

Volume II: COUNTRY STUDIES

Contents

Foreword.....	xxi
— <i>Nelson Mandela</i>	
Preface	xxiii
— <i>Richard H. Solomon</i>	
Introduction.....	xxv
— <i>Charles D. Smith</i>	
Acknowledgments.....	xxviii
The Dilemmas of Transitional Justice.....	xxix
— <i>Neil J. Kritz</i>	
1. Germany (after Nazism)	1
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	1
The Potsdam Program	3
Prosecution of Nazi Criminality	4
The Transfer of Jurisdiction from Allied to German Control.....	4
The Establishment of a Central Coordinating Office	6
Questions of Evidence and Procedure	10
The Defenses	11
Status of "Accomplices"	14
Sentencing	16
Assessment of the Prosecution Effort.....	17
The Purge of Nazi Personnel	19
The Purge Program Under the Military Government.....	19
The Purge Program Under German Authority.....	21
Categories of Offenders.....	22
The Results and the Impact of Denazification.....	26
Rehabilitation and Reparations for Government Employees	27
The "131 Law"	28
Judges and Jurists.....	32
Assessment of Denazification.....	40
The Reform of Education	43
Compensation for Victims	46
The First Compensation Laws and Agreements	48
The Federal Compensation Law (BEG).....	49
Basic Principles	50
Categories of Damage.....	51
Special Provisions for Legal Persons, Institutions or Associations.....	56

Special Groups of Persecutees.....	56
Compensation Authorities and Procedures	57
Before and After the Law	58
Opponents and Supporters.....	58
Successor Organizations and the United Restitution Organization.....	58
The Effects of the Law	59
The Working of the Law: Weaknesses and Accomplishments	60
How Germany Has Coped: Four Decades Later	63
2. France.....	71
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	71
Overview.....	73
Distinguishing Qualities	73
Legitimacy of Vichy	74
The "Anti-Vichy" State	75
The Dismantling—The Great Purge.....	77
The Initial Phase.....	81
Algiers.....	81
Retribution and Ad Hoc Justice	83
Establishing Order	85
Purge Laws	86
The "State" of National Indignity	87
New Courts.....	91
The Trials	94
Controversies Surrounding the Trials.....	96
The Political Arena.....	102
Politicians.....	102
Government Administration.....	105
Purge in the Economic Sphere.....	109
Targeting Collaborators or Capitalists?	111
The Media and the Arts.....	112
Print Media.....	112
Writers and Artists	116
Show Business.....	118
The Final Phase	120
The Punished.....	120
The Question of Amnesty	121
Assessment of the Purge.....	125
3. Denmark.....	127
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	127
The Purge Laws	129
Punishment of Treason: Law 259/45.....	130
Procedure for Purge Cases: Law 260/45.....	135
Penal Law for Collaboration in "Work and Trade:" Law 406/45	136

Other Purge Laws.....	138
Amendments.....	138
Conclusion.....	139
4. Belgium	141
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	141
The Criminal Justice System in Periods of Transition	143
In Search of Literature	143
Paths Toward Redemocratization.....	144
Courts and the Return to Democracy.....	145
The Purge of the Belgian Quislings	146
Criminalization of Political Acts	148
Decriminalization of Economic Collaboration.....	149
The Ambivalence of the Criminal Justice System	149
Political or Partisan Justice?.....	151
5. Italy	153
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	153
Contending With a Fascist Legacy.....	155
The Role of Fascism in Italian Society	156
A Preliminary Analysis of Defascistization.....	159
The Initial Phase.....	163
Efforts of the Badoglio Government 1943-44	163
Debate Between the Political Parties	167
The Second Phase	172
The New Purge Law: DLL 159	172
The Commissioners.....	175
The Administrative Purge.....	176
The Trials	179
The Final Phase	186
The Growing Debate over Defascistization.....	186
Resolution of the Crisis	188
Liberation and Purge of the North.....	188
The Trials of Saló Regime Collaborators.....	192
Criticism of Sanctions Mounts	193
Comparisons to Sanctions Against Fascists Elsewhere	195
The End of Sanctions	195
The End of the Anti-Fascist Threat.....	200
Assessment of the Purge.....	201
6. South Korea	205
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	205
The Democratic Interlude: 1960-61	207
Caught in the Middle: The Chang Myon Government Between the "Revolutionary" and "Anti-Revolutionary" Forces	207

	Dissatisfaction of the Anti-Rhee Groups.....	208
	The Enactment of Special Laws to Punish Former Rhee Supporters	212
	Demoralization of the Police.....	221
	The Question of Illegal Wealth.....	227
	"Purifying" the Military	231
	Return to Transition: Dealing with the Chun Legacy Post-1987	238
	The Politics of Settling Old Scores	239
7.	Greece	241
	<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	241
	A Theoretical Analysis.....	243
	Comparison with other Transitions.....	243
	The Transfer of Power	246
	The Legacy Problem: From Gradualism to Stern Punishment	248
	A Strategy for Democratization	250
	A Historical Account.....	253
	The Regime of the Colonels	253
	The Arrival of the Savior	255
	The Liquidation of the Dictatorship	259
	The Road to Legitimacy.....	262
	Elections.....	264
	Dealing with the Legacy: Purges and Trials.....	264
	The Torturers' Trial	268
	The First ESA Trial	268
	The Officers	272
	The Soldiers	274
	Assessment.....	279
8.	Portugal	283
	<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	283
	The Salazar Legacy.....	285
	Political Context of the Transition.....	287
	Liberation by Military Intervention.....	287
	Reform or Revolution	289
	Purges and Counter-Purges	291
	Conclusion.....	295
9.	Spain	297
	<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	297
	The Gradual Transition.....	299
	Origins, Dimensions, and Scope of the Crisis.....	299
	Weakening of the Regime.....	304
	Return to Repression.....	307
	The Immediate Post-Franco Period.....	309
	The Suárez Approach: Democratization Without Rupture.....	312

New Elections and a New Constitution.....	315
Problems of Consolidation.....	317
Conclusion.....	321
10. Argentina	323
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	323
The End of the Military Regime	325
"Final Document" and "Self-Amnesty" Law	326
The National Commission on Disappeared Persons	327
Military Opposition	330
The CONADEP Report.....	330
The Trial of the Former Junta Members.....	332
Political Considerations Underlying	
Military Jurisdiction.....	335
The First Stage of the Trial	337
The Supreme Council of the Armed	
Forces	337
Transfer to Civilian Jurisdiction.....	337
Report of the Supreme Council.....	338
The Trial in Civilian Court.....	340
The Second Stage of the Trial.....	340
Appeals to the Supreme Court.....	340
Preliminary Developments in the	
Federal Court	341
The Oral Public Proceedings in the	
Second Stage of the Trial	342
The Prosecution Case.....	343
International Practice	344
The Criminal Plan of the Juntas	345
The Defense Case	349
The Verdict of the Court.....	351
Appeals from the Federal Court to the	
Supreme Court.....	357
Limitations on Further Prosecutions	359
The Directives of the Minister of Defense.....	359
A Deadline for New Cases: The Law of	
"Full Stop"	360
The Directives of the Procurator General	362
The Defense of "Following Orders:" The Law	
of "Due Obedience"	362
Procedural History of the Camps Case	365
The Supreme Court's Holding	366
The Majority Arguments of the Court.....	367
Reactions of Human Rights Organizations	369
Arguments the Majority Did Not	
Address: Amnesty.....	370
Compensation.....	376

Postscript: A Retrospective by Former President Alfonsín	378
Principles of Punishment	379
11. Uruguay	383
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	383
The Controversy over Amnesty for Past Human Rights Violations	385
Transition to Civilian Rule: The Naval Club Pact.....	385
Attempts at Judicial Resolution	386
The Search for a Political Solution	387
Law Nullifying the State's Claim to Punish Certain Crimes	388
Challenges to the Law's Constitutionality	390
Application of the Law to "Disappearance" Cases	391
Criticisms of Investigations.....	392
Settling Accounts	393
The Doctors	394
Reintegration of Victims.....	395
The Question of Amnesty	397
Referendum to Rescind the Amnesty Law	401
Views of President Sanguinetti	405
Conclusion of the Referendum Campaign	409
Review of the <i>Ley de Caducidad</i> by the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights	412
The Position of the Petitioners.....	412
The Theory of Complaints	412
The Misapplication of Amnesty	413
The American Convention's Superiority	413
Governmental Succession to Treaty Obligations	414
The State's Obligations	415
The Position of the Government of Uruguay.....	416
The Law's Contextual Setting	416
Lawful Restrictions	416
Articles Disputed	417
The Ley's Intentions	417
The Commission's Opinion and Conclusions.....	417
Competence to Examine the Ley's Effects	417
Violation of Fair Trial Guarantees.....	418
A Violation of Obligation	419
Commission's Recommendations to Uruguay	419
<i>Nunca Más</i> Report on Human Rights Violations.....	420
Preface.....	420
Epilogue	424
Methodology	426

	The Genesis of Uruguay <i>Nunca Más</i>	426
	The Contents of Uruguay <i>Nunca Más</i>	428
	Survey Population	429
12. Brazil		431
	<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	431
	An Analytical Framework.....	433
	Authoritarian Regimes and Transitions	434
	The Paradoxes of Success.....	438
	Brazil: <i>Nunca Mais</i> —The Clandestine Report on Human Rights Violations	443
	Excerpts from the Report	447
	Introduction to the Brazilian Edition.....	447
	The "Brazil: Never Again" Project.....	448
	Overview	450
13. Chile		453
	<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	453
	The Political Setting for the Transition.....	455
	Overview	455
	A Plebiscite Where the Ruling Junta Loses (Though Not Everything).....	456
	The Issue of Human Rights During the Presidential Campaign	458
	The Final Political Conditions	459
	The National Commission on Truth and Reconciliation.....	461
	Selection of Commissioners.....	463
	Mandate	464
	Content.....	465
	Findings	466
	Methodology	471
	Assessing the Impact of the Rettig Commission Report	473
	Two Views from the Commission.....	478
	Perspective of Jorge Correa S.....	478
	What Kind of Truth	478
	Universal or General.....	478
	The Individual Case by Case Story.....	479
	Authoritative Truth that Could No Longer be Contested	481
	An Official Truth	483
	Publicly Exposed	484
	Quick and, Thus, Limited	484
	Why the Truth?	485
	Truth and Prevention: Truth as a Lesser Alternative of Punishment	486
	Retribution.....	486
	Prevention	486

Truth as a Starting Point for Reparation.....	489
Truth as One of the Most Important Components of the Reparative Process.....	489
Recognition of the Dignity of the Victim and of Relatives' Claims	490
Compensating for the Quality of Life	491
Truth and Reconciliation.....	492
Reconciliation as De-Polarization	492
Reconciling People with Their History: Accepting the Truth	493
Perspective of José Zalaquett.....	495
Problems of Prosecution.....	499
The 1978 Amnesty Law	500
Government Position on the Amnesty Law	501
The Reparations Program.....	502
The National Corporation for Reparation and Reconciliation.....	503
Financial Reparation.....	504
Health Benefits.....	506
Educational Benefits.....	507
Reparation for Remaining Political Prisoners.....	508
14. Uganda	511
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	511
Commission of Inquiry into Violations of Human Rights.....	513
Background and Reasons for the Commission.....	513
Terms of Reference.....	513
Composition and Set-Up	514
Members	514
Secretariat	514
Legal Counsel.....	514
Investigation Team.....	515
Modus Operandi and What Has Been Achieved So Far.....	515
Investigation of Complaints.....	515
Itineraries of Hearing of Evidence	515
Criteria for Calling Witnesses.....	516
Testimony in Person, by Affidavits or Answers to Questionnaires	516
Record of Evidence.....	517
Public Response	517
Discussions and Exchange of Views on Uganda with International Groups and Individuals	518
Impact of the Commission.....	518
Demonstrations of Government Seriousness	518
Educational Encouragement.....	518

Necessity for a Permanent Human Rights Commission.....	519
Conclusion.....	519
Comments by Four Members of the Commission of Inquiry	520
15. Czechoslovakia.....	533
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	533
An Interview with President Václav Havel.....	536
The Nature of the Transition	542
The Process of Purging: "Lustration"	544
Introduction.....	544
The Initial Screening Attempts	545
Pressures for Further Action.....	547
The Lustration Law	549
People and Posts Affected.....	550
The Screening Process.....	552
Redress	552
Who Will Be Affected?.....	553
Reactions	554
Assessment	554
The Independent Appeals Commission.....	555
Problems of Implementation: The Jan Kavan Case	558
Compensation and Restitution in Czechoslovakia.....	569
Background	569
April 1990 Law on Judicial Rehabilitation.....	572
Restitution of Property	575
February 1991 Law on Extrajudicial Rehabilitation.....	578
The Return of Property	579
Controversies, Problems, and Limitations.....	581
1993 Law on the Illegality of the Communist Regime	587
The Law	588
Reactions.....	590
16. Germany (after Communism)	593
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	593
Overview.....	595
Secret Police Files	596
Trials of Communism: Erich Honecker vs. Berlin	
Border Guards.....	598
Restitution of Property	600
Screening the Civil Service.....	601
Treatment of the Secret Police Files	602
Perspective of the Federal Commissioner for the Stasi Files	602
Further Considerations of the Files Dilemma.....	609
The Pain of Reading One's Own File.....	612

The Debate Within the German Church Community	615
Repressing the Past	618
Stasi Informants and Stasi Files.....	620
Problems of Prosecution.....	625
Introduction.....	625
The Rule of Law.....	626
The Rule of Law and the Trials of Former East German Border Guards	627
Municipal Law	627
The Law of the German Democratic Republic	628
The Law of the Federal Republic of Germany	630
Natural Law	630
Decisions in the East German Border Guard Trial.....	631
Positivism and Natural Law in Post-World War II Germany.....	635
Positivism and Natural Law in United Germany	636
Similarities to Application of Natural Law in Post-World War II Germany.....	636
Conclusion.....	639
Compensation and Restitution.....	640
Restitution Before Compensation	640
The Decision in Favour of Restitution.....	642
Compensation Before Restitution.....	643
Restitution in Practice.....	644
17. Hungary	645
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	645
Prosecution of Communist Crimes: The Debate Over the Statute of Limitations	647
The Zetenyi-Takacs Law	648
Strong Emotional Reactions.....	648
Political Concern.....	650
Legal Considerations	651
Decision of the Constitutional Court Overturning the Law.....	652
Roundtable on the Court's Ruling	653
A Different Approach to the Statute of Limitations: The 1993 Law	661
Screening Legislation	662
Previous Attempts to Deal with the Past.....	663
The Screening Process	663
Posts to be Screened	664
Consequences	665
The Question of Compensation: Land Restitution	667
Compensation Proposals Before the Constitutional Court.....	667

The Role of the Constitutional Court in the Legal Transition	668
Property Rights Under Socialism and the Problem of Confiscation	669
Privatization and Historical Justice.....	670
Compensation Case I—An Advisory Opinion	672
Equal Protection and Reverse Discrimination.....	673
The Takings Clause and Neutral Principles	676
Compensation Case II —Self-Restraint or Activism?	678
Compensation Case III.....	680
Conclusion: Law and Politics.....	684
The Compensation Law.....	685
The Law and the Agricultural Cooperatives	689
Supply and Demand	690
Assessment	690
Other Forms of Compensation and Rehabilitation	691
Voiding of Convictions	691
Financial Compensation	691
Law No. 32: Compensation for Unlawful Deprivation of Life or Liberty.....	691
Executive Decree No. 93-1990: Increasing Pensions for Former Political Prisoners.....	692
Pending Legislation	692
18. Bulgaria	693
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	693
Overview.....	695
Purge Laws	698
Draft Lustration Laws.....	698
The Banking and Pension Laws	699
The Constitutional Court's Decisions.....	700
The Panev Law: Another Attempt at Lustration Legislation	700
The Constitutional Court's Decision on the Panev Law	702
Implementation of the Panev Law.....	703
Prosecution of Past Abuses	706
The First Trial of Former President Zhivkov	706
The Turning of the Tide.....	706
Zhivkov Powerless.....	707
A Controversial Trial	707
The Sentence.....	708
Other Criminal Cases.....	709
Amnesty and Compensation	713
Land Restitution	715

Restoration of Ownership Rights in Agricultural Land.....	717
Size of Agricultural Land Subject to Restitution	718
Compensation.....	718
Agricultural Land Restitution: General Assessment.....	719
Restoration of Ownership Rights in Immovable Property Confiscated Under Effective Sentences or at Deprivation of Bulgarian Citizenship	719
Restoration of Ownership Rights in Immovable Property Expropriated for "State and Public Purposes"	720
19. Albania.....	723
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	723
The Initial Transition.....	725
Prosecution of the Former Communist Leadership	727
Constitutional Court Decision on the First Lustration Law	729
The Overturned Law	730
The Constitutional and Legal Background.....	731
The Ruling of the Constitutional Court.....	733
20. Russia	735
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	735
The Trial of the Communist Party	738
Background to the Case.....	738
Defining the Stakes: Backstage Maneuvering.....	739
The "Trial of the Century" in Overview	740
Pro and Con: Political Combat in the Legal Arena	743
The Trial as Political Theater	746
Conclusion: The Verdict as Politics, Law and History	748
The Law on Rehabilitation	751
Definitions and Scope of the Law	751
Procedure for Rehabilitation.....	752
Benefits and Privileges of Rehabilitation	753
Purging: The Debate over a Proposed Law	754
Draft Law Triggers Debate	756
KGB Documents Shed Light on Draft Law	758
Legal Obstacles to Lustration	760
21. Lithuania.....	763
<i>Editor's Introduction</i>	763
The Purge of Security Agents and Collaborators	766
The Law and Procedures.....	766
Major Cases	767
KGB Files and Agents.....	768

Author Index	771
Contents of Volume I: General Considerations	775
Contents of Volume III: Laws, Rulings, and Reports	777