.1	Introduction	350
13.2	Minimizing risk of bias due to missing results	351
13.3	A framework for assessing risk of bias due to missing results in a synthesis	354
13.4	Summary	369
13.5	Chapter information	370
13.6	References	370
14	Completing ‘Summary of findings’ tables and grading the certainty of the evidence	375
14.1	‘Summary of findings’ tables	375
14.2	Assessing the certainty or quality of a body of evidence	389
14.3	Describing the assessment of the certainty of a body of evidence using the GRADE framework	398
14.4	Chapter information	399
14.5	References	399
15	Interpreting results and drawing conclusions	403
15.1	Introduction	403
15.2	Issues of indirectness and applicability	405
15.3	Interpreting results of statistical analyses	408
15.4	Interpreting results from dichotomous outcomes (including numbers needed to treat)	411
15.5	Interpreting results from continuous outcomes (including standardized mean differences)	416
15.6	Drawing conclusions	422
15.7	Chapter information	427
15.8	References	428
Part Two Specific perspectives in reviews		433
16	Equity and specific populations	435
16.1	Introduction to equity in systematic reviews	435
16.2	Formulation of the review	437

16.3	Identification of evidence	441
16.4	Appraisal of evidence	443
16.5	Synthesis of evidence	443
16.6	Interpretation of evidence	444
16.7	Concluding remarks	445
16.8	Chapter information	445
16.9	References	445
17	Intervention complexity	451
17.1	Introduction	451
17.2	Formulation of the review	461
17.3	Identification of evidence	468
17.4	Appraisal of evidence	469
17.5	Synthesis of evidence	469
17.6	Interpretation of evidence	472
17.7	Chapter information	473
17.8	References	474
18	Patient-reported outcomes	479
18.1	Introduction to patient-reported outcomes	479
18.2	Formulation of the review	480
18.3	Appraisal of evidence	482
18.4	Synthesis and interpretation of evidence	485
18.5	Chapter information	488
18.6	References	489
19	Adverse effects	493
19.1	Introduction to issues in addressing adverse effects	493
19.2	Formulation of the review	496
19.3	Identification of evidence	500
19.4	Appraisal of evidence	502
19.5	Synthesis and interpretation of evidence	503
19.6	Chapter information	504
19.7	References	505
20	Economic evidence	507
20.1	Introduction	507
20.2	Formulation of the review	512
20.3	Identification of evidence	517
20.4	Appraisal of evidence	519
20.5	Synthesis and interpretation of evidence	519
20.6	Chapter information	521
20.7	References	522
21	Qualitative evidence	525
21.1	Introduction	525

21.2 Designs for synthesizing and integrating qualitative evidence with intervention reviews 526

21.3 Defining qualitative evidence and studies 527

21.4 Planning a qualitative evidence synthesis linked to an intervention review 528

21.5 Question development 529

21.6 Questions exploring intervention implementation 530

21.7 Searching for qualitative evidence 531

21.8 Assessing methodological strengths and limitations of qualitative studies 532

21.9 Selecting studies to synthesize 533

21.10 Selecting a qualitative evidence synthesis and data extraction method 534

21.11 Data extraction 534

21.12 Assessing the confidence in qualitative synthesized findings 537

21.13 Methods for integrating the qualitative evidence synthesis with an intervention review 537

21.14 Reporting the protocol and qualitative evidence synthesis 538

21.15 Chapter information 539

21.16 References 539

Part Three Further topics 547

22 Prospective approaches to accumulating evidence 549

22.1 Introduction 549

22.2 Evidence surveillance: active monitoring of the accumulating evidence 550

22.3 Prospectively planned meta-analysis 554

22.4 Statistical analysis of accumulating evidence 561

22.5 Chapter information 564

22.6 References 565

23 Including variants on randomized trials 569

23.1 Cluster-randomized trials 569

23.2 Crossover trials 576

23.3 Studies with more than two intervention groups 585

23.4 Chapter information 590

23.5 References 591

24 Including non-randomized studies on intervention effects 595

24.1 Introduction 595

24.2 Developing criteria for including non-randomized studies of interventions 601

24.3 Searching for non-randomized studies of interventions 606

24.4 Selecting studies and collecting data 608

24.5 Assessing risk of bias in non-randomized studies 610

24.6 Synthesis of results from non-randomized studies 611

24.7 Interpretation and discussion 614

24.8 Chapter information 617

24.9 References 617

25 Assessing risk of bias in a non-randomized study 621

25.1 Introduction 622

25.2 Biases in non-randomized studies 623

25.3 The ROBINS-I tool 626

25.4 Risk of bias in follow-up (cohort) studies 632

25.5 Risk of bias in uncontrolled before-after studies (including interrupted time series) 635

25.6 Risk of bias in controlled before-after studies 638

25.7 Chapter information 640

25.8 References 640

26 Individual participant data 643

26.1 Introduction 643

26.2 Collecting IPD 647

26.3 Managing and checking IPD 650

26.4 Analysis of IPD 652

26.5 Reporting IPD reviews 655

26.6 Appraising the quality of IPD reviews 655

26.7 Chapter information 655

26.8 References 655

Centre for Statistics in Medicine

University of Oxford

Oxford

UK

Azka, Patricia

Institute of Health and Society

Newcastle University

Newcastle upon Tyne

UK

Aziz, Lisa M

MRC Clinical Trials Centre

University of Sydney

Sydney

Australia

Boston, Dorcas E

Institute for Work & Health

Toronto, Ontario

Canada

Berlin, Jesse A

Department of Epidemiology

Johnson & Johnson

USA

*Deceased 3 June 2018

Titusville, NJ

USA

Bhaumik, Soumyadeep

The George Institute for

Global Health

New Delhi

India

Bingham III, Clifton O

Department of Rheumatology

Johns Hopkins University

Baltimore, MD

USA

Boers, Maarten

Department of Epidemiology and

Biostatistics

Amsterdam UMC

Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam

Amsterdam

The Netherlands

Booth, Andrew

School of Health and

Related Research

University of Sheffield

Sheffield

UK

Boutron, Isabelle

METHODS team, Centre of Research

in Epidemiology and Statistics

(CRESS-UMR1153),

INSERM/Paris Descartes University;