

Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xi
1. Introduction	1
1. The abuse of constitutional identity	1
2. The rise of constitutional identity	2
3. Constitutional identity in the European Union	5
4. Constitutional ‘identity politics’	6
5. Illiberal misappropriations	8
6. Displacing identity	11
7. The frame: constitutional identity <i>abuse</i>	12
8. Structure of this book	16
2. Constitutional Identity in the European Union	21
1. Introduction	21
2. Constitutional pluralism	22
3. Constitutional identity before Lisbon	24
3.1 First intimations: <i>Solange</i> and <i>controlimiti</i>	24
3.2 Constitutional identity in the Maastricht era	27
4. Constitutional identity in the Lisbon era	28
4.1 The Constitutional Treaty and the French and Spanish constitutional courts	28
4.2 The German <i>Lisbon</i> judgment	29
4.3 Constitutional identity review in East Central Europe	32
4.4 Constitutional identity as a tool for constitutional contestation and dialogue	34
4.5 The role of Article 4(2) TEU: relative primacy of EU law?	37
5. A metaconstitutional argument	39
5.1 The ‘argument from constitutional identity’	41
5.2 Problems with the argument	47
6. Conclusion	49
3. Critiques of Constitutional Identity	51
1. Introduction	51
2. The viability of constitutional pluralism	51
2.1 Constitutional pluralism and constitutional backsliding	54
3. The critiques of constitutional identity	57
3.1 The case of Hungary	58
3.2 The case of Poland	59
3.3 Constitutional identity: inherently dangerous?	61
3.4 Abandon constitutional identity?	64

4. In defence of constitutional identity	65
4.1 Overstated conceptual critiques	66
4.2 Replacing identity with primacy?	70
4.3 A different conceptual frame for constitutional pluralism?	73
5. Constitutional identity abuse: a preview	76
5.1 Three dimensions of constitutional identity abuse	78
4. Generative Abuse of Constitutional Identity	83
1. Introduction	83
2. Constitutional identity and constituent power	85
2.1 Constitutional identity as the decision of the constituent power	86
2.2 Constitutional identity and the constraints of constituent power	88
2.3 From static to dynamic constitutional identity	91
3. The 2011 Hungarian constitution	93
3.1 The 'roundtable constitution' of 1989 and the unfinished revolution	94
3.2 The 'Fundamental Law' of 2011	96
4. Constitutional identity and constitutional change	101
4.1 Amending constitutional identity	103
4.2 Constitutional identity and constitutional instrumentalism	104
4.3 The Fourth Amendment	106
4.4 Commandeering constitutional identity: the Seventh and Ninth Amendments	107
5. Constitutional identity and constitutional courts	110
6. Constitutional identity 'beyond the constitution'	112
6.1 Hungary's 'historical constitution': historicizing the constitution ...	114
6.2 ... and constitutionalizing history	116
7. Conclusion	118
5. Substantive Abuse of Constitutional Identity	121
1. Introduction	121
2. The 'constitution' in 'constitutional identity'	122
2.1 'Constitutionalism': conceptual expectations	124
2.2 'European constitutionalism': contextual expectations	130
2.3 Collapsing constitutional identity into constitutionalism?	133
2.4 Conclusion	135
3. 'Illiberal democracy' as constitutional identity	136
3.1 Rejecting liberalism and embracing 'identity'?	138
3.2 Collapsing 'constitutionalism' into 'constitutional identity'?	141
4. Social homogeneity and the human dignity of refugees	143
4.1 Hungary's refugee policy since 2015	144
4.2 The invocation of constitutional identity	146
4.3 Constitutional identity and social homogeneity	148
4.4 The human dignity of refugees	152
5. The Polish judiciary capture	154
5.1 The Polish 'reforms' of the judiciary since 2015	155

5.2 European challenges to the judiciary capture	157
5.3 The constitutional identity defence	158
5.4 Constitutional identity, constitutionalism, and the rule of law	161
6. Conclusion	166
6. Relational Abuse of Constitutional Identity	169
1. Introduction	169
2. The importance of the relational	170
2.1 Constitutional ironism	171
2.2 Constitutional identity and 'relative authority'	173
2.3 Relational requirements	176
2.4 Substantive implications	178
2.5 Conflict	179
3. Relationality in practice	181
3.1 Openness to, and normative compatibility with, European law	181
3.2 Dialogue and good faith	182
3.3 The <i>Taricco</i> case: a blueprint for judicial dialogue	184
4. Intimations of relational abuse	185
4.1 The <i>Slovak Pensions</i> case	186
4.2 The case law of the German Constitutional Court: from barking to biting	187
5. Constitutional solipsism	191
5.1 From judicial dialogue to internal monologue: the case of Hungary	193
5.2 Politically mandated disengagement: the case of Poland	194
5.3 A function of authoritarianism	197
6. Conclusion	198
7. Conclusion	201
1. Three dimensions of constitutional identity abuse	201
2. Beyond the European Union	204
3. Rethinking constitutional identity	206
4. What now?	207
<i>Index</i>	211