

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

|                       |   |
|-----------------------|---|
| LIST OF AUTHORS ..... | v |
|-----------------------|---|

## INTRODUCTION

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| MASHA ANTOKOLSKAIA ..... | 1 |
|--------------------------|---|

## *PART I. THE CONVERGENCE AND DIVERGENCE DEBATE: A NEVERENDING STORY?*

### HARMONISATION OF FAMILY LAW IN EUROPE: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

|   |    |
|---|----|
| MASHA ANTOKOLSKAIA .....  | 11 |
| 1. Introduction .....   | 11 |
| 2. Tendency Towards Convergence and Tendency Towards Modernisation .                              | 11 |
| 3. Have Family Laws Been Converging in the Past? .....  | 15 |
| 3.1. Selection of Period is Crucial .....   | 15 |
| 3.2. Has There Been Convergence of the Laws on Marriage? .....                                    | 17 |
| 3.3. Has There Been Convergence of the Laws on Divorce? .....                                     | 18 |
| 3.4. Has There Been Convergence of the Laws on Extramarital<br>Cohabitation? .....                | 18 |
| 3.5. Has There Been Convergence of the Laws Governing Position<br>of Extramarital Children? ..... | 19 |
| 3.6. Has There Been Convergence of the Laws Governing Matrimonial<br>Property? .....              | 19 |
| 3.7. Conclusion .....   | 21 |
| 4. Are Family Laws Converging at Present? .....   | 21 |
| 4.1. Would the Rearguard Ever Reach the Vanguard? .....   | 21 |
| 4.2. The End of History of Family Law? .....  | 22 |

**CONVERGENCE AND DIVERGENCE: THEORETICAL ISSUES**

|  |    |
|--|----|
| ESİN ÖRÜCÜ .....   | 25 |
| 1. Introduction .....  | 25 |
| 2. Theories of Convergence and Divergence from the Vantage Point<br>of a Comparatist ..... | 28 |
| 2.1. Introduction .....  | 28 |
| 2.2. Contamination .....   | 31 |
| 2.3. Diffusion .....   | 32 |
| 2.4. Derivation .....  | 33 |
| 2.5. Transposition .....   | 33 |
| 2.6. Appropriation of Common Laws .....  | 34 |
| 2.7. 'Family Tree' Model and 'Wave Theory' .....   | 35 |
| 3. Original and Ongoing Convergence .....  | 37 |
| 4. Paths of Convergence .....  | 43 |
| 5. An Example Straddling Two Worlds .....  | 45 |
| 6. Concluding Remarks .....  | 46 |

***PART II. FROM DIVERSITY TO SIMILARITY: REGIONAL TENDENCIES***

**APPROXIMATION OF NORDIC FAMILY LAW WITHIN THE  
FRAMEWORK OF NORDIC COOPERATION**

|   |    |
|---|----|
| INGRID LUND-ANDERSEN .....                          | 51 |
| 1. Introduction .....                               | 51 |
| 2. Demographics .....                               | 51 |
| 3. Nordic Legal Cooperation – A Short History ..... | 52 |
| 4. Examples .....                                   | 56 |
| 5. Conclusion .....                                 | 60 |

**FAMILY LAW OF SPANISH AUTONOMIES: FOLLOWING A SIMILAR  
PATTERN?**

|   |    |
|---|----|
| MIQUEL MARTÍN-CASALS .....  | 63 |
| 1. Family Law Within the Context of Non-Unified Civil Law in Spain .....  | 63 |
| 2. The Introduction of Family Mediation and of a Scheme for Opposite-<br>and Same-Sex Couples by the Autonomous Communities ..... | 65 |
| 2.1. Initial Idleness of the Spanish Legislature and Catalan Activism .....   | 65 |

|        |  |    |
|--------|--|----|
| 2.2.   | Family Mediation Acts .....  | 67 |
| 2.2.1. | Main Characteristics of the Acts of the Autonomous<br>Communities .....    | 67 |
| 2.2.2. | The State's Proposal on Mediation .....                                    | 69 |
| 2.2.3. | Practical Results .....  | 70 |
| 2.3.   | Opposite-Sex and Same-Sex Partnerships Acts .....                          | 71 |
| 2.3.1. | Main Characteristics of the Acts of the Autonomous<br>Communities .....    | 71 |
| 2.3.2. | Practical Results .....  | 74 |
| 2.3.3. | The State's Silence and New Catalan Activism: What's<br>Coming Next? ..... | 75 |

#### **THE ACCESSION OF BULGARIA TO THE EUROPEAN UNION: A PATH TO THE HARMONISATION OF FAMILY LAW?**

|      |  |    |
|------|--|----|
|      | VELINA TODOROVA .....  | 79 |
| 1.   | Introduction .....   | 79 |
| 2.   | The Policy of 'Conditionality' As a Means to the 'Top-Down'<br>Harmonisation of Bulgarian Family Law ..... | 81 |
| 2.1. | The 'Acquis' Conditionality .....  | 82 |
| 2.2. | Democratic Conditionality .....  | 86 |
| 3.   | The 'Bottom Up' Pressures for Convergence of Family Law: The<br>New 'Old' Family in Bulgaria .....         | 88 |
| 4.   | Political Factors 'for' or 'Against' Convergence of Family Law<br>in Bulgaria .....                        | 89 |
| 5.   | The Child Care Reform and the New Family Law .....   | 92 |
| 6.   | Conclusion .....   | 94 |

#### **FAMILY LAW IN THE FORMER SOVIET UNION: MORE DIFFERENCES OR MORE IN COMMON?**

|      |   |     |
|------|---|-----|
|      | OLGA A. KHAZOVA .....                                   | 97  |
| 1.   | The Background .....                                    | 97  |
| 2.   | New Laws – Post-Soviet Reforms – General Overview ..... | 99  |
| 3.   | Peculiarities of Some of the Laws .....                 | 103 |
| 3.1. | Marriage .....  | 103 |
| 3.2. | Divorce and Separation .....                            | 106 |
| 3.3. | Property Issues and Spousal Maintenance .....           | 110 |

|                             |     |
|-----------------------------|-----|
| 4. Cohabitation .....       | 115 |
| 5. Concluding Remarks ..... | 116 |

**PART III. CONVERGENCE AND DIVERGENCE IN SPECIFIC  
FIELDS OF FAMILY LAW**

**O TEMPORA, O MORES! THE EVOLVING MARRIAGE CONCEPT  
AND THE IMPEDIMENTS TO MARRIAGE**

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| FREDERIK SWENNEN .....  | 121 |
| 1. Previously in Family Law .....   | 121 |
| 2. Convergence with Intervals: The Impediments to Marriage on the<br>Ground of Kinship and Affinity (by Adoption) ..... | 125 |
| 2.1. Analysis .....   | 125 |
| 2.2. Overview .....   | 131 |
| 3. Convergence in Disguise: A Short Intermezzo on Polygamy .....  | 135 |
| 4. Temporary Divergence: Same-Gender Marriage .....   | 137 |
| 5. The Weakest Link .....   | 143 |

**CONVERGENCE AND DIVERGENCE IN THE LAW ON SAME-SEX  
PARTNERSHIPS**

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| INGEBORG SCHWENZER .....                                    | 145 |
| 1. Introduction .....                                       | 145 |
| 2. Legal Parentage and Medically-Assisted Procreation ..... | 148 |
| 3. Adoption .....   | 150 |
| 4. Parental Responsibility .....                            | 154 |
| 5. Contact .....  | 156 |
| 6. Summary .....  | 157 |

**MOVING TO THE SAME DESTINATION? RECENT TRENDS  
IN THE LAW OF DIVORCE**

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| BEA VERSCHRAEGEN .....   | 159 |
| 1. Introduction .....  | 159 |
| 2. Rapid Divorce, Judicial Supervision and Clean-Break Versus<br>Continuing Responsibility ..... | 159 |

|                         |     |
|-------------------------|-----|
| 3. Assessment .....     | 161 |
| 4. Policy Matters ..... | 163 |
| 5. Summary .....        | 166 |

## THE ESTABLISHMENT OF PARENTHOOD: A STORY OF SUCCESSFUL CONVERGENCE?

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| CAROLINE FORDER and KEES SAARLOOS .....   | 169 |
| Introduction .....  | 169 |
| 1. National Laws on Legal Affiliation: How Do They Differ? .....                                    | 170 |
| 1.1. A Model for the Comparison of National Laws on Legal Affiliation                               | 170 |
| 1.2. Grounds for Legal Affiliation .....  | 171 |
| 1.2.1. Grounds for Legal Maternity .....  | 172 |
| 1.2.1.1. Childbirth .....   | 172 |
| 1.2.1.2. Apparent Status or Possession d'État .....   | 174 |
| 1.2.1.3. The Relationship Between Genetic Affiliation<br>and Apparent Status Under French Law ..... | 175 |
| 1.2.2. Grounds for Legal Paternity .....  | 176 |
| 1.2.2.1. Genetic Affiliation .....  | 177 |
| 1.2.2.2. Intention .....  | 177 |
| a. Definition of the Field of Application of<br>Intention As a Ground for Legal Affiliation ....    | 179 |
| b. Differences Between National Provisions on<br>the Consequences of Assisted Reproduction ...      | 182 |
| 1.2.3. Grounds for Legal Parenthood – Overview .....  | 185 |
| 1.3. Establishment and Annulment of Legal Parenthood .....  | 185 |
| 1.3.1. Establishment of Parenthood – Four Methods .....   | 186 |
| 1.3.1.1. Ex Lege Existence of Parenthood .....  | 186 |
| 1.3.1.2. Establishment of Parenthood by Means of<br>Administrative Action .....                     | 191 |
| 1.3.1.3. Judicial Establishment of Parenthood .....   | 194 |
| a. Exceptions to the Grounds of Legal Affiliation .   | 194 |
| b. Locus Standi .....   | 196 |
| c. Statutory Periods of Limitation .....  | 197 |
| 1.3.1.4. Annulment of Parenthood .....  | 198 |
| a. Judicial Annulment of Legal Parenthood .....   | 199 |
| b. Restrictions on Judicial Annulment of<br>Paternity Under Dutch Law .....                         | 200 |
| c. Judicial Annulment of Legal Parenthood<br>and Apparent Status .....                              | 201 |

|          |   |     |
|----------|---|-----|
|          | d. Locus Standi .....   | 202 |
|          | e. Statutory Periods of Limitation .....  | 205 |
|          | f. Administrative Annulment of Parenthood ....  | 207 |
| 1.4.     | Evidence and Legal Parenthood .....   | 209 |
| 1.4.1.   | Evidence and Ex Lege Existence of Parenthood .....  | 209 |
| 1.4.2.   | DNA Evidence in Court Proceedings on (Legal) Affiliation .  | 212 |
| 2.       | The European Court of Human Rights and National Laws of<br>Parenthood .....                                       | 218 |
| 2.1.     | Parenthood: Natural Reproduction and Assisted Reproduction ...  | 218 |
| 2.2.     | Natural Reproduction and Legal Parenthood .....   | 219 |
| 2.2.1.   | The Child-Mother Relationship .....   | 220 |
| 2.2.2.   | The Child-Father Relationship .....   | 221 |
| 2.2.2.1. | The Presence or Absence of a Biological Link<br>Between the Man and the Child .....                               | 222 |
| 2.2.2.2. | The Social Relationship Between the Mother<br>and Father or Between the Father and the Child ...                  | 222 |
| 2.2.2.3. | Presence or Absence of a Conflict of Interest<br>Regarding the Establishment of Parenthood .....                  | 224 |
| 2.2.3.   | Legal Recognition of Family Life: The Criteria .....  | 226 |
| 2.2.4.   | Private Life and Legal Parenthood .....   | 227 |
| 2.2.5.   | The Significance of the European Court's Attention<br>for the Presence or Absence of a Conflict of Interest ..... | 231 |
| 2.3.     | Assisted Reproduction .....   | 231 |
| 2.4.     | Assisted Reproduction: The Criteria .....   | 233 |
| 3.       | Convergence or Divergence? .....  | 233 |

## **MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY LAW: DIVERSITY OF FORMS, EQUIVALENCE IN SUBSTANCE?**

|        |   |     |
|--------|---|-----|
|        | BENTE BRAAT .....   | 237 |
| 1.     | Introduction .....  | 237 |
| 2.     | Diversity of Forms Regulating the Property of Spouses .....                           | 239 |
| 2.1.   | Matrimonial Property or no Matrimonial Property Regime?<br>That is the Question ..... | 239 |
| 2.2.   | Matrimonial Property Law in Europe: A Colourful Patchwork? ...                        | 240 |
| 2.2.1. | Community or no Community During the Marriage .....                                   | 240 |
| 2.2.2. | Management of Property .....  | 240 |
| 2.2.3. | Creditor's Rights .....   | 241 |
| 2.2.4. | Distribution of Property upon Dissolution .....                                       | 242 |
| 3.     | Equivalence in Substance .....  | 243 |

|          |  |     |
|----------|--|-----|
| 3.1.     | The Gap Between England and the Rest of the EU Isn't That Big After All .....      | 243 |
| 3.2.     | The Colours of the Patchwork Aren't That Different After All .....                 | 244 |
| 3.2.1.   | Community or no Community During Marriage .....                                    | 244 |
| 3.2.2.   | Management of Property .....   | 244 |
| 3.2.3.   | Creditor's Rights .....  | 245 |
| 3.2.4.   | Distribution of Property upon Dissolution .....                                    | 245 |
| 4.       | An Optional Matrimonial Property Regime for Europe .....                           | 245 |
| 4.1.     | The Basis: Common Core and Better Law Regarding Matrimonial Property Law .....     | 247 |
| 4.1.1.   | First Step: Looking for the Common Core of European Matrimonial Property Law. .... | 247 |
| 4.1.2.   | Second Step: Common Core is Not Enough, European Couples Need a Better Law .....   | 247 |
| 4.1.2.1. | Use of the Dutch Guidelines for a Default Regime .                                 | 247 |
| 4.1.2.2. | Europeanisation of the Dutch Guidelines .....                                      | 248 |
| 4.2.     | Starting Point for a European Optional Matrimonial Property Regime .....           | 249 |

***PART IV: CONVERGENCE AND DIVERGENCE: PRACTICAL AND POLITICAL ASPECTS***

**BUILDING ON CONVERGENCE AND COPING WITH DIVERGENCE IN THE CEFL PRINCIPLES OF EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW**

|      |  |     |
|------|--|-----|
|      | KATHARINA BOELE-WOELKI .....   | 253 |
| 1.   | Introduction .....   | 253 |
| 2.   | Remarks on the Terminology Used .....  | 254 |
| 2.1. | Convergence and Divergence and Similarities and Differences ....   | 254 |
| 2.2. | Common Core and Better Law .....   | 256 |
| 2.3. | Unification and Harmonisation .....  | 258 |
| 3.   | International and Regional Organisations and the CEFL: A Brief Comparison of Their Working Methods ..... | 259 |
| 4.   | CEFL's Six Steps and Five Approaches .....   | 261 |
| 4.1. | Coping with Divergence .....   | 263 |
| 4.2. | Building on Convergence .....  | 265 |
| 5.   | Final Remarks .....  | 267 |

**TOWARDS A UNIFORM EUROPEAN FAMILY LAW?  
A POLITICAL APPROACH. GENERAL CONCLUSIONS**

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| MARIE-THÉRÈSE MEULDERS-KLEIN .....          | 271 |
| 1. Introduction .....                       | 271 |
| 2. Specificity of Family Law .....          | 272 |
| 3. Europeanisation of Family Laws .....     | 275 |
| 4. The Council of Europe .....              | 275 |
| 5. The European Union .....                 | 278 |
| 6. The Common Core or the Better Law? ..... | 279 |
| 7. Conclusion .....                         | 280 |