

# Contents

## DEBATES IN THE PRESS AND IN PRIVATE CORRESPONDENCE

January 14–August 9, 1788

- Robert Yates and John Lansing, Jr., to Governor George Clinton, January 14, 1788  
*On the Likely Failure of Liberty: The Dissent of Two New York Delegates to the Philadelphia Convention* . . . . . 3
- Hugh Ledlie to John Lamb, January 15, 1788  
*"Beware, Beware, Beware, For I Apprehend a Dreadful Snare"* . . . . . 7
- Nathaniel Barrell to George Thatcher, January 15, 1788  
*Will Congress Remain a Faithful Guardian?* . . . . . 16
- Rawlins Lowndes and Edward Rutledge Debate in the South Carolina Legislature, January 16, 1788  
*Should One Experiment with Liberty, or Tamper with Slavery?* . . . . . 19
- "Publius," The Federalist XXXIX [James Madison], January 16, 1788  
*What Is a Republic? Can It Be Part National, Part Federal?* . . . . . 26
- "An Old State Soldier" I, January 16, 1788  
*"To Complete the Designs of a War That Ended Many Years Before"* . . . . . 33
- "Brutus" IX, January 17, 1788  
*The Dangers of a Standing Army* . . . . . 40
- "Publius," The Federalist XLI [James Madison], January 19, 1788  
*On the Powers of the National Government: An Analysis of Armies, Taxation, and the General Welfare Clause.* . . . . 47
- Henry Knox to John Sullivan, January 19, 1788  
*"Something Must Be Done Speedily"* . . . . . 57



“Americanus” [John Stevens, Jr.] VII, January 21, 1788 <i>A Refutation of Governor Edmund Randolph’s Objections . . .</i>	58
“Publius,” The Federalist XLII [James Madison], January 22, 1788 <i>On the Powers of the Federal Government: Relations with Foreign Nations, and Other Provisions of Article I, Section 8. . . . .</i>	63
“Publius,” The Federalist XLIII [James Madison], January 23, 1788 <i>Are Force and Right Necessarily on the Same Side? . . . . .</i>	71
“Centinel” [Samuel Bryan] XII, January 23, 1788 <i>The Federalists’ Conspiracy Detected: “The Most Odious System of Tyranny That Was Ever Projected . . . A Crime of the Blackest Dye” . . . . .</i>	81
“Brutus” X, January 24, 1788 <i>“That Dangerous Engine of Despotism a Standing Army” . . .</i>	86
“Publius,” The Federalist XLIV [James Madison], January 25, 1788 <i>Restraints on the States and a Defense of the “Necessary and Proper” and “Supreme Law” Clauses . . . . .</i>	93
“Publius,” The Federalist XLV [James Madison], January 26, 1788 <i>On the Preponderant Power of the States . . . . .</i>	101
On the New Constitution, January 28, 1788 <i>“A Mere Disguise for Parliament and King” . . . . .</i>	107
“Publius,” The Federalist XLVI [James Madison], January 29, 1788 <i>Federal Tyranny: “The Incoherent Dreams of a Delirious Jealousy” . . . . .</i>	109
David Ramsay to Benjamin Lincoln, January 29, 1788 <i>“Federalism . . . Has Gained Great Ground” . . . . .</i>	117
John Williams to His Constituents, written January 29, 1788, published February 25, 1788 <i>New York’s Advantage in the Present System: Low Taxes . . .</i>	119



- “Publius,” The Federalist XLVII [James Madison],  
January 30, 1788  
*On the Separation of Powers: A Subject Misconceived  
and Misapplied* . . . . . 121
- “Brutus” XI, January 31, 1788  
*The Supreme Court: They Will Mould the Government Into  
Almost Any Shape They Please* . . . . . 129
- “Publius,” The Federalist XLVIII [James Madison],  
February 1, 1788  
*The Separation of Powers: On the Dangers of Legislative  
Usurpation.* . . . . . 136
- “Publius,” The Federalist XLIX [James Madison],  
February 2, 1788  
*On the Dangers of Too Frequent Conventions: Stirring the  
Public Passions and Attacking the Timidity of Reason* . . . . 142
- “Civis” [David Ramsay] to the Citizens of South Carolina,  
February 4, 1788  
*Advantages for the South.* . . . . . 147
- “Agrippa” [James Winthrop] XVIII, February 5, 1788  
*Amend the Articles of Confederation or Amend the  
Constitution? Fourteen Conditions for Accepting the  
Constitution* . . . . . 155
- “Publius,” The Federalist LI [James Madison],  
February 6, 1788  
*On the Safety of Multiple Interests: Ambition Will  
Counteract Ambition* . . . . . 163
- “A. B.” [Francis Hopkinson], The Raising: A New Song for  
Federal Mechanics, February 6, 1788 . . . . . 169
- “Brutus” XII, February 7 and 14, 1788  
*On the Power of the Supreme Court: Nothing Can  
Stand Before It* . . . . . 171
- George Washington to the Marquis de Lafayette,  
February 7, 1788  
*Two Basic Reasons to Support the Constitution.* . . . . . 178



- "Publius," The Federalist LII [James Madison],  
 February 8, 1788  
*On the House of Representatives: Electoral Qualifications  
 and Biennial Elections* . . . . . 182
- "Publius," The Federalist LIII [James Madison],  
 February 9, 1788  
*On the Frequency of Elections* . . . . . 187
- William Williams to the Printer, February 11, 1788  
*To Obtain Blessings from the Most High* . . . . . 193
- "Publius," The Federalist LIV [James Madison],  
 February 12, 1788  
*Are Slaves Property or Persons?* . . . . . 196
- "Publius," The Federalist LV [James Madison],  
 February 13, 1788  
*How Large Should the House of Representatives Be?* . . . . . 202
- "Publius," The Federalist LVI [James Madison],  
 February 16, 1788  
*"The Sufficiency of a Moderate Number of  
 Representatives"* . . . . . 208
- "Publius," The Federalist LVII [James Madison],  
 February 19, 1788  
*Representatives and Their Constituencies: The Chords  
 Which Bind* . . . . . 213
- Harry Innes to John Brown, February 20, 1788  
*The Trans-Appalachian West: "We Shall Be the Mere  
 Vassals of the Congress"* . . . . . 219
- "Brutus" XIII, February 21, 1788  
*The Judicial Power: Can an Individual Sue a State?* . . . . . 222
- Hugh Williamson's Speech at Edenton, North Carolina,  
 delivered November 8, 1787, printed  
 February 25, 26, 27, 1788  
*"General Bankruptcy and Loss of Honor . . . Rejoice in the  
 Prospect of Better Times"* . . . . . 227
- "Centinel" [Samuel Bryan] XVI, February 26, 1788  
*A Conspiracy Detected To Obliterate Debts Owed to  
 the Public* . . . . . 237



- Jeremiah Hill to George Thatcher, c. February 26, 1788  
*"Future Grandeur"* . . . . . 241
- "A Deep Laid Scheme to Enslave Us . . . Invented in the  
 Society of the Cincinnati," February 27, 1788 . . . . . 243
- "Publius," The Federalist LXII [James Madison],  
 February 27, 1788  
*The Senate Examined* . . . . . 244
- "The Impartial Examiner" I, part 2, February 27, 1788  
*On the Diversity of Interests and the Dangers of Standing  
 Armies and a Supreme Court* . . . . . 251
- Benjamin Rush to Jeremy Belknap, February 28, 1788  
*A Hopeful Future* . . . . . 256
- "Brutus" XIV, February 28 and March 6, 1788  
*The Supreme Court: The Danger of Appellate Jurisdiction* . . . 258
- Joseph Spencer to James Madison, Enclosing John Leland's  
 Objections, February 28, 1788  
*Ten Objections by a Leading Virginia Baptist* . . . . . 267
- Rhode Island's Assembly Refuses to Call a Convention  
 and Submits the Constitution Directly to the People,  
 February 29 and March 1, 1788. . . . . 270
- The Freemen of Providence Submit Eight Reasons  
 for Calling a Convention, March 26, 1788 . . . . . 276
- "A Columbian Patriot" [Mercy Otis Warren], Observations  
 on the Constitution, February 1788  
*"The Gulph of Despotism Set Open"* . . . . . 284
- "Giles Hickory" [Noah Webster] III, February 1788  
*Liberty Is Never Secured by Paper Declarations* . . . . . 304
- "Publius," The Federalist LXIII [James Madison],  
 March 1, 1788  
*"The Necessity of a Well Constructed Senate"* . . . . . 316
- "Publius," The Federalist LXV [Alexander Hamilton],  
 March 7, 1788  
*The Senate as the Court for Impeachments* . . . . . 325



John Page to Thomas Jefferson, March 7, 1788 <i>Convincing the Voters</i> . . . . .	331
“Publius,” The Federalist LXVIII [Alexander Hamilton], March 12, 1788 <i>The Electoral College Will Prevent “Cabal, Intrigue and Corruption” in Presidential Elections.</i> . . . . .	333
“Publius,” The Federalist LXIX [Alexander Hamilton], March 14, 1788 <i>The Limits of Executive Power.</i> . . . . .	338
“Publius,” The Federalist LXX [Alexander Hamilton], March 15, 1788 <i>Executive Energy: Is It Necessary? Safe?</i> . . . . .	346
Comte de Moustier to Comte de Montmorin, March 16, 1788 <i>On the Difficulty of Judging What the Outcome Will Be</i> . . . . .	355
“Publius,” The Federalist LXXI [Alexander Hamilton], March 18, 1788 <i>On the Length of the President’s Term</i> . . . . .	357
“Publius,” The Federalist LXXII [Alexander Hamilton], March 19, 1788 <i>Should the President Be Eligible for Reelection?</i> . . . . .	362
“A Freeman” to the Freeholders and Freemen of Rhode Island, March 20, 1788 <i>The British and American Constitutions Contrasted</i> . . . . .	368
“Brutus” XV, March 20, 1788 <i>The Supreme Court: “No Power Above Them That Can Controul Their Decisions, or Correct Their Errors”</i> . . . . .	372
“Publius,” The Federalist LXXIV [Alexander Hamilton], March 25, 1788 <i>The President’s Pardoning Power: To “Restore the Tranquility of the Commonwealth”</i> . . . . .	379
James Madison to Eliza House Trist, March 25, 1788 <i>Madison’s First “Harangue . . . In the Open Air”</i> . . . . .	382



- “Publius,” The Federalist LXXV [Alexander Hamilton],  
March 26, 1788  
*Why Both the President and the Senate Have  
Treaty-Making Power* . . . . . 383
- “Publius,” The Federalist LXXVI [Alexander Hamilton],  
April 1, 1788  
*On Executive Appointments: Why the President and the  
Senate Together?* . . . . . 389
- “Publius,” The Federalist LXXVII [Alexander Hamilton],  
April 2, 1788  
*Executive Powers: Energy and Safety Combined* . . . . . 395
- “K.” [Benjamin Franklin] to the Editor, April 8, 1788  
*The Antifederalists Compared with the Ancient Jews as  
Rejectors of Divine Constitutions* . . . . . 401
- “To Be or Not To Be? Is the Question,” April 16, 1788 . . . . . 406
- “Fabius” [John Dickinson], “Observations on the  
Constitution Proposed by the Federal Convention” III,  
April 17, 1788  
*Freedom and Society: On the Necessity of Sacrificing Separate  
Rights for the Good of All* . . . . . 408
- “Plough Jogger,” April 17, 1788  
*Too Little Virtue for a Mild Government* . . . . . 414
- Benjamin Rush to David Ramsay, April 19, 1788  
*Against Simple Democracies and Bills of Rights: Only  
Representation and Checks Can Guarantee Liberty* . . . . . 417
- George Washington to John Armstrong, April 25, 1788  
*On Amendments and the Value of a Formidable Opposition* . . . . . 420
- “Fabius” [John Dickinson], “Observations on the  
Constitution Proposed by the Federal Convention” VIII,  
April 29, 1788  
*On the Safety of an Extensive Republican Empire* . . . . . 424
- A Grand Procession in Honor of Ratification, May 6, 1788  
*“The Most Interesting Scene Ever Exhibited in this  
Part of the World”* . . . . . 430



J. Hector St. John Crèvecoeur to Comte de la Luzerne, May 16, 1788 <i>Dismal Prospects for the New Union</i> . . . . .	439
James Madison to George Nicholas, May 17, 1788 <i>The Constitution and the Development of the American West</i> . . . . .	443
"An American" [Tench Coxe], May 21, 1788 <i>Virginia's Power Under the Constitution and the Dangers of Failing to Ratify: Advice from a Respectful Countryman</i> . . .	451
Richard Henry Lee to Edmund Pendleton, May 26, 1788 <i>To Guarantee Essential Rights: A Scheme for Amending the Constitution</i> . . . . .	462
"Publius," The Federalist LXXVIII [Alexander Hamilton], May 28, 1788 <i>On the Independence of Judges and Judicial Review</i> . . . . .	467
"Publius," The Federalist LXXX [Alexander Hamilton], May 28, 1788 <i>On the Bounds and Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts</i> . . . . .	476
"Publius," The Federalist LXXXI [Alexander Hamilton], May 28, 1788 <i>On the Supposed Danger of the Supreme Court Legislating and Becoming "Uncontrolable and Remediless"</i> . . . . .	483
"Publius," The Federalist LXXXII [Alexander Hamilton], May 28, 1788 <i>State and Federal Courts: Concurrent Jurisdictions?</i> . . . . .	493
"Publius," The Federalist LXXXV [Alexander Hamilton], May 28, 1788 <i>Some Final Thoughts</i> . . . . .	498
David Ramsay's Oration at Charleston, South Carolina, delivered May 27, 1788, printed June 5, 1788 <i>"Heaven Smiled on Their Deliberations, and Inspired Their Councils with a Spirit of Conciliation"</i> . . . . .	506
Simeon Baldwin's Oration at New Haven, July 4, 1788 <i>"This Monument of Wisdom . . . the Foundation of a Glorious Empire"</i> . . . . .	514



- “Phocion,” July 17, 1788  
*On the Economic Advantages of Union: Providence Will Be  
 Another Antwerp, Newport Another Brest* . . . . . 526
- “Solon, Junior” [David Howell], August 9, 1788  
*The Spirit of the Times: Greater Than Laws and  
 Constitutions* . . . . . 533
- The Ratifications and Resolutions of Seven State  
 Conventions, February 6–August 2, 1788  
*Principles Affirmed and Amendments Proposed* . . . . . 536

### DEBATES IN THE STATE RATIFYING CONVENTIONS

#### *South Carolina Ratifying Convention, May 12–24, 1788*

- Charles Cotesworth Pinckney Explains America’s Unique  
 Structure of Freedom, May 14, 1788 . . . . . 577
- Patrick Dollard Fears a Corrupt, Despotic Aristocracy . . . . . 592

#### *Virginia Ratifying Convention, June 2–27, 1788*

- Patrick Henry’s Opening Speech: A Wrong Step Now and  
 the Republic Will Be Lost Forever, June 4, 1788. . . . . 595
- Governor Edmund Randolph Explains Why He Now  
 Supports the Constitution with Amendments,  
 June 4, 1788 . . . . . 598
- George Mason Fears for the Rights of the People,  
 June 4, 1788 . . . . . 605
- James Madison Replies to Patrick Henry, Defending the  
 Taxing Power and Explaining Federalism, June 6, 1788 . . . 611
- Patrick Henry Replies to Governor Randolph, June 7, 1788 . . . 623
- Henry Lee’s Sharp Reply to Patrick Henry’s Attacks  
 on the Constitution, June 9, 1788 . . . . . 637
- James Madison on Direct Taxation by the Federal  
 Government, June 11, 1788. . . . . 649



James Madison on Concurrent Taxation and the Future of the American West, June 12, 1788 . . . . .	664
Patrick Henry Elaborates His Main Objections, and James Madison Responds, June 12, 1788 . . . . .	673
James Monroe Questions James Madison on Congressional Control of Elections to the House and Senate, June 14, 1788 . . . . .	693
Patrick Henry's Objections to a National Army and James Madison's Reply, June 16, 1788. . . . .	695
Patrick Henry and James Madison Debate Constructive Rights and the Uses of the Militia, June 16, 1788 . . . . .	701
George Mason and James Madison Debate the Slave-Trade Clause, June 17, 1788 . . . . .	706
Governor Edmund Randolph on the "Necessary and Proper" Clause, Implied Powers, and Bills of Rights, June 17, 1788 . . . . .	709
George Mason on the President: He Will Serve for Life and Be Corrupted by Foreign Powers, June 17, 1788 . . . . .	718
George Mason Fears the Power of the Federal Courts: What Will Be Left to the States? June 19, 1788 . . . . .	720
John Marshall on the Fairness and Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts, June 20, 1788 . . . . .	730
John Dawson's Fears for the Future, June 24, 1788 . . . . .	742
Zachariah Johnston, "of the Middle Rank," Favors Ratification Without Previous Amendments, June 25, 1788 . . . . .	751
<i>New York Ratifying Convention, June 17–July 26, 1788</i>	
Melancton Smith and Alexander Hamilton Debate Representation, Aristocracy, and Interests, June 21, 1788 . . . . .	757
Robert R. Livingston, Melancton Smith, and John Jay Debate Aristocracy, Representation, and Corruption, June 23, 1788 . . . . .	776



Gilbert Livingston Warns Against Giving the Senate Power Too Profusely, June 24, 1788 . . . . .	789
Robert R. Livingston Replies to Gilbert Livingston's "Dreamings of a Distempered Fancy," June 24, 1788 . . . . .	792
Alexander Hamilton Defends the Senate: A Small, Independent, Discerning Body to Check the Passions of the People, June 24, 1788 . . . . .	795
Melancton Smith and Alexander Hamilton Debate Rotation in the Senate, June 25, 1788 . . . . .	803
Melancton Smith Fears the Federal Taxing Power and the Capacity of Any Free Government to Rule So Vast a Nation, June 27, 1788 . . . . .	816
Melancton Smith Writes to Nathan Dane, Reconsidering His Position on Ratification and Amendments, June 28, 1788 . . . . .	822
Alexander Hamilton Discusses Federal Taxation and Denies That His Views Are Influenced by Personal Ambition, June 28, 1788 . . . . .	824
Robert R. Livingston Compares Antifederalists to "Children Making Bubbles with a Pipe," July 1, 1788 . . . . .	836
Melancton Smith Mocks Robert R. Livingston's "Comic Talents" and Replies to His "Misrepresentation," July 2, 1788 . . . . .	841
Nathan Dane Writes to Melancton Smith, Recommending That New York Unconditionally Ratify, July 3, 1788 . . . . .	844
Melancton Smith Replies to Nathan Dane, Agreeing with His Arguments, c. July 15, 1788 . . . . .	851
Melancton Smith Speaks in Support of Ratification Without Condition, July 23, 1788 . . . . .	852
<i>North Carolina Ratifying Convention, July 21–August 4, 1788</i>	
Five Speakers Debate Congressional Control of Congressional Elections, July 25, 1788 . . . . .	854
The Debate on Congressional Elections Continued: Britain and America Contrasted, July 25, 1788 . . . . .	861



James Iredell on the Necessity for a Peacetime Army, July 26, 1788 . . . . .	864
James Iredell on the Presidency, Spies, the Pardoning Power, and Impeachment, July 28, 1788 . . . . .	870
Samuel Spencer Objects to the Powers of the Senate and Fears It Will Control the President, July 28, 1788 . . . . .	879
James Iredell on Impeachment: "It Must Be for an Error of the Heart, and Not of the Head," July 28, 1788 . . . . .	882
Samuel Spencer and William R. Davie Debate the Need for a Bill of Rights and the Jurisdiction of the Federal Courts, July 29, 1788 . . . . .	888
Andrew Bass Thinks the Constitution Is "Uncommonly Difficult, or Absolutely Unintelligible"; Maclaine and Iredell Respond, July 29, 1788 . . . . .	897
James Iredell and Timothy Bloodworth Debate the Supremacy of the Constitution and of Federal Law, July 29, 1788 . . . . .	899
Henry Abbot and James Iredell Debate the Ban on Religious Tests: Could Not the Pope Be President? July 30, 1788 . . . . .	902
Rev. David Caldwell and Samuel Spencer Continue the Debate on Religious Toleration, July 30, 1788 . . . . .	908
James Iredell Urges Ratification, and a Vote Is Taken, July 30, 1788 . . . . .	910

APPENDIX

The Declaration of Independence . . . . .	921
The Articles of Confederation . . . . .	926
Letter from the Constitutional Convention to the President of Congress . . . . .	937
Resolutions of the Convention Concerning the Ratification and Implementation of the Constitution . . . . .	939
The Constitution. . . . .	940



CONTENTS

xxi

---

<i>Biographical Notes</i> . . . . .	967
<i>Chronology of Events 1774-1804</i> . . . . .	1025
<i>Notes on State Constitutions, 1776-90</i> . . . . .	1087
<i>Note on the Texts</i> . . . . .	1093
<i>Notes</i> . . . . .	1105
<i>Index</i> . . . . .	1159