

# Contents

*List of Abbreviations*  
*Table of Cases*

xxv  
xxxi

## I. SYSTEMS OF LIABILITY

<b>1. Introduction</b>	3
101 Europe, European tort law and international tort law	3
101-1 Europe	3
101-2 European tort law	4
101-3 International tort law	6
102 Focus of the book	6
102-1 Aim of the book	6
102-2 Three national systems	7
103 Plan and structure of the book	8
103-1 Introduction	8
103-2 Part I: Systems of liability	9
103-3 Part II: Requirements of liability	11
103-4 Part III: Categories of liability	13
<b>2. Europe</b>	15
201 Comparative law and <i>ius commune</i>	15
201-1 Influences on Community law	15
201-2 Influences on national laws	16
202 European Convention on Human Rights	18
203 European Union	20
203-1 History and structure	20
203-2 Judiciary	21
204 Vicinity of liability for breach of Community law	23
204-1 Legislation and case law	23
204-2 Vertical direct effect	25
204-3 Horizontal direct effect	26
204-4 Purposive interpretation (horizontal indirect effect)	28
204-5 Article 288 EC: liability of Community institutions	29
205 General principle of liability for breach of Community law	31
205-1 Member State liability for breach of Community law	31
205-2 Link between Member State liability and Article 288 EC	32
205-3 Liability of individuals for breach of Community law	35
205-4 Member State liability for judicial decisions	37
206 Requirements for liability for breach of Community law	39

## Contents

3. France	41
301 Introduction	41
301-1 History	41
301-2 <i>Code civil</i>	42
301-3 Judiciary	43
301-4 Doctrine	45
302 Fault liability (arts. 1382 and 1383 <i>Code civil</i> )	46
302-1 General observations	46
302-2 <i>Abus de droit</i> (abuse of rights)	48
303 General rule of strict liability for things (art. 1384 al. 1 <i>Code civil</i> )	49
303-1 History and background	49
303-2 <i>Fait de la chose</i> (fact of the thing)	51
303-3 <i>Gardien</i> (custodian): general observations	53
303-4 <i>Garde commun</i> (common custodianship); transfer of custodianship	54
304 Specific rules of strict liability for things	56
305 General rule of strict liability for persons (art. 1384 al. 1 <i>Code civil</i> )	57
306 Specific rules of strict liability for persons	60
4. Germany	61
401 Introduction	61
401-1 History	61
401-2 <i>Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch</i> (Civil Code)	62
401-3 Judiciary	63
401-4 Doctrine	65
402 Fault liability: the BGB provisions	66
402-1 General rules	66
402-2 Requirements for fault liability	67
402-3 § 823 I BGB: infringement of a right	69
402-4 § 826 BGB: intentional infliction of damage <i>contra bonos mores</i>	70
403 Fault liability: judge-made safety duties ( <i>Verkehrspflichten</i> )	72
403-1 Origin, character, and place in the legal system	72
403-2 Application	74
404 Fault liability: judge-made rights	75
404-1 Right to business ( <i>Recht am Gewerbebetrieb</i> )	75
404-2 General personality right ( <i>allgemeines Persönlichkeitsrecht</i> )	76
405 Rules of stricter liability	77
405-1 General observations	77
405-2 Liability for things	78
405-3 Liability for persons	79

## Contents

5. England	80
501 Introduction	80
501-1 Common law in England	80
501-2 Common law around the world	81
501-3 Judiciary	82
501-4 Legislation and judiciary	84
501-5 Doctrine	86
502 Origins of tort law	87
502-1 Writs	87
502-2 Torts	88
502-3 Trespass and case	89
503 Tort of negligence	90
503-1 History	90
503-2 Rise and fall of the neighbour principle	92
503-3 Current situation	93
503-4 Relationship between the requirements	94
504 Intentional torts to the person	96
504-1 Torts	96
504-2 Defences	98
505 Intentional interference with goods	99
505-1 Trespass to land	99
505-2 Trespass to goods	101
506 Rules of stricter liability	103
506-1 Public and private nuisance	103
506-2 Other rules of stricter liability	105
6. <i>Ius Commune</i>	106
A INTRODUCTION	106
601 Overview	106
B THE QUEST FOR A EUROPEAN <i>IUS COMMUNE</i>	107
602 From old to new <i>ius commune</i>	107
603 Search for harmonization	108
603-1 Publications and principles	108
603-2 Background of the discussion	111
C VARIOUS LEGAL RULES	113
604 Fault liability	113
604-1 Requirements	113
604-2 Casuism and conceptualism	114
604-3 Unlawfulness and fault	115
605 Stricter liability	116
606 The basic liability rules in the Principles	118
607 Common law and codified law	119

## Contents

607-1 Different views on systematization	119
607-2 Predominance of judiciary over legislator	120
D VARIOUS SCENES BEHIND THE RULES	122
608 Legal cultures	122
608-1 Germany	122
608-2 England	123
608-3 France	124
608-4 Europe	124
609 Policy approaches	125
609-1 Introduction	125
609-2 England	126
609-3 France and Germany	128
610 The role of rights	129
E THE WAY AHEAD	131
611 Role of the Community institutions	131
612 The case for harmonization	133
613 The need for a European policy discourse	135
II. REQUIREMENTS OF LIABILITY	
7. Protected Interests	141
A INTRODUCTION	141
701 Overview	141
701-1 Protected interests in the framework of torts and damages	141
701-2 Protected interests in the framework of the legal systems	142
B PROTECTION OF THE PERSON	143
702 Life	143
703 Physical integrity and physical health	145
704 Mental health	146
705 Personality rights	149
705-1 Introduction	149
705-2 Germany	150
705-3 France	152
705-4 England	152
705-5 Article 8 ECHR	154
706 Wrongful conception (wrongful birth)	156
706-1 Protection of the right to self-determination	156
706-2 Heads of damage	158
707 Prenatal harm (wrongful life)	161
707-1 Actively caused prenatal harm	161
707-2 Not prevented prenatal harm	162
C PROTECTION OF PROPERTY	165
708 Introduction	165

## Contents

709	Germany	167
710	England	168
D	PROTECTION OF ECONOMIC INTERESTS	169
711	Introduction	169
712	France	171
713	Germany	172
714	England	174
	714-1 The <i>Caparo</i> rule	174
	714-2 The extended <i>Hedley Byrne</i> principle	175
	714-3 Intentional interference with economic interests	177
E	CONCLUDING REMARKS	179
715	Balancing freedom and protection	179
716	The role of insurance	182
<b>8.</b>	<b>Intention and Negligence</b>	<b>184</b>
A	INTRODUCTION	184
801	Fault liability: intention and negligence	184
B	INTENTION	185
802	Intention in the legal systems	185
	802-1 France	185
	802-2 Germany	186
	802-3 England	187
803	Comparative observations	188
C	NEGLIGENT CONDUCT	189
804	Negligence in the legal systems	189
	804-1 England	189
	804-2 Germany	190
	804-3 France	192
805	The reasonable person balancing risk and care	193
	805-1 The elements of negligence	193
	805-2 The four factors of negligent conduct	194
	805-3 Background and plan of the chapter	197
806	Magnitude of the risk	198
	806-1 Seriousness of the harm	198
	806-2 Probability of the harm	199
807	Precautionary measures	200
	807-1 Costs, effort, and time	200
	807-2 Reducing the risk	202
	807-3 Duty to warn or to inform	203
	807-4 Negligent victims	204

## Contents

808	Omissions	205
	808-1 General remarks	205
	808-2 Indications for affirmative duties	207
	808-3 Fitting affirmative duties into the legal systems	209
809	Character and benefit of the conduct	211
	809-1 General remarks	211
	809-2 Assumption of risk	213
D	NEGLIGENT PERSON	214
810	Knowledge and ability	214
	810-1 Introduction	214
	810-2 Knowledge	215
	810-3 Ability	217
	810-4 State of the art	217
811	Subjective and objective tests	219
	811-1 Subjective test	219
	811-2 Objective test	220
812	Standards of reference	222
	812-1 General remarks	222
	812-2 Professionals	223
813	Children and mentally disabled persons	225
	813-1 Introduction	225
	813-2 France	227
	813-3 Germany	229
	813-4 England	231
E	DEFENCES AND GROUNDS OF JUSTIFICATION	233
814	Overview	233
815	Consent	234
F	CONCLUDING REMARKS	235
816	Comparative observations	235
9.	Violation of a Statutory Rule	237
	901 Introduction	237
	902 England	238
	902-1 Private right of action: introduction	238
	902-2 Private right of action: relevant factors	240
	902-3 Scope of the statutory duty	241
	902-4 Negligence and strict liability	243
	903 Germany	243
	904 France	245
	905 Liability for breach of Community law	247
	905-1 Violated rule must confer rights on individuals	247
	905-2 Illustration: liability for inadequate banking supervision	249

## Contents

906	Comparative observations	251
906-1	Conferment of rights and private right of action; scope and causation	251
906-2	Negligence and strict liability	253
<b>10.</b>	<b>Strict Liability</b>	<b>255</b>
1001	Introduction	255
1002	Background of strict liability	256
1003	Three variations on strict liability	258
1003-1	Liability with an extra debtor	258
1003-2	Liability for a defective object	259
1003-3	Liability with a limited defence	259
1004	Strict elements in negligence	260
1004-1	Raising the standard of care	260
1004-2	Shifting the burden of proof	262
1005	The blurred border between strict and fault liability	264
<b>11.</b>	<b>Causation</b>	<b>266</b>
A	INTRODUCTION	266
1101	General remarks	266
1102	Establishing and limiting causation; factual and legal causation	268
B	CAUSATION IN THE LEGAL SYSTEMS	270
1103	Germany	270
1103-1	Adequacy theory	270
1103-2	Scope of the rule	272
1104	England	275
1105	France	278
1106	European Union	279
C	ESTABLISHING CAUSATION	281
1107	Shifting the burden of proof	281
1107-1	Germany	281
1107-2	France	283
1107-3	England	284
1108	More than one possible cause	286
1108-1	Comparative overview	286
1108-2	Conclusion	289
1109	Successive causes	290
1109-1	Second event would have caused same damage as first event	290
1109-2	Second event increases damage caused by first event	292
1110	The loss of a chance	293
1110-1	France	293
1110-2	England	294
1110-3	Germany	296

## Contents

1110-4 Comparative overview	296
D    UNEXPECTED AND UNLIKELY CONSEQUENCES	297
1111 Confusion and principles	297
1112 Tortfeasor takes victim as he finds him	299
<b>12. Damage and Damages</b>	<b>301</b>
A    INTRODUCTION	301
1201 Purposes	301
1201-1 Reparation and compensation	301
1201-2 Recognition and satisfaction	302
1201-3 Punishment and prevention	303
1202 Features of the legal systems	306
1202-1 France	306
1202-2 Germany	309
1202-3 England	311
1202-4 Community law: liability of Member States	313
1202-5 Community law: liability of Community institutions	314
1202-6 European Convention on Human Rights	315
1203 Collateral benefits	316
B    PERSONAL INJURY	318
1204 Introduction	318
1205 Future damage	319
1206 Non-pecuniary loss for personal injury	322
1207 Unconsciousness	323
C    FAMILY TIES	325
1208 Introduction	325
1209 Loss of maintenance	326
1210 Non-pecuniary loss for loss of a loved one	329
1211 Nervous shock	331
D    CONTRIBUTORY NEGLIGENCE	334
1212 Introduction	334
1213 Contributory risk	336
1214 Systematic observations	337
1215 Children	340
E    CONCLUDING REMARKS	342
1216 Comparative observations	342
1217 Community law and effective national remedies	343
 <b>III. CATEGORIES OF LIABILITY</b>	
<b>13. Introduction</b>	<b>349</b>
1301 Supervising persons, immovable and movable objects	349
1302 Liability for lack of information and for defective information	350



## Contents

14. Liability for Movable Objects	353
A INTRODUCTION	353
1401 Overview	353
B ANIMALS	355
1402 National rules	355
1403 Comparative observations	357
C MOTOR VEHICLES	359
1404 National rules	359
1404-1 France: <i>loi Badinter</i>	359
1404-2 Germany: <i>Straßenverkehrsgesetz</i>	362
1404-3 England: tort of negligence	363
1405 International perspective	366
1405-1 Comparative observations	366
1405-2 European law	368
D PRODUCTS	370
1406 History, future, and context of the EC Product Liability Directive	370
1407 Level of harmonization	373
1407-1 Options in the Directive; differences in the laws of damages	373
1407-2 Previously existing liability systems	374
1408 Defective product	376
1408-1 Relevant provisions	376
1408-2 Case law	378
1409 Damage	380
1410 Defences	382
1410-1 General observations	382
1410-2 Development risk defence	384
1411 Other requirements	386
E DANGEROUS SUBSTANCES AND THE ENVIRONMENT	388
1412 Introduction	388
1413 Law of neighbours	389
1413-1 Germany: § 906 and 1004 BGB	389
1413-2 England: private nuisance	390
1413-3 France: <i>trouble de voisinage</i>	392
1413-4 Comparative observations	393
1413-5 Article 8 ECHR	394
1414 Environmental liability	396
1414-1 Germany: <i>Umwelthaftungsgesetz</i> and <i>Wasserhaushaltsgesetz</i>	396
1414-2 England: <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i> and breach of statutory duty	397
1414-3 France: art. 1384 al. 1 CC and violation of a statutory rule	400
1415 International perspective	401
1415-1 Comparative observations	401

## Contents

1415-2 International law	402
1415-3 European Union law	403
F CONCLUDING REMARKS	405
1416 Comparative observations	405
<b>15. Liability for Immovable Objects</b>	<b>408</b>
A NATIONAL RULES	408
1501 Introduction	408
1502 France	409
1502-1 Strict liability for collapsing buildings (art. 1386 CC)	409
1502-2 General strict liability for things (art. 1384 al. 1 CC)	410
1503 Germany	412
1503-1 Liability for collapsing buildings (§ 836–838 BGB)	412
1503-2 <i>Verkehrspflichten</i>	413
1504 England	416
1504-1 Statutory duties: Occupiers' Liability Acts	416
1504-2 Public nuisance	419
B NEGLIGENCE AND STRICT LIABILITY	420
1505 Relation between negligence and strict liability	420
1506 Common issues in negligence and strict liability	421
1506-1 Liable person	421
1506-2 Character of the premises	422
1506-3 Unauthorized visitors	424
1506-4 Negligent visitors	425
1506-5 Protection of visitors against each other	427
C ROADS	429
1507 England: Highways Act 1980	429
1508 France: <i>Droit administratif</i>	431
1509 Germany: <i>Straßenverkehrssicherungspflichten</i>	432
1510 Comparative observations	434
D CONCLUDING REMARKS	435
1511 Comparative observations	435
<b>16. Liability for Other Persons</b>	<b>437</b>
A INTRODUCTION	437
1601 Overview	437
B CHILDREN AND MENTALLY DISABLED PERSONS	439
1602 Liability of parents	439
1602-1 France	439
1602-2 Germany	441
1602-3 England	442

## Contents

1603	Liability of other supervisors over children	443
1604	Comparative observations	445
1605	Supervising mentally disabled persons	447
C	EMPLOYEES	448
1606	National rules	448
	1606-1 Germany: § 831 BGB	448
	1606-2 Germany: bypasses for § 831 BGB	450
	1606-3 France	452
	1606-4 England	454
1607	Comparative observations	456
	1607-1 General remarks	456
	1607-2 Rationales	458
	1607-3 Conditions	459
<b>17.</b>	<b>Liability in Emergency Cases</b>	<b>462</b>
1701	Pure omissions: emergency cases	462
1702	National rules	463
	1702-1 France	463
	1702-2 Germany	464
	1702-3 England	465
1703	Duty to rescue	467
	1703-1 When does a duty to rescue exist?	467
	1703-2 Rescuer's standard of care	468
	1703-3 Rescuer's right to compensation	470
<b>18.</b>	<b>Liability of Public Authorities</b>	<b>472</b>
A	INTRODUCTION	472
1801	Overview	472
B	NATIONAL LEGAL SYSTEMS	474
1802	France	474
	1802-1 Administrative liability	474
	1802-2 Liability based on fault	476
	1802-3 Liability based on risk: the equality principle	478
1803	Germany	481
	1803-1 Introduction	481
	1803-2 Civil servant's personal liability (§ 839 BGB)	482
	1803-3 Discretion	485
	1803-4 State liability (Article 34 <i>Grundgesetz</i> )	486
1804	England	488
	1804-1 Introduction	488
	1804-2 Tort of negligence: duty of care, discretion, and justiciability	489
	1804-3 Tort of negligence and Article 6 ECHR: from <i>Osman</i> to <i>Z</i>	492

## Contents

1804-4 Tort of negligence: recent developments	495
1804-5 Misfeasance in a public office	497
C COMMUNITY LAW	498
1805 Sufficiently serious breach	498
1805-1 Relevant factors	498
1805-2 Application	500
1805-3 Terminology and comparison	502
1806 Liability for lawful acts and specific damage	504
D EUROPEAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS	507
1807 The right to life: Article 2 ECHR	507
1807-1 Introduction	507
1807-2 Protection against imminent life-threatening danger	509
1808 The right to physical integrity and health	511
1808-1 Article 3 ECHR	511
1808-2 Articles 2 and 8 ECHR	512
E CONCLUDING REMARKS	513
1809 The issue of public authority liability	513
1810 Inevitability and limits of discretion	515
1811 Strict liability and the equality principle	517
<i>Bibliography</i>	520
<i>Index</i>	523