

**The Right of a Cleric to "*bona fama*"**  
**by Michael J. Mazza**  
**Pontificia Università della Santa Croce**  
**Relatore: Prof. Eduardo Baura**

## OUTLINE

|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>ABBREVIATIONS</b>   | <b>vii</b> |
| <b>INTRODUCTION</b>  | <b>1</b>   |
| <b>CHAPTER I: DEFINING <i>BONA FAMA</i></b>                                | <b>7</b>   |
| <b>I.A Distinguishing Terms</b>  | <b>7</b>   |
| I.A.1 <i>Fama</i>  | 11         |
| I.A.2 <i>Bona Fama</i>   | 18         |
| I.A.3 <i>Honos</i>   | 26         |
| I.A.4 <i>Infamia</i>   | 33         |
| I.A.5 <i>Iniuriae</i>  | 39         |
| I.A.6 Section Summary  | 49         |
| <b>I.B Determining the Scope of the Right to <i>Bona Fama</i></b>          | <b>50</b>  |
| I.B.1 What is the nature of a "right"?                                     | 51         |
| I.B.2 What is the precise content of the right to <i>bona fama</i> ?       | 57         |
| I.B.3 Are there "limits" to the right to <i>bona fama</i> ?                | 67         |
| I.B.4 Who holds the right to <i>bona fama</i> ?                            | 84         |
| <b>CHAPTER II: VALUING <i>BONA FAMA</i></b>                                | <b>93</b>  |
| <b>II.A The <i>Ratio Iuris</i> in Sacred Scripture</b>                     | <b>99</b>  |
| II.A.1 The power of the spoken word  | 99         |
| II.A.2 The power of a name   | 101        |
| <b>II.B The Witness of the Early Church</b>                                | <b>109</b> |
| II.B.1 The <i>Didaché</i> and the <i>Didascalia Apostolorum</i>            | 109        |
| II.B.2 The Fathers of the Church   | 110        |
| <b>II.C The Testimony of the Scholastics</b>                               | <b>119</b> |
| II.C.1 Identifying types of harm to <i>bona fama</i>                       | 120        |
| II.C.2 Establishing the foundations for rights in general                  | 126        |
| <b>II.D Moral and Legal Contributions from the 18th and 19th Centuries</b> | <b>130</b> |
| II.D.1 St. Alphonsus Liguori   | 130        |
| II.D.2 Early U.S. defamation laws  | 132        |



|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>II.E The Magisterium of the 20th Century</b>                    | <b>136</b> |
| II.E.1 Pope Pius XI and Pope Pius XII                              | 136        |
| II.E.2 Pope St. John XXIII and the Second Vatican Council          | 139        |
| II.E.3 <i>The Catechism of the Catholic Church</i>                 | 142        |
| II.E.4 Pope St. Paul VI and Pope St. John Paul II                  | 144        |
| II.E.5 <i>The Revision of the Codex Iuris Canonici</i>             | 146        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>II.F The Evidence from Modern Science</b>                       | <b>150</b> |
| II.F.1 The use of scientific studies                               | 150        |
| II.F.2 The 2016 Oxford Study                                       | 153        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>CHAPTER III: PROTECTING <i>BONA FAMA</i></b>                    | <b>161</b> |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>III.A Historically</b>  | <b>161</b> |
| III.A.1 The Ancients   | 161        |
| III.A.2 The " <i>Leges Barbarorum</i> "                            | 169        |
| III.A.3 The Canonical Tradition                                    | 174        |
| III.A.3.a <i>The Ius Antiquum</i>                                  | 174        |
| III.A.3.b <i>The Ius Novum</i>                                     | 177        |
| III.A.3.c <i>Defamation Cases in England to 1600</i>               | 179        |
| III.A.3.d <i>The Purgatio Canonica</i>                             | 185        |
| III.A.3.e <i>Defamation in the Post-Classical Canonical Period</i> | 188        |
| III.A.4 The 1917 Code of Canon Law                                 | 193        |
| <br>   |            |
| <b>III.B Contemporary Protection</b>                               | <b>202</b> |
| III.B.1 At the Supranational Level                                 | 203        |
| III.B.2 At the International Regional Level                        | 210        |
| III.B.3 At the National Level                                      | 219        |
| III.B.3.a <i>Protecting "reputation"</i>                           | 219        |
| III.B.3.b <i>The mode of defamation</i>                            | 222        |
| III.B.3.c <i>The identity of the one defamed</i>                   | 225        |
| III.B.3.d <i>"Privileges" and "Fair Comment"</i>                   | 229        |
| III.B.3.e <i>Publishing the defamation</i>                         | 231        |
| III.B.3.f <i>Truth as a defense</i>                                | 238        |
| III.B.3.g <i>The potential claimants</i>                           | 241        |
| III.B.4 Within the Catholic Church                                 | 246        |
| III.B.4.a <i>Preparing the 1983 Code</i>                           | 246        |
| III.B.4.b <i>Rights to privacy and information</i>                 | 252        |
| III.B.4.c <i>Textual analysis of canon 220</i>                     | 255        |
| III.B.4.d <i>Related codicial provisions</i>                       | 260        |
| III.B.4.e <i>The canonical delict of defamation</i>                | 263        |
| III.B.4.f <i>Related extra-codicial provisions</i>                 | 265        |



|  |            |
|--|------------|
| <b>CHAPTER IV: VINDICATING <i>BONA FAMA</i></b>          | <b>269</b> |
| <b>IV.A <i>Status quaestionis</i></b>                    | <b>271</b> |
| IV.A.1 In the age of the internet and social media       | 271        |
| IV.A.2 In the wake of the clerical sexual abuse scandals | 272        |
| IV.A.3 In view of the current antinomian environment     | 276        |
| IV.A.4 Ignoring <i>Bona Fama</i>                         | 281        |
| <b>IV.B Defending <i>Bona Fama</i> Canonically</b>       | <b>291</b> |
| IV.B.1 The <i>Notitia Criminis</i>                       | 295        |
| IV.B.2 Restrictions on Ministry                          | 299        |
| IV.B.3 The <i>Investigazione Praevia</i>                 | 302        |
| IV.B.4 Administrative v. Judicial                        | 309        |
| IV.B.5 Recovering Damages                                | 314        |
| <b>IV.C Defending <i>Bona Fama</i> Civilly</b>           | <b>327</b> |
| IV.C.1 Theological Challenges                            | 328        |
| IV.C.2 Legal Challenges                                  | 331        |
| IV.C.3 Practical Challenges                              | 340        |
| IV.C.4 Recovering Damages                                | 346        |
| <b>CONCLUSION</b>  | <b>349</b> |
| <b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>                                      | <b>359</b> |