

## CONTENTS

|   |    |
|---|----|
| <i>Acknowledgements</i> .....   | v  |
| <i>List of selected abbreviations</i> .....   | xv |
| Introduction .....  | 1  |
| <b>Part I</b>   |    |
| <b>Theoretical and normative approaches to minority rights</b> .....  | 17 |
| Chapter 1   |    |
| General theories and definitional entrapment .....  | 19 |
| Introduction .....  | 19 |
| 1.1 Theoretical conundrums and definitional dilemmas .....  | 19 |
| 1.2 Historical and conventional approaches to minority rights .....   | 26 |
| 1.2.1 Numerical inferiority .....   | 28 |
| 1.2.2 Non-dominance .....   | 29 |
| 1.2.3 Nationality .....   | 30 |
| 1.2.4 Range of distinctive, constitutive characteristics .....  | 30 |
| 1.2.5 Sense of solidarity .....   | 31 |
| 1.2.6 Combination of objective and subjective criteria for recognition. . .   | 32 |
| 1.3 Troublesome taxonomies and the notion of fixed features .....   | 33 |
| Conclusions .....   | 40 |
| Chapter 2   |    |
| The shaping of theories through international legal and political frameworks . . . .  | 43 |
| Introduction .....  | 43 |
| 2.1 International instruments with focuses on minority rights .....   | 43 |
| 2.1.1 Genocide Convention .....   | 44 |
| 2.1.2 United Nations Charter .....  | 46 |
| 2.1.3 Universal Declaration of Human Rights .....   | 47 |
| 2.1.4 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights .....  | 49 |
| 2.1.5 UN Declaration on the Rights of Persons Belonging to National<br>or Ethnic, Religious and Linguistic Minorities ..... | 55 |
| 2.1.6 UN institutional approaches to minority rights .....  | 56 |
| 2.2 European instruments with focuses on minority rights .....  | 58 |
| 2.2.1 European Convention on Human Rights .....   | 59 |
| 2.2.2 Standard-setting by the Parliamentary Assembly of the Council<br>of Europe .....                                      | 67 |

|            |  |     |
|------------|--|-----|
| 2.2.3      | Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM)..... | 76  |
| 2.2.3(i)   | Ceci n'est pas une minorité!.....  | 81  |
| 2.2.3(ii)  | Water in the wine and holes in the cheese.....                             | 85  |
| 2.2.3(iii) | Proof of the pudding.....  | 89  |
| 2.2.4      | Organization for Security and Co-operation in Europe standards..           | 96  |
| 2.2.4(i)   | OSCE High Commissioner on National Minorities (HCNM).....                  | 99  |
| 2.2.5      | European Union.....  | 105 |
|            | Conclusions.....   | 109 |

**Part II**

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| <b>Theoretical and normative approaches to freedom of expression and minority rights.....</b> | <b>111</b> |
|---|------------|

Chapter 3

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Minorities, freedom of expression and of the media..... | 113 |
|---|-----|

|                   |     |
|-------------------|-----|
| Introduction..... | 113 |
|-------------------|-----|

|            |   |     |
|------------|---|-----|
| 3.1        | Theories of freedom of expression and of the media.....           | 113 |
| 3.1.1      | Rationales for minorities' access to expressive opportunities.... | 120 |
| 3.1.1(i)   | Democratic participation in public life.....                      | 120 |
| 3.1.1(ii)  | Creating alternative discursive spaces.....                       | 122 |
| 3.1.1(iii) | Creating and sustaining (cultural) identities.....                | 123 |
| 3.1.2      | Enhanced liberty for the media/the Fourth Estate.....             | 127 |
| 3.1.3      | An enabling environment for media freedom.....                    | 130 |
| 3.2        | Media functionality and media types.....                          | 134 |
| 3.2.1      | Media functionality.....  | 134 |
| 3.2.2      | Media types.....  | 138 |
| 3.2.2(i)   | Community media.....  | 141 |
| 3.2.2(ii)  | Public service media/content.....                                 | 144 |
| 3.2.2(iii) | Commercial media.....   | 152 |
| 3.2.2(iv)  | Transnational media.....  | 153 |
| 3.2.2(v)   | Other types of media.....   | 155 |
| 3.3        | New media and new regulatory paradigms.....                       | 156 |
|            | Conclusions.....  | 168 |

Chapter 4

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| The coupling of freedom of expression and minority rights..... | 171 |
|--|-----|

|                   |     |
|-------------------|-----|
| Introduction..... | 171 |
|-------------------|-----|

|          |   |     |
|----------|---|-----|
| 4.1      | An underexplored nexus of international law.....                  | 171 |
| 4.1.1    | Tentative tendencies and attempted couplings in international law | 173 |
| 4.1.1(i) | Actual couplings.....   | 173 |

|                     |  |            |
|---------------------|--|------------|
| 4.1.1(ii)           | Attempted couplings: United Nations . . . . .  | 175        |
| 4.1.1(iii)          | Attempted couplings: Council of Europe . . . . .   | 177        |
| 4.1.1(iv)           | Attempted couplings: assessment . . . . .  | 179        |
| 4.1.2               | Qualifying State obligations . . . . .   | 182        |
| 4.1.2(i)            | International human rights treaty law . . . . .  | 185        |
| 4.1.2(ii)           | Differentiated roles and duties of States regarding<br>expression. . . . .                         | 188        |
| 4.2                 | New trends in the development of the nexus under international treaty<br>law . . . . .             | 191        |
| 4.2.1               | Filling the interstices of international treaty law . . . . .                                      | 191        |
| 4.2.2               | Modesty of scope and content of international treaty law . . . . .                                 | 194        |
| 4.2.3               | Under-utilisation of international treaty law. . . . .   | 199        |
| 4.3                 | Emergence of differentiated protection for minorities' right to freedom<br>of expression . . . . . | 201        |
| 4.3.1               | Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities<br>(FCNM). . . . .                  | 202        |
| 4.3.2               | European Charter for Regional or Minority Languages<br>(ECRML) . . . . .                           | 211        |
| 4.3.3               | Conceptual over-stretch and non-treaty-based standard-setting . .                                  | 218        |
| 4.3.4               | Guidelines on the use of Minority Languages in the Broadcast<br>Media. . . . .                     | 223        |
| 4.4                 | Interplay with other human rights. . . . .   | 226        |
| 4.4.1               | Added value of minority dimension to human rights. . . . .   | 229        |
|                     | Conclusions. . . . .   | 231        |
| <br><b>Part III</b> |  |            |
|                     | <b>Regulation and Restriction of Expression to Protect Minority Rights. . . . .</b>                | <b>235</b> |
| <br>Chapter 5       |  |            |
|                     | The pluralism <i>problématique</i> . . . . .   | 237        |
|                     | Introduction. . . . .  | 237        |
| 5.1                 | Selected theories of pluralism and tolerance. . . . .  | 237        |
| 5.1.1               | Pluralism . . . . .  | 237        |
| 5.1.2               | Tolerance . . . . .  | 238        |
| 5.1.2(i)            | Notions of tolerance. . . . .  | 239        |
| 5.1.2(ii)           | Normative articulations of tolerance . . . . .   | 241        |
| 5.2                 | Towards a notion of comprehensive pluralistic tolerance . . . . .                                  | 244        |
| 5.2.1               | Minimum moral and ideological commonality . . . . .  | 246        |
| 5.2.2               | Pluralistic tolerance, democracy and freedom of expression . . . . .                               | 249        |
| 5.3                 | Comprehensive pluralistic tolerance in practice . . . . .  | 251        |
|                     | Conclusions. . . . .   | 254        |

|   |  |
|---|--|
| Chapter 6   |  |
| Delineating the limits of permissible expression under International Human Rights Law . . . . . |  |
|   | 257  |
| Introduction. . . . .   |  |
|   | 257  |
| 6.1   | Global instruments: asymmetries and conundrums . . . . .                               |
|   | 257  |
| 6.1.1   | Genocide Convention . . . . .  |
|   | 257  |
| 6.1.2   | International Bill of Rights . . . . .   |
|   | 271  |
| 6.1.3   | ICERD. . . . .   |
|   | 280  |
| 6.1.4   | UNESCO standards . . . . .   |
|   | 290  |
| 6.1.5   | Other UN standards and mechanisms . . . . .  |
|   | 291  |
| 6.1.5(i)  | World Conference against Racism and Review Conference . . . . .                        |
|   | 291  |
| 6.1.5(ii)   | Work of Special Rapporteurs on Freedom of Expression . . . . .                         |
|   | 293  |
| 6.2   | Council of Europe instruments: contrived consistency? . . . . .                        |
|   | 294  |
| 6.2.1   | European Convention on Human Rights . . . . .  |
|   | 294  |
| 6.2.2   | Other relevant Council of Europe treaties . . . . .                                    |
|   | 301  |
| 6.2.2(i)  | Cybercrime Convention and its Additional Protocol . . . . .                            |
|   | 301  |
| 6.2.2(ii)   | European Convention on Transfrontier Television . . . . .                              |
|   | 303  |
| 6.2.2(iii)  | Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities. . . . .                |
|   | 303  |
| 6.3   | Other European standards: an ancillary normative dimension . . . . .                   |
|   | 304  |
| 6.3.1   | European Union standards . . . . .   |
|   | 304  |
| 6.3.1(i)  | General. . . . .   |
|   | 304  |
| 6.3.1(ii)   | The Audiovisual Media Services Directive. . . . .                                      |
|   | 309  |
| 6.3.2   | OSCE standards . . . . .   |
|   | 314  |
| Conclusions. . . . .  |  |
|   | 315  |
| Chapter 7   |  |
| “Hate speech” and intolerance targeting minorities. . . . .                                     |  |
|   | 317  |
| Introduction. . . . .   |  |
|   | 317  |
| 7.1   | Irruption of “hate speech” into international human rights law and discourse . . . . . |
|   | 317  |
| 7.1.1   | The effectiveness of “hate speech” laws. . . . .                                       |
|   | 323  |
| 7.1.2   | Critical race theory . . . . .   |
|   | 328  |
| 7.2   | A square conceptual peg in a round normative hole? . . . . .                           |
|   | 331  |
| 7.2.1   | Rough coherence of principles . . . . .  |
|   | 336  |
| 7.2.2   | Contextual variables . . . . .   |
|   | 338  |
| 7.2.2(i)  | Impact of publication . . . . .  |
|   | 341  |
| 7.2.2(ii)   | Specificity of genre . . . . .   |
|   | 344  |
| 7.2.2(iii)  | Proportionality of sanctions. . . . .  |
|   | 346  |
| 7.2.2(iv)   | New doctrinal directions? . . . . .  |
|   | 347  |

|                |   |            |
|----------------|---|------------|
| 7.3            | Specific current controversies as stress tests for the right to freedom of expression . . . . . | 351        |
| 7.3.1          | Denial or trivialisation of genocide and other crimes against humanity . . . . .                | 351        |
| 7.3.2          | “Defamation” of religions . . . . .   | 363        |
| 7.3.3          | Protection of founders of religions . . . . .   | 375        |
|                | Conclusions . . . . .   | 379        |
| <br>           |   |            |
| Chapter 8      |   |            |
|                | Integrated approaches to countering “hate speech” . . . . .                                     | 381        |
|                | Introduction . . . . .  | 381        |
| 8.1            | Theoretical foundations for an integrated approach to countering “hate speech” . . . . .        | 381        |
| 8.2            | An integrated approach in practice: case study of the Council of Europe . . . . .               | 385        |
| 8.2.1          | Framework Convention for the Protection of National Minorities . . . . .                        | 385        |
| 8.2.1(i)       | Studying the chemistry between Articles 6 and 9 . . . . .                                       | 386        |
| 8.2.1(ii)      | Affirmation of the AC’s approach . . . . .  | 394        |
| 8.2.1(iii)     | Conclusions . . . . .   | 394        |
| 8.2.2          | Non-treaty-based approaches to hate speech . . . . .  | 395        |
| 8.2.2(i)       | Standard-setting by the Committee of Ministers . . . . .  | 395        |
| 8.2.2(ii)      | Standard-setting by the Parliamentary Assembly . . . . .  | 403        |
| 8.2.2(iii)     | European Ministerial Conferences on Mass Media Policy . . . . .                                 | 405        |
| 8.2.2(iv)      | The European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) . . . . .                         | 408        |
| 8.3            | Evaluation of integrated approaches to countering “hate speech” . . . . .                       | 420        |
|                | Conclusions . . . . .   | 424        |
| <br>           |   |            |
| <b>Part IV</b> |   |            |
|                | <b>Regulation and facilitation of expression to promote minority rights . . . . .</b>           | <b>427</b> |
| <br>           |   |            |
| Chapter 9      |   |            |
|                | Media-related pluralism . . . . .   | 429        |
|                | Introduction . . . . .  | 429        |
| 9.1            | Connecting pluralistic tolerance to media-related pluralism . . . . .                           | 429        |
| 9.2            | Media-related pluralism: structural and substantive considerations . . . . .                    | 431        |
| 9.2.1          | Conceptual confusion . . . . .  | 432        |
| 9.2.2          | Structural considerations . . . . .   | 433        |
| 9.2.2(i)       | Source/Ownership . . . . .  | 434        |
| 9.2.2(ii)      | Outlet . . . . .  | 438        |
| 9.2.3          | Substantive considerations . . . . .  | 440        |
| 9.2.4          | Gauging media-related pluralism . . . . .   | 441        |

## Contents

|            |  |     |
|------------|--|-----|
| 9.2.4(i)   | State obligations . . . . .  | 441 |
| 9.2.4(ii)  | Media responsibilities . . . . .   | 447 |
| 9.3        | Interrelationship of international legal standards . . . . .   | 449 |
| 9.3.1      | United Nations standards . . . . .   | 450 |
| 9.3.2      | Council of Europe standards . . . . .  | 452 |
| 9.3.2(i)   | European Court of Human Rights . . . . .   | 452 |
| 9.3.2(ii)  | European Convention on Transfrontier Television . . . . .  | 457 |
| 9.3.2(iii) | Non-treaty-based standard-setting . . . . .  | 459 |
| 9.3.2(iv)  | Framework Convention for the Protection of National<br>Minorities . . . . .                                    | 461 |
| 9.3.2(v)   | European Charter for Regional or Minority<br>Languages . . . . .   | 462 |
| 9.3.3      | European Union standards . . . . .   | 463 |
| 9.3.3(i)   | Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European<br>Union . . . . .   | 463 |
| 9.3.3(ii)  | European Court of Justice . . . . .  | 465 |
| 9.3.3(iii) | Other regulatory measures . . . . .  | 471 |
| 9.3.3(iv)  | European Commission . . . . .  | 471 |
| 9.3.3(v)   | European Parliament . . . . .  | 472 |
|            | Conclusions . . . . .  | 474 |
|            |  |     |
| Chapter 10 |  |     |
|            | Cultural and linguistic diversity . . . . .  | 477 |
|            |  |     |
|            | Introduction . . . . .   | 477 |
| 10.1       | Connecting pluralistic tolerance and media-related pluralism to<br>cultural and linguistic diversity . . . . . | 477 |
| 10.1.1     | Defining culture and cultural rights . . . . .   | 478 |
| 10.1.2     | Defining cultural diversity . . . . .  | 481 |
| 10.1.3     | Rationales for the promotion of cultural diversity . . . . .   | 482 |
| 10.2       | Universal standards: centrality of UNESCO instruments . . . . .  | 484 |
| 10.2.1     | UNESCO Declaration on Cultural Diversity . . . . .   | 484 |
| 10.2.2     | UNESCO Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the<br>Diversity of Cultural Expressions . . . . .        | 486 |
| 10.2.3     | World Summit on the Information Society (WSIS) . . . . .   | 494 |
| 10.2.4     | Joint IGO Special Mandates' Declaration on Diversity in<br>Broadcasting . . . . .                              | 495 |
| 10.3       | European-level measures concerning cultural diversity . . . . .  | 495 |
| 10.3.1     | Council of Europe standards . . . . .  | 496 |
| 10.3.1(i)  | Treaty-based standards . . . . .   | 496 |
| 10.3.1(ii) | Non-treaty-based standards . . . . .   | 501 |
| 10.3.2     | European Union standards . . . . .   | 506 |
| 10.3.2(i)  | Audiovisual Media Services Directive . . . . .   | 507 |
| 10.3.2(ii) | Public service broadcasting/media . . . . .  | 514 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 10.3.2(iii) Community broadcasting .....  | 515 |
| 10.3.2(iv) Must-carry regulation .....  | 515 |
| 10.3.3 OSCE standards .....   | 521 |
| Conclusions.....  | 521 |
| <br>Chapter 11  |     |
| Access rights.....  | 523 |
| <br>Introduction.....   |     |
| 11.1 Rights-based theories of access to the media .....   | 523 |
| 11.1.1 Freedom of expression and access rights .....  | 524 |
| 11.1.2 Interplay between rights .....   | 528 |
| 11.1.3 Dynamism of rights.....  | 532 |
| 11.1.4 Prognosis for the future development of access rights .....                                | 536 |
| 11.2 General “taxonomy” of access rights .....  | 539 |
| 11.2.1 Right of reply as a form of access.....  | 540 |
| 11.2.2 Public access channels .....   | 545 |
| 11.3 Development of rights of access to the media for minorities under<br>international law ..... | 547 |
| 11.3.1 FCNM: factors affecting minorities’ access to the media .....                              | 547 |
| 11.3.1(i) Linguistic topography .....   | 548 |
| 11.3.1(ii) Official recognition of minorities/languages.....                                      | 548 |
| 11.3.1(iii) Market sustainability .....   | 549 |
| 11.3.1(iv) Licensing of broadcasters .....  | 550 |
| 11.3.1(v) Regulation of broadcasting output.....  | 551 |
| 11.3.1(v)(a) Broadcasting in general .....  | 551 |
| 11.3.1(v)(b) Public service broadcasting .....  | 553 |
| 11.3.1(vi) Transfrontier dimension.....   | 554 |
| 11.3.1(vii) Temporal and qualitative criteria.....  | 555 |
| 11.3.1(viii) Facilitative measures .....  | 555 |
| 11.3.2 ECRML: factors affecting minorities’ access to the media .....                             | 557 |
| 11.3.2(i) Official recognition of languages .....   | 557 |
| 11.3.2 (ii) Active access to media.....   | 559 |
| 11.3.2(iii) Market sustainability .....   | 560 |
| 11.3.2(iv) Facilitative measures .....  | 560 |
| 11.3.3 New technology-driven challenges for the FCNM and ECRML ..                                 | 562 |
| Conclusions.....  | 564 |
| Summary and conclusions .....   | 567 |
| <i>List of academic works consulted.....</i>  | 585 |
| <i>International instruments .....</i>  | 635 |
| <i>General and thematic comments and recommendations .....</i>                                    | 645 |
| <i>Table of cases .....</i>   | 649 |
| <i>Index .....</i>  | 655 |