

CONTENTS

Abbreviations
Table of Cases

xxii
xxvii

PART I SYSTEMS OF LIABILITY

1	INTRODUCTION	3
101	Europe, European Tort Law, and International Tort Law	3
101-1	Europe	3
101-2	European Tort Law	4
101-3	International Tort Law	6
102	Aim and Focus of the Book	8
102-1	Aim of the Book	8
102-2	Three National Systems	9
103	Comparative Law	10
103-1	Comparative Law in Theory	10
103-2	Comparative Law in Practice	11
103-3	Pitfalls of Comparative Law	13
104	Comparative Law, National Law, and EU Law	14
104-1	Influence of Comparative Law on EU Law	14
104-2	Influences of Comparative Law on National Law	15
105	Plan and Structure of the Book	17
105-1	Overview	17
105-2	Part I: Systems of Liability	18
105-3	Part II: Requirements for Liability	19
105-4	Part III: Categories of Liability	21
2	EUROPE	23
201	ECHR and EU: Their Relevance for Tort Law	23
202	European Convention on Human Rights	24
202-1	The Council of Europe, the Convention, and the Court	24
202-2	Tort Remedies as Effective ECHR Remedies	25
203	European Union	26
203-1	History and Structure	26
203-2	Judiciary	28
203-3	Sources of EU Tort Law: Treaties, Regulations, Directives, and Case Law	29
203-4	Liability of the EU (Art. 340 TFEU)	31
203-5	Relationship Between the EU and the ECHR	32

204	The Need for Liability for Breach of EU Law	34
204-1	Vertical Direct Effect	34
204-2	Horizontal Direct Effect	36
204-3	Indirect Horizontal Effect (Purposive Interpretation)	37
205	The Development of a General Principle of Liability for Breach of EU Law	39
205-1	Member State Liability for Breach of EU Law	39
205-2	Link between Member State Liability and Article 340 TFEU	42
205-3	Member State Liability for Judicial Decisions	44
205-4	Liability of Individuals for Breach of EU Law	47
206	Requirements for Liability for Breach of EU Law	49
3	FRANCE	51
301	Introduction	51
301-1	History	51
301-2	<i>Code civil</i>	52
301-3	Judiciary	53
301-4	Doctrine	55
302	Fault Liability (arts. 1382 and 1383 <i>Code civil</i>)	56
302-1	General Observations	56
302-2	Abuse of Rights (<i>Abus de droit</i>)	58
303	General Rule of Strict Liability for Things (art. 1384 al. 1 <i>Code civil</i>)	60
303-1	History and Background	60
303-2	Fact of the Thing (<i>Fait de la chose</i>)	62
303-3	Custodian (<i>Gardien</i>): General Observations	64
303-4	Common Custodianship (<i>Garde commun</i>); Transfer of Custodianship	65
304	Specific Rules of Strict Liability for Things	67
305	General Rule of Strict Liability for Persons (art. 1384 al. 1 <i>Code civil</i>)	68
306	Specific Rules of Strict Liability for Persons	71
4	GERMANY	73
401	Introduction	73
401-1	History	73
401-2	Civil Code (<i>Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch</i>)	74
401-3	Judiciary	75
401-4	Doctrine	77
402	Fault Liability: The BGB Provisions	78
402-1	Three General Provisions	78
402-2	Requirements for Fault Liability	80
402-3	§ 823 I: Infringement of a Right	81
402-4	§ 826 BGB: Intentional Infliction of Damage <i>Contra Bonos Mores</i>	83
402-5	Gaps in the BGB and the Need for Judicial Intervention	84
403	Fault Liability: Judge-Made Safety Duties (<i>Verkehrspflichten</i>)	85
403-1	Origin, Character, and Place in the Legal System	85
403-2	Application	86

404	Fault Liability: Judge-Made Rights	88
404-1	Right to Business (<i>Recht am Gewerbebetrieb</i>)	88
404-2	General Personality Right (<i>Allgemeines Persönlichkeitsrecht</i>)	89
405	Rules of Stricter Liability	89
405-1	General Observations	89
405-2	Liability for Objects	91
405-3	Liability for Persons	91
5	ENGLAND	93
501	Introduction	93
501-1	Common Law in England	93
501-2	Common Law Around the World	94
501-3	Judiciary	95
501-4	Legislator and Judiciary	97
501-5	Doctrine	99
502	Origins of Tort Law	100
502-1	Writs	100
502-2	Torts	101
503	Tort of Negligence	102
503-1	From Specific Duties to Lord Atkin's Speech	102
503-2	Rise and Fall of the General Duty of Care	104
503-3	The <i>Caparo</i> Test	105
503-4	Assumption of Responsibility	106
503-5	Relationship Between <i>Caparo</i> Test and Assumption of Responsibility	108
503-6	Problematic Duty Situations	109
504	Trespass to the Person	110
504-1	Introduction	110
504-2	Assault and Battery	111
504-3	Defences Against Assault and Battery	112
504-4	Defamation	114
504-5	Other Torts of Trespass to the Person	116
505	Intentional Interference with Land and Goods	117
505-1	Trespass to Land	117
505-2	Trespass to Goods	119
506	Nuisance	120
506-1	Public Nuisance	120
506-2	Private Nuisance and the Rule in <i>Rylands v Fletcher</i>	122
507	Overview of Other Torts	124
6	IUS COMMUNE	126
A	Introduction	126
601	Overview	126
B	The Quest for a European <i>Ius Commune</i>	127
602	From Old to New <i>Ius Commune</i>	127

603	Search for Harmonization	128
603-1	An Ever Growing Number of Publications	128
603-2	Harmonization Initiatives	130
603-3	Background to the Discussion	131
C	The Variety of National Rules	133
604	Common Law and Codified Law	133
604-1	Different Views on Systematization	133
604-2	Predominance of Judiciary over Legislator	135
605	Rules of Fault Liability	136
605-1	Diverging Requirements	136
605-2	Casuism and Conceptualism	137
605-3	The Role of Unlawfulness	138
606	Rules of Stricter Liability	139
607	The Basic Liability Rule in a European <i>Ius Commune</i>	141
608	The Role of Rights	142
D	The Various Scenes Behind the Rules	144
609	Various Policy Approaches	144
609-1	Introduction	144
609-2	England	145
609-3	France and Germany	146
610	Various Legal Cultures	148
610-1	Link Between Culture and Law	148
610-2	Germany	149
610-3	England	150
610-4	France	151
610-5	European Union	152
610-6	Cultural Diversity and European Cooperation	153
E	The Way Forward	156
611	Competing roles of the EU Institutions	156
612	A Case for Harmonization?	159
613	The Need for a Continuous European Policy Discourse	161

PART II REQUIREMENTS FOR LIABILITY

7	PROTECTED RIGHTS AND INTERESTS	167
A	Introduction	167
701	Overview	167
701-1	Protected Rights and Interests in Tort Law	167
701-2	Protected Rights and Interests in the Legal Systems	168

B	Protection of the Person	169
702	The Right to Life	169
703	The Right to Physical Integrity	171
704	The Right to Physical Health	172
705	The Right to Mental Health	174
	705-1 Various National Thresholds	174
	705-2 France	176
	705-3 Germany	177
	705-4 England	178
	705-5 Rescuers	180
	705-6 Anxiety	181
	705-7 Comparative Remarks	183
706	Personality Rights	184
	706-1 Introduction	184
	706-2 Germany	185
	706-3 France	186
	706-4 England	188
	706-5 Article 8 ECHR: <i>Caroline von Hanover</i>	190
	706-6 Article 8 ECHR: Follow-Up to <i>Caroline von Hanover</i>	192
707	Wrongful Conception (Wrongful Birth)	193
	707-1 Protection of the Right to Self-Determination and Family Life	193
	707-2 Heads of Recoverable Damage	195
708	Prenatal Harm (Wrongful Life)	198
	708-1 Actively Caused Prenatal Harm	198
	708-2 Not Prevented Prenatal Harm	199
C	Protection of Property and Economic Interests	202
709	The Right to Property	202
	709-1 Introduction	202
	709-2 Article 1 First Protocol ECHR	203
	709-3 Germany	205
	709-4 England	206
710	Protection Against Pure Economic Loss	208
	710-1 Introduction	208
	710-2 France	210
	710-3 Germany	211
	710-4 England: Tort of Negligence	213
	710-5 England: Economic Torts	215
D	Concluding Observations	218
711	Tort Law, Insurance, and Human Rights	218
	711-1 Rights Protected by Tort Law	218
	711-2 Balancing Freedom and Protection	219
	711-3 The Role of Insurance	221
	711-4 Tort Rights are Human Rights	222

8 INTENTION AND NEGLIGENCE	225
A Introduction	225
801 Fault Liability: Intention and Negligence	225
B Intention	226
802 Intention in the Legal Systems	226
802-1 France	226
802-2 Germany	227
802-3 England	228
803 Comparative Observations	229
C Negligent Conduct	230
804 Negligence in the Legal Systems	230
804-1 England	230
804-2 Germany	231
804-3 France	233
805 The Reasonable Person Balancing Risk and Care	234
805-1 The Elements of Negligence	234
805-2 The Four Factors of Negligent Conduct	235
805-3 Background and Plan of the Chapter	238
806 Magnitude of the Risk	239
806-1 Seriousness of the Harm	239
806-2 Probability of the Harm	240
806-3 Probability that Potential Victim Acts Negligently	241
807 Precautionary Measures	242
807-1 Costs, Effort, and Time	242
807-2 Reducing the Risk	244
807-3 Duty to Warn or to Inform	245
808 Omissions	246
808-1 General Remarks	246
808-2 Indications for Affirmative Duties	248
808-3 Fitting Affirmative Duties into the Legal Systems	250
809 Character and Benefit of the Conduct	253
809-1 Introduction	253
809-2 Defences and Grounds of Justification	255
809-3 Assumption of Risk	256
809-4 Consent	258
D Negligent Person	259
810 Knowledge and Skills	259
810-1 Introduction	259
810-2 Knowledge	260
810-3 Skills	261
810-4 State of the Art	261

811	Subjective and Objective Tests	263
811-1	Subjective Test	263
811-2	Objective Test	264
812	Standards of Reference	266
812-1	General Remarks	266
812-2	Professionals	267
813	Children and the Mentally Incapacitated	269
813-1	Introduction	269
813-2	France	271
813-3	Germany	273
813-4	England	276
E	Concluding Remarks	277
814	Comparative Observations	277
9	VIOLATION OF A STATUTORY RULE	279
901	Introduction	279
902	England	280
902-1	Private Right of Action: Introduction	280
902-2	Private Right of Action: Relevant Factors	281
902-3	Scope of the Statutory Duty	283
902-4	Negligence or Strict Liability?	284
903	Germany	285
904	France	286
905	Liability for Breach of EU Law	288
905-1	Violated Rule Must Confer Rights on Individuals	288
905-2	Illustration: Liability for Inadequate Banking Supervision	290
906	Comparative Observations	293
906-1	Conferment of Rights and Private Right of Action; Scope and Causation	293
906-2	Negligence or Strict Liability?	295
10	STRICT LIABILITY	297
1001	Introduction	297
1002	Background of Strict Liability	298
1003	Three Variations on Strict Liability	300
1003-1	Liability with an Extra Debtor	300
1003-2	Liability for a Defective Object	301
1003-3	Liability for with a Limited Defence	301
1004	Strict Elements in Negligence	302
1004-1	Raising the Standard of Care	302
1004-2	Shifting the Burden of Proof	304
1005	The Blurred Border Between Strict and Fault Liability	306

11 CAUSATION	307
A Introduction	307
1101 General Remarks	307
1102 Establishing and Limiting Causation; Factual and Legal Causation	310
B Causation in the Legal Systems	312
1103 Germany	312
1103-1 Adequacy Theory	312
1103-2 Scope of the Rule	314
1104 England	316
1105 France	319
1106 European Union	321
C Establishing Causation	324
1107 Shifting the Burden of Proof	324
1107-1 Germany	324
1107-2 France	325
1107-3 England	327
1108 More Than One Possible Cause	329
1108-1 Comparative Overview	329
1108-2 Illustration: <i>DES</i>	332
1109 Successive Causes	334
1109-1 Second Event Would Have Caused Same Damage as First Event	334
1109-2 Second Event Increases Damage Caused by First Event	336
1110 The Loss of a Chance	337
1110-1 France	337
1110-2 England	338
1110-3 Germany	340
1110-4 Comparative Overview	340
D Unexpected and Unlikely Consequences	342
1111 Principles and Confusion	342
1112 Tortfeasor Takes Victim as He Finds Him	344
12 DAMAGE AND DAMAGES	346
A Introduction	346
1201 Overview	346
1202 Purposes	347
1202-1 Reparation and Compensation	347
1202-2 Recognition, Vindication, and Satisfaction	349
1202-3 Punishment and Prevention	349
1203 Features of the Legal Systems	353
1203-1 France	353
1203-2 Germany	355

1203-3	England	357
1203-4	European Union	359
B	Personal Injury	360
1204	Future Damage	360
1205	Non-Pecuniary Loss	362
1205-1	Comparative Overview	362
1205-2	Unconsciousness	365
1206	Family Ties	366
1206-1	Introduction	366
1206-2	Loss of Maintenance	367
1206-3	Non-Pecuniary Loss Caused by Death of a Loved One	370
C	Reducing the Amount of Damages	372
1207	Collateral Benefits	372
1208	Contributory Negligence	375
1208-1	Introduction	375
1208-2	Contributory Risk	376
1208-3	Systematic Observations	378
1208-4	Children	381
D	Damages as an Effective Remedy in Supranational Law	383
1209	European Union	383
1209-1	Member State Liability	383
1209-2	Competition Law	384
1209-3	Other Areas	385
1210	European Convention on Human Rights	387
1211	Business and Human Rights	389
1211-1	Litigation in the United States and Europe	389
1211-2	Hurdles for Tort Claims Against Companies for Human Rights Abuses	391
E	Concluding Remarks	393
1212	Comparative Observations	393

PART III CATEGORIES OF LIABILITY

13	INTRODUCTION	397
1301	Supervising Persons and Objects	397
1302	Liability for Lack of Information and for Defective Information	398
14	LIABILITY FOR MOVABLE OBJECTS	402
A	Introduction	402
1401	Overview	402
B	Animals	404

1402	National Rules	404
1403	Comparative Observations	406
C	Motor Vehicles	408
1404	National Rules	408
1404-1	France: <i>Loi Badinter</i>	408
1404-2	Germany: Road Traffic Act (<i>Straßenverkehrsgesetz</i>)	411
1404-3	England: Tort of Negligence	413
1405	International Perspective	415
1405-1	Comparative Observations	415
1405-2	EU Law	417
D	Products	420
1406	History and Context of the European Product Liability Directive	420
1407	Level of Harmonization	423
1407-1	Options; No Harmonization of the Laws of Damages	423
1407-2	Previously Existing Liability Regimes	424
1408	When is a Product Defective?	427
1408-1	Relevant Provisions	427
1408-2	Case Law	429
1409	Damage	431
1410	Defences	433
1410-1	General Observations	433
1410-2	Development Risk Defence	434
1410-3	Limitation and Extinction Periods	436
1411	Other Requirements for Liability	438
E	Dangerous Substances, Neighbourhood Law, and Environmental Liability	439
1412	Introduction	439
1413	Germany	441
1413-1	Law of Neighbours: § 906 and 1004 BGB	441
1413-2	Environmental Liability Act and Water Resources Act	442
1414	England	444
1414-1	Private Nuisance	444
1414-2	<i>Rylands v Fletcher</i> and Breach of Statutory Duty	446
1415	France	448
1415-1	<i>Trouble de voisinage</i>	448
1415-2	Article 1384 al. 1 CC and Violation of a Statutory Rule	449
1416	International Perspective	450
1416-1	Comparative Observations	450
1416-2	International Law	452
1416-3	EU Law	454
1416-4	Article 8 ECHR	456
F	Concluding Remarks	459
1417	Comparative Observations	459

15	LIABILITY FOR IMMOVABLE OBJECTS	461
	A National Rules	461
1501	Introduction	461
1502	France	462
	1502-1 Liability for Collapsing Buildings (art. 1386 <i>Code civil</i>)	462
	1502-2 General Strict Liability for Things (art. 1384 al. 1 <i>Code civil</i>)	464
1503	Germany	465
	1503-1 Liability for Collapsing Buildings (§ 836–838 BGB)	465
	1503-2 <i>Verkehrspflichten</i> (§ 836–838 BGB)	467
1504	England	469
	1504-1 Occupiers' Liability Acts	469
	1504-2 Public Nuisance	472
	B Negligence and Strict Liability	473
1505	Relation Between Negligence and Strict Liability	473
1506	Common Issues in Negligence and Strict Liability	474
	1506-1 Liable Person	474
	1506-2 Character of the Premises	476
	1506-3 Unauthorized Visitors	478
	1506-4 Negligent Visitors	479
	1506-5 Protecting Visitors Against Each Other	480
	C Roads	482
1507	England: Highways Act 1980 and the Tort of Negligence	482
1508	France: <i>Droit administratif</i>	484
1509	Germany: <i>Straßenverkehrssicherungspflichten</i>	485
1510	Comparative Observations: Liability of Highway Authorities	487
	D Concluding Remarks	488
1511	Comparative Observations: Liability for Immovable Objects	488
16	LIABILITY FOR OTHER PERSONS	490
	A Introduction	490
1601	Overview	490
	1601-1 Negligence and Strict Liability	490
	1601-2 Supervisory Liability Based on Negligence	492
	B Children and the Mentally Incapacitated	493
1602	Liability of Parents	493
	1602-1 France	493
	1602-2 Germany	495
	1602-3 England	496
1603	Liability of Other Supervisors over Children	497
1604	Comparative Observations	499
1605	Supervising the Mentally Incapacitated	501

C	Employees	502
1606	National Rules	502
1606-1	Germany: § 831 BGB	502
1606-2	Germany: Bypassing § 831 BGB	504
1606-3	France	506
1606-4	England	508
1607	Comparative Observations	511
1607-1	General Remarks	511
1607-2	Rationales for the Employer's Liability	512
1607-3	Conditions for the Employer's Liability	513
D	Corporations	516
1608	Parent Companies vis-à-vis Their Subsidiaries	516
1608-1	Introduction	516
1608-2	Requirements for Parent Company Liability	518
17	LIABILITY IN EMERGENCY CASES	520
1701	Pure Omissions: A Duty to Rescue?	520
1702	National Rules	521
1702-1	France	521
1702-2	Germany	522
1702-3	England	524
1703	Comparative Observations	525
1703-1	When Should a Duty to Rescue Exist?	525
1703-2	The Rescuer's Standard of Care	527
1703-3	The Rescuer's Right to Compensation	528
18	LIABILITY OF PUBLIC BODIES	530
A	Introduction	530
1801	Overview	530
1801-1	Differences Between Liability of Public and Private Actors	530
1801-2	Different Views on Liability of Public Bodies	531
B	National Legal Systems	533
1802	France	533
1802-1	Administrative Liability	533
1802-2	Liability Based on Fault	535
1802-3	Liability Based on Risk: The Equality Principle	537
1803	Germany	539
1803-1	Introduction	539
1803-2	Liability of the Civil Servant (§ 839 BGB)	541
1803-3	Discretion and its Limits	543
1803-4	State Liability (Art. 34 <i>Grundgesetz</i>)	545

1804	England	546
1804-1	Introduction	546
1804-2	Justiciability	548
1804-3	Duty of Care: General	550
1804-4	Duty of Care and the Right to a Fair Trial (Art. 6 ECHR)	553
1804-5	Duty of Care and the Right to Life (Art. 2 ECHR)	555
1804-6	Misfeasance in Public Office	557
C	EU Law	559
1805	Sufficiently Serious Breach	559
1805-1	Relevant Factors	559
1805-2	Application of the Relevant Factors	561
1805-3	A Genuinely European but Unfortunate Terminology	564
1806	No Liability for Lawful Acts	566
D	European Convention on Human Rights	569
1807	The Right to Life: Article 2 ECHR	569
1807-1	Introduction	569
1807-2	Duties of Police Authorities	571
1807-3	Duties of Local Authorities	572
1807-4	Duties of Prison Authorities	573
1807-5	Evaluation	574
1808	The Right to Physical Integrity and Health	575
1808-1	Article 3 ECHR: Degrading Treatment	575
1808-2	Articles 2 and 8 ECHR: Information About Health and Safety Risks	576
E	Concluding Remarks	577
1809	The Peculiarities of Public Body Liability	577
1810	Discretion: Its Inevitability and its Limits	579
1811	The Equality Principle as an Illustration of the Rift in Europe	581
	<i>Bibliography</i>	585
	<i>Index</i>	589