

---

# CONTENTS

---

<i>List of Authors</i> .....	<i>xi</i>
<i>List of Cases</i> .....	<i>xiii</i>
<i>List of Legislation</i> .....	<i>xli</i>

<i>Introduction</i> .....	<i>1</i>
---------------------------	----------

## **Matteo Bonelli, Mariolina Eliantonio and Giulia Gentile**

The Project .....	1
Volume II and its Structure.....	3
Appendix: Questionnaire for Authors.....	5
A. Introduction .....	5
B. Article 47 in the National Courts' Case Law: A Quantitative Analysis.....	5
C. Article 47 before National and EU Courts: Convergence or Divergence? A Qualitative Analysis .....	5
D. The Systemic Impact of Article 47 at the National Level.....	6
1. <i>Article 47 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights: A Fruitful Tree Growing     in the Belgian Landscape of Judicial Protection</i> .....	7

## **Yseult Marique and Cécilia Rizcallah**

I. Introduction .....	7
II. The Belgian Judicial System and its Relationship with EU Law .....	8
A. Judicial Organisation in Belgium .....	8
B. The Relationship between Belgian and European Law and, in Particular, the Application of the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights .....	9
C. Judicial Protection in Belgium.....	10
III. Article 47 of the Charter before the Belgian Courts .....	11
A. Article 47 in the Case Law of the National Courts: A Quantitative Analysis.....	12
B. Article 47 in the Case Law of the National Court: A Qualitative Analysis.....	12
IV. The Systemic Impact of Article 47 at the National Level.....	20
A. Weaknesses Impairing the Full Potential of Article 47 of the Charter in the Belgian Legal Order.....	20
B. The Benefits and Strengths of Article 47 of the Charter in the Belgian Legal Order .....	21
V. Conclusion.....	27

2.	<i>The Application of Article 47 of the Charter in Croatia: Happening by Accident?</i> .....	29
	<b>Davor Petrić</b>	
	I. Introduction .....	29
	II. The Judicial System and Sources of Law in Croatia .....	30
	III. Case Law on the Relationship between EU and National Law .....	32
	IV. Article 47 of the Charter and the Croatian Courts: An Overview .....	34
	V. Article 47 of the Charter and the Croatian Courts: A Discussion .....	36
	A. The Style of Reasoning .....	36
	B. The Unsophisticated Use of Article 47 of the Charter .....	38
	C. Avoiding the Preliminary Ruling Procedure .....	44
	VI. Concluding Remarks .....	45
3.	<i>Article 47 of the Charter in France: From Darkness to Light?</i> .....	49
	<b>Marion Ho-Dac and Lamprini Xenou</b>	
	I. Introduction .....	49
	II. The Main Features of the French Judicial System .....	50
	A. The Importance of the ECHR .....	50
	B. The Impact of the Constitutionality Review .....	51
	C. Interplay between International Law (Including EU Law) and National Law .....	52
	D. The Limitation of the Primacy of International Law, Including EU Law .....	52
	III. The Limited Application of Article 47 of the Charter by French Courts .....	53
	A. Identification of the French Case Law Referring to Article 47 of the Charter .....	53
	B. The Reasons for the Limited Role of Article 47 in the French Case Law .....	57
	IV. The Constructive Application of Article 47 of the Charter by French Courts .....	60
	A. The Dialogue between French Courts and the CJEU .....	60
	B. The Growing Importance of Article 47 of the Charter in the French Case Law .....	64
	V. Conclusion .....	68
4.	<i>The Application of Article 47 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights by German Courts</i> .....	71
	<b>Angela Schwerdtfeger</b>	
	I. Introduction .....	72
	A. Jurisdictions .....	72
	B. The Relationship between the Different Sources of Fundamental Rights .....	72
	II. Article 47 in the National Courts' Case Law: A Quantitative Analysis .....	74
	A. Data on Court Decisions .....	74
	B. Quantitative Analysis .....	75
	C. Evolution .....	76

III.	Article 47 before the National and EU Courts: A Qualitative Analysis .....	77
	A. Preliminary Ruling Procedures .....	77
	B. Autonomous Application of Article 47 by German Courts.....	80
IV.	The Relationship of Article 47 with Other Norms and Principles .....	86
V.	Conclusion: The Systemic Impact of Article 47 at the National Level.....	88
5.	<i>An Opportunity Seized or Lost? The Application of Article 47 of the Charter by Hungarian Courts</i> .....	89
	<b>Marton Varju and Mónika Papp</b>	
	I. Introduction .....	89
	II. The Judicial System and EU Law in Hungary .....	90
	III. Article 47 EUCFR before the Hungarian Courts: The Numbers.....	92
	IV. Article 47 before the Hungarian Courts: Qualitative Analysis .....	93
	A. The Impact of Article 47 Following a Preliminary Ruling .....	93
	B. Article 47 Applied Autonomously by Hungarian Courts .....	99
	V. Assessment.....	104
	VI. Future Perspectives.....	106
6.	<i>The Impact of Article 47 of the Charter in the Irish Legal System</i> .....	109
	<b>David Fennelly, Gráinne Gilmore and Clíodhna Murphy</b>	
	I. Introduction .....	109
	II. The Irish Legal System: An Overview .....	110
	A. The Courts System.....	110
	B. The Protection of Fundamental Rights in Irish Law.....	112
	C. EU Law in the Irish Legal System.....	113
	III. The Application of Article 47 of the Charter by the Irish Courts: An Overview .....	114
	IV. The Influence of Article 47 of the Charter in Key Areas of Practice.....	116
	A. Asylum and Immigration .....	116
	B. Criminal Law .....	120
	C. Data Protection.....	123
	D. The Environment and Planning .....	127
	V. Conclusion: The Systemic Impact of Article 47 in the Irish Legal System .....	131
7.	<i>Article 47 of the Charter in the Italian Legal System: The Pervasive Application of a Provision Perceived as the Expression of a Common Legal Heritage</i> .....	133
	<b>Chiara Favilli, Nicole Lazzerini and Simone Torricelli</b>	
	I. Introduction .....	133
	II. The Italian Judicial System in a Nutshell .....	135
	III. The Primacy of EU Law in the Italian Legal Order: A Long- Established Approach and a Recent Evolution .....	136
	IV. An Overview of the Use of Article 47 EUCFR in the Case Law of Italian Courts.....	137
	V. Article 47 EUCFR in the Preliminary Rulings Submitted by Italian Courts.....	139

VI.	The Autonomous Application of Article 47 EUCFR by Italian Courts .....	145
VII.	Concluding Remarks: Article 47 EUCFR as Part of a ‘Common Legal Heritage’ .....	149
8.	<i>Article 47 of the Charter and the Netherlands: A World to Win</i> .....	151
	<b>Rob Widdershoven, Sim Haket, Anna van Duin and Anna Taimr</b>	
I.	Introduction.....	151
II.	The Main Features of the Dutch Legal System .....	152
	A. The Organisation of the Judiciary.....	152
	B. The Constitutional Status of the EUCFR and the ECHR .....	153
III.	Article 47 EUCFR in Dutch Case Law: The General Picture .....	154
	A. Article 47 EUCFR in Numbers .....	154
	B. Competition and Interplay between Article 47 EUCFR and Article 6 ECHR .....	159
IV.	The Constructive Application of Article 47 EUCFR by the Dutch Courts .....	166
	A. The Dialogue between the Dutch Courts and the CJEU.....	166
	B. The Autonomous Interpretation of Article 47 EUCFR by the Dutch Courts.....	174
V.	Conclusion .....	178
9.	<i>The Impact of Article 47 of the Charter in the Polish Legal Order</i> .....	181
	<b>Mateusz Grochowski and Maciej Taborowski</b>	
I.	Introduction.....	181
	A. Evolution of the Polish Legal Order .....	182
	B. The Architecture of the Polish Legal and Judicial System .....	183
	C. The Quantitative Data .....	184
II.	Article 47 of the Charter and the Rule of Law.....	186
	A. The Unexpected Role of Article 47 in the Polish Constitutional Crisis.....	186
	B. Various (Non-)Implementations of the ‘AK Test’ Concerning an Independent and Impartial Court.....	188
	C. The Non-implementation of the ‘Simpson Test’ (of a Court Established by Law) .....	192
	D. Article 47 EUCFR and the Suspension of a National Law ( <i>Factortame/Unibet</i> ) .....	193
III.	Article 47 of the Charter and Consumer Law .....	195
	A. The <i>Profi Credit</i> Saga.....	195
	B. A ‘Positive’ (‘Creative’) Function of Article 47 of the Charter .....	197
IV.	Conclusion .....	198
10.	<i>Article 47 of the Charter of Fundamental Rights before Spanish Courts: Reasonable Accommodations without Structural Changes</i> .....	201
	<b>Luis Arroyo Jiménez and Raúl Cancio Fernández</b>	
I.	Introduction.....	201
II.	The Institutional and Normative Context.....	202

III.	Quantitative Analysis .....	205
IV.	Qualitative Analysis.....	210
V.	Systemic Impact .....	215
VI.	Conclusion.....	219
11.	<i>The Right to an Effective Remedy in Article 47 of the Charter and the Principle of Effective Judicial Protection before the Swedish Courts.....</i>	<i>221</i>
	<b>Johanna Engström</b>	
I.	Introduction .....	222
II.	The Swedish Judicial System and the Reception of EU Law in the Swedish Legal Habitat .....	222
III.	Article 47 in the Swedish Courts' Case Law: A Quantitative Analysis.....	224
A.	Quantitative Analysis of Swedish Case Law on Article 47 of the Charter .....	224
B.	Observations on the Judiciary's Choice of Legal Basis for Assessing Swedish Law's Compatibility with the Right to an Effective Remedy .....	226
IV.	Article 47 before National and EU Courts: Convergence or Divergence? A Qualitative Analysis .....	229
A.	The Submission of Preliminary Questions under Article 47 of the Charter and the Right to an Effective Remedy .....	230
B.	The Autonomous Application of the Principle by Swedish Courts and Sources where Guidance was Sought.....	232
V.	The Systemic Impact of the Principle of an Effective Judicial Protection at the National Level .....	238
VI.	Conclusion .....	239
	<i>Article 47 of the Charter and the Principle of Effective Judicial Protection before National Courts: Comparative Remarks.....</i>	<i>241</i>
	<b>Matteo Bonelli, Mariolina Eliantonio and Giulia Gentile</b>	
I.	Introduction .....	241
II.	Quantitative Analysis .....	243
III.	Qualitative Analysis.....	245
A.	Who Applies Article 47 of the Charter and when.....	245
B.	On what Issues .....	247
C.	The Dialogue with the CJEU.....	248
D.	The Interplay between Different Sources of Judicial Protection .....	250
IV.	The Systemic Impact of Article 47 .....	251
A.	Where, when and why Article 47 has Played a Significant Role .....	252
B.	Where, when and why Article 47 has not Played a Significant Role.....	253
C.	Where, when and why Article 47 Could Play a Significant Role.....	254
V.	Article 47 in the European Network of Fundamental Rights Protection.....	255
	<i>Index.....</i>	<i>259</i>