

## Table of Contents

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| Foreword   | <i>vii</i> |
| Our Sponsors and Donors                                  | <i>x</i>   |
| Preface to this volume                                   | <i>xii</i> |
| <br>   |            |
| Text of Articles   |            |
| <br>   |            |
| English<br>Unjustified Enrichment                        | 3          |
| Bulgarian<br>Правої на неоїсноївателноїтої оїбоїгатяване | 9          |
| Dutch<br>Het recht der ongerechtvaardigde verrijking     | 15         |
| Estonian<br>Alusetu rikastumise õigus                    | 21         |
| Finnish<br>Perusteettoman edun palautus                  | 27         |
| French<br>Enrichissement injustifié                      | 33         |
| German<br>Ungerechtfertigte Bereicherung                 | 39         |
| Hungarian<br>Jogalap nélküli gazdagodás                  | 46         |
| Italian<br>Arricchimento senza causa                     | 52         |
| Polish<br>Niesłuszne Wzbogacenie                         | 58         |

|                                     |    |
|-------------------------------------|----|
| Portuguese                          |    |
| Direito do enriquecimento sem causa | 64 |
| Romanian                            |    |
| Îmbogățirea față justă cauză        | 70 |
| Spanish                             |    |
| Enriquecimiento injustificado       | 76 |
| Swedish                             |    |
| Bestämmelser om obehörig vinst      | 82 |

## Principles of European Law on Unjustified Enrichment

### Introduction

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>A. The concept of unjustified enrichment law within the meaning of this Book</b> |     |
| 1. Definition and purpose of “unjustified enrichment law”                           | 91  |
| 2. Scope  | 91  |
| 3. Matters not covered  | 91  |
| 4. Nature   | 92  |
| 5. No principle of subsidiarity   | 92  |
| 6. A modern notion of the law of unjustified enrichment                             | 92  |
| 7. About this introduction  | 92  |
| <b>B. The national systems’ notion of unjustified enrichment law</b>                |     |
| 8. General observations   | 93  |
| 9. The most important distinguishing criteria                                       | 93  |
| 10. Two hundred years of legal development  | 94  |
| 11. The <i>Code Napoléon</i>  | 95  |
| 12. <i>Enrichissement sans cause</i>  | 96  |
| 13. The subsidiary nature of the law of <i>enrichissement sans cause</i>            | 96  |
| 14. The Austrian Civil Code   | 97  |
| 15. Modern linguistic usage   | 98  |
| 16. Relationship between unjustified enrichment and other fields of law             | 98  |
| 17. Malta   | 99  |
| 18. Spain   | 99  |
| 19. <i>Enriquecimiento sin causa</i>  | 100 |
| 20. Germany   | 101 |
| 21. Distinction between performance and non-performance conditions                  | 102 |
| 22. Issues of concurrence of actions  | 102 |
| 23. Greece  | 103 |
| 24. Contentious ambit of the principle of subsidiarity                              | 104 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| 25.  | Italy   | 104 |
| 26.  | Priority accorded to other causes of action   | 105 |
| 27.  | Portugal  | 106 |
| 28.  | The subsidiary character of an enrichment claim   | 106 |
| 29.  | Hungary   | 107 |
| 30.  | Poland and the Czech and Slovak Republics   | 108 |
| 31.  | Slovenia and Bulgaria   | 109 |
| 32.  | Romania   | 110 |
| 33.  | The Netherlands   | 111 |
| 34.  | The Baltic States   | 111 |
| 35.  | The Nordic countries  | 112 |
| 36.  | Common Law  | 114 |
| 37.  | England and Wales   | 115 |
| 38.  | The interplay between the traditional forms of action and the modern unjustified enrichment principle   | 116 |
| 39.  | Ireland   | 116 |
| 40.  | Scotland  | 117 |
| <br> |   |     |
| C.   | The national systems' approach to the key legal issues addressed in this Book                           |     |
| 41.  | General   | 118 |
| <br> |   |     |
| (1)  | Prestations conferred in error  | 119 |
| 42.  | Particular manifestations of this action  | 119 |
| 43.  | The <i>Code Napoléon</i>  | 119 |
| 44.  | <i>Indu objectif</i>  | 119 |
| 45.  | <i>Indu subjectif</i>   | 120 |
| 46.  | The concept of <i>paiement</i>  | 120 |
| 47.  | Spain   | 121 |
| 48.  | Assets, money, services   | 122 |
| 49.  | Italy   | 122 |
| 50.  | Austria   | 123 |
| 51.  | Portugal  | 124 |
| 52.  | Germany   | 125 |
| 53.  | Greece  | 126 |
| 54.  | Central and Eastern Europe  | 126 |
| 55.  | The Netherlands   | 127 |
| 56.  | The Baltic States   | 128 |
| 57.  | The Nordic countries  | 128 |
| 58.  | England and Wales   | 128 |
| 59.  | Ireland   | 129 |
| 60.  | Scotland  | 129 |
| <br> |   |     |
| (2)  | Performances rendered under a contract void <i>ab initio</i> or subsequently with <i>ex tunc</i> effect | 129 |
| 61.  | General   | 129 |
| 62.  | The <i>Code Napoléon</i>  | 130 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 63. France   | 130 |
| 64. Return of property   | 131 |
| 65. Tort law claims  | 131 |
| 66. Belgium and Luxembourg   | 132 |
| 67. Spain  | 133 |
| 68. Interplay between the law on contractual nullity and <i>condictio indebiti</i> | 133 |
| 69. Italy  | 134 |
| 70. Austria  | 135 |
| 71. Portugal   | 136 |
| 72. Germany  | 137 |
| 73. Greece   | 137 |
| 74. Hungary  | 138 |
| 75. Reform of the Hungarian CC   | 139 |
| 76. Poland, Czech and Slovak Republics, Bulgaria and Slovenia                      | 139 |
| 77. The Netherlands  | 139 |
| 78. The Nordic countries   | 140 |
| 79. The Baltic States  | 140 |
| 80. Cyprus   | 141 |
| 81. England and Wales  | 141 |
| 82. Ireland  | 142 |
| 83. Scotland   | 142 |
| <br>   |     |
| (3) Claims for expenditure consequent upon improvements made to another's property | 143 |
| 84. France and Belgium   | 143 |
| 85. Spain  | 144 |
| 86. Italy  | 145 |
| 87. Austria  | 145 |
| 88. Portugal   | 146 |
| 89. Germany  | 147 |
| 90. Greece   | 147 |
| 91. Hungary and Romania  | 147 |
| 92. Poland and Slovenia  | 148 |
| 93. Bulgaria   | 148 |
| 94. Dutch Law  | 149 |
| 95. Baltic States  | 149 |
| 96. Nordic Countries   | 150 |
| 97. England and Wales  | 150 |
| 98. Ireland  | 151 |
| 99. Scotland   | 152 |
| <br>   |     |
| (4) Interferences with another's legal domain                                      | 152 |
| 100. General   | 152 |
| 101. France, Belgium, Luxembourg   | 152 |
| 102. Infringements of incorporeal personality rights                               | 153 |
| 103. <i>Enrichissement sans cause</i>  | 154 |
| 104. Spain   | 154 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 105. Italy   | 155 |
| 106. Austria   | 155 |
| 107. Portugal  | 155 |
| 108. Germany   | 156 |
| 109. Greece  | 157 |
| 110. Hungary, Bulgaria and Slovenia  | 157 |
| 111. The Netherlands   | 158 |
| 112. The Baltic States   | 158 |
| 113. Nordic countries  | 159 |
| 114. England and Wales   | 159 |
| 115. Ireland   | 161 |
| 116. Scotland  | 161 |
| <br>   |     |
| (5) Discharge of liability owed by another person  | 161 |
| 117. France: erroneous discharge of another's liability                                      | 161 |
| 118. France: intentional payment of someone else's debt                                      | 163 |
| 119. Belgium   | 163 |
| 120. Spain   | 164 |
| 121. Italy   | 165 |
| 122. Austria   | 166 |
| 123. Portugal  | 167 |
| 124. Germany   | 167 |
| 125. Greece  | 167 |
| 126. Central and Eastern Europe  | 168 |
| 127. The Netherlands   | 169 |
| 128. The Baltic States   | 169 |
| 129. Nordic countries  | 170 |
| 130. England and Wales   | 170 |
| 131. Ireland   | 171 |
| 132. Scotland  | 171 |
| <br>   |     |
| D. European Community Law and PECL   |     |
| 133. Unjustified Enrichment law in the case law of the Courts<br>of the European Communities | 171 |
| 134. Rules in PECL with reference to unjustified enrichment law                              | 172 |
| <br>   |     |
| E. Overview of the concept infusing the text   |     |
| 135. Basic decisions   | 173 |
| 136. No revival of the law on quasi-contract   | 173 |
| 137. Incorporation of the reversal of a mistaken performance ...                             | 174 |
| 138. ... and of performances rendered on the basis of a contract void <i>ab initio</i>       | 174 |
| 139. Exclusion of a contractual restitutionary regime  | 174 |
| 140. Unjustified enrichment as a constituent of the law of obligations                       | 175 |
| 141. Application of the general law of obligations under the DCFR                            | 176 |
| 142. In particular: right to withhold performance  | 176 |
| 143. Interplay with the PEL Ben.Int  | 176 |
| 144. The relationship to PEL Liab.Dam  | 177 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 145. Relationship to PEL Trusts                                       | 178 |
| 146. Unfurling of unjustified enrichment law from a single basic norm | 178 |
| 147. A unitary model of unjustified enrichment law                    | 179 |
| 148. The four core elements of an enrichment claim                    | 179 |
| 149. Terminology  | 179 |
| 150. The separate Chapters  | 180 |

## Chapter I: General

### Article 1:101: Basic rule

#### Comments

#### A. General

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. Overview  | 181 |
| 2. A single general norm   | 181 |
| 3. Scope   | 181 |
| 4. Operation only in conjunction with the other provisions of the Book | 181 |
| 5. Elements of the basic rule  | 182 |
| 6. Content of the obligation; defences                                 | 182 |
| 7. How the basic rule works  | 182 |

#### B. Parties: “a person”; “another”

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 8. General                              | 185 |
| 9. Absence of need for prior connection | 185 |
| 10. Absence of need for direct transfer | 185 |
| 11. Natural persons and legal persons   | 186 |
| 12. Persons without full legal capacity | 186 |

#### C. Mode of enrichment: “obtains”

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 13. Application to both active and passive enrichment | 186 |
| 14. No requirement of wrongful enrichment             | 187 |

#### D. Content of liability: “obliged to reverse the enrichment”

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 15. Transferable and non-transferable enrichments | 187 |
| 16. Personal and proprietary claims               | 187 |

#### Notes

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| I. A single overarching claim in unjustified enrichment law versus a multitude of discrete claims | 188 |
| II. Prerequisites of a general unjustified enrichment action                                      | 188 |
| III. Prerequisites of specific claims to recovery, in particular the <i>condictio indebiti</i>    | 198 |
| IV. Terminology   | 203 |
| V. Burden of proof  | 207 |

## Chapter 2: When enrichment unjustified

### Article 2:101: Circumstances in which an enrichment is unjustified

#### Comments

|            |  |     |
|------------|--|-----|
| <b>A.</b>  | <b>Enrichments unjustified for want of legal basis or consent: para. (1)</b> |     |
| 1.         | Overview   | 213 |
| 2.         | Absence of legal basis, not unjust factors                                   | 213 |
| 3.         | Two alternative justifications   | 214 |
| 4.         | Effect of paragraph (2)  | 214 |
| 5.         | Effect of paragraph (3)  | 214 |
| 6.         | Relationship to paragraph (4)  | 214 |
| 7.         | Relationship to Article 2:102 (Performance of obligation to third person)    | 214 |
| 8.         | Prestations by both parties  | 215 |
| <b>B.</b>  | <b>Justification under a contract or other juridical act</b>                 |     |
| <b>(a)</b> | <b>General</b>   |     |
| 9.         | Entitlement under a juridical act  | 215 |
| 10.        | Juridical act  | 215 |
| <b>(b)</b> | <b>In particular: entitlement under a contract</b>                           |     |
| 11.        | General  | 215 |
| 12.        | Valid concluded contract without a specific determination of the price       | 216 |
| 13.        | Partial invalidity   | 216 |
| 14.        | Entitlements not specifically enforceable                                    | 217 |
| 15.        | Unenforceable entitlements   | 217 |
| 16.        | Performance not yet due  | 217 |
| 17.        | Obligation to suffer another's enjoyment                                     | 218 |
| 18.        | Performance as condition of another's liability                              | 219 |
| 19.        | Rationale  | 219 |
| <b>(c)</b> | <b>Scope of the entitlement</b>  |     |
| 20.        | Justification as to part of enrichment only                                  | 220 |
| 21.        | Incomplete performance   | 220 |
| 22.        | Role of good faith in extreme cases  | 221 |
| 23.        | Deviations from contractual terms  | 222 |
| <b>(d)</b> | <b>Validity of the juridical act</b>   |     |
| 24.        | General  | 222 |
| 25.        | Valid contracts  | 222 |
| 26.        | Rationale  | 222 |
| 27.        | In particular: matters not affecting the validity of the contract            | 223 |
| 28.        | In particular: donations   | 224 |

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
| 29.  | Voidable contracts not avoided   | 224 |
| 30.  | Rights to withhold performance   | 224 |
| 31.  | Unenforceable (but valid) contractual obligations                                      | 225 |
| 32.  | Satisfaction of claims subject to prescription   | 226 |
| 33.  | Obligations ceasing to have effect for the future only                                 | 226 |
| 34.  | Void juridical acts  | 227 |
| 35.  | Grounds of invalidity of contracts   | 227 |
| 36.  | Voidable juridical acts which are avoided  | 227 |
| 37.  | Grounds of avoidance of contracts  | 227 |
| 38.  | Exercise of right to avoid and failure to avoid a contract                             | 228 |
| 39.  | Juridical acts otherwise rendered ineffective retrospectively                          | 228 |
| 40.  | Illegal contracts which are without effect   | 228 |
| 41.  | Suspensive conditions not fulfilled  | 229 |
| <br> |  |     |
| (e)  | <b>Entitlement as against the disadvantaged person</b>                                 |     |
| 42.  | Entitlement as against third party insufficient  | 230 |
| 43.  | Protection of persons dealing with non-entitled third parties in good faith            | 230 |
| 44.  | Discharge of one solidary debtor by another  | 231 |
| <br> |  |     |
| C.   | <b>Justification under a court order or rule of law</b>                                |     |
| <br> |  |     |
| (a)  | <b>General</b>   |     |
| 45.  | Entitlement under a court order or rule of law   | 231 |
| 46.  | Court order  | 231 |
| 47.  | Rule of law in general   | 232 |
| 48.  | Extra-contractual obligations  | 232 |
| 49.  | In particular: benevolent intervention   | 232 |
| 50.  | Requirements of benevolent intervention  | 232 |
| 51.  | Effect of the rule   | 233 |
| 52.  | Rationale  | 233 |
| 53.  | Significance of ratification   | 233 |
| 54.  | Entitlement under property law rules   | 233 |
| <br> |  |     |
| (b)  | <b>Entitlement to the benefit of the enrichment under a rule of law: paragraph (3)</b> |     |
| 55.  | General  | 234 |
| 56.  | Enrichment with liability under other rules  | 234 |
| 57.  | Enrichment without liability   | 234 |
| 58.  | Exclusion of enrichment claim need not be explicit                                     | 234 |
| 59.  | Entitlement to enrichment, but subject to liability under this Book                    | 235 |
| 60.  | Transfer of title rules  | 235 |
| 61.  | Unsolicited goods sent to or services rendered to a consumer                           | 236 |
| 62.  | Discharge of bankrupt  | 236 |
| 63.  | Acquisitive prescription   | 237 |
| 64.  | Statutory rights to encroach on property rights  | 237 |
| 65.  | Further examples   | 237 |



|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| D.    | Consent to the disadvantage: paragraph (1)(b)  | 238 |
| (a)   | Consent to the disadvantage  |     |
| 66.   | Meaning of consent   | 238 |
| 67.   | Deliberate enrichment of another   | 238 |
| 68.   | Incidental benefit to others from acts within own sphere   | 238 |
| (b)   | Error  |     |
| 70.   | General  | 239 |
| 71.   | Error of fact or law   | 239 |
| 72.   | Inexcusable errors   | 239 |
| 73.   | Unilateral errors  | 239 |
| 74.   | Requirement of a causative error   | 240 |
| 75.   | Awareness of disadvantage, but error as to terms   | 240 |
| 76.   | Illustrative types of relevant error   | 241 |
| 77.   | Compromises and submission to doubtful claims  | 241 |
| 78.   | Mispredictions   | 242 |
| (c)   | Absence of consent   |     |
| 79.   | Categories of enrichment without consent   | 243 |
| E.    | Purpose not achieved; expectation not realised: paragraph (4)  |     |
| (a)   | General  |     |
| 80.   | Overview   | 243 |
| 81.   | Relationship to paragraph (1)  | 243 |
| (b)   | Conferment for a purpose not achieved or with an expectation not realised:<br>sub-paragraph (a)                        |     |
| 82.   | General  | 244 |
| 83.   | Causative purpose or expectation   | 244 |
| 84.   | Failure of negotiations  | 244 |
| (c)   | The enriched persons awareness of the purpose or expectation:<br>sub-paragraph (b)                                     | 245 |
| 85.   | General  | 245 |
| (d)   | The enriched persons acceptance that the enrichment must be reversed:<br>sub-paragraph (c)                             | 245 |
| 86.   | General  | 245 |
| Notes |  |     |
| I.    | Benefits conferred on a contractual counterparty in order to<br>fulfil an obligation pursuant to a valid juridical act | 247 |
| II.   | Recovery of prestations conferred to fulfil putative obligations under<br>an avoided contract.                         | 261 |

|       |  |     |
|-------|--|-----|
| III.  | The recovery of prestations conferred under a contract which is rendered void on other grounds | 266 |
| IV.   | Resolutive and suspensive conditions   | 284 |
| V.    | Analogous application to extra-contractual obligations   | 289 |
| VI.   | Court order and rule of law  | 291 |
| VII.  | Voluntary dispositions and performance rendered pursuant to a natural obligation               | 296 |
| VIII. | Restitution for failure of purpose   | 296 |

## Article 2:102: Performance of obligation to third person

### Comments

|           |   |     |
|-----------|---|-----|
| <b>A.</b> | <b>General</b>  |     |
| 1.        | Overview  | 302 |
| 2.        | Relation to Article 2:101 (Circumstances in which an enrichment is unjustified)           | 302 |
| <b>B.</b> | <b>Performance under obligation to a third party: para. (a)</b>                           |     |
| 3.        | General   | 302 |
| 4.        | Performance of an obligation owed to a third party  | 303 |
| 5.        | Rationale   | 304 |
| 6.        | Exception   | 305 |
| 7.        | No exception for error  | 305 |
| 8.        | Third parties with a right to performance   | 306 |
| 9.        | Assignees and other creditors   | 307 |
| 10.       | Further applications  | 307 |
| <b>C.</b> | <b>Incidental benefit to enriched person from performance to a third party: para. (b)</b> |     |
| 11.       | General   | 308 |

### Notes

|     |  |     |
|-----|--|-----|
| I.  | No restitution where a debtor pays a third party in performance of an obligation to the creditor         | 309 |
| II. | Restitution where a debtor pays a third party in performance of an obligation under an invalid contract? | 315 |

**Article 2:103: Consenting or performing freely**

## Comments

**Absence of free consent: incapacity, fraud, threats and unfair exploitation**

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. General  | 322 |
| 2. Overlapping grounds for absence of free consent            | 322 |
| 3. Meaning of fraud, coercion, threat and unfair exploitation | 322 |
| 4. Source of the fraud, threat or unfair exploitation         | 322 |
| 5. Rationale  | 323 |
| 6. Scope of the two paragraphs                                | 323 |

## Notes

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| I. Voluntary transfer of property   | 324 |
| II. Performance based on an obligatio naturalis   | 329 |
| III. Fault of the disadvantaged person as a legal justification for the retention of the prestation | 333 |
| IV. Performances to a third party based on a legally vitiated contractual intention                 | 339 |

**Chapter 3:**  
**Enrichment and disadvantage**

**Article 3:101: Enrichment****Article 3:102: Disadvantage**

## Comments (Article 3:101 and 3:102)

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>A. General</b>  |     |
| 1. Twin provisions   | 343 |
| 2. Overview  | 344 |
| 3. Relation to Chapter 4 (Attribution)   | 344 |
| 4. Relation to other Chapters  | 344 |
| <b>B. Increase in assets or decrease in liabilities:<br/>paragraph (1)(a) of Article 3:101</b> |     |
| 5. Change in assets or liabilities, not change in value  | 344 |
| 6. Meaning of asset  | 345 |
| 7. Criteria  | 345 |
| 8. Examples  | 345 |
| 9. Mode of increase in assets  | 346 |
| 10. Decrease in liabilities  | 346 |

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
| C.   | Receipt of a service or having work done: paragraph (1)(b) of Article 3:101   |     |
| 11.  | General; rationale  | 347 |
| 12.  | Change in patrimonial balance immaterial  | 347 |
| 13.  | Composite notion of service or work   | 348 |
| 14.  | Notion of service   | 348 |
| 15.  | Services by agreement, but without a binding contract   | 348 |
| 16.  | Unsolicited services  | 349 |
| 17.  | Services provided unwittingly   | 349 |
| 18.  | Incidental benefits in pursuit of own interest  | 349 |
| D.   | Use of another's assets: paragraph (1)(c) of Article 3:101  |     |
| 19.  | General   | 350 |
| 20.  | Assets capable of use   | 350 |
| 21.  | Irrelevance of authority of right-holder to license use   | 351 |
| 22.  | Irrelevance of right-holder's intention to use or commercialise use   | 352 |
| 23.  | Irrelevance of utility to enriched person   | 352 |
| 24.  | Meaning of use  | 352 |
| 25.  | An intentional act  | 353 |
| 26.  | Displacement of another's use   | 353 |
| 27.  | Intangible property rights  | 353 |
| 28.  | Apparent infringements  | 354 |
| 29.  | Mode of use   | 354 |
| 30.  | Interferences not amounting to a use  | 355 |
| E.   | Non-merger of enriched person's concurrent or subsequent disadvantage with the enrichment: paragraph (2) of Article 3:101 |     |
| 31.  | General   | 356 |
| 32.  | Enrichment as improvement to net wealth   | 356 |
| 33.  | Enrichment on an itemised approach  | 356 |
| 34.  | Comparison  | 357 |
| 35.  | Contemporaneous and subsequent disadvantage   | 357 |
|      | Notes (Articles 3:101 and 3:102)  | 358 |
| I.   | Establishing an enrichment and a disadvantage: balance-sheet test or itemised approach?                                   | 358 |
| II.  | Instances of enrichment   | 365 |
| III. | Disadvantage  | 371 |

## Chapter 4: Attribution

### Article 4:101: Instances of attribution

#### Comments

#### A. General

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 1. Overview                            | 375 |
| 2. Particular instances of attribution | 375 |
| 3. Non-exhaustive list                 | 375 |
| 4. Other scenarios                     | 376 |
| 5. Variety of possible attributions    | 376 |
| 6. Relation to other Chapters          | 376 |

#### B. Direct transfer: paragraph (a)

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 7. An asset of the disadvantaged person | 376 |
| 8. Meaning of asset                     | 377 |
| 9. Transfer by the disadvantaged person | 377 |

#### C. Rendering a service or doing work: paragraph (b)

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 10. General; meaning of service and work | 377 |
|--|-----|

#### D. Use of another's assets: paragraph (c)

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 11. Meaning of asset  | 377 |
| 12. Meaning of use  | 377 |
| 13. Infringements of rights and legally protected interests | 377 |

#### E. Improvement of another's assets: paragraph (d)

- |                                  |     |
|----------------------------------|-----|
| 14. Meaning of asset             | 378 |
| 15. Asset of the enriched person | 378 |

#### F. Discharge of another's liability: paragraph (e)

- |                          |     |
|--------------------------|-----|
| 16. Meaning of liability | 379 |
|--------------------------|-----|

#### Notes

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| I. Transfer of assets                            | 379 |
| II. Particularities in the rendering of services | 382 |
| III. Use of another's assets and rights          | 386 |
| IV. Improvement of another's asset               | 393 |
| V. Discharging another's liability               | 399 |

**Article 4:102: Indirect representation**

## Comments

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Overview   | 403 |
| 2. Indirect representation  | 403 |
| 3. The problem of the principal who is not a party to the transaction | 403 |
| 4. Internal relationship of representative and principal              | 404 |
| 5. Insolvency or fundamental non-performance of the representative    | 405 |

## Notes

405

**Article 4:103: Debtor's performance to a non-creditor; onward transfer in good faith**

## Comments

**A. General**

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Overview                             | 410 |
| 2. A particular instance of attribution | 411 |

**B. The disadvantaged person's loss of a right against the third person**

- |  |     |
|--|-----|
| 3. General   | 411 |
| 4. Partial loss of a right   | 411 |
| 5. Rules protective of a third party                               | 411 |
| 6. Third party performing binding instructions                     | 413 |
| 7. Disappointed expectation insufficient                           | 413 |
| 8. Subsistence of right precludes application without ratification | 414 |
| 9. Reduction in value of right insufficient                        | 415 |
| 10. Effect of insolvency of debtor                                 | 415 |
| 11. Incurring a debt as an alternative to loss of a right          | 416 |

**C. In particular: onward transfer in good faith: paragraph (2)**

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 12. Onward transfer as specific application | 416 |
|---|-----|

## Notes

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| I. Basic case: restitution under unjustified enrichment law for performance rendered in discharge of an obligation to a supposed creditor | 416 |
| II. Persistence of a claim despite disenrichment through gratuitous disposition   | 423 |

## Article 4:104: Ratification of debtor's performance to a non-creditor

### Comments

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>A. General</b>                            |     |
| 1. Overview                                  | 426 |
| 2. Rationale                                 | 426 |
| <b>B. Scope</b>                              |     |
| 3. Payment of debts and other performances   | 426 |
| 4. Possible exclusion in cases of insolvency | 426 |
| <b>C. Ratification</b>                       |     |
| 5. Entitlement to ratify                     | 427 |
| 6. Effect of ratification                    | 427 |
| Notes  | 428 |

## Article 4:105: Attribution resulting from an act of an intervener

### Comments

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Overview                                       | 432 |
| 2. A general principle and a specific application | 432 |
| 3. Typical cases                                  | 432 |
| 4. A particular instance of attribution           | 432 |
| 5. Meaning of use                                 | 433 |
| 6. Unauthorised collection of another's debt      | 433 |
| 7. Deprivation and accrual                        | 433 |
| Notes   | 434 |

## Article 4:106: Ratification of intervener's acts

### Comments

|                   |     |
|-------------------|-----|
| <b>A. General</b> |     |
| 1. Overview       | 438 |
| 2. Rationale      | 439 |
| 3. Meaning of use | 439 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>B. Ratification</b>                                   |     |
| 4. Authorisation of the disposition or use               | 439 |
| 5. Justification of the third party's enrichment         | 439 |
| 6. No justification of the intervener's use of the asset | 440 |
| 7. Law on liability for non-contractual damage           | 440 |

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Notes | 440 |
|-------|-----|

### Article 4:107: Where type or value not identical

#### Comments

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. Overview   | 441 |
| 2. Non-equivalence of enrichment and disenrichment immaterial | 442 |

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Notes | 443 |
|-------|-----|

## Chapter 5: Reversal of enrichment

### Article 5:101: Transferable enrichment

#### Comments

#### A. General

|             |     |
|-------------|-----|
| 1. Overview | 445 |
|-------------|-----|

#### B. Transfer: paragraph (1)

|                         |     |
|-------------------------|-----|
| 2. Transferable asset   | 446 |
| 3. Place of performance | 446 |

#### C. Election to pay monetary value instead: paragraph (2)

|                                    |     |
|------------------------------------|-----|
| 4. Election to pay value           | 446 |
| 5. Uniqueness of the asset         | 447 |
| 6. Election by the enriched person | 447 |
| 7. Monetary value                  | 448 |

#### D. Liability to pay monetary value transfer no longer possible: paragraph (3)

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 8. General   | 448 |
| 9. Modifications of liability to pay the monetary value of the enrichment obtained | 448 |
| 10. Partial disposition, loss or destruction of the enrichment                     | 448 |



|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>E. Election that substitute be transferred; good faith: paragraphs (4)-(5)</b> |     |
| 11. General   | 449 |
| 12. Election  | 449 |
| 13. Rationale where the enriched person is in good faith                          | 449 |
| 14. Rationale where the enriched person is not in good faith                      | 449 |
| 15. Good faith at the time of loss or disposal                                    | 450 |
| 16. Meaning of good faith   | 450 |
| 17. Restriction of the enriched person's right of election                        | 451 |
| 18. Apportionment of substitute   | 451 |
| 19. Rationale for apportionment   | 451 |

### Notes

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| I. The claim to restitution of the asset obtained  | 452 |
| II. Acquisition of a substitute for the enrichment | 455 |
| III. Definition of good faith                      | 458 |

## Article 5:102: Non-transferable enrichment

### Comments

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>A. General</b>  |     |
| 1. Overview  | 461 |
| 2. Enrichments which are not transferable assets         | 462 |
| <b>B. Basic liability: paragraph (1)</b>                 |     |
| 3. Monetary value as maximum liability                   | 462 |
| 4. Monetary value  | 462 |
| <b>C. Reduced liability: paragraph (2)</b>               |     |
| 5. Reduced liability                                     | 462 |
| 6. Measure of liability: saving                          | 462 |
| 7. Circumstances in which liability is reduced           | 463 |
| 8. Rationale   | 463 |
| <b>D. Intermediate liability: paragraphs (3) and (4)</b> |     |
| 9. Measure of liability under paragraph (3)              | 463 |
| 10. Intermediate liability                               | 464 |
| 11. Rationale  | 464 |
| 12. A price or value genuinely fixed                     | 464 |

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Notes | 465 |
|-------|-----|

**Article 5:103: Monetary value of an enrichment; saving**

## Comments

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 1. General                                    | 470 |
| 2. Time at which value to be assessed         | 470 |
| 3. Monetary value                             | 471 |
| 4. In particular: composite price of services | 471 |
| 5. Saving                                     | 471 |

## Notes

472

**Article 5:104: Fruits and use of an enrichment**

## Comments

- |                         |     |
|-------------------------|-----|
| 1. General              | 476 |
| 2. Measure of liability | 476 |
| 3. Bad faith            | 476 |
| 4. Fruits               | 476 |
| 5. Use                  | 476 |

## Notes

477

**Chapter 6:  
Defences****Article 6:101: Disenrichment**

## Comments

**A. General**

- |                    |     |
|--------------------|-----|
| 1. Overview        | 483 |
| 2. Burden of proof | 483 |

**B. Notion of disenrichment****(a) Forms and manner of disenrichment**

- |   |     |
|---|-----|
| 3. General  | 484 |
| 4. Forms of disenrichment   | 484 |
| 5. Disposal of the enrichment   | 484 |
| 6. Other disadvantages  | 485 |
| 7. In particular: other loss of the assets; loss of other assets                  | 485 |
| 8. In particular: incurring obligations   | 486 |
| 9. In particular: allowing use of one's rights                                    | 486 |
| 10. Manner of disenrichment: voluntarily and involuntarily sustained disadvantage | 486 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <b>(b) Fault in causing the disenrichment</b>                                       |     |
| 11. Fault in general  | 487 |
| 12. Fault of the disadvantaged claimant   | 487 |
| 13. Fault of a third party: claim of enriched person against third party            | 487 |
| 14. Relationship to Article 5:101 (Transferable enrichment), paragraphs (3) and (4) | 487 |
| 15. Fault of a third party: direct claim of disadvantaged person                    | 488 |
| 16. Fault of the enriched person  | 488 |
| 17. Disenrichment by improvement of the enrichment obtained                         | 489 |
| <b>C. Disenrichments excluded from the defence</b>                                  |     |
| 18. General   | 490 |
| <b>(a) Absence of nexus between disenrichment and enrichment</b>                    |     |
| 19. Disenrichment independent of enrichment   | 490 |
| 20. Basis of comparison   | 490 |
| 22. Involuntary loss of the enrichment  | 491 |
| 23. Unconnected hardship: involuntary loss of other patrimony                       | 491 |
| 24. Voluntary disenrichments not predicated by the enrichment                       | 492 |
| 25. Obligatory expenditure: pre-existing obligations                                | 492 |
| 26. Obligations incurred after the enrichment                                       | 492 |
| 27. Exceptional relevance of pre-existing obligations                               | 493 |
| 28. Necessary or usual expenditure and exceptional or extraordinary disbursements   | 493 |
| 29. Independent liberality: gifts uninfluenced by the enrichment                    | 493 |
| 30. Other exceptional disbursements   | 494 |
| 31. Disenrichments prior to enrichment (anticipatory reliance)                      | 494 |
| 32. No general exclusion of anticipatory reliance                                   | 494 |
| 33. Disenrichment in expectation of a voluntary enrichment                          | 494 |
| 34. Disenrichment in expectation of performance under an apparent obligation        | 495 |
| 35. Disbursements in context of bargain but in own interest                         | 495 |
| <b>(b) Substitutes</b>  |     |
| 36. Counter-enrichment  | 496 |
| <b>(c) Disenrichments which are not in good faith</b>                               |     |
| 37. Disenrichment in bad faith  | 496 |
| 38. Actual or constructive awareness of absence of justification                    | 496 |
| 39. Constructive knowledge  | 496 |
| 40. False supposition of justification  | 497 |
| 41. Exception: where the disadvantaged person would have been disenriched too       | 497 |
| 42. Exception where the enriched person does not bear the risk of loss              | 498 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| (d) Agreement genuinely fixing the price or value of the enrichment |     |
| 43. Defence restricted in cases of genuine agreement                | 498 |
| 44. Rationale   | 499 |
| <b>D. Extent of the defence</b>                                     |     |
| 45. General pro tanto reduction                                     | 499 |
| 46. Rationale   | 499 |
| <b>E. Rights against onward recipient: paragraph (3)</b>            |     |
| 47. General   | 499 |
| Notes   | 500 |

### Article 6:102: Juridical acts in good faith with third parties

#### Comments

|                          |     |
|--------------------------|-----|
| 1. General               | 506 |
| 2. Direct recipients     | 506 |
| 3. Indirect recipients   | 507 |
| 4. Exchange              | 507 |
| 5. Good faith            | 508 |
| 6. Extent of the defence | 508 |

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Notes | 508 |
|-------|-----|

### Article 6:103: Illegality

#### Comments

|                                 |     |
|---------------------------------|-----|
| 1. General                      | 511 |
| 2. Illegality and justification | 511 |
| 3. Criterion                    | 512 |
| 4. Relevant factors             | 512 |
| 5. Illustrative application     | 512 |

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Notes | 513 |
|-------|-----|

## Chapter 7: Relation to other legal rules

### Article 7:101: Other private law rights to recover

#### Comments

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| <b>A. Exclusivity of contractual rules: paragraph (1)</b>                                  |     |
| 1. General   | 519 |
| 2. Exclusion of a right to reversal of enrichment  | 519 |
| 3. Deviation from terms of the obligation  | 519 |
| 4. Obligations ceasing to have effect for the future only                                  | 520 |
| 5. Contractual relationships terminated for non-excused non-performance                    | 520 |
| 6. Contractual relationships terminated for excused non-performance (frustrated contracts) | 521 |
| 7. Exercise of a right of withdrawal   | 521 |
| 8. Obligations subject to resolutive conditions  | 521 |
| 9. Deviations from contract to which contract law rules do not apply                       | 522 |
| 10. Frustrated purpose or disappointed expectation   | 522 |
| <b>B. Proprietary effect of a right to recover: paragraph (2)</b>                          |     |
| 11. Proprietary claims   | 523 |
| <b>C. Rights to recover under other private law rules: paragraph (3)</b>                   |     |
| 12. General  | 523 |

#### Notes

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| I. Subsidiarity of unjustified enrichment liability                     | 524 |
| II. Liability in unjustified enrichment law and contractual liability   | 526 |
| III. Liability under unjustified enrichment and vindication of property | 533 |
| IV. Other private law claims  | 536 |

### Article 7:102: Concurrent obligations

#### Comments

|                                     |     |
|-------------------------------------|-----|
| 1. General                          | 541 |
| 2. Claims with different bases      | 542 |
| 3. Claims against different persons | 542 |

|       |     |
|-------|-----|
| Notes | 543 |
|-------|-----|

**Article 7:103: Public law claims**

## Comments

- |             |     |
|-------------|-----|
| 1. General  | 545 |
| 2. Contexts | 545 |
| 3. Scope    | 546 |

## Notes

546

**Annexes**

## Abbreviations

551

## Table of Cases

569

## Table of Codes and Statutes

579

## Table of Enactments of the European Union

620

## Table of Literature Cited in Abbreviated Form

621