

Table of Contents

| | |
|---|-----|
| <i>Table of Cases</i> | xv |
| <i>List of Contributors</i> | xxv |
| 1. Introduction | 1 |
| <i>Ulrich Becker</i> | |
| I. Starting points | 1 |
| II. The constitution of the welfare state under pressure | 6 |
| 1. Social policy reforms and the financial crisis | 6 |
| 2. Constitutional protection of social rights | 7 |
| a) Starting points: different meanings of social rights | 8 |
| b) Interplay between different legal levels | 9 |
| c) Mechanisms: dimensions of human rights | 12 |
| d) Substance: guidelines for social protection | 14 |
| e) Procedure: separation of powers and rule of law | 15 |
| III. Aim and outline of the Book | 16 |
| 1. Aim | 16 |
| 2. Time and area under analysis | 17 |
| a) Countries | 17 |
| b) Time frame | 21 |
| 3. Structure of the country reports | 22 |
| 2. Human Rights Obligations of European Financial Assistance Mechanisms | 24 |
| <i>Anastasia Poulou</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 24 |
| II. The EU financial assistance mechanisms | 25 |
| III. The applicability of the Charter to EU institutions involved in the MTFFA and EFSM | 28 |
| IV. The hybrid European financial assistance mechanisms | 29 |
| V. The applicability of the Charter to EU institutions involved in the EFSF and ESM | 33 |
| 1. The applicability of the Charter to the Eurogroup | 33 |
| 2. The applicability of the Charter to the Commission and the ECB | 36 |
| 3. The applicability of the Charter to the Council of the EU | 40 |
| VI. International human rights obligations of the ESM | 41 |
| VII. Conclusion | 48 |

| | |
|---|----|
| 3. The Transition from Welfare to Workfare in Times of Crisis: A Double-based Reform of the Hungarian Welfare State | 49 |
| <i>József Hajdú</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 49 |
| II. The main reforms and developments of the social security systems in Hungary during the last financial crisis | 53 |
| 1. Brief outlook of the Hungarian social security system | 53 |
| 2. Pension system after the economic crises | 54 |
| a) The transfer of the mandatory, private pension scheme (second pillar) | 55 |
| b) Fundamental changes in early retirement pension rights | 57 |
| 3. Challenges to the statutory healthcare system | 58 |
| 4. Transformation of 'disability pension' to 'rehabilitation benefits' | 60 |
| 5. Challenges to family policy | 62 |
| 6. Employment and unemployment policies | 63 |
| III. The impact of constitutional law on the content of social security rights | 66 |
| 1. Transition from Constitution to Fundamental Law | 66 |
| 2. Right to social security: state goals instead of social rights | 67 |
| IV. Conclusion | 71 |
| 4. The Latvian Response to Its First Economic Crisis under a Free Market Economy | 73 |
| <i>Kristīne Dupate</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 73 |
| II. Reforms in national social security systems | 75 |
| 1. Overview on the social security and healthcare system | 75 |
| 2. Structural reforms and the cuts introduced after the crisis | 77 |
| 3. Elements in the making and implementation of the reforms | 79 |
| a) Overview | 79 |
| b) Reasons for reforms | 81 |
| c) Procedural particularities in the making of the reforms | 82 |
| III. Human rights affected by social security reforms | 83 |
| 1. National case law referring to the social security reforms | 83 |
| a) Overview | 83 |
| b) Outcome | 84 |
| 2. Analysis of the case law | 86 |
| a) Role of constitutional rights | 86 |
| aa) Right to property | 86 |
| bb) Right to social security | 88 |
| cc) Equality | 93 |
| b) Role of general principles | 94 |
| aa) Relation to rights | 94 |
| bb) Legitimate expectation | 96 |
| c) Changes of constitutional doctrine | 97 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| 3. Critical assessment of the decisions | 98 |
| 4. Role of international law | 101 |
| a) ECHR | 102 |
| b) ICESCR | 103 |
| c) Other sources and conclusions | 104 |
| IV. Conclusion | 105 |
| 5. Upholding the Welfare State During the Financial Crisis: The Pivotal Role of the Constitutional Court of Romania | 108 |
| <i>Elena-Luminița Dima</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 108 |
| II. Reforms in Romania's social protection systems | 111 |
| 1. Background and stages of reform | 111 |
| a) First stage | 112 |
| b) Second stage | 113 |
| c) Third stage | 114 |
| 2. Specific reform measures | 115 |
| a) Old-age benefits | 115 |
| aa) Pensions pillar I | 115 |
| bb) Pensions pillar II | 119 |
| cc) Pensions pillar III | 119 |
| b) Unemployment benefits | 120 |
| c) Family allowances | 121 |
| aa) Social assistance benefits | 121 |
| bb) Social insurance allowances | 123 |
| d) Healthcare benefits | 124 |
| e) Social assistance benefits | 124 |
| III. Human rights affected by social protection reforms | 125 |
| 1. Procedural issues | 126 |
| 2. Pensions | 128 |
| a) Restrictions in cumulating the pension with salary income paid from state budget | 128 |
| b) Decrease in the amount of pensions | 130 |
| aa) Right to property (article 44 of the Constitution and article 1 of Protocol 1 to the ECHR) | 130 |
| bb) Right to a decent living standard and right to benefits | 131 |
| c) Removal of the non-contributive part of the special pensions | 132 |
| aa) Retroactive effect (article 15(2) of the Constitution) | 133 |
| bb) Right to property | 134 |
| cc) Decent living standard and securing conditions to increase the quality of life | 135 |
| dd) Necessity of acts of parliament | 136 |
| ee) Breach of other constitutional provisions | 137 |
| ff) Independence of the judiciary | 138 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 3. Unemployment benefits | 141 |
| 4. Other social protection benefits | 143 |
| IV. Conclusion | 144 |
| 6. <i>Salus Rei Publicae Suprema Lex Esto?</i> Welfare State Reforms Before the Greek Courts | 148 |
| <i>Maria Bakavou</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 148 |
| II. Overview of the Greek social security protection systems and their reforms | 151 |
| 1. Overview of the Greek social security system | 152 |
| 2. Suggested and implemented reform measures | 155 |
| 3. The Greek healthcare system | 160 |
| III. Constitutional and human rights affected by social security reforms | 164 |
| 1. Procedural particularities in the adoption of the reform measures | 164 |
| 2. Constitutional protection of the welfare state | 165 |
| 3. Overview of the Greek system of judicial review | 167 |
| 4. Social protection reforms before the Greek courts | 169 |
| a) The initial phase of judicial self-restraint | 169 |
| b) The milestone decisions on cuts in pensions | 171 |
| c) Current developments | 173 |
| d) The decision on the Greek PSI LM Facility Agreement | 175 |
| 5. Assessment of the courts' approach to social protection reforms | 175 |
| 6. The healthcare reform before the Greek courts | 177 |
| IV. Conclusion | 179 |
| 7. The Financial Crisis as a Turning Point for Constitutional Rights Jurisprudence: An Assessment of the Absence of Social Rights Protection in the Irish Constitution | 181 |
| <i>Elaine Dewhurst</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 181 |
| II. The economic crisis and crisis-related reforms | 183 |
| 1. Economic crisis in Ireland | 183 |
| 2. Structure, administration, and funding of social protection and healthcare | 183 |
| a) Structure | 184 |
| b) Administration | 186 |
| c) Funding | 187 |
| 3. Justifying crisis-related reforms | 187 |
| a) Old-age benefits | 191 |
| b) Social assistance | 193 |
| c) Family allowances | 194 |
| d) Unemployment benefits | 195 |
| e) Healthcare | 196 |
| f) Overall assessment | 197 |

| | |
|---|-----|
| III. Crisis and the Constitution | 199 |
| 1. Institutional and procedural conditions | 199 |
| 2. Constitutional rights impact | 200 |
| 3. Administrative protections | 203 |
| 4. Social protection and healthcare rights | 205 |
| IV. Conclusion | 206 |
| | |
| 8. Legal Changes and Constitutional Adjudication in Portuguese Social Law in Consequence of the European Financial Crisis | 208 |
| <i>José Carlos Vieira de Andrade, João Carlos Loureiro, and Suzana Tavares da Silva</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 208 |
| II. Reforms in national social security systems | 210 |
| 1. Overview of the social security and healthcare system in Portugal | 210 |
| a) Social security | 211 |
| b) Civil servant's social protection system: convergent social protection scheme | 213 |
| c) Healthcare system | 213 |
| 2. Structural reforms and cuts introduced after the crisis | 214 |
| a) Old-age benefits | 214 |
| aa) Old-age benefits: a brief introduction | 214 |
| bb) Reform and cuts during the intervention | 216 |
| b) Social assistance | 217 |
| c) Family allowances | 218 |
| d) Unemployment benefits | 218 |
| e) Healthcare | 219 |
| aa) Sickness benefits | 219 |
| bb) Healthcare: National Health Service and ADSE | 220 |
| 3. Relationship between the reforms and financial assistance commitments | 220 |
| III. Human rights affected by social security reforms and constitutional theoretical achievements from this period | 223 |
| 1. National case law | 223 |
| a) State Budget Law 2012 | 224 |
| b) State Budget Law 2013 and definitive cut in amount of the pensions of CGA beneficiaries | 226 |
| c) Decisions of 2014 and 2015 | 229 |
| 2. Critical assessment of Portuguese constitutional case law | 232 |
| 3. The judicial protection of social rights in times of crisis | 236 |
| IV. Conclusion | 239 |
| | |
| 9. A 'Bail-In' of Social Rights? The Cypriot Experience of the Financial Crisis | 240 |
| <i>Constantinos Kombos and Athena Herodotou</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 240 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| II. The background of the Cypriot economic crisis and the adoption of the MoU | 242 |
| 1. The Cypriot banking crisis and the need to restructure the welfare system | 242 |
| 2. The uncertain legal nature of the MoU in the Cypriot legal order | 245 |
| III. Reforms in national social protection systems during the financial crisis | 248 |
| 1. Overview of the national social protection and healthcare systems | 248 |
| a) Constitutional social protection | 248 |
| b) Overview of the social protection system | 248 |
| c) Overview of the healthcare system | 250 |
| 2. Structural reforms and cuts | 252 |
| a) Old-age pension | 252 |
| b) Social assistance | 254 |
| c) Family allowances | 255 |
| d) Unemployment benefits | 257 |
| e) Healthcare | 257 |
| 3. Grounds of justification and procedural particularities of the reforms | 258 |
| IV. Social protection reforms before Cypriot courts: a constitutional approach | 261 |
| 1. Legal basis for challenging social protection cuts and reforms | 261 |
| 2. Social protection cuts and reforms: the human rights dimension | 261 |
| a) The initial judicial approach: the <i>Charalambous</i> and <i>Koutselini-Ioannidou</i> cases | 262 |
| b) Social protection cuts and reforms and the right to property | 267 |
| c) Assessing the Cypriot courts' approach to social protection reforms and human rights violations | 271 |
| 3. Separation of powers and judges' remunerations | 273 |
| V. Conclusion | 274 |
| 10. The Outcome of the Financial Crisis in Italy: A Sea Change for the Doctrine of Social Rights | 276 |
| <i>Matteo De Nes and Andrea Pin</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 276 |
| II. Background | 278 |
| 1. The 2011 ECB letter, the political crisis, and the decline of social rights | 278 |
| 2. The constitutionalisation of the balanced budget rule | 282 |
| III. Reforms in national security systems | 285 |
| 1. Preliminary remarks: social security and the healthcare system in Italy | 285 |
| 2. Reform (and counter-reform) of the pension system | 287 |
| 3. Reform of labour market regulation and unemployment benefits | 291 |

| | |
|--|-----|
| 4. The healthcare system and its underfunding | 293 |
| 5. Social assistance under stress | 296 |
| IV. Human rights affected by social security reforms: the jurisprudence of the Italian Constitutional Court | 298 |
| 1. From 2011 to 2014: the Constitutional Court and the de-prioritisation of social rights | 298 |
| 2. From 2015 to present: the (slow) recovery of social rights | 301 |
| a) The mitigation of the impact of specific Court judgments | 301 |
| b) Budgetary constraints and the need of adequate justification | 303 |
| c) The hard core of social rights | 305 |
| d) The principle of reasonableness | 306 |
| V. Conclusion | 307 |
| 11. The Predominance of a 'Strong' Economy over a 'Weak' Social Constitution: The Legacy of the Financial Crisis in Spain | 311 |
| <i>Juan Antonio Maldonado Molina and Juan Romero Coronado</i> | |
| I. Introduction | 311 |
| II. Characterisation of the reforms | 314 |
| 1. As to the form: the 'making-of': the governmentalisation of the reform process | 314 |
| 2. On the substance: arguments used to justify the reforms | 315 |
| a) Financial stability | 315 |
| b) Economic emergency | 315 |
| c) Gaining the confidence of the financial markets | 316 |
| d) Implementing policies of the European Union | 316 |
| III. The structural reforms | 319 |
| 1. The retirement pension | 319 |
| a) Early reforms | 319 |
| aa) No revaluation of pensions | 320 |
| bb) Reform of the retirement pension | 320 |
| b) Decisive reforms | 322 |
| aa) Consolidation measures and measures to favour the continuity of the working life | 322 |
| bb) Sustainability factor and revaluation index of the public pension system | 323 |
| 2. Long-term care | 325 |
| 3. Family allowances | 327 |
| 4. Unemployment | 327 |
| 5. Healthcare | 329 |
| IV. Interpretation by the Constitutional Court | 330 |
| 1. Constitutional evaluation of the procedural aspects of the reforms | 330 |
| 2. Constitutional evaluation of pension reform | 331 |
| 3. Constitutional evaluation of health reform | 333 |
| V. Conclusion | 335 |

| | |
|---|---------|
| 12. Conclusions from a Comparative Perspective | 338 |
| <i>Ulrich Becker</i> | |
| I. Legacy of the reforms with respect to social protection | 338 |
| 1. Facts: social protection reforms | 338 |
| a) Pensions and healthcare | 338 |
| b) Unemployment and family benefits | 340 |
| c) Social assistance | 341 |
| 2. Reasons: financial crisis and other drivers | 342 |
| 3. Outcome: cutbacks and structural changes | 344 |
| II. Legacy of the reforms with respect to constitutional law | 346 |
| 1. The role of constitutional law and adjudication | 346 |
| a) Overview | 346 |
| b) Objects and rights | 348 |
| c) Inter- and supranational sources | 349 |
| 2. Impact of the constitution on welfare state reforms | 350 |
| 3. Economic pressure and legal doctrine | 351 |
| III. The financial crisis and the constitution of European welfare states | 353 |
| <i>Index</i> | 357 |