Contents

Abbreviations ix
Table of Cases and Legislation xi

1. Introduction 1

2. Genetic Data, Genome Understanding, and Socially Relevant Information 7
   A. Introduction 7
   B. Types of Genetic Data 7
   C. Types of Socially Significant Information Revealed via Genetic Analysis 9
   D. The Range of Genetic Analyses Potentially Applicable to Genetic Data 12
   E. The Accuracy of Information Produced via Genetic Analysis 14
   F. The Range of Parties Implicated by Genetic Analyses 16
   G. Conclusion 17

3. The Context and State of the Art in European Biobanking 19
   A. Introduction 19
   B. The Human Genome Project: Where It All Began 19
   C. Organisational Legacies of the Human Genome Project 21
   D. Methodological Legacies of the Human Genome Project 22
   E. The Promises of Genomic Research 24
   F. The Unfulfillable Promises of Genomic Research? 25
   G. Defining Biobanks: A Loose Definition for a Heterogeneous Class 26
   H. Variations in European Biobanking: Scientific Approach 29
   I. Variations in European Biobanking: Organisational Structure 31
   J. Variations in European Biobanking: Substance Ownership and Intellectual Property 33
   K. Variations in European Biobanking: Approach to Research Subjects 34
   L. Future Trends in European Biobanking 36
   M. Conclusion 38

4. Genetic Privacy and Other Interests in Biobanking: Conflict and Confluence 40
   A. Introduction 40
   B. Privacy: As a Condition and as a Right 40
   C. Genetic Privacy Rights: A Subset of Privacy Rights 43
   D. Mapping Genetic Privacy Rights Engaged by Biobanking: The Research Subject's Genetic Privacy Rights on the Transactional Axis 46
   E. Mapping Genetic Privacy Rights Engaged by Biobanking: Genetic Relatives' and Genetic Groups' Genetic Privacy Rights on the Relational Axis 51
   F. Genetic Classes and Genetic Categories: Two Different Kinds of Genetic Groups 54
   G. Mapping Other Interests Engaged by Biobanking: Interests Tied Up with the Conduct and Outcome of Biobank Research 56

H. Mapping Other Interests Engaged by Biobanking: Third-Party Non-Research Interests in Accessing Biobanking Substances 59
I. Mapping the Relationships between Genetic Privacy Rights and Other Interests: Conflicts 63
J. Mapping the Relationships between Genetic Privacy Rights and Other Interests: Confluences 65
K. Conclusion 66

5. The Protection of Genetic Privacy in Biobanking at International Level: Establishing a Baseline Standard for Genetic Privacy Protection in Biobanking 67
A. Introduction 67
B. The Structure of the International Framework 68
C. Common International Principles Regarding Research Subjects' Genetic Privacy on the Transactional Axis 71
D. Common International Principles Regarding Genetic Relatives' and Groups' Genetic Privacy on the Relational Axis 75
E. Emerging International Principles Regarding Research Subjects' Genetic Privacy on the Transactional Axis 77
F. Emerging International Principles Regarding Genetic Relatives' and Groups' Genetic Privacy on the Relational Axis 79
G. Problems of Structure: The International Framework Is Not Hard Law 80
H. Problems Along the Transactional Axis: The International Framework Does Not Provide Protection for the Full Range of Research Subjects' Genetic Privacy Rights 82
I. Problems Along the Relational Axis: The International Framework Does Not Provide Protection for the Full Range of Genetic Privacy Rights Holders 85
J. Problems with the Standard of Protection: The International Framework Provides Incomprehensive Protection 88
K. Conclusion 89

6. Do we Need Data Protection at All? Evaluating Protection for Genetic Privacy in Biobanking in Europe *Excluding* Data Protection 91
A. Introduction 91
B. Selection of European Legal Systems to Analyse 92
C. EU Law *Excluding* Data Protection 93
D. Estonian Law *Excluding* Data Protection 94
E. German Law *Excluding* Data Protection 101
F. UK Law *Excluding* Data Protection 107
G. Problems of Structure: No System—*Excluding* Data Protection—Is Optimally Structured to Protect Genetic Privacy in Biobanking 115
H. Problems with the Protection of Research Subjects' Genetic Privacy: *Excluding* Data Protection, Only Estonia Protects the Full Range of Genetic Privacy Rights 117
I. Problems with the Protection of Genetic Relatives' and Genetic Groups' Genetic Privacy: No System—*Excluding* Data Protection—Protects Genetic Relatives or Groups 119
J. Problems with the Adequacy of Protection: No System—*Excluding* Data Protection—Provides Comprehensive Protection 121

K. Problems of Harmony: Systems—*Excluding* Data Protection—Are Neither Harmonised, Nor Necessarily Compatible 123
L. Looking to Data Protection and the GDPR 126
M. Conclusion 128

7. Testing the GDPR in Relation to Biobanking: When Does the GDPR Apply to Biobanking? 129
A. Introduction 129
B. The GDPR's General Applicability Principles: Article 2 and Biobanking 129
C. Personal Data and Its Constituent Criteria 131
D. Which Biobanking Substances Could Potentially Be Personal Data? 135
E. Biological Samples as Personal Data? Practical Parallels Between Biological Samples and Sequenced Genomic Data 137
F. Biological Samples as Personal Data? Biological Samples Can Be Considered in Terms of Information 138
G. Biological Samples as Personal Data? Biological Samples Can Be Considered as Information as the Term Is Used in the GDPR 141
H. Which Biobanking Links Qualify as Identified or Identifiable? 143
I. Conclusion 146

8. Testing the GDPR in Relation to Biobanking: How Does the GDPR classify the Biobanking Process? 148
A. Introduction 148
B. Two Classifications Systems: The Actor Classification System and the Personal Data Classification System 148
C. The Applicability of the Actor Classification System to Biobanking 152
D. The Applicability of the Personal Data Classification System to Biobanking 155
E. Conclusion 157

9. Testing the GDPR in Relation to Biobanking: How Do the GDPR's Substantive Provisions Apply to Biobanking? 159
A. Introduction 159
B. Biobanking and Oversight under the GDPR 159
C. Biobanking and Legitimate Processing under the GDPR 162
D. Biobanking and Data Subject Rights under the GDPR 169
E. Biobanking and Data Controller Obligations under the GDPR 175
F. Biobanking and Transfers to Third Countries under the GDPR 181
G. Biobanking and Sanctions under the GDPR 186
H. Biobanking and Derogations under the GDPR 188
I. Conclusion 190

10. A Critical Analysis of the Efficacy of the GDPR as a Framework for the Protection of Genetic Privacy in Biobanking 192
A. Introduction 192
B. A Framework for the Critical Analysis of the GDPR 193
C. Problems Concerning the Structure of the GDPR 196
D. Problems Concerning the Protection of Research Subjects' Genetic Privacy Rights on the Transactional Axis 201
E. Problems Concerning the Protection of Genetic Relatives' and Genetic Groups' Genetic Privacy Rights on the Relational Axis 205

F. Problems Concerning the Substantive Protection Offered by the GDPR 212
G. Problems Concerning the Technical Applicability of the GDPR's Provisions to Biobanking 222
H. Problems Concerning the Disproportionate Impact of the GDPR on Research 229
I. Problems Concerning the Practical Applicability of the GDPR to Biobanking 236
J. Problems Concerning the Degree to Which the GDPR Harmonises Protection 247
K. Conclusion 254

11. Conclusion 256

References 261
Index 281