

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	xiii
INTRODUCTION	xv
I. Searching for the Continuity in Legal Thinking of Post-Communist Europe	xv
II. Roadmap of the Book	xviii
CHAPTER ONE. THE ORIGINS OF CENTRAL EUROPEAN LEGAL CULTURE	
I. The Austrian Legal Tradition	I
II. The Central European Legal Systems in the Aftermath of World War I	4
<i>II.1. Hungarian Law</i>	4
<i>II.2. Polish Law</i>	6
<i>II.3. Czechoslovak Law</i>	7
III. The Status of Judges and its Problems	9
IV. Legal Professions in Central Europe Prior to Communism	14
V. The Experience of World War II	17
CHAPTER TWO. SOCIALIST LEGAL CULTURE IN CENTRAL EUROPE: AN INTRODUCTION	
I. The Success of Stalinization	21
II. The Political Trials of the 1950s	26
III. From the 1960s through the 1980s	28
IV. The Transformation of the Legal System	31
<i>IV.1. Towards Law Comprehensible to All</i>	31
<i>IV.2. The Inclusion of Laymen</i>	34
<i>IV.3. Restricting the Competence of the Courts and the Proliferation of Decrees</i>	36
<i>IV.4. Leaving the Continental Tradition</i>	40
<i>IV.5. The Prosecutor: The Main Guardian of Socialist Legality</i>	43

V. Law and Everyday Life	45
VI. Law Students during Socialism	49
VII. The Legal and Social Status of Lawyers and Judges in Particular	52
VIII. Assessing Judicial Independence	57
IX. Conclusions: Central European Legal Culture on the Eve of 1989	62

CHAPTER THREE. FROM STALINIST ANTI-FORMALISM TO SOCIALIST TEXTUAL POSITIVISM: CENTRAL EUROPEAN JUDICIAL METHODOLOGY DURING THE COLD WAR

I. Ideologies of Judicial Decision-Making	67
<i>I.1. The Ideologies of Bound and Free Judicial Decision-Making in Comparison</i>	69
<i>I.2. Formalism and Anti-Formalism in Judicial Reasoning</i>	74
<i>I.3. The Decline of Formalism and Bound Judicial Decision-Making in Western Law</i>	77
<i>I.4. Western European Judicial Practice</i>	86
II. The Socialist Judge in the 1950s: A Builder of Communism	88
<i>II.1. The Soviet Idea of Law</i>	88
II.1.1. Antecedents: Anti-Positivism	
II.1.2. Towards Stalinist Law: A New Concept of Law and Its Inner Contradiction	
II.1.3. The Origins of Stalinist Judicial Activism	
<i>II.2. The Aftermath of the Communist Takeover and the Beginnings of the Transformation of Judicial Rhetoric</i>	98
II.2.1. Stalinist Decentralized Constitutional Review: A Short-Lived Novelty	
II.2.2. Marxist Ideology in Adjudication	
II.2.3. Identification of Law with Morality?	
II.2.4. The Instrumental Concept of the Law	
II.2.5. Heavy Emphasis on Criminal Sanctions	
III. The End of Stalinism and the New Socialist Textual Positivism	116
<i>III.1. Post-Stalinist Desiderata: Stability and Formality</i>	116
<i>III.2. The Contradiction between Claimed Anti-Formalism and Practiced Ultra-Formalism</i>	120
<i>III.3. Analyzing Czechoslovak Case Law of the 1970s and 1980s</i>	124

III.4. <i>Constructing the Concept of Limited Law</i>	129
III.4.1. Legal Education	
III.4.2. Socialist Scholarship	
III.4.3. Static Interpretation of the Law	
III.4.4. Western Law as Seen by Communist Lawyers	
III.4.5. The Communist Countries Did Not Need Long-Lasting Codes but Ever-Changing Laws	
III.4.6. Socialist Judicial Practice in Socialist Jurisprudence and Socialist Jurisprudence in Socialist Judicial Opinions	
IV. Socialist Legal Injustice: Formalism <i>versus</i> Anti-Formalism Revisited	145
V. An Attempt to Explain the Rationale of Socialist Ultra-Formalism	151

CHAPTER FOUR. INSTITUTIONAL CHANGES AFTER THE COLLAPSE OF COMMUNISM

I. The Replacement of Judges	164
II. Introducing the Actors	169
II.1. <i>Professional Career Judges Born from Infant Judges</i>	169
II.2. <i>Who Are Central European Constitutional Justices?</i>	174
III. The Rise of Litigation	176
IV. The Independence of Judges after the Fall of Communism	178
V. Towards More Efficient Procedure	182

CHAPTER FIVE. JUDICIAL METHODOLOGY IN A POST-COMMUNIST WORLD: OVERCOMING THE CONCEPT OF LIMITED LAW?

I. The Judicial Discourse on Formalism. The Institutional Background	191
I.1. <i>Unpublished Case Law</i>	191
I.2. <i>Constitutional and Ordinary Courts</i>	192
II. Discourse between the Czech Constitutional Court and Ordinary Courts. The Ideology of the Bound Judicial Decision-Making Challenged	199
II.1. <i>The Concept of 'Mechanical Jurisprudence': A Slow Transformation</i>	199

II.2. <i>Limited Law and Limited Sources of Law</i>	207
II.2.1. Listening to Legal Academia	
II.2.2. The Issue of Precedent	
II.2.3. The Czech Constitutional Court on the Binding Force of Precedents of Ordinary Courts	
III. Textual Positivism: Public Critique and the Position of Legal Science	227
IV. The Issue of the Binding Force of Decisions of Constitutional Courts	232
IV.1. <i>Case Study: 'The War of Courts' in Poland and the Czech Republic</i>	236
IV.2. <i>The Problem of Interpretation Consistent with the Constitution</i>	240
V. Making New Constitutionalism Inclusive <i>vis-à-vis</i> the Ordinary Courts: The Problem of the 'Over-Centralization' of Centralized Judicial Review	244
V.1. <i>Former Czechoslovakia: The Empires of Centralized Judicial Review</i>	248
V.2. <i>Poland: Activism of the Ordinary Judges and the Battle over Centralized Judicial Review</i>	252
V.3. <i>On Disobedient Judges: The Polish and Czech Situation Compared</i>	258
V.4. <i>Centralized versus Decentralized Constitutional Review Revisited</i>	260
VI. Learning Abroad: Comparative Constitutionalism and Central European Constitutional Courts	263
VII. New European Judges	267
VII.1. <i>The Application of EU Law prior to EU Enlargement</i>	267
VII.1.1. Examples of Application	
VII.1.2. Examples of Non-Application	
VII.2. <i>Central European Judges as New "European" Judges</i>	274
VII.2.1. The Application of European Law: General Maxims	
VII.2.2. Constitutional Courts	
VII.2.3. Ordinary Courts I: Textual Positivism and European Law	
VII.2.4. Textual Positivism and European Law: Case Scenario	
VII.2.5. Ordinary Courts II: Two Different Conceptions of Law	
VII.3. <i>Reconsidering the Principle Iura novit curia: Authoritarian versus Authoritative Approach to Law</i>	288

Table of Contents

xi

**CONCLUSIONS. RETHINKING THE FUTURE OF
THE CENTRAL EUROPEAN JUDICIARY** 293

SUBJECT-MATTER INDEX 297

INDEX OF PERSONAL NAMES 309

ABOUT THE AUTHOR 313