

Table of Contents

Preface

xv

Chapter 1

Function and Nature of the Preliminary Ruling Procedure	1
1 Uniformity of the Community Legal Order	1
1.1 Full Effect of Community Law	1
1.1.1 Concept of Full Effect	1
1.1.2 Direct Effect and Primacy of Community Law	2
1.2 Application of Community Law by National Courts	3
1.2.1 Obligation to Ensure the Full Effect of Community Law	3
1.2.2 Obligation to Ensure Legal Protection	5
1.3 Remedies before National Courts	6
1.3.1 Availability of Remedies	6
1.3.2 Organization of and Procedures before National Courts	7
2 Uniform Application and Interpretation of Community Law	9
2.1 Risks of Divergences in the Interpretation of Community Law	9
2.2 Function of Article 234 EC	10
2.3 System of Article 234 EC	12
3 Features of the Preliminary Ruling Procedure	14
3.1 Instrument of Cooperation between National Courts and the Court of Justice	14
3.1.1 Common Function	14
3.1.2 Allocation of Jurisdiction between National Courts and the Court of Justice	15
3.2 Function of the Court of Justice under Article 234 EC	20
3.3 Non-contentious Character of the Preliminary Ruling Procedure	23
3.4 Rules Governing the Preliminary Ruling Procedure	24

3.4.1	Article 234 EC	24
3.4.2	Statute of the Court of Justice	25
3.4.3	Rules of Procedure	25
3.4.4	Costs	26
 Chapter 2		
Scope of Article 234 EC		27
1	Community Law	27
1.1	EC Treaty and Treaties of Accession	27
1.1.1	Scope and Limits	27
1.1.2	Application of Community Law by National and Community Institutions	28
1.1.3	Situations outside the Scope of Community Law	30
1.1.4	Treaty on European Union	31
1.2	Specific Provisions of the EC Treaty	32
1.2.1	Article 234 EC	32
1.2.2	State Aids (Articles 87 EC and 88 EC)	32
1.2.3	Failure to Act (Article 232 EC)	33
1.2.4	Extra-Contractual Responsibility (Articles 235 EC and 288, Second Paragraph EC)	34
1.3	General Principles of Law	34
1.4	Internal Situations	35
2	Reference to Community Law by National Law	36
2.1	Applicability of Article 234 EC	36
2.2	Forms of References to Community Law	39
2.3	Limits to the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice	40
2.4	Reference to Community Law by Contractual Provisions	41
2.5	Reference to National Law by Community Law	41
3	Acts of the Institutions	42
3.1	Scope of Article 234 EC	42
3.2	Legal Nature of a Community Act	43
3.3	Specific Acts	44
3.4	International Agreements	45
3.4.1	Applicability of Article 234 EC	45
3.4.2	Limits to the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice	46
3.4.3	Agreements Prior to the EC Treaty	48
3.4.4	International Agreements Forming Part of the Legal Background to the Main Proceedings	49
 Chapter 3		
National Courts or Tribunals		51
1	Concept of National Court or Tribunal	51
1.1	Conditions	51
1.2	Compulsory Jurisdiction	53
1.3	Jurisdictional Function	53

1.4	Independence	55
1.5	Procedure <i>Inter Partes</i>	56
2	Bodies Satisfying the Criteria of a National Court or Tribunal within the Meaning of Article 234 EC	57
2.1	Judge Investigating in Criminal Matters	57
2.2	Council of State	57
2.3	Courts Having Special Jurisdiction	58
3	Bodies Exercising Jurisdictional and Administrative Functions	64
3.1	Accounting Offices	64
3.2	Courts Exercising Administrative Functions	64
4	Bodies Not Considered To Be Courts or Tribunals	65
4.1	Administrative Appeal Bodies	65
4.2	Public Prosecutor	66
4.3	Other Bodies	67
5	Arbitration	68
5.1	Conventional and Compulsory Arbitration	68
5.2	Arbitration by National Courts	69
6	Court or Tribunal of a Member State	69
6.1	Courts of Territories Having a Special Status	69
6.2	Courts Common to More Than One Member State	70

Chapter 4

Participation in the Preliminary-Ruling Procedure 71

1	Persons Entitled to Participate in the Preliminary-Ruling Procedure	71
1.1	Parties in the Main Proceedings and Other Participants	71
1.2	Third Persons	73
1.3	Intervenants	73
2	Rights of the Participants	74
2.1	Right To Be Heard	74
2.2	Right To Be Informed	74
3	Limits to the Participation	77
3.1	National Court as Dominus Litis	77
3.2	Questions Raised by Parties before the National Court	78
3.3	Challenging the Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice	79
3.4	Challenging Facts and National Law	79
3.5	Determination of the Preliminary Questions	80
3.5.1	Exclusive Competence of National Courts	80
3.5.2	Artificial Disputes	81
3.5.3	Questions Proposed by Parties in the Main Proceedings	81
3.6	Extraordinary Proceedings	82
3.6.1	Request for Interpretation of a Preliminary Judgment	82
3.6.2	Request for Revision of a Preliminary Judgment	83
3.6.3	Request to Supplement Preliminary Judgments	83

Chapter 5

Entitlement of National Courts to Refer Preliminary Questions	85
1 Position of National Courts under Article 234 EC	85
1.1 Rights and Obligations of National Courts	85
1.1.1 General Conditions for Preliminary References	85
1.1.2 Obligation and Entitlement to Make a Reference	86
1.2 Exclusive Competence of National Courts to Refer	87
2 Entitlement of National Courts to Refer	88
2.1 Function and Scope	88
2.2 Entitlement to Refer and National Law	89
2.3 Entitlement to Refer and Community Law	90
3 Nature of the Main Proceedings	91
3.1 Whether or Not the Procedure Is <i>Inter Partes</i>	91
3.2 Nature of the Decision To Be Given by the National Court	92
3.3 Summary Proceedings	93
4 Questions on Interpretation or Validity	94
4.1 Questions Raised by Parties in the Main Proceedings	94
4.2 Questions Raised by a National Court of Its Own Motion	95
4.3 Obligation of National Courts to Raise Points of Community Law of Their Own Motion	96

Chapter 6

Facultative and Obligatory References	99
1 Necessity of a Decision on a Question of Interpretation or Validity	99
1.1 Appreciation by the National Court	99
1.1.1 Relevance of the Questions Raised by the Case before the National Court	99
1.1.2 Necessity of a Preliminary Reference	100
1.1.3 Formulation of the Preliminary Questions	109
1.2 Absence of Power of the Court of Justice to Assess the Necessity of a Preliminary Reference	110
1.3 Appreciation by the National Court of the Necessity of a Facultative or Obligatory Reference	112
1.4 Appreciation by the National Court of the Necessity of Questions on Interpretation or Validity	114
2 Presumption of Relevance of a Preliminary Reference	115
3 Facultative References	116
4 Obligatory References	118
4.1 Purpose	118
4.2 Notion of a Court against Whose Decisions There Is No Judicial Remedy under National Law	119
4.3 Obligation to Refer in Summary Proceedings	120
4.4 Obligatory Reference of a Question on Interpretation	121
4.4.1 <i>Acte Éclairé</i> ('Clarified Act')	121
4.4.2 <i>Acte Clair</i> ('Clear Act')	122

4.5	Obligatory Reference of a Question on Validity	124
4.5.1	Questions on Validity Raised before a Court against Whose Decisions There Is No Judicial Remedy	124
4.5.2	Suspension of a National Measure to Implement a Community Act	124
4.5.3	Non-applicability of the CILFIT Criteria	125
4.6	Violation of the Obligation to Refer	126

Chapter 7

The Decision to Refer	129
1 Effect and Legal Nature	129
1.1 Condition of and Basis for the Preliminary Procedure	129
1.2 Character of an Incident in the Main Proceedings	129
2 Organization of National Courts and Their Procedure	130
2.1 Competence of National Courts by Virtue of National Law	130
2.2 Admissibility of the Action in the Main Proceedings	131
2.3 Appeal against the Decision to Refer	132
2.4 Termination of the Proceedings before the National Court	134
3 Form of the Decision to Make a Reference	135
4 Stage of the Procedure	136
4.1 Discretion of National Courts	136
4.2 Prior Determination of the Facts and the Legal Framework	137
4.3 Requirement of a Pending Dispute	138
5 Contents of the Decision to Refer	139
5.1 Function of the Information in the Decision to Refer	139
5.2 Information on the Facts and Legal Framework	142
5.2.1 Information Required for a Useful Reply	142
5.2.2 Degree of Precision	146
5.2.3 Consequences of Incomplete Information	147
5.3 Setting Out of the Reasons for the Reference	148

Chapter 8

Preliminary Interpretation and Appreciation of Validity	151
1 Foundation of the Exercise of Preliminary Jurisdiction	151
2 Interpretation of Community Law	152
2.1 Concept of 'Interpretation'	152
2.2 Effects of the Interpretation of Community Law on National Law	154
3 Appreciation of the Validity of Community Acts	154
3.1 Place and Function in the EC Treaty	154
3.2 Pleading the Illegality of a Community Measure before National Courts	156
3.3 Indirect Legality Control through a Preliminary Reference	158
3.4 Action for Annulment and Validity Control	159

4	Interim Measures	161
4.1	Scope of the Competence of National Courts	161
4.2	Conditions to Provide Interim Relief	163
4.3	Power to Declare Community Acts Invalid	166
5	Scope of Validity Control of Community Acts	168
5.1	Community Law and General Principles of Law	168
5.2	International Law	169
5.3	Procedural Aspects	169

Chapter 9

	The Court of Justice and the Preliminary Questions	171
1	Determination of Preliminary Questions	171
2	Modification of Preliminary Questions	173
2.1	Limits	173
2.2	Elements of Community Law Not Mentioned in the Decision for Reference	174
3	Questions Not Submitted in the Decision for Reference	177
3.1	Questions Submitted by the Participants in the Preliminary Procedure	177
3.2	Questions Rejected by the Referring Court	179
3.3	New Elements Presented during the Preliminary Procedure	179
4	Interpretation of the Decision Making the Reference	180
4.1	Identification of the Elements of Community Law To Be Interpreted	180
4.2	Imperfect Preliminary Questions	183
4.3	Reformulation of Preliminary Questions	184

Chapter 10

	Limits to the Competence to Give a Preliminary Ruling	187
1	Facts and Context of the Dispute in the Main Proceedings	187
1.1	Establishment and Investigation of the Facts of the Case	187
1.1.1	Division of Functions	187
1.1.2	Responsibility of National Courts	188
1.1.3	Assessment of the Facts of the Case	189
2	National Law	192
2.1	Interpretation of National Law	192
2.2	Application of National Law	196
3	Community Law	198
3.1	Applicability of Community Law	198
3.2	Application of Community Law to the Facts of the Case	198
4	Compatibility of National Law with Community Law	202
4.1	Absence of Jurisdiction of the Court of Justice	202
4.2	Assistance to the National Court to Rule on the Conformity of National Law with Community Law	206

4.3	Conformity with Community Law of the Law of another Member State	211
Chapter 11		
	Obligation and Refusal to Give a Preliminary Ruling	213
1	Obligation to Give a Preliminary Ruling	213
1.1	Scope	213
1.1.1	General Principles	213
1.1.2	Questions on Interpretation	215
1.1.3	Questions on Validity	219
1.1.4	Possible Consequences of a Preliminary Ruling	220
1.2	Exceptions to the Obligation to Give a Preliminary Ruling	220
1.3	Circumstances without Influence on the Admissibility of Preliminary Questions	228
1.3.1	Questions Belonging to the Substance of the Case	228
1.3.2	Lack of Indications in the Decision Making the Reference	229
1.3.3	Applicability of the Provisions of Community Law To Be Interpreted	231
2	Requirement of a Case Pending Before the National Court	231
2.1	Absence of an Actual Dispute	231
2.1.1	Principle	231
2.1.2	Extinction of the Main Proceedings	232
2.1.3	Hypothetical Questions	232
2.2	Fabricated Disputes	233
2.3	Factors without Influence on the Reality of a Dispute	234
3	Absence of Information on the Factual and Legal Context of the Case	235
3.1	Criterion of a Useful Reply	235
3.2	Manifestly Inadmissible References	236
4	Preliminary Questions Bearing No Relation to the Case	237
5	Questions Lacking Precision	239
5.1	Absence of a Relation between the Case and Community Law	239
5.2	Preliminary Questions without Motivation	240
5.3	Interests of the Participants in the Preliminary Ruling Procedure	241
Chapter 12		
	Preliminary Judgment	243
1	Legal Nature	243
1.1	Binding Character	243
1.1.1	Authority of a Preliminary Judgment	243
1.1.2	Consequences for the Referring Court	244

1.1.3	Consequences for Other National Courts	244
1.1.4	Consequences for National Authorities	244
1.2	Scope of Preliminary Judgments	245
2	Interpretative Judgments	245
2.1	Retroactive Effect	245
2.2	Restrictions of the Retroactive Effect of Interpretative Judgments	248
2.2.1	Exclusive Competence of the Court of Justice	248
2.2.2	Exceptions	250
2.3	Conditions for a Restriction of the Retroactive Effect	251
2.3.1	Procedural Conditions	251
2.3.2	Substantive Conditions	252
2.3.3	Legal Certainty	253
2.3.4	Serious Difficulties	254
2.3.5	Financial Consequences	254
3	Judgments on Validity	256
3.1	Consequences of a Judgment Declaring a Provision of Community Law Invalid	256
3.1.1	Consequences for the Institutions	256
3.1.2	Consequences for National Authorities	257
3.1.3	Consequences for the National Court	257
3.1.4	Consequences for Other National Courts	258
3.2	Retroactive Effect	258
3.3	Restrictions of the Retroactive Effect of Judgments on Validity	259
3.3.1	Exclusive Competence of the Court of Justice	259
3.3.2	Application by Analogy of Articles 231 EC and 233 EC	259
3.3.3	Exceptions	260
4	Further References to the Court of Justice	262
 Chapter 13		
Article 68 EC and Article 35 EU		265
1	Article 68 EC	265
2	Article 35 EU	265
2.1	Competence of the Court of Justice	265
2.2	Scope	266
2.3	Courts or Tribunals of a Member State	267
2.4	Admissibility	268
2.5	Modification of Preliminary Questions	268

Table of Contents

xiii

Annex

271

1	Treaty Provisions on the Preliminary Ruling Procedure	271
2	Protocol on the Statute of the Court of Justice	273
3	Rules of Procedure of the Court of Justice	274
4	Information Note on References from National Courts for a Preliminary Ruling	278