

CONTENTS

Preface	XIII
Abbreviations	XV
Introduction.....	1
Chapter One. Aim and Relevance.....	15
1.1. The Aim of the Study	15
1.1.1. Various Viewpoints.....	15
1.1.2. Refinement of the Study's Aim	21
1.2. The Study's Relevance.....	22
1.2.1. Historical Relevance.....	22
1.2.1.1. The Council of Ephesus (431).....	23
1.2.1.2. The Council of Chalcedon (451).....	24
1.2.1.3. The Miaphysite Theologians of the Fifth and Sixth Centuries	29
1.2.1.4. The 'Neo-Chalcedonian' Theologians of the Fifth and Sixth Centuries	30
1.2.2. Ecumenical Relevance	43
1.2.3. Dogmatic Relevance.....	47
1.2.3.1. Karl Rahner	49
1.2.3.2. Piet Schoonenberg	54
1.2.3.3. Georg Essen	56
1.2.3.4. Aloys Grillmeier	58
1.3. Conclusion	59
Chapter Two. Cyril of Alexandria's Use of Aristotelian Logic	61
2.1. Introduction	61
2.2. Cyril of Alexandria and Ancient Philosophy	62
2.2.1. Varying Assessments.....	62
2.2.2. Ancient Logic	65
2.2.3. Christian Authors and Aristotelian Logic	66
2.3. Aristotle and Logic.....	70
2.3.1. The <i>Categories</i>	70

2.3.2.	The <i>Topics</i>	76
2.3.3.	The <i>Metaphysics</i>	80
2.4.	Porphyry and Logic	84
2.4.1.	<i>Commentary on Aristotle's Categories</i>	84
2.4.2.	<i>Isagoge</i>	88
2.5.	Cyril of Alexandria and Logic	93
2.5.1.	Logic in Context	94
2.5.2.	Cyril's Grasp of Logic	98
2.5.3.	<i>Thesaurus</i> , Chapter III	104
2.5.4.	<i>Thesaurus</i> , Chapter XI	106
2.5.5.	<i>Dialogues on the Trinity</i> II	114
2.5.6.	<i>Dialogues on the Trinity</i> IV and VII	119
2.6.	Conclusion	121
Chapter Three. Meanings and Metaphysics in the Trinitarian Writings		
3.1.	Introduction	123
3.2.	Οὐσία	124
3.2.1.	<i>Dialogues on the Trinity</i> I	124
3.2.2.	The Trinitarian Writings	127
3.3.	Ἐπόστασις	137
3.4.	Φύσις	143
3.4.1.	Φύσις and οὐσία	143
3.4.2.	Ruth M. Siddals's Dissertation	152
3.4.3.	Jacques Liébaert's <i>La doctrine christologique</i>	157
3.4.4.	Christology and Soteriology	171
3.4.5.	Summary	178
3.5.	Πρόσωπον	179
3.6.	ἴδιος, ἴδιον, ιδιότης	185
3.7.	Conclusion	189
Chapter Four. Comparison of Interpretations		
4.1.	Introduction	193
4.2.	Small-Capital Terms	193
4.2.1.	Definition of the Small-Capital Terms	193
4.2.2.	Cyril's Terminology and Metaphysics before 429	202
4.3.	Christological 'Models' or 'Themes'	205
4.3.1.	Richard A. Norris	205
4.3.2.	Ruth M. Siddals	207
4.3.3.	Thomas G. Weinandy	209

4.3.4.	Discussion	211
4.4.	Various Interpretations	220
4.4.1.	Joseph Lebon	221
4.4.2.	Martin Jugie	230
4.4.3.	Joseph van den Dries	233
4.4.4.	Aloys Grillmeier	235
4.4.5.	The Ecumenical Consultations between the Eastern Orthodox and the Oriental Orthodox	237
4.4.5.1.	Johannes N. Karmiris	238
4.4.5.2.	John S. Romanides	238
4.4.6.	John A. McGuckin	239
4.4.7.	Gudrun Münch-Labacher	242
4.4.8.	Bernard Meunier	243
4.4.9.	Steven A. McKinion	246
4.4.10.	Overview	248
4.5.	Conclusion	248
Chapter Five. The First Year of the Nestorian Controversy		251
5.1.	Introduction	251
5.2.	Selected Writings	252
5.2.1.	A Brief History	252
5.2.2.	Disputed Writings	258
5.2.3.	The Writings to be Investigated	261
5.3.	<i>On the Incarnation</i>	262
5.3.1.	Summary of the Contents	263
5.3.2.	Terminology	268
5.3.2.1.	Οὐσία	268
5.3.2.2.	Ἑπόστασις	269
5.3.2.3.	Φύσις	271
5.3.2.4.	Πρόσωπον	277
5.3.2.5.	Ἰδιος	279
5.3.3.	Christology	282
5.4.	<i>Festal Letter 17</i>	290
5.4.1.	Summary of the Contents	291
5.4.2.	Terminology	293
5.4.2.1.	Οὐσία, ἕπόστασις, πρόσωπον	293
5.4.2.2.	Φύσις	294
5.4.2.3.	Ἰδιος	299
5.4.3.	Christology	299
5.5.	<i>Letter to the Monks</i>	303

5.5.1.	Summary of the Contents	303
5.5.2.	Terminology	308
5.5.2.1.	Οὐσία, ὑπόστασις, πρόσωπον	308
5.5.2.2.	Φύσις	308
5.5.2.3.	Ἰδιος	311
5.5.3.	Christology	312
5.6.	Several Letters from 429	316
5.6.1.	<i>To the Accusers</i> (ep. 8)	316
5.6.2.	<i>To the Apocrisiaries</i> (ep. 10)	317
5.6.2.1.	Summary of the Contents	317
5.6.2.2.	Terminology and Christology	318
5.6.3.	<i>To a Devotee of Nestorius</i> (ep. 9)	320
5.6.4.	<i>To Acacius of Beroea</i> (ep. 14)	320
5.6.5.	<i>First Letter to Nestorius</i> (ep. 2)	322
5.7.	<i>Festal Letter</i> 18	323
5.7.1.	Summary of the Contents	323
5.7.2.	Terminology and Christology	325
5.8.	<i>Second Letter to Nestorius</i> (ep. 4)	326
5.8.1.	Summary of the Contents	327
5.8.2.	Terminology	328
5.8.2.1.	Οὐσία and ὑπόστασις	328
5.8.2.2.	Πρόσωπον	330
5.8.2.3.	Φύσις	331
5.8.2.4.	Ἰδιος	332
5.8.3.	Christology	333
5.8.4.	Nestorius's Response	334
5.9.	Conclusion	336
	Chapter Six. <i>Contra Nestorium</i>	339
6.1.	Introduction	339
6.2.	Summary of the Contents	341
6.2.1.	Book I	341
6.2.2.	Book II	347
6.2.3.	Book III	354
6.2.4.	Book IV	360
6.2.5.	Book V	365
6.3.	Terminology	370
6.3.1.	Οὐσία	370
6.3.2.	Ἐπόστασις	372
6.3.3.	Πρόσωπον	377

6.3.4.	Φύσις	381
6.3.5.	Ἰδιος	393
6.3.6.	Ἐνωσις and Συνάφεια	395
6.3.7.	Σχέσις	396
6.4.	Christology	398
6.4.1.	Attributing the Sayings	403
6.4.2.	Metaphysics	406
6.4.2.1.	The Scented Flower	408
6.4.3.	Soteriology	410
6.5.	Conclusion	414
Chapter Seven. Other Writings from the Year 430		419
7.1.	Introduction	419
7.2.	<i>Oratio ad Theodosium</i>	419
7.2.1.	A Comparison with <i>On the Incarnation</i>	419
7.2.2.	Terminology	425
7.2.3.	Christology	428
7.3.	<i>Oratio ad dominas</i>	433
7.3.1.	Summary of the Contents	433
7.3.2.	Terminology	440
7.3.2.1.	Οὐσία	440
7.3.2.2.	Ἐπόστασις	442
7.3.2.3.	Πρόσωπον	442
7.3.2.4.	Φύσις	446
7.3.2.5.	Ἰδιος	450
7.3.2.6.	Other Terms	451
7.3.3.	Christology	452
7.4.	<i>Oratio ad augustas</i>	454
7.4.1.	Summary of the Contents	454
7.4.2.	Terminology	461
7.4.2.1.	Οὐσία	461
7.4.2.2.	Ἐπόστασις	462
7.4.2.3.	Πρόσωπον	463
7.4.2.4.	Φύσις	465
7.4.2.5.	Ἰδιος	470
7.4.2.6.	Other Terms	471
7.4.3.	Christology	473
7.5.	Cyril and Rome	475
7.5.1.	<i>Letter to Celestine</i> (ep. II)	475
7.5.2.	<i>Memorandum to Posidonius</i> (ep. IIa)	476

7.6.	Two Brief Letters to Nestorius (<i>epp.</i> 6 and 7).....	478
7.7.	<i>Third Letter to Nestorius</i> with the Anathemas	479
7.7.1.	<i>Third Letter to Nestorius</i>	479
7.7.1.1.	Summary of the Contents.....	479
7.7.1.2.	Terminology	483
7.7.1.3.	Christology	487
7.7.2.	The Anathemas.....	489
7.7.2.1.	Paraphrase of the Contents	489
7.7.2.2.	Terminology	491
7.7.2.3.	Interpretation.....	493
7.8.	Other Letters from November 430.....	495
7.8.1.	<i>Letter to John of Antioch (ep. 13)</i>	495
7.8.2.	<i>Letter to Juvenal of Jerusalem (ep. 16)</i>	495
7.8.3.	<i>To the Clergy and the People of Constantinople (ep. 18)</i>	496
7.8.4.	<i>To the Monks of Constantinople (ep. 19)</i>	497
7.9.	<i>Festal Letter 19</i>	497
7.9.1.	Summary of the Contents.....	497
7.9.2.	Terminology and Christology.....	499
7.10.	Conclusion	501
	Chapter Eight. Recapitulation and Conclusions	503
8.1.	Theology and Philosophy	503
8.2.	The Meaning of the Terms.....	505
8.2.1.	Οὐσία.....	505
8.2.2.	ὑπόστασις	507
8.2.3.	Πρόσωπον	509
8.2.4.	Φύσις	512
8.2.5.	ἴδιος	517
8.2.6.	Ἐνωσις and Συνάφεια	518
8.3.	Miaphysite Terminology.....	518
8.4.	'In Contemplation Only'	531
8.5.	Christology	544
8.5.1.	Two Christological Models.....	544
8.5.2.	Attributing the Sayings	549
8.5.3.	Of / Out of / In Two Natures.....	554
8.5.4.	The Passions of Christ.....	556
8.5.5.	Christ's Full Humanity	562
8.6.	Soteriology	570
8.7.	Ecumenical Relevance	577
8.8.	Conclusion	578

Bibliography	583
Indexes	
Index of Biblical Names	605
Index of Ancient Names.....	607
Index of Modern Names	611
Index of Subjects.....	615
Index of Scriptural References	623

The ecumenical consultations between Eastern Orthodox and Oriental Orthodox theologians over the past fifty years. In their discussions they took Cyril of Alexandria and his *μία φύσις* formula as their starting-point. An initial study made me doubt whether the interpretation given to the christological terms in the ecumenical agreements was in line with what the archbishop himself will have meant. I also found out that present-day commentators are not in agreement on the meaning of the key terms in Cyril's christology. Besides, a systematic study into the meaning of these terms in Cyril's christological works has never been published. This volume is meant to fill at least part of that lacuna.

It is my desire that the ecumenical movement will develop and that Christian unity will grow. If, therefore, the conclusions of my study undermine the abovementioned agreements, I hope that it will lead to intensified consultations, also between Eastern and Western churches.

An earlier version of this book was my doctoral dissertation at the Protestant Theological University in Kampen, the Netherlands. I wish to thank the three people who supervised the work and who, each in her or his own way, have contributed to the improvement of the end result. Prof. Gerrit W. Neven has been a continuous encouragement to me for many years, and with his questions and remarks he made me think through underlying assumptions and possible implications. Prof. Adelbert J.M. Davids has introduced me into patristic theology and his careful reading of the text has led to many improvements. With her expertise on the christological developments in the early church, Prof. Theresia Hainthaler was willing to read the manuscript with a critical eye. I am also grateful to Prof. A.P. Bos for his valuable comments on the chapter about Aristotelian logic.