

Contents

Part I Historical Denialism as a Criminal Offence: Origins and Development	
1 The Birth of the Crime of Historical Denialism	3
1.1 Origins of the Phenomenon	4
1.1.1 Historical Denialism and Revisionism	4
1.1.2 A Brief History of Historical Denialism	7
1.2 Origins of the Offence	9
1.2.1 Evolution of the Criminal Offence	11
1.2.2 Criminal Law and Remembrance Laws	20
1.3 The Relationship Between Law and Memory	21
1.4 The Leading Role of Criminal Law	22
1.4.1 Memory as Collective Redefinition of a Common Past	24
1.4.2 Collective Historical Memory as an Ethical Pact	25
1.4.3 Memory, Law and Punishment	27
1.5 Historical Denialism, Anti-Terrorist Legislation and the Protection of Collective Historical Memory	31
1.6 Criminalising Dissent Versus Protecting Consensus	36
References	38
2 The Crime of Historical Denialism and International Law	51
2.1 The International Obligation to Criminalise Historical Denialism	51
2.1.1 International Level	53
2.1.2 EU Level	55
2.1.3 The 2008 Framework Decision	56
2.1.4 European Convention of Human Rights	62
2.2 The Relationship Between Criminal Law and Memory	66
References	67

Part II Denialism in Practice

3	Criminal Law and Memory	73
3.1	Criminal Law and Historical Memory	74
3.2	The French Experience: The Legislator and Judge as Memory Makers	75
3.2.1	Lois Mémorielles	76
3.2.2	The First-Ever Crime of Historical Denialism: The <i>Gayssot</i> Act	78
3.2.3	From the Holocaust to the Armenian Genocide: The <i>Boyer</i> Bill	83
3.2.4	The Role of the Legislator and Freedom of Speech Before the French Courts	89
3.2.5	Constitutional Developments	90
3.2.6	Protecting Historical Research Methodology: The <i>Theil</i> Case	94
3.3	The European Court of Human Rights	96
3.3.1	'Clearly Established Historical Facts': The <i>Garaudy</i> Case	96
3.3.2	'Fact' and 'Legal Qualification of Fact': The <i>Perinçek</i> Case	99
3.4	Courts of Memory	112
3.4.1	Enshrining Memory	115
3.4.2	Manufacturing Memory	117
	References	119
4	Criminal Law and Free Speech	125
4.1	'Fact' and 'Opinion': The German Federal Constitutional Court	125
4.1.1	The German Legal Framework	126
4.1.2	From the <i>Deckert I</i> to Criminal Offence	127
4.1.3	The Law of 28 October 1994	128
4.1.4	Punishable Acts	130
4.1.5	Scope	131
4.1.6	Public Nature and Potential to Disturb the Public Peace ...	132
4.1.7	The Federal Constitutional Court Decision	134
4.2	'Fact' and 'Value': The Spanish Constitutional Court	138
4.2.1	The Spanish Legal Framework	138
4.2.2	The Decision of the Constitutional Court	144
	References	152
5	Conclusion	157
5.1	Criminal Law as a Warden of Memory	157
5.2	The Reversal of Manifest and Latent Functions	159

5.3 The Return of Ethics?	162
5.4 An Attack on the Ethical Pact	165
5.5 In Defence of the Non-Criminal Protection of History	168
References	173
Appendix	179
Bibliography	189
Index	213