

# Contents

## DEBATES IN THE PRESS AND IN PRIVATE CORRESPONDENCE

September 17, 1787–January 12, 1788

Benjamin Franklin's Speech at the Conclusion of the Constitutional Convention, September 17, 1787 <i>"I Agree to This Constitution, with All Its Faults"</i> . . . . .	3
"Z" Replies to Franklin's Speech, December 6, 1787 <i>"No Wonder He Shed a Tear"</i> . . . . .	6
Alexander Hamilton's Conjectures About the New Constitution, September 1787 . . . . .	9
"A Revolution Effected by Good Sense and Deliberation," September 24, 1787 . . . . .	12
David Redick to William Irvine, September 24, 1787 <i>"The Loss of American Liberty"</i> . . . . .	15
Strictures on the Proposed Constitution, September 26, 1787 . . . . .	17
"An American Citizen" [Tench Coxe] I, September 26, 1787 <i>The English and American Constitutions Contrasted</i> . . . . .	20
"An American Citizen" [Tench Coxe] II, September 28, 1787 <i>Senators and Nobles</i> . . . . .	25
"An American Citizen" [Tench Coxe] III, September 29, 1787 <i>An Uncorrupted House</i> . . . . .	28
"Cato" I, September 27, 1787 <i>Deliberate with Coolness, Analyze with Criticism, Reflect with Candor</i> . . . . .	31
Reply to "Cato" I: "Cæsar" I, October 1, 1787 <i>On the Language of Distrust</i> . . . . .	34
Rebuttal to "Cæsar" I: "Cato" II, October 11, 1787 <i>On the Right of Free Deliberation</i> . . . . .	37

James Madison to George Washington, September 30, 1787 <i>Congress Forwards the Constitution to the States</i> . . . . .	42
Richard Henry Lee to George Mason, October 1, 1787 <i>On the Deviousness of Congress's Action, and the Need for Amendments</i> . . . . .	45
Rev. James Madison to James Madison, c. October 1, 1787 <i>For an Experimental Period and an Absolute Separation of Powers</i> . . . . .	48
"Southwark," October 3, 1787 <i>Antifederalists—Tories Reborn</i> . . . . .	50
"Centinel" [Samuel Bryan] I, October 5, 1787 <i>"A Most Daring Attempt to Establish a Despotic Aristocracy"</i> . . . . .	52
James Wilson's Speech at a Public Meeting, October 6, 1787 <i>"Every Thing Which Is Not Given, Is Reserved"</i> . . . . .	63
Reply to Wilson's Speech: "A Democratic Federalist," October 17, 1787 <i>What Shelter from Arbitrary Power?</i> . . . . .	70
Reply to Wilson's Speech: "Centinel" [Samuel Bryan] II, October 24, 1787 <i>To Avoid the Usual Fate of Nations</i> . . . . .	77
Reply to Wilson's Speech: "Cincinnatus" [Arthur Lee] I, November 1, 1787 <i>To Defeat a Monstrous Aristocracy</i> . . . . .	92
Reply to Wilson's Speech: "An Officer of the Late Continental Army" [William Findley?], November 6, 1787 <i>"A Set of Aspiring Despots, Who Make Us Slaves"</i> . . . . .	97
Rebuttal to "An Officer of the Late Continental Army": "Plain Truth," November 10, 1787 <i>"I Have Answered All the Objections"</i> . . . . .	105

Reply to Wilson's Speech: "Cincinnatus" [Arthur Lee] V, November 29, 1787 "O Sense Where Is Your Guard! Shame Where Is Your Blush!" . . . . .	114
"An Old Whig" [George Bryan et al.] I, October 12, 1787 <i>No Amendments Will Ever Be Made Without Violent Convulsion or Civil War</i> . . . . .	122
"Marcus," October 15, 1787 <i>Interests and the Constitution</i> . . . . .	127
"A Citizen of America" [Noah Webster], October 17, 1787 <i>An Examination Into the Leading Principles of the Federal Constitution</i> . . . . .	129
"Brutus" I, October 18, 1787 "If You Adopt It . . . Posterity Will Execrate Your Memory" . . . . .	164
The Weaknesses of Brutus Exposed: "A Citizen of Philadelphia" [Pelatiah Webster], November 8, 1787 "Congress Can Never Get More Power Than the People Will Give" . . . . .	176
A Political Dialogue, October 24, 1787 "There Is Some Trick In It" . . . . .	189
James Madison to Thomas Jefferson, October 24, 1787 <i>The Constitution Explained and Justified, with an "Immoderate Digression" on a Defeated Proposal</i> . . . . .	192
Thomas Jefferson Replies to Madison, December 20, 1787 "The Will of the Majority Should Always Prevail" . . . . .	209
"Cato" III, October 25, 1787 <i>The Dangers to Liberty and Happiness</i> . . . . .	214
"Publius," The Federalist I [Alexander Hamilton], October 27, 1787 "Vigour of Government Is Essential to the Security of Liberty" . . . . .	219

“John Humble,” October 29, 1787 <i>“To Lick the Feet of Our Well Born Masters”</i> . . . . .	224
“Americanus” [John Stevens, Jr.] I, November 2, 1787 <i>“We Must Think, We Must Reason, For Ourselves”</i> . . . . .	227
Elbridge Gerry to the Massachusetts General Court, November 3, 1787 <i>“The Greatest Men May Err”</i> . . . . .	231
Reply to Elbridge Gerry: “A Landholder” [Oliver Ellsworth] IV, November 26, 1787 <i>“To Alarm the Fears of the People”</i> . . . . .	234
A Further Reply to Elbridge Gerry: “A Landholder” [Oliver Ellsworth] V, December 3, 1787 <i>“To Combat Phantoms”</i> . . . . .	239
Letters from the “Federal Farmer” to “The Republican,” November 8, 1787 <i>“Examine Coolly Every Article, Clause, and Word”</i> . . . . .	245
Refutation of the “Federal Farmer”: Timothy Pickering to Charles Tillinghast, December 24, 1787 <i>“The Best Constitution We . . . Have Any Right     To Expect”</i> . . . . .	289
George Washington to Bushrod Washington, November 10, 1787 <i>“Is It Best for the States to Unite, or Not to Unite?”</i> . . . . .	305
Thomas Jefferson to William Stephens Smith, November 13, 1787 <i>“The Tree of Liberty Must Be Refreshed from Time     to Time with the Blood of Patriots and Tyrants”</i> . . . . .	309
“Publius,” The Federalist VI [Alexander Hamilton], November 14, 1787 <i>“Men Are Ambitious, Vindictive and Rapacious”</i> . . . . .	311
“Brutus” III, November 15, 1787 <i>“Representation Is Merely Nominal—A Mere Burlesque”</i> . . . . .	317

Resolution of the Inhabitants of Pittsburgh, November 17, 1787 <i>Nothing Better Could Be Expected</i> . . . . .	324
“Philanthrop” to the Public, November 19, 1787 <i>“Real True Self Interest Considered on a Large Extensive Scale, Is Public Good”</i> . . . . .	325
“A Landholder” [Oliver Ellsworth] III, November 19, 1787 <i>“Power When Necessary for Our Good Is as Much to Be Desired as the Food We Eat”</i> . . . . .	329
“Publius,” The Federalist VIII [Alexander Hamilton], November 20, 1787 <i>Militarism, the Inevitable Result of Disunion</i> . . . . .	333
“Publius,” The Federalist IX [Alexander Hamilton], November 21, 1787 <i>A Confederate Republic: The Internal Advantages of a Republican with the External Force of a Monarchical Government</i> . . . . .	339
George Mason, “Objections to the Constitution,” circulated early October 1787, published in full November 22, 1787 <i>America Under the Constitution: “A Monarchy, or a Corrupt Oppressive Aristocracy”</i> . . . . .	345
A “Prolix” Comment on Mason’s “Objections”: James Madison to George Washington, October 18, 1787 . . . . .	350
Reply to Mason’s “Objections”: “Civis Rusticus,” January 30, 1788 <i>Not to Condemn, But to Correct</i> . . . . .	353
Answers to Mason’s “Objections”: “Marcus” [James Iredell] I–V, February 20–March 19, 1788 <i>“A System of Government Which I Am Convinced Can Stand the Nicest Examination”</i>	
I, February 20, 1788 . . . . .	363
II, February 27, 1788 . . . . .	371
III, March 5, 1788 . . . . .	378
IV, March 12, 1788 . . . . .	384
V, March 19, 1788 . . . . .	394

“Cato” V, November 22, 1787  
*Can an American Be a Tyrant? On the Great Powers  
of the Presidency, the Vagueness of the Constitution,  
and the Dangers of Congress* . . . . . 399

“Publius,” The Federalist X [James Madison],  
November 22, 1787  
*“To Break and Control the Violence of Faction”* . . . . . 404

“A Countryman” [Roger Sherman?] II, November 22, 1787  
*On the Interests of Rulers and Ruled* . . . . . 412

“Americanus” [John Stevens, Jr.] II, November 23, 1787  
*“Cato’s” Folly: “A President Possessing the Powers  
of a Monarch”* . . . . . 415

Louis Guillaume Otto to Comte de Montmorin,  
November 26, 1787  
*There Is No Way to Go Back* . . . . . 420

“Brutus” IV, November 29, 1787  
*Fair Representation Is the Great Desideratum in Politics* . . . . 423

“Publius,” The Federalist XIV [James Madison],  
November 30, 1787  
*“A Revolution Which Has No Parallel in the Annals of  
Human Society”* . . . . . 431

“Americanus” [John Stevens, Jr.] III, November 30, 1787  
*On Representation and the Modern State.* . . . . . 437

“Agrippa” [James Winthrop] III, November 30, 1787  
*On the Present Prosperity: Recommit the Constitution* . . . . . 443

Samuel Adams to Richard Henry Lee, December 3, 1787  
*The Sovereignty and Diversity of the States Will Be Lost* . . . . 446

“Agrippa” [James Winthrop] IV, December 4, 1787  
*The Despotism and Misery of a Uniform National State.* . . . . 448

“Publius,” The Federalist XVI [Alexander Hamilton],  
December 4, 1787  
*Civil War and the Death of the Union* . . . . . 451

“Americanus” [John Stevens, Jr.] IV, December 5 & 6, 1787  
*On the Errors of “Cato” and of Celebrated Writers* . . . . . 457

Richard Henry Lee to Governor Edmund Randolph, December 6, 1787 <i>Must We Kill Ourselves For Fear of Dying?</i> . . . . .	465
John Adams to Thomas Jefferson, December 6, 1787 <i>The Dangers of the One and of the Few</i> . . . . .	473
"Agrippa" [James Winthrop] V, December 11, 1787 <i>On the "Derangement" of the Federal Courts</i> . . . . .	474
George Lee Turberville to James Madison, December 11, 1787 <i>Some Puzzling Questions</i> . . . . .	477
"Publius," The Federalist XXI [Alexander Hamilton], December 12, 1787 <i>The Extent and Malignity of the Present Disease</i> . . . . .	481
"Americanus" [John Stevens, Jr.] V, December 12, 1787 <i>On Montesquieu, a System Monger Without Philosophic Precision, and More on the Errors of "Cato"</i> . . . . .	487
"Philadelphiensis" [Benjamin Workman] IV, December 12, 1787 <i>"This Monster, This Colossus of Despotism"</i> . . . . .	494
"Brutus" V, December 13, 1787 <i>On the "Necessary and Proper" and the "General Welfare" Clauses, and on Congress's Power to Tax: the States Will Be Destroyed</i> . . . . .	499
"Publius," The Federalist XXII [Alexander Hamilton], December 14, 1787 <i>Further Defects in the Present System</i> . . . . .	507
"Agrippa" [James Winthrop] VI, December 14, 1787 <i>The Power to Incorporate, and the Regulation of Commerce</i> . . . . .	517
Lawrence Taliaferro to James Madison, December 16, 1787 <i>"The Federal Sistum Is Rufly Handeld"</i> . . . . .	520
"A Landholder" [Oliver Ellsworth] VII, December 17, 1787 <i>"No Religious Test Shall Ever Be Required"</i> . . . . .	521
Dissent of the Minority of the Pennsylvania Convention, December 18, 1787 . . . . .	526

Reply to the Pennsylvania Minority: "America"  
[Noah Webster], December 31, 1787 . . . . . 553

A Cumberland County Mutual Improvement  
Society Addresses the Pennsylvania Minority,  
January 2, 1788  
"Support the Drooping Cause of Liberty" and  
Annihilate "the Proposed Aristocratic  
Delusion" . . . . . 563

Reply to the Pennsylvania Minority: "A Citizen of  
Philadelphia" [Pelatiah Webster], January 23, 1788  
"Their Folly and Wickedness in Opposing the New  
Government" . . . . . 566

"Publius," The Federalist XXIII [Alexander Hamilton],  
December 18, 1787  
*On Military Power: Ends and Means* . . . . . 570

"Publius," The Federalist XXIV [Alexander Hamilton],  
December 19, 1787  
*The Danger of a Standing Army: "An Intention  
to Mislead the People"* . . . . . 575

"Philadelphiensis" [Benjamin Workman] V,  
December 19, 1787  
*"Diabolical Plots and Secret Machinations . . .  
to Destroy Your Liberties"* . . . . . 581

Joseph Barrell to Nathaniel Barrell, December 20, 1787  
*"A Constitution . . . Dictated by Heaven Itself"* . . . . . 586

Ezra Stiles: Pluses and Minuses of the Constitution,  
December 24, 1787 . . . . . 589

"Publius," The Federalist XXVII [Alexander Hamilton],  
December 25, 1787  
*On the Acceptance of Federal Authority* . . . . . 591

Governor Edmund Randolph's Reasons for Not Signing  
the Constitution, December 27, 1787  
*"I Will, as an Individual Citizen, Accept the Constitution"* . . . 595

George Washington to Charles Carter, December 27, 1787 <i>The Constitution or Anarchy: The Need to Ratify</i> . . . . .	612
“Brutus” VI, December 27, 1787 <i>The Dangers of Unlimited Taxation: “Give! Give!”</i> . . . . .	613
“Publius,” The Federalist XXX [Alexander Hamilton], December 28, 1787 <i>“An Unrestrained Power of Taxation”? On the Necessity and Uses of Federal Revenue</i> . . . . .	622
“Agrippa” [James Winthrop] IX, December 28, 1787 <i>On the Virtues of “Pure Blood” and Limited Federal Power</i> . . . . .	628
Luther Martin, “The Genuine Information” I, II, VIII, IX, XII, December 28, 1787–February 8, 1788 <i>Resisting the Federalists’ “Violent Struggle . . . to Obtain All Power and Dominion”</i> I, December 28, 1787 . . . . . II, January 1, 1788 . . . . . VIII, January 22, 1788. . . . . IX, January 29, 1788 . . . . . XII, February 8, 1788 . . . . .	631 638 645 651 655
“The New Roof” [Francis Hopkinson], December 29, 1787 <i>Skilful Architects and Intriguing Old Women</i> . . . . .	662
“Giles Hickory” [Noah Webster] I, December 1787 <i>On the Absurdity of a Bill of Rights</i> . . . . .	669
“Agrippa” [James Winthrop] X, January 1, 1788 <i>A Summary View: “This System Ought to Be Rejected”</i> . . . . .	673
“Publius,” The Federalist XXXII-XXXIII [Alexander Hamilton], January 2, 1788 <i>On Repugnancy, Concurrence, and Reciprocal Forbearance</i> . . . . .	678
“Centinel” [Samuel Bryan] VIII, January 2, 1788 <i>“The Rapacious Hand of Power”</i> . . . . .	686
“Brutus” VII, January 3, 1788 <i>“Unlimited Authority in Matters of Revenue”?</i> . . . . .	691

“Publius,” The Federalist XXXIV [Alexander Hamilton], January 4, 1788 <i>State vs. National Revenues: “Calculate . . . on Permanent Causes of Expenditure”</i> . . . . .	698
Samuel Osgood to Samuel Adams, January 5, 1788 <i>“An Inexhaustible Fountain of Corruption”</i> . . . . .	704
“The Republican” to the People, January 7, 1788 <i>“The Principal Circumstances Which Render Liberty Secure”</i> . . . . .	710
Resolutions of the Tradesmen of the Town of Boston, January 8, 1788 <i>To Promote Trade, Industry, and Morality</i> . . . . .	717
“Publius,” The Federalist XXXVI [Alexander Hamilton], January 8, 1788 <i>The Representation of Interests and Federal Taxation</i> . . . . .	720
Thomas B. Wait to George Thatcher, January 8, 1788 <i>“Darkness, Duplicity, and Studied Ambiguity”</i> . . . . .	727
“Brutus” VIII, January 10, 1788 <i>On the Calamity of a National Debt That Cannot Be Repaid, and on Standing Armies</i> . . . . .	732
“Mark Antony,” January 10, 1788 <i>Slavery “Ought To Be Regretted . . . But It Is Evidently Beyond Our Control”: A Defense of the Three-Fifths Clause</i> . . . . .	737
James Madison to Governor Edmund Randolph, January 10, 1788 <i>The Dangers of a Second Convention</i> . . . . .	744
Samuel Holden Parsons to William Cushing, January 11, 1788 <i>“Our Security Must Rest in Our Frequently Recurring Back to the People”</i> . . . . .	748
“Publius,” The Federalist XXXVII [James Madison], January 11, 1788 <i>“An Abstract View of the Subject”</i> . . . . .	754

“Agrippa” [James Winthrop] XII, January 11, 15, 18, 1788  
*“Cherish the Old Confederation Like the Apple of Our Eye”* . . . 762

“Publius,” The Federalist XXXVIII [James Madison],  
 January 12, 1788  
*A Bedlam of Criticism and a Counsel of Perfection* . . . . . 774

“Americanus” [John Stevens, Jr.] VI, January 12, 1788  
*“An Iron Handed Despotism”?* . . . . . 783

DEBATES IN THE STATE  
 RATIFYING CONVENTIONS

*Pennsylvania Ratifying Convention, November 20–December 15, 1787*

James Wilson’s Opening Address, November 24, 1787 . . . . . 791

John Smilie Responds to Wilson on the Lack of  
 a Bill of Rights, November 28, 1787 . . . . . 804

James Wilson and John Smilie Debate the Need  
 for a Bill of Rights, November 28, 1787. . . . . 807

“The Defect Is in the System Itself”: Robert Whitehill  
 on the Dangers of the Powers of Congress  
 and the Illogic of the Habeas Corpus Clause,  
 November 30, 1787 . . . . . 811

Benjamin Rush Speaks Against a Bill of Rights,  
 November 30, 1787 . . . . . 816

William Findley on the Constitution as a Plan for National  
 Consolidation, December 1, 1787. . . . . 818

James Wilson Replies to Findley, December 1, 1787 . . . . . 820

James Wilson on the Slave-Trade Clause, December 3, 1787 . . . 829

Robert Whitehill Replies to Wilson on the Slave-Trade  
 Clause, December 3, 1787 . . . . . 831

James Wilson's Summation and Final Rebuttal, December 11, 1787 . . . . .	832
Benjamin Rush on Morality and Government, December 12, 1787 . . . . .	869
Robert Whitehill's Amendments and the Final Vote, December 12, 1787 . . . . .	871
<i>Connecticut Ratifying Convention, January 3-9, 1788</i>	
Oliver Ellsworth Defends the Taxing Power and Comments on Dual Sovereignties and Judicial Review, January 7, 1788 . . . . .	877
Governor Samuel Huntington on the Need for Coercive National Power, January 9, 1788 . . . . .	885
<i>Massachusetts Ratifying Convention, January 9-February 7, 1788</i>	
Letter to the <i>Massachusetts Centinel</i> by "Marcus" Objecting to Instructing the Delegates, January 9, 1788 . . . . .	889
Fisher Ames on Biennial Elections and on the Volcano of Democracy, January 15, 1788. . . . .	891
A Sharp Exchange on the Powers of Congress and Its Probable Corruption, January 17, 1788 . . . . .	896
Major Martin Kinsley on the Excessive Powers of Congress, January 21, 1788 . . . . .	902
Thomas Dawes, Jr., on Legitimate Standing Armies, January 24, 1788 . . . . .	904
Amos Singletary and Jonathan Smith on "Leviathan" Swallowing Up "Us Little Folks" and on the Danger of Anarchy, January 25, 1788 . . . . .	906
Abraham Holmes and Christopher Gore on the Possible Abuses of the Federal Judiciary, January 30, 1788 . . . . .	910
General William Heath on Slavery, January 30, 1788 . . . . .	915
Charles Jarvis on the Amendment Procedure: An Irrefutable Argument for Ratification, January 30, 1788 . . . . .	917

The Reverend Daniel Shute and Colonel William Jones on Religious Tests and Christian Belief, January 31, 1788 . . .	919
John Hancock Proposes Ratification, with Amendments Recommended to "Quiet the Apprehensions of Gentlemen," January 31, 1788 . . . . .	921
Samuel Adams Supports Hancock's Proposition, January 31, 1788 . . . . .	923
Samuel Nasson's "Pathetick Apostrophe" to Liberty, and Judge Increase Sumner's Reply, February 1, 1788 . . . .	925
Isaac Backus on Religion and the State, Slavery, and Nobility, February 4, 1788 . . . . .	931
Charles Jarvis Supports Hancock's Strategy on Amendments, February 4, 1788 . . . . .	934
Nathaniel Barrell, a "Plain Husbandman," Warns of the Passion for Power, but Favors Ratification, February 5, 1788 . . . . .	938
John Hancock's Final Observations: "We Must All Rise or Fall Together," February 6, 1788. . . . .	941
The Form of the Ratification of Massachusetts, February 6, 1788 . . . . .	943

## APPENDIX

The Declaration of Independence . . . . .	949
The Articles of Confederation . . . . .	954
Letter from the Constitutional Convention to the President of Congress . . . . .	965
Resolutions of the Convention Concerning the Ratification and Implementation of the Constitution . . . . .	967
The Constitution. . . . .	968

<i>Biographical Notes</i> . . . . .	995
<i>Chronology of Events 1774–1804</i> . . . . .	1055
<i>Notes on State Constitutions, 1776–90</i> . . . . .	1117
<i>Note on the Texts</i> . . . . .	1123
<i>Notes</i> . . . . .	1137
<i>Index</i> . . . . .	1195