

# CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements .....</i>	v
<i>List of Cases .....</i>	xvii
<b>Chapter 1. Introduction .....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1. General Obligations of a State .....	3
1.2. Who Must Guarantee a Fair Trial? .....	4
1.3. Autonomous Interpretation of Concepts .....	5
<b>Chapter 2. Civil Rights and Obligations .....</b>	<b>7</b>
2.1. What are “Civil Rights and Obligations”? .....	7
2.1.1. Right Having a Basis in Domestic Law .....	7
2.1.2. Discretionary Decisions .....	9
2.2. What does “Civil” Mean? .....	10
2.2.1. Matters Falling within the Scope of Civil Law .....	10
2.2.2. Autonomous Interpretation .....	11
2.2.2.1. Nature of the Right or Obligation .....	12
2.2.2.2. Pan-European Consensus .....	12
2.2.2.3. Classification in Domestic Law .....	13
2.2.2.4. Aim and Scope of the Convention .....	13
2.2.3. Case-Law on the Line between Civil Law and Public Law .....	14
2.2.3.1. Relations between Private Individuals .....	14
2.2.3.2. Relations between a State and Private Individuals .....	14
2.2.3.2.1. Pecuniary Rights .....	14
2.2.3.2.1.1. Right to Property .....	15
2.2.3.2.1.2. Right to Practise a Profession or to Engage in a Commercial Activity .....	16
2.2.3.2.1.3. Right to Compensation for Illegal State Action .....	17
2.2.3.2.1.4. Right to Social Security and Social Assistance .....	18
2.2.3.2.2. Non-Pecuniary Rights .....	19

2.2.3.2.3.	Public Law Rights and Obligations .....	21
2.2.3.2.3.1.	Obligation to Pay Tax.....	22
2.2.3.2.3.2.	Political Rights and Obligations .....	22
2.2.3.2.3.3.	Entry, Stay and Removal of Aliens and Right to Passport.....	23
2.2.3.2.3.4.	Employment in the Public Sector .....	24
2.2.3.2.3.5.	Other Public Law Rights and Obligations.....	26
2.2.3.2.4.	Rights Connected to Criminal Proceedings and Imprisonment .....	27
2.3.	“Dispute” Concerning Civil Rights and Obligations .....	28
2.4.	“Determination” of Civil Rights and Obligations .....	30
2.5.	Administrative Decisions .....	32
2.5.1.	Policy Decisions .....	33
2.5.2.	Assessment of the Proportionality of Administrative Decisions.....	34
2.6.	Which Stages of Proceedings Fall within the Scope of “Civil Rights and Obligations”?.....	34
2.6.1.	Applicability from the Start of Judicial Proceedings.....	34
2.6.2.	Accessory Proceedings and Interim Decisions .....	35
2.6.3.	Ordinary and Extraordinary Appeal Proceedings.....	36
2.6.4.	Execution.....	38
2.6.5.	Interim Measures .....	40
	<b>Chapter 3. Criminal Charge .....</b>	<b>43</b>
3.1.	Autonomous Interpretation .....	43
3.2.	Three Criteria of an Offence (The <i>Engel</i> Criteria) .....	43
3.2.1.	Classification in Domestic Law .....	44
3.2.2.	Nature and Purpose of the Act.....	44
3.2.2.1.	Disciplinary Proceedings.....	45
3.2.2.2.	Misdemeanours and Petty Offences.....	49
3.2.2.3.	Applicability to the Wider Public .....	50
3.2.3.	Nature and Severity of the Punishment .....	51
3.3.	Autonomous Meaning of a Charge .....	52
3.4.	Which Stages of Procedure Fall within the Scope of Criminal Charge?.....	53
3.4.1.	Beginning and End of a Criminal Charge .....	53
3.4.2.	To What is a Criminal Charge not Applicable? .....	54

<b>Chapter 4. Rights Guaranteed by Article 6 §1 . . . . .</b>	<b>59</b>
<b>4.1. Access to a Court . . . . .</b>	<b>60</b>
4.1.1. Right of Effective Access . . . . .	64
4.1.1.1. Legal Aid . . . . .	64
4.1.1.2. Court Fees . . . . .	65
4.1.1.3. Discontinuation of the Proceedings . . . . .	67
4.1.1.4. Uncertainty of the Content or Interpretation of Law . . . . .	67
4.1.2. Restrictions Upon the Right of Access . . . . .	68
4.1.2.1. Time Limits, Statute of Limitations and Errors of Pleading . . . . .	70
4.1.2.2. Reasons Related to an Applicant's Personal Circumstances and the Requirement of Flexibility . . . . .	73
4.1.2.3. Limitations on the Right of Action . . . . .	74
4.1.2.4. Retroactive Laws . . . . .	74
4.1.2.5. Annulment and Non-Enforcement of Final Judgments . . . . .	75
4.1.2.6. Immunities, Privileges and Territorial Competence . . . . .	75
4.1.2.7. Limitations Imposed by International Treaties or Owing to International Tribunal Competences . . . . .	80
4.1.2.8. Restrictions on Access to a Court in Criminal Matters and Convictions in Absentia . . . . .	81
4.1.3. Waiver of the Right of Access . . . . .	84
4.1.4. Relationship with Article 13 . . . . .	85
<b>4.2. Right to a Fair Trial . . . . .</b>	<b>86</b>
4.2.1. Basic Principles . . . . .	86
4.2.2. Hearing in One's Presence . . . . .	87
4.2.2.1. Waiver of the Right to be Present . . . . .	89
4.2.2.2. Default Judgments . . . . .	90
4.2.2.3. Applicant's Disruptive Behaviour in the Courtroom or Partial Absence . . . . .	92
4.2.2.4. Presence During an Appeal . . . . .	93
4.2.3. Effective Participation and Legal Safeguards Concerning Young Offenders . . . . .	94
4.2.4. Equality of Arms . . . . .	97
4.2.5. Adversarial Proceedings . . . . .	100
4.2.6. Rules on Evidence . . . . .	104
4.2.6.1. Basic Principles Concerning Evidence . . . . .	104
4.2.6.2. Admissibility of Evidence . . . . .	106
4.2.6.2.1. Co-Defendant's Statement as Evidence and Plea-Bargaining . . . . .	108
4.2.6.2.2. Indirect Evidence or Hearsay Witnesses . . . . .	110
4.2.6.2.3. Illegally Obtained Evidence . . . . .	112

4.2.6.2.4. Evidence Obtained by Undercover Operations or by Other Covert Methods of Investigation .....	114
4.2.6.2.5. Forced Confessions and Other Evidence Obtained by Force.....	121
4.2.6.3. Withholding of Evidence.....	124
4.2.6.4. Refusal to Admit Evidence .....	125
4.2.6.5. Assessment of Evidence and Interpretation and Application of Domestic Law .....	126
4.2.7. Presumption of Innocence in Non-Criminal Matters.....	128
4.2.7.1. Confiscation Proceedings .....	128
4.2.7.2. Subsequent Civil or Administrative Law Proceedings .....	130
4.2.8. Presumption of Innocence in Separate Prosecutions .....	134
4.2.9. Principle of Immediacy.....	134
4.2.10. Freedom from Self-Incrimination and Right to Remain Silent .....	135
4.2.10.1. Nature of Freedom from Self-Incrimination.....	136
4.2.10.2. Procedure Violating the Freedom from Self-Incrimination.....	138
4.2.10.2.1. Documents and Samples Obtained by Coercive Measures .....	139
4.2.10.2.2. Situations Unconnected to Criminal Proceedings .....	139
4.2.10.2.3. Physical Coercion, Torture and Inhuman Treatment.....	140
4.2.10.2.3.1. For Obtaining a Confession..	140
4.2.10.2.3.2. Real Evidence .....	142
4.2.10.2.4. Indirect Situations.....	144
4.2.10.3. Two Typical Situations Concerning Freedom from Self-Incrimination.....	144
4.2.10.3.1. Pending and Anticipated Trials .....	145
4.2.10.3.2. Subsequent Criminal Charges.....	146
4.2.10.3.3. Situations Concerning Speeding Controls .....	148
4.2.10.4. Freedom from Self-Incrimination and Legal Safeguards of a Trial .....	149
4.2.10.5. Freedom from Self-Incrimination and its Effect on Other Defendants .....	150
4.2.11. Plea Bargaining.....	151
4.2.12. Legal Representation in Non-Criminal Cases .....	153
4.2.13. Retroactive Legislation .....	153

4.2.14. Adequate Reasoning .....	155
4.2.15. Requests for a Preliminary Ruling.....	159
4.2.16. Principle of Legal Certainty .....	161
4.2.16.1. Supervisory Review Proceedings .....	161
4.2.16.2. Coherency of Case-Law.....	163
4.2.17. Prejudicial Publicity.....	164
4.3. Right to a Public Hearing and Public Announcement of Judgment....	165
4.3.1. Public Hearing .....	165
4.3.1.1. Public Hearing Requirement.....	166
4.3.1.2. Exceptions to a Public Hearing.....	167
4.3.1.2.1. Interests of Juveniles.....	169
4.3.1.2.2. Protection of Private Life.....	169
4.3.1.2.3. Public Order and Security Concerns.....	170
4.3.1.2.4. National Security .....	171
4.3.2. Oral Hearing.....	172
4.3.2.1. Waiver of an Oral Hearing.....	172
4.3.2.2. Development of the Court's Case-Law.....	173
4.3.2.3. Civil and Administrative Law Cases.....	174
4.3.2.4. Criminal Matters.....	175
4.3.2.4.1. Matters Concerning the Core Areas of Criminal Law.....	175
4.3.2.4.2. Other Criminal Matters.....	176
4.3.2.5. Oral Hearing at the Appeal Stage .....	177
4.3.2.5.1. Need to Organise an Oral Hearing on Appeal.....	178
4.3.2.5.2. Judgment Changed to the Accused's Detriment.....	179
4.3.2.5.3. Participation by Video Conference .....	181
4.3.3. Requirement for Public Pronouncement of a Judgment .....	182
4.3.3.1. How Much of a Judgment Must be Pronounced?....	183
4.3.3.2. Manner of Pronouncing.....	184
4.3.3.3. Exception in Cases Involving Child Custody and Contact Rights.....	184
4.3.3.4. Exceptions in Cases Involving Security Reasons .....	185
4.3.3.5. Waiver of the Right.....	185
4.4. Reasonable Length of the Proceedings.....	185
4.4.1. Means to Seek Redress for Length of Proceedings .....	186
4.4.1.1. Acceleration of the Proceedings .....	187
4.4.1.2. Compensation for Lengthy Proceedings .....	187
4.4.1.3. Mitigation of Sentence .....	188
4.4.2. Victim Status and Exhaustion of Domestic Remedies .....	188
4.4.3. Period to be Considered .....	189
4.4.4. Complexity of the Matter .....	192

4.4.5.	Applicant's Conduct .....	193
4.4.6.	Conduct of the Authorities .....	195
4.4.7.	Importance of the Matter to the Applicant .....	198
4.4.8.	Reasonableness of the Length of the Proceedings .....	199
4.5.	Independent and Impartial Tribunal Established by Law .....	199
4.5.1.	Definition of a Tribunal .....	200
4.5.2.	Independent Tribunal .....	202
	4.5.2.1. Manner of Appointment and Duration of Term .....	202
	4.5.2.2. Guarantees against Outside Pressure (Dismissal of a Judge) .....	205
	4.5.2.3. Appearance of Independence .....	207
4.5.3.	Impartial Tribunal .....	208
	4.5.3.1. Subjective Test .....	210
	4.5.3.2. Objective Test .....	210
	4.5.3.3. Judges Acting in Different Roles .....	213
	4.5.3.4. Judges Participating at More than One Stage or in Parallel .....	216
	4.5.3.5. Judge's Family Ties and Personal Relationships .....	218
	4.5.3.6. Special Courts .....	220
	4.5.3.7. Statements in Public .....	221
	4.5.3.8. Judges with their Own Interest in Matters .....	223
4.5.4.	Waiver of the Right to an Independent and Impartial Tribunal .....	224
4.5.5.	Issue Corrected on Appeal .....	225
4.5.6.	Established by Law .....	226
<b>Chapter 5.</b>	<b>Presumption of Innocence in Article 6 §2 .....</b>	<b>229</b>
5.1.	Basic Principles on Presumption of Innocence .....	229
5.2.	Dimensions of Presumption of Innocence .....	230
	5.2.1. Personal Dimension .....	230
	5.2.2. Material Dimension .....	231
	5.2.3. Duration of Presumption of Innocence .....	232
5.3.	Content of Presumption of Innocence .....	233
	5.3.1. Presumption of Innocence and Burden of Proof by the Prosecution .....	233
	5.3.2. Presumption of Innocence, Legal Presumptions and Different Requirements for Burden of Proof .....	236
	5.3.3. Presumption of Innocence and Admission and Adequacy of Evidence .....	238
	5.3.4. Presumption of Innocence and Organisation of a Trial .....	239
5.4.	Statements Given in Pending Cases .....	240
	5.4.1. Statements Given at Different Stages of the Proceedings .....	240

5.4.2.	Position of the Person Giving a Statement . . . . .	242
5.4.2.1.	Judges, Prosecutors and Police . . . . .	242
5.4.2.2.	Other State Authorities . . . . .	244
5.4.2.3.	Adverse Press Campaigns . . . . .	245
5.4.3.	Extending the Presumption to Other Criminal Proceedings . . . . .	246
5.4.4.	Extending the Presumption to Non-Criminal Proceedings . . . . .	247
5.5.	Correction of a Violation . . . . .	252
5.6.	Presumption of Innocence and Freedom from Self-Incrimination . . . . .	253
<b>Chapter 6. Article 6 §3 and Special Guarantees in Criminal Proceedings . . . . .</b>		<b>257</b>
6.1.	Basic Principles of Article 6 §3 . . . . .	257
6.2.	Right to be Informed of Accusations . . . . .	259
6.2.1.	Information about the Nature and Causes of Accusations . . . . .	260
6.2.1.1.	Detailed Information . . . . .	260
6.2.1.2.	Modified Charges . . . . .	261
6.2.1.3.	Alternative Charges . . . . .	263
6.2.1.4.	Manner of Service . . . . .	264
6.2.2.	Prompt Information . . . . .	265
6.2.3.	Language of the Charges . . . . .	265
6.3.	Right to Adequate Time and Facilities for Preparing a Defence . . . . .	266
6.3.1.	Content of the Right . . . . .	266
6.3.2.	Adequate Time for Preparing a Defence . . . . .	267
6.3.3.	Adequate Facilities for Preparing a Defence . . . . .	269
6.3.3.1.	Access to a Lawyer . . . . .	269
6.3.3.2.	Right to Disclosure of Pretrial Investigation Material . . . . .	271
6.3.3.3.	Information about Material Submitted by Other Parties . . . . .	277
6.3.3.4.	Information about Material Obtained Ex Officio . . . . .	278
6.4.	Right to Defend Oneself in Person or Through Legal Assistance . . . . .	278
6.4.1.	Right to a Lawyer . . . . .	279
6.4.1.1.	Pretrial Investigation and the Right to a Lawyer . . . . .	280
6.4.1.1.1.	From the Beginning of a Pretrial Investigation . . . . .	280
6.4.1.1.2.	Young Suspects . . . . .	282
6.4.1.1.3.	Use of Pretrial Statements as Evidence and Right to a Lawyer . . . . .	283
6.4.1.1.4.	Non-Interrogation Situations . . . . .	283
6.4.1.1.5.	Informing a Suspect of his Rights and Calling a Lawyer . . . . .	284

6.4.1.2. Restrictions on the Right to Legal Assistance from a Lawyer .....	285
6.4.1.2.1. Limiting the Freedom of Choice of the Accused.....	286
6.4.1.2.2. Denial of Any Legal Assistance in the Pretrial Investigation Phase .....	288
6.4.1.3. Waiver of the Right to a Lawyer .....	293
6.4.2. Defence in Person .....	294
6.4.3. Free Legal Aid.....	297
6.4.4. Right to Defend Oneself Through Legal Assistance .....	299
6.4.5. Practical and Effective Legal Assistance .....	301
6.4.5.1. The State's Responsibility for Legal Assistants' Mistakes .....	301
6.4.5.2. Other Requirements of Effectiveness.....	303
6.5. Right to Call and Cross-Examine Witnesses .....	305
6.5.1. Assessing Overall Fairness of the Proceedings .....	305
6.5.2. Concept of a Witness.....	306
6.5.3. Hearing Witnesses in the Presence of an Accused .....	307
6.5.4. Waiving the Right to Cross-Examine Witnesses .....	310
6.5.5. Cross-Examination and Pretrial Investigation Statements.....	311
6.5.5.1. The Three-Step Test .....	312
6.5.5.2. Absence, Disappearance, Illness or Death of a Witness, or Absence Owing to Fear .....	315
6.5.5.2.1. Measures Taken to Summons a Witness to a Court.....	315
6.5.5.2.2. Valid Excuse for a Witness's Absence and Sufficient Safeguards of the Defence .....	317
6.5.5.2.2.1. Dead Witness .....	317
6.5.5.2.2.2. Witnesses in Fear .....	319
6.5.5.2.2.3. Witnesses Who have Fallen Ill .....	321
6.5.5.2.4. Witnesses Who are Abroad and Unreachable.....	322
6.5.5.2.5. Absent Witness Who has been Cross-Examined During Pretrial Investigation .....	325
6.5.5.2.6. Hearing of (Silent) Co-Defendants .....	325
6.5.5.2.7. Spouse's Refusal to Testify ..	326
6.5.5.2.8. Changed Composition of the Court and Related Absences .....	328

6.5.5.3.	Hearing Witnesses in Sexual Crime Cases .....	329
6.5.5.3.1.	Sexual Abuse of a Child.....	329
6.5.5.3.2.	Sexual Abuse of an Adult.....	332
6.5.5.4.	Anonymous Witnesses.....	332
6.5.5.4.1.	Valid Reasons for Using Anonymous Witnesses .....	334
6.5.5.4.2.	Significance of Anonymous Witnesses ..	335
6.5.6.	Right to Call and Hear Witnesses .....	339
6.5.6.1.	Restrictions on Hearing Witnesses.....	340
6.5.6.1.1.	General Principles.....	340
6.5.6.1.2.	Expert Witnesses.....	343
6.5.6.2.	A Witness's Refusal to Testify .....	344
6.5.6.3.	Right to Present One's Own Evidence .....	345
6.6.	Right to a Free Interpreter .....	345
6.6.1.	Extent of the Right.....	346
6.6.2.	Service for Free.....	349
<i>Bibliography</i>	.....	351
<i>Index</i>	.....	361