

Contents

Part I State, Citizen and Dissent

1	Conscience and Conscientiousness: Principles, Concepts, and Parameters	3
1.1	Introduction	3
1.2	Principles and Definitions	4
1.2.1	Religion, Belief and Matters of Conscience	5
1.2.2	State Neutrality Towards Religion and Belief	12
1.3	Conscientious Objection: Concept, Interpretation and the Law	15
1.3.1	Objections: Conscientious and Otherwise	15
1.3.2	Objections: Conscientiousness and the Law	22
1.4	Parameters	25
1.4.1	Origins: Exemption on Grounds of Religious Belief	25
1.4.2	Broadening the Parameters: The De-Criminalisation of Abortion, Homosexuality and Prostitution	27
1.4.3	Extending the Parameters by Analogy: Same Sex Issues Etc	30
1.5	Conclusion	32
	References	33
2	Dissent and the Common Law Nations: Pluralism and Objecting Conscientiously	35
2.1	Introduction	35
2.2	Common Law, Christianity and Culture: A Shared History and a Shared Basis for Dissent	36
2.2.1	The Common Law Jurisdictions: A Shared Cultural Heritage	36
2.3	Democracy and the Common Law Nations	42
2.3.1	Democratic Society	42

2.3.2	Dissent	44
2.4	Civil Society, Citizenship, Pluralism and the Law	48
2.4.1	Civil Society	48
2.5	Law and Human Rights	53
2.5.1	Law	54
2.5.2	Fundamental Rights	55
2.5.3	Rights to Private Life and to Social Participation	56
2.6	Conclusion	60
	References	61

Part II Conscientious Objection and Contemporary International Law

3	The International Legal Framework for Conscientious Objection and Themes for Comparative Jurisdictional Analysis	65
3.1	Introduction	65
3.2	Framework of International Instruments	66
3.2.1	The Universal Declaration of Human Rights (UDHR)	66
3.2.2	The European Convention on Human Rights (ECHR)	67
3.2.3	The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR)	69
3.2.4	The International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR)	69
3.2.5	The UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (UN CRC)	70
3.2.6	The Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union	70
3.2.7	The Convention for the Protection of Human Rights and Dignity of the Human Being with Regard to the Application of Biology and Medicine of 1997 (the Oviedo Convention)	70
3.2.8	The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights	70
3.2.9	The United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples	71
3.2.10	Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees	72
3.2.11	The American Convention on Human Rights	72
3.3	Framework of Courts and Regulatory Bodies	72
3.3.1	Courts, Commissions and Other Regulatory Bodies	72
3.3.2	Monitoring and Review Procedures	76
3.4	The Principle of Conscientious Objection: Legal Definition and Interpretation	77
3.4.1	Human Rights and Conscientious Objection	77
3.4.2	Freedom of Belief/Conscience	80
3.4.3	State Neutrality	82

3.5	Fundamental Human Rights as Grounds for State Interference in Matters of Belief/Conscience/Religion in a Democratic Society	85
3.5.1	The ECtHR and a 'Democratic Society'	85
3.5.2	Freedom of Expression	87
3.5.3	Freedom of Association/Assembly	88
3.5.4	Freedom of Religion	89
3.6	Conscientious Objection and Equality Caselaw	91
3.6.1	Public Service Providers	91
3.6.2	Public Health	92
3.6.3	Public Education	98
3.6.4	Public Officials and Justice Issues	102
3.6.5	Citizenship and Conscientious Objection	105
3.6.6	Private Service Provision	107
3.7	Conclusion	109
	References	110

Part III Jurisdictional Survey

4	England and Wales	113
4.1	Introduction	113
4.2	Principles, Doctrines and Definitions	114
4.2.1	Religion, Belief and Matters of Conscience	114
4.2.2	State Neutrality	119
4.3	Conscientious Objection and Exemption: An Evolving Policy	121
4.3.1	Initial Exemptions	121
4.3.2	Abortion, Contraception and Adoption: A Context for Developing Policy	123
4.3.3	Same Sex Relationships: Evolving Contemporary Policy	123
4.3.4	Medical Advancement: Contiguous Policy Development	125
4.4	From Policy to Legislation	126
4.4.1	Universal Legislative Constraints	126
4.4.2	Contemporary Government Initiatives	128
4.5	Legislative Framework: International and Domestic	128
4.5.1	International Legislation	128
4.5.2	Domestic Legislation	129
4.6	Framework of Courts and Regulatory Bodies	132
4.6.1	International Courts and Regulatory Bodies	132
4.6.2	Domestic Courts and Regulatory Bodies	133
4.7	Fundamental Human Rights and Conscience	133
4.7.1	Freedom of Expression	133
4.7.2	Right to Freedom of Association/Assembly	137
4.7.3	Right to Freedom of Religion	137

4.8	Conscientious Objection and Equality: Contemporary Caselaw	140
4.8.1	Public Health	140
4.8.2	Social Care Services	148
4.8.3	Public Education	152
4.8.4	Public Defence and Security	158
4.8.5	Employment	160
4.8.6	Commercial Services	164
4.9	Conclusion	166
	References	167
5	Ireland	169
5.1	Introduction	169
5.2	Principles, Doctrines and Definitions	170
5.2.1	Religion, Belief and Matters of Conscience	170
5.2.2	State Neutrality	172
5.3	Conscientious Objection and Exemption: An Evolving Policy . . .	174
5.3.1	Initial Exemptions	174
5.3.2	Abortion, Contraception and Adoption: A Context for Developing Policy	176
5.3.3	Same Sex Relationships: Evolving Contemporary Policy	179
5.3.4	Medical Advancement: Contiguous Policy Development	180
5.4	From Policy to Legislation	181
5.4.1	Universal Legislative Constraints	181
5.4.2	Contemporary Government Initiatives	184
5.5	Legislative Framework: International and Domestic	184
5.5.1	International Legislation	184
5.5.2	The Constitution and Domestic Legislation	185
5.6	Framework of Courts and Regulatory Bodies	188
5.6.1	International Courts and Regulatory Bodies	189
5.6.2	Domestic Courts and Regulatory Bodies	190
5.7	Fundamental Human Rights and Conscience	190
5.7.1	Right to Freedom of Expression	190
5.7.2	Right to Freedom of Association/Assembly	193
5.7.3	Right to Freedom of Religion	194
5.8	Conscientious Objection and Equality: Contemporary Caselaw	196
5.8.1	Public Health	197
5.8.2	Social Care Services	207
5.8.3	Public Education	209
5.8.4	Public Defence and Security	219
5.8.5	Employment	221
5.8.6	Commercial Services	226

5.9	Conclusion	228
	References	228
6	United States of America	231
6.1	Introduction	231
6.2	Principles, Doctrines and Definitions	232
6.2.1	Religion, Belief and Matters of Conscience	232
6.2.2	State Neutrality	236
6.3	Conscientious Objection and Exemption: An Evolving Policy . . .	241
6.3.1	Initial Exemptions	241
6.3.2	Abortion, Contraception and Adoption: A Context for Developing Policy	243
6.3.3	Same Sex Relationships: Evolving Contemporary Policy	246
6.3.4	Medical Advancement: Contiguous Policy Development	248
6.4	From Policy to Legislation	249
6.4.1	Universal Legislative Constraints	249
6.4.2	Contemporary Government Initiatives	251
6.5	Legislative Framework: International and Domestic	252
6.5.1	International Legislation	253
6.5.2	The Constitution and Federal Legislation	253
6.6	Framework of Courts and Regulatory Bodies	257
6.6.1	International Courts and Regulatory Bodies	257
6.6.2	Domestic Courts and Regulatory Bodies	258
6.7	Fundamental Human Rights and Conscience	259
6.7.1	Freedom of Expression	259
6.7.2	Right to Freedom of Association/Assembly	265
6.7.3	Right to Freedom of Religion	267
6.8	Conscientious Objection and Equality: Contemporary Caselaw	271
6.8.1	Public Health	272
6.8.2	Social Care Services	282
6.8.3	Public Education	286
6.8.4	Public Defence and Security	293
6.8.5	Employment	297
6.8.6	Commercial Services	303
6.9	Conclusion	304
	References	304
7	Canada	307
7.1	Introduction	307
7.2	Principles, Doctrines and Definitions	308
7.2.1	Religion, Belief and Matters of Conscience	309
7.2.2	State Neutrality	313

7.3	Conscientious Objection and Exemption: An Evolving Policy . . .	319
7.3.1	Initial Exemptions	319
7.3.2	Abortion, Contraception and Adoption: A Context for Developing Policy	322
7.3.3	Same Sex Relationships: Evolving Contemporary Policy	323
7.3.4	Medical Advancement: Contiguous Policy Development	324
7.4	From Policy to Legislation	325
7.4.1	Universal Legislative Constraints	326
7.4.2	Contemporary Government Initiatives	327
7.5	Legislative Framework: International and Domestic	328
7.5.1	International Legislation	328
7.5.2	Domestic Constitution and Legislation	329
7.5.3	Other Legislation	332
7.6	Framework of Courts and Regulatory Bodies	332
7.6.1	International Courts and Regulatory Bodies	332
7.6.2	Domestic Courts and Regulatory Bodies	333
7.7	Fundamental Human Rights and Conscience	334
7.7.1	Freedom of Expression	334
7.7.2	Right to Freedom of Association/Assembly	337
7.7.3	Right to Freedom of Religion	338
7.8	Conscientious Objection and Equality: Contemporary Caselaw	343
7.8.1	Public Health	343
7.8.2	Social Care Services	350
7.8.3	Public Education	353
7.8.4	Public Defence and Security	360
7.8.5	Employment	362
7.8.6	Commercial Services	366
7.9	Conclusion	368
	References	369
8	Australia	371
8.1	Introduction	371
8.2	Principles, Doctrines and Definitions	372
8.2.1	Religion, Belief and Matters of Conscience	372
8.2.2	State Neutrality	376
8.3	Conscientious Objection and Exemption: An Evolving Policy . . .	379
8.3.1	Initial Exemptions	379
8.3.2	Abortion, Contraception and Adoption: A Context for Developing Policy	381
8.3.3	Same Sex Relationships: Evolving Contemporary Policy	381

	8.3.4	Medical Advancement: Contiguous Policy Development	383
8.4		From Policy to Legislation	384
	8.4.1	Universal Legislative Constraints	385
	8.4.2	Contemporary Government Initiatives	386
8.5		Legislative Framework: International and Domestic	387
	8.5.1	International Legislation	387
	8.5.2	The Constitution and Federal Legislation	388
8.6		Framework of Courts and Regulatory Bodies	390
	8.6.1	International Courts and Regulatory Bodies	391
	8.6.2	Domestic Courts and Regulatory Bodies	391
8.7		Fundamental Human Rights and Conscience	392
	8.7.1	Right to Freedom of Expression	392
	8.7.2	Right to Freedom of Association/Assembly	398
	8.7.3	Right to Freedom of Religion	398
8.8		Conscientious Objection and Equality: Contemporary Caselaw	402
	8.8.1	Public Health	402
	8.8.2	Social Care Services	409
	8.8.3	Public Education	412
	8.8.4	Public Defence and Security	418
	8.8.5	Employment	421
	8.8.6	Commercial Services	424
8.9		Conclusion	426
		References	426
9		New Zealand	429
	9.1	Introduction	429
	9.2	Principles, Doctrines and Definitions	430
	9.2.1	Religion, Belief and Matters of Conscience	430
	9.2.2	State Neutrality	433
9.3		Conscientious Objection and Exemption: An Evolving Policy . . .	436
	9.3.1	Initial Exemptions	436
	9.3.2	Abortion, Contraception and Adoption: A Context for Developing Policy	438
	9.3.3	Same Sex Relationships: Evolving Contemporary Policy	439
	9.3.4	Medical Advancement: Contiguous Policy Development	440
9.4		From Policy to Legislation	442
	9.4.1	Universal Legislative Constraints	442
	9.4.2	Contemporary Government Initiatives	443
9.5		Legislative Framework: International and Domestic	443
	9.5.1	International Legislation	443
	9.5.2	The Constitution and Federal Legislation	444

9.6	Framework of Courts and Regulatory Bodies	447
9.6.1	International Courts and Regulatory Bodies	447
9.6.2	Domestic Courts and Regulatory Bodies	448
9.7	Fundamental Human Rights and Conscience	449
9.7.1	Right to Freedom of Expression	449
9.7.2	Right to Freedom of Association/Assembly	453
9.7.3	Right to Freedom of Religion	454
9.8	Conscientious Objection and Equality: Contemporary Caselaw	457
9.8.1	Public Health	457
9.8.2	Social Care Services	465
9.8.3	Public Education	467
9.8.4	Public Defence and Security	471
9.8.5	Employment	474
9.8.6	Commercial Services	478
9.9	Conclusion	479
	References	480

Part IV Equality, Exemption and Democracy

10	Themes of Jurisdictional Commonality and Difference	483
10.1	Introduction	483
10.2	Principles, Policy, & Legislation	483
10.2.1	Principles	484
10.2.2	Policy	490
10.2.3	Legislation	494
10.3	Conscientious Objection & Fundamental Human Rights	495
10.3.1	Freedom of Expression	496
10.3.2	Freedom of Association/Assembly	499
10.3.3	Freedom of Religion	500
10.4	Conscientious Objection and Equality	502
10.4.1	Public Health	502
10.4.2	Social Care Services	507
10.4.3	Public Education	509
10.4.4	Public Defence and Security	513
10.4.5	Employment	515
10.4.6	Commercial Services	518
10.5	Conclusion	519
	References	520
11	A Democratic and Diverse Society: Balancing Equality and Exemption	521
11.1	Introduction	521
11.2	Cultural Heritage and Pluralism	522
11.2.1	Pluralism	523

11.2.2	Diversity	523
11.2.3	Conscientious Objection in a Non-Christian Context . . .	525
11.3	Democracy and Dissent	526
11.3.1	Dissent and Development	527
11.3.2	Religion and Dissent	528
11.3.3	Reform and Dissent	530
11.4	Democracy and the Contemporary State/Citizen Relationship . . .	532
11.4.1	Citizenship	532
11.4.2	Contemporary Citizenship and Conscientious Objection	534
11.5	The Public/Private Balance and the Proportionality Principle . . .	535
11.5.1	Public/Private Interests	535
11.5.2	Public Interest and Conscientious Objection	537
11.5.3	Private Interest and Conscientious Objection	539
11.5.4	Balancing Public/Private Interests: The Proportionality Principle	539
11.6	Conclusion	544
	References	544
12	Conclusion	547
12.1	State/Citizen, Covid-19 and Conscientious Objection	548
12.2	The State/Citizen Relationship	548
12.2.1	The State	548
12.2.2	Citizen and Citizenship	550
12.3	Public Health, Conscientious Objection and Lessons from the Covid-19 Pandemic	550
12.3.1	Lockdown	551
12.3.2	Vaccination	551
	References	552
	Index	553